Distribution Agreement

In presenting this thesis or dissertation as a partial fulfillment of the requirements for an advanced degree from Emory University, I hereby grant to Emory University and its agents the non-exclusive license to archive, make accessible, and display my thesis or dissertation in whole or in part in all forms of media, now or hereafter known, including display on the world wide web. I understand that I may select some access restrictions as part of the online submission of this thesis or dissertation. I retain all ownership rights to the copyright of the thesis or dissertation. I also retain the right to use in future works (such as articles or books) all or part of this thesis or dissertation.

Signature:

_____ _____

Thomas W. Comstock III Date

Vivímos Aca:
A Video Documentary on a Community Experiencing Marginalization
in Bañado Sur, Asunción Paraguay

By

Thomas W. Comstock III
MPH

Hubert Department of Global Health

_____

Dr. Karen L. Andes
Committee Chair

Vivímos Aca:
A Video Documentary on a Community Experiencing Marginalization in Bañado Sur, Asunción Paraguay

By

Thomas W. Comstock III

B.A. in Government and Theatre
College of William and Mary
2009

M.Ed in Special Education
George Mason University
2011

Thesis Committee Chair: Dr. Karen L. Andes, Ph.D.

An abstract of
A thesis submitted to the Faculty of the
Rollins School of Public Health of Emory University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Public Health
in Hubert Department of Global Health
2015

Abstract

Vivímos Aca:
A Video Documentary on a Community Experiencing Marginalization
in Bañado Sur, Asunción Paraguay
By Thomas W. Comstock III

Background: Bañado Sur is an informal settlement in the flood plain of the Paraguay River in Asuncion, Paraguay. The community is next to the municipal dump and most families derive their income from processing trash. They are marginalized in Paraguayan society, where they are considered "good for nothings." The literature on the Social Determinants of Health shows that marginalization can have a negative impact on physical health. This project sought to understand how local youth themselves understood and experienced marginalization.

Methods: Photovoice is a participatory research technique that has been used in marginalized communities around the world. This project is a video documentary about the Bañado Sur using an adapted Photovoice methodology to illicit an emic perspective from participants. Ten young activists were asked to photograph meaningful things in their community. They then selected their favorite 3-7 photos and were interviewed on camera about what the images represented for them. For the documentary, clips were assembled with an eye towards maintaining the fidelity of participants' statements and intentions. Additional material included interviews with key informants at Emory who have worked in this community, additional footage of the Bañado, and context for audiences outside of Paraguay.

Results: Participants spoke to a deep sense of marginalization and a strong desire to define their future on their own terms as a community that is full of both struggle and hope. Participants discuss the floods that force families to leave their homes and discuss the hardship and lack of government response. They highlight that the motivation for their activism is the children in their community, so that they can grow up with dignity and hope for the future.

Discussion: As Asuncion develops, the residents of Bañado Sur live increasingly in the city's waste and risk losing their homes to further development. Participants spoke of marginalization – as well as abiding hope. Hopeful future expectations are linked to the core elements of positive youth development approaches – competence, confidence, character, connection, caring, and contribution. Hope and solidarity may be the Bañado's greatest resource. Despite harsh conditions, the residents share strong community bonds and hope for the future.

Vivímos Aca:
A Video Documentary on a Community Experiencing Marginalization in Bañado Sur, Asuncion Paraguay

By

Thomas W. Comstock III

B.A. in Government and Theatre
College of William and Mary
2009

M.Ed in Special Education
George Mason University
2011

Thesis Committee Chair: Dr. Karen L. Andes, Ph.D.

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of the
Rollins School of Public Health of Emory University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Public Health
in Hubert Department of Global Health
2015

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction

In development and social justice circles, one often hears the Parable of the River. It is the story where a town keeps noticing people floating down a river, so they do the nice thing and pull them out. Then, so many people are getting pulled out of the river, they have to start dealing with housing them and feeding them. The wiser ones in the town look at the situation and ask the fundamental question, why are people ending up in the river? So, they go and find out that the bridge is out. By fixing the bridge, people no longer fall in, need to be pulled out, or need services. It is a story about the difference between charity and justice or dealing in prevention rather than treatment.

Public Health, as a field, is about going up stream. It deals in populations and prevention rather than individuals and treatment. The idea is to prevent problems before they even happen and at a level that scales. For some health outcomes, though, one has to look far upstream. Health is not just determined by microbes and personal choice, but by systematic level social factor that get lumped into the term the Social Determinants of Health. These are things like poverty, discrimination, inequality, and stigma that whole population might be equally susceptible to given their relative social location. One's social position affects risk.

This project is, then, an intervention for marginalization. Admittedly, not one that will "solve" marginalization, but one that can participate in a process of helping to push back against marginalization. Bañado Sur, an improvised settlement on the outskirts of Asuncion, Paraguay, suffers from a lot of health challenges. The teen pregnancy rate is reportedly high. Food insecurity is rampant. Intimate Partner Violence, hazardous working conditions, and poor water and sanitation all take their tolls. However, from the community's perspective, it is really about being marginalize. They are physically pushed to the edge of the city, kept in legal limbo

limiting their access to services, and stigmatized by broader Paraguayan society. This limits their ability to rise to the health challenges, but they are trapped under the weight of structural injustice.

Thus, this is a video documentary amplifying an emic perspective. What this project attempts to do is to give activists in the Bañado Sur community an outlet to speak for themselves and to control the script. The documentary aims to be a tool that they can use to show people who they really are and what they really need – rather than the stereotypes imposed upon them. It is part of shifting how they are perceived and in that way push back against the forces that keep them on the margin.

Chapter 2: Review of Literature

Social Determinants of Health

Marginalization is not health neutral. Those studying the social determinants of health are quick to point out the exact opposite. In fact, the Word Health Organization (WHO)'s Commission on Social Determinants of Health in 2008 stated that where you were born, live, and work (your social setting) is the number one factor in determining one's health state. Hofrichter (2010) goes through three of the more virulent forms of marginalization in the United States, classism, racism, and sexism, and points out that health outcomes have improved far less for African American women than any other social group, or that even holding economic class constant, experiencing racism has a tangible effect on one's circulatory functioning. The social determinants of health go even further beyond those three categories as Satcher (2010) sums it up, "These social and structural conditions include education; housing; employment; living wages; access to health care; access to healthy foods and green spaces; justice; occupational safety; hopefulness; and freedom from racism, classism, sexism, and other forms of exclusion, marginalization, and discrimination based on social status" (Satcher 2010, p. 6). The structural factor that people often feel powerless to overcome are intimately linked to Public Health. To ignore them is to continue to pull bodies out of the river without asking why they end up there in the first place.

Photovoice as Emic Discourse

At the heart of this project is a participatory research technique called Photovoice. It was developed by C. Wang and MA Burris (1997) out of their work with women in China. The top level view of the methodology is that it gives community members cameras, asks them to take pictures of a relatively open ended subject, and then has individuals or groups describe what is in the photos and what gives those photos particular meaning for the community. This, in turn, has

the potential to have a direct impact, as C. Wang and MA Burris put it, "It uses the immediacy of the visual image to furnish evidence and to promote an effective, participatory means of sharing expertise and knowledge" (C. Wang and MA. Burris 1997, p. 369). In applying it to Public Health, they envision it as a way of performing participatory needs and assets assessment but also makes it clear that the design is deliberately flexible to meet a variety of public health challenges.

Getting more specific, the authors describe Photovoice as having three discrete goals, "(1) to enable people to record and reflect their community's strengths and concerns, (2) to promote critical dialogue and knowledge about important issues through large and small group discussion of photographs, and (3) to reach policy makers" (C. Wang and MA. Burris 1997, p. 369). They seek to make an emic perspective motivate and move a community and, in turn, influence those who can bring power to bear on a problem.

C. Wang and MA. Burris create Photovoice out of three distinct theoretical areas. First is the work of the Brazilian teacher and activist Paulo Freire. Particularly, they built off of his "problem-posing" education system, where by learning and community organizing both are grounded in the real issues affecting the community. The classic example is that a stone mason was taught to read by first learning to read the word brick. Photovoice is also driven by this instinct to capture and tell the story of what is really going on in a community – from their perspective.

To expand on this some from Hope and Timmel (1984)'s operationalization of Freire's theory into practical community organizing, Freire's work is bringing about societal transformation from the bottom-up. It involves getting groups actively involved in their own process of transformation – rather than relying on the elite, the "better educated," or the "development experts." It is a methodology that breaks through apathy and hopelessness to bring about critical awareness of the root causes and concerted action at those root causes. This

movement stems from the idea that emotion equals motivation. People seeking to transform communities need to find issues that are emotionally resonate, termed generative themes. By using these generative themes, it leads individuals to choose transformation for themselves, which is an inherently grassroots path to liberation. The pithy phrase that gets used is "feelings are fact," or that what people feel is just as true or real for them (and perhaps more so) than anything an expert can teach them. These feelings can break through the apathy and sense of powerlessness, so it is important to start with an issue surrounded by strong emotion by actively listening to the community.

This generative is translated into action through a process of popular education that empowers all to make a full contribution to a new society. This education takes on a much different form than how one traditionally construes education. The leader functions as animator. Instead of talking and offering a lot of their own words and ideas, an animator promotes discussion, asks good questions, draws in the shy people, and prevents domination by the more aggressive in the group. Popular education is based on a problem-posing model rather than a banking model. In the traditional banking model of education, the teacher fills the students' heads with knowledge – like a pitcher pouring into an empty glass or a gas pump filling up a car. In this problem-posing model, education presents the community with a problem and animates them to realize that they have something to say about it and offer toward a solution. Through strategic questioning, the community moves themselves from exploring the surface of the problem to plumbing the deep root causes and structural issues.

The actual methodology for enacting this is through the introduction and discussion of a code or provocative image. A code is some form of image, poster, drama, poem, or story that poses the problem in a way that draws everyone's attention to it. It is not something that is

explained, but rather, the animator asks specifically structured questions about the code that leads the group to describe and analyze the problem. This starts with the literal events of the code, moves to the larger issues at play, and finally to the root causes of the situation. And the end of the code making process is action planning. Thus, using Friere's methodology, a community latches onto an issue that is emotionally generative to them, which breaks through their apathy, and by exploring a code, they get at the root causes – ready to justice based action. In this way, Photovoice can be interpreted as involving the community in code creation. C. Wang and MA. Burris (1997) layout the capturing of images as just a first stage. After the images are captured, community members are brought together to select the images that are most important, meaningful, or representational. Then, the community tells stories around these images with a little prompting from the facilitator and comes up with the themes that stand out from the various stories. To map this onto Hope and Timmel (1984)'s process, the taking and selecting the images is code creation, and the storytelling and thematic selection is the description and analysis with the goal of moving toward action planning.

The Photovoice creators cite Feminist Theory as a major influence. One of the key contributions of Feminism to cultural discourse is the pushing back from and tearing down of male dominant or male only narratives. For Photovoice, in giving community cameras, it serves as a corrective on dominant narrative and allows marginalized people to reenter the conversation.

Finally, C. Wang and MA. Burris recognize that their work builds off of Documentary Photography. Several artists in this field had already branched out into placing cameras into the hands of people whose perspective is often missing. Photovoice takes this and adds storytelling and research components to it. All of this is in service of the technique's overall main advantage

– creating a higher likelihood of capturing an emic perspective, while being flexible and able to adapt to a variety of health challenges.

This flexibility has been put to use in a variety of settings. Photovoice has been used for needs and asset assessment (Berbes-Blazquez 2012 and Bader, et al 2007). It has served as a program evaluation tool (Kramer, et al 2013). More relevant to this project, Photovoice has been used as a tool for consciousness raising and stigma reduction in a variety of contexts. These include African American communities in the United States (Carlson, et al 2006), people suffering from mental illness and associated stigmatization (Yanos, et al 2014), fighting HIV and AIDS stigma in South Africa (Moletsane, et al 2007), and school based adolescent empowerment (Wilson, et al 2007).

Thus, Photovoice has been used to address similar problems as the one facing Bañado Sur. It offers an open-ended methodology that seeks to capture and amplify non-dominant narratives, but generally, each of the projects cited here were part of a larger program. Photovoice served as the preliminary to a larger action or a fact-finding stage. Few use Photovoice's ability to capture and amplify voices often left out and turn that directly into the intervention. This is the space that this project carves out. It is not an assessment or a first stage. It takes the community's story and turns it into its own intervention.

Context of Bañado Sur

Bañado Sur is an improvised settlement in Asuncion Paraguay. It is located in the flood plain of the Paraguay River south and west of the main body of the city and next to the city's garbage dump. Most of the poverty in Asuncion has been pushed to these liminal regions because the tightly packed geography of the city dictates that the areas around the city's river are the only places to go. People moving into these flood plains went on from most of the 20th

century and produced the city's two main Bañados – North and South. Demographic mapping of the city shows that most of the city's poor and inadequate housing are concentrated in the Bañados, and as of 2005, the two Bañados boasted a combined population 55,000 inhabitants. This constitutes a majority of the city's poverty (Candia Baeza 2005).

The four or five square kilometers of Bañado Sur strike a drastic contrast with the center of Asuncion. The center has tree lined streets and a growing middle class. Bañado Sur's landscape is marked by contaminated water, trash, and the looming vista of the city dump. Most inhabitants came to the Bañado with the rise of the cattle industry in the 1960s. This expansion required a lot more land, so the inhabitants had to leave their land. Many of them made their way into Bañado Sur. As it is an improvised settlement, it was these original residents that built much of the area's infrastructure including roads, bridges, rudimentary plumbing, and basic electricity access. There have now been three generations born in Bañado Sur, but, at this point in history, only one in ten residents has formal employment. The other 90% work as trash pickers, sell animals, or become street vendors (Zibechi 2008). The vast majority of adults and many children do some work involving trash. They either work on the city dump's trash pile as informal trash pickers, or they spend hours every day roving the city with a cart looking for items that can be sold as recyclables. Either way, they are eking out a living of around two dollars per day. Overall, Bañado Sur is a community of roughly 16,000 people. 90% of who, according to some sources, live in some form of poverty, and more than half live in abject poverty (Oliva 2007).

Little reliable health data exists for the Bañado, but there is a study looking at the health effects of working as an informal trash picker in Asuncion. Cunningham, et al (2012) looked at 12 formal trash pickers, hired by a trash picking company, and 102 informal trash pickers working in improvised bands each working on the trash pile next to Bañado Sur. Most residents

of the Bañado would qualify as some form of informal trash picker with many working on the pile. Cunningham, et al found that the health outcomes and risks were much worse for the informal pickers versus the formal ones. Specifically, informal pickers were more frequently exposed to syringes laying amongst the trash ($p=0.011$) and bags containing medical waste ($p<0.0001$). They were also more likely to be pricked by a syringe while working ($p=0.033$), to not wear gloves or other protective clothing ($p=0.0017$), and to be exposed to higher levels of dust ($p=0.0006$). Their work places are also much more likely to lack basic sanitation, such as running water for hand washing ($p=0.0005$) and amenities, such as potable water ($p=0.0008$). All of this is to say that even within the relatively dangerous and undignified world of trash picking, Bañado residents, as one of the key groups making up the informal pickers, suffer disproportionately

Chapter 3: Methodology

The goal of this project is to create a video documentary, using the Photovoice methodology, which can be used by the Bañado Sur community and US based activists to raise awareness about who the residents of the Bañado really are. This is a slightly different goal than the most of the published studies that have used Photovoice, so the formula has been adjusted to better fit the needs of this particular project. Some of the initial steps were altered and additional steps were added both for thematic and artistic reasons.

In C. Wang and MA. Burris (1997)'s original description of Photovoice, they lay out a method for conducting a Photovoice project. The first step is to train people on how to use the cameras, give them open ended questions, and have them take pictures. After the pictures are in, begins stages of participatory analysis. First, the community, in a group process, choose the meaningful photos. Then, through group discussions, the community creates the stories and contexts that go along with the photos, and finally, the participants look for connections and codes among the stories.

In this project, the first step was much the same. A team of four Emory researchers brought cheap digital cameras with them, while working and living in Bañado Sur. These were given to ten Bañado community activists ranging in age from mid-teens to early forties. They were each given one to two days in order to take pictures, and their only prompt was to "take pictures of something that is meaningful to you." Most of the activists were digitally literate enough to operate the cameras without training, but technical support was given by the Emory team throughout the project.

The second step is where this project begins to deviate from Wang and Burris. The participants, rather than the Emory based facilitators, did select the images to be used. However,

each participant was asked to select their own 3-7 images. Minimal advice was given as to which shots to choose. The overall goal was simply to find the pictures that each participant liked the best or thought most meaningful in some way. The shift from the more standard methodology represents a desire to capture each individual voice, so that the audience viewing the documentary will get the community in aggregate without losing its sense of diversity.

Third, each individual, rather than the community in aggregate, was interviewed on camera about each of their images – in the storytelling stage. They were shown each image on a screen just outside the camera angle and asked three questions about each of them, "What is in this picture?" "Why did you take it?" "What does it mean to you?" The camera was then left rolling until they stopped talking. With few exceptions, little prompting was offered. Interviewer, cameraman, and participant were all seated.

In the fourth stage, codifying, artistic and logistical concerns drove the shift in methodology. It was the Emory based team that went through the interviews and pull out what would be used in the actual finished product. Part of this is because it took several days of sitting and listening to the interviews repeated, and it would not be reasonable to ask community members to take that much time. It also involved selection criteria other than purely content. The camera focus needed to be right. The audio could not have too much background voice. With those things in mind, clips were selected based on coherence, their ability to standalone, and length. Unlike print, the expectations that viewers have of video is that one does not spend too much time on any one shot, to facilitate this, clips were selected that, as adequately as possible, captured the spirit of what the participant said in a one to three minute clip that held together coherently. Since the whole goal was to capture people's genuine voices, the selection processes pulled out longer clips than a normal documentary.

At stage five, the Photovoice side of the project ended, and it began to proceed like a more standard video documentary. In this stage, additional material was captured and created. The Emory team interviewed the original residents of the Bañado, filmed a protest march and speeches, interviewed key informants such as health researchers and a local priest, created introductory segments that contextualized the piece for audiences unfamiliar with the community, and shot additional material all over the community.

Finally, the film was assembled using Apple Inc.'s Final Cut Pro. The limitation in any video work is that the choices that the editor makes influences how people interpret what is presented on screen. This "hand of the editor" can shift and obscure the original meaning of the participants. While some of this is inevitable, every effort was made, in the editing process, to amplify rather than obscure the participants' meanings and themes.

Chapter 4: Documentary Script

Episode 1: The Good for Nothings

Hector: First, something came out in the press, and one of our representatives, someone who has asked for our help, asked why we were asking for help, asking for food, 'What's up with those men there, why don't they go to work?'"

--[in the background] Because we're good for nothing!

Because we're good for nothing. Yes, we have to say this, [Uru Rubín - Politician] was the one who said this. Someone who was asking for help from the city, its citizens, to take their posts, is now saying that we are good for nothing. They are good for nothings because they're not doing their job. It's not our job, it's theirs: to help people with house, food, guarantee health for the population, it's the state's responsibility, not ours. And there is no reason to call us "good for nothing" if we're the ones who are trying to help our community right now.

Voice Over: Bañado Sur is a community of between 15 and 20 thousand people on the outskirts of Asuncion Paraguay that has experienced and continues to experience significant marginalization. Originally, the now denizens of the Bañado were small farmers in the vast rural stretches of Paraguay referred to as El Campo. However, with the rise of cattle ranching in the 1960s and the huge amount of territory that requires, they were forced off their land and turned into migrant workers. Eventually, they came to Asuncion, Paraguay's capital and largest city looking for work. Once in the city, they were still pushed to the margins living in an unofficial settlement on the flood plane of the Paraguay River next to the city dump. They often used the trash and found materials to fill in parts of the flood plane creating more land. The settlement that was created is Bañado Sur. Some residents of the Bañado have been there for over 60 years and upwards of 3 generations.

Margarita: Here, here for example, here people would walk, there was brush, animals, bugs, pools of water, and now our neighborhood is a paradise, there is life here. There are neighbors, my son was just saying this. Here in the neighborhood we are unified, if someone needs something everyone gets together and has a raffle, a potluck, and helps them get money for what they need. But in other places it's not like that. Here no, anyone gets sick or something, they ask for help and everyone helps out.

Voice Over: Beyond being physically pushed to the margins, Paraguayan society tends to view the residents of Bañado Sur as uneducated, violent, addicted to crack, lazy, and overall good for nothing. The slang used in Paraguay for this is Los Aragones, the good for nothings.

Young Man: Poor people, you can't play with their hopes. I liked what the man over there said earlier, that they say that we're good for nothing, that we're not doing anything. Let's take those people out of their place [of power], there are others who have killed themselves working for the community. Some had sick children, the representatives shouldn't be saying that [that we're 'good for nothing], it's ridiculous. We are here demanding our rights, and our right is not to be called "good for nothing," it's them who haven't lived up to their promises. And we are going to stay here until they do what they've promised.

Voice Over: Many of the following images and interviews come from a Photo Voice project conducted in Bañado Sur. Activists from the community were given digital cameras and asked to take pictures of people, places, and activities in their community that were in some way meaningful to them. They, then, selected their favorite 3-5 images and were interviewed on camera about what was in the image and what made it significant. Thus, the visuals, stories, and themes presented here come from the *people* of Bañado Sur.

(Picture: Man building a house and a street in the center of town)

Lea: This is a picture of downtown Asunción, the capital of Paraguay. With another picture which is the Banado Sur, a man who is making his house of plywood, corrugated iron, a little bit of plastic sheeting, which is a representation of all the houses of the Banado Sur. And the other one is the "Paris" ice cream shop, where, when you're a kid, it's a dream to go to the "Paris" ice cream shop where the ice cream costs 12,000 guaranies for a tiny cup. And there are the houses, which are built well with all the [right] materials. And the cars, and, above anything, no plastic sheeting, nothing thrown around, no garbage. It also represents the two faces of the same coin. The two faces of society. One that the state presents of Asuncion, with its street cleaners, with it's nice conditions, even the wires look much better than they do here in the Banado Sur. On the other hand, the total absence, of waiting, also the winter in Asunción, people with jackets, scarves, people with everything on. And the other is in the Banado Sur, where it doesn't matter if it's hot or cold, if it rains, there's mud or flooding, the people keep working and we see too with this picture that people in the Banado Sur aren't the kind of people that don't want to work or pay their taxes and that's why they come here. It's actually the opposite, the people here pay electricity, water, they sacrifice and keep working.

(Picture: A woman marching with a recycling cart)

Kimberli: This third photo, it gets to my heart, because there is a cart that shows our source of work here in the Banado, recycling. Our friends are going, taking this cart to the Itaguatí Center, we are behind this cart showing our humility, as the people that we are, human beings here. Not like the people say, that we are "mototerros", we have heart, we have feelings. It's not because we want to be poor that we are poor, it's the life that's given to us. And we are fighting against this social injustice. We want for everyone to be on the same level, not to discriminate against

someone if they are poor, not to consider the rich people more. We only demand and ask that we are all considered equal, because we are all human beings.

Voice Over: What Paraguayan society doesn't see is the dangerous, difficult, and tenusous existence that is the Bañado's main industry. Many of the residents make their living picking through the city's trash for items that can be sold as recyclables.

(Picture: Woman put things into a bag)

Fide: We do this recycling every day, it's what gives us our daily bread. It sustains myself and my family. We've been working in this for a long time.

(Picture: Man putting trash into a large bag)

Fide: We began about thirty years ago, my wife and I. Most of the work we do is recycling. This is the work that all of the Bañadenses do here. Practically all of the family works like this, because there is a lot of need right now here, and all there is is to work in recycling. There are a lot of people who don't have work and that live from the recycling we do, the recycling that we get from the downtown. We go and find things near the downtown and bring it here, for a lot of people it's just trash but for us it's a living, with this we feed our family, send our children to study, buy medicine, clothes, shoes, all through the recycling that we do.

Voice Over: The work of processing other people's trash for potential value can often have severe health implications. The community as a whole is put at risk by being constantly surrounded by waste and pollution. The individual recyclers face an increased threat of injury and disease as a function of their work either in sorting through the trash or working on the giant trash piles.

(Picture: Woman standing a group with a cart)

Sonia: This photo shows the work of this woman, who is single. It shows her hard work, she puts a lot of effort into her work for her children. This photo also shows the contamination that there is in the Bañado Sur.

(Picture: Trash pile with a rooster standing on top)

Sonia: This photo is in the same place of the Bañado, in Villa Luján, close to the river. It shows the contamination in the Bañado. Behind the woman's house, they're all taken in the same place, the photos that we have here. There are times when they are at risk, because the contamination and the smell that it produces can make her children sick too.

(Picture: Newspaper clipping held in a hand)

Interviewer: What happened in this photo?"

Gloria: This is my brother and my uncle, when my brother had an accident.

Interviewer: What happened in the accident?

Gloria: My brother was looking there in the trash and a friend of his came and pushed him. It was raining and just then he pushed him and he fell because it was all slippery, right when a tractor was coming.

Interviewer: Your brother…. what is his work?

Gloria: He goes and recycles. The tractor went over him, but didn't see him and went over him, and everyone was telling the driver to get off of him. But the driver didn't hear because it was loud, the tractor was loud and he couldn't hear anything. So the driver ran over him and my uncle went and made him stop and go in reverse. And nobody wanted to touch him because they said he was already dead. And my uncle went and brought a police car and took him away. And everyone said he had already died.

Interviewer: But it wasn't true?

Gloria: No. In the newspapers it said he died. And my mom and everyone were there.

Interviewer: How long ago was this?

Gloria: A long time ago. He's now 27 and it was when he was 17.

Interviewer: 10 years ago.

Gloria: Yes.

Interviewer: And now, what's he doing?

Gloria: Now he's at my house, but he's not ok. Because they should have put plates on the back of his head but couldn't because it was too expensive. So they never put them on and now he has some holes in his head. And sometimes, he's not very well. He doesn't know anything, wants to grab everything…. When I saw him I cried so much, I thought he had already died. My mom was so upset because they told her that. Nobody called, my mom didn't have …???... and no one went with her, everyone thought he had already died. Everyone was crying at my house because they thought he had already died.

Voice Over: Part of what is at issue is the strained relationship between the gov't of Paraguay and the residents of the Bañado. Up until very recently, the gov't refused to recognize the legal existence of the Bañado. They were quite literally off the map. Even now, they do not feel fully recognized by the gov't. For instance, in July of 2013, the Bañado was hit by the worst flooding that it had experienced in decades. Dozens of families were sent fleeing from their homes as the waters rose and forced to live in hastily constructed one-room structures. The perception of the residents was that the gov't did not do enough in Bañado Sur to react to the disaster. Rather, it was the residents, themselves, rallying together to care for their neighbors. Many were so dissatisfied with the lack of gov't response that they took the streets and protested in front of a local gov't office trying to get support for these disaster stricken families. Some of this conflict

stems from the fact that early in the life of the Banado, when residents first started settling there, the land they chose to live on, the floodplain of the river, was considered undesirable. As the city has grown, however, and land has become scarcer, planners and developers have started to look more carefully at all the city's Banados as land that could be recuperated and developed. Proposals such as this one often overlook the people who currently live in informal settlements and officials even argue that resettling the population would improve their living conditions. Despite the struggles that are part of their daily lives, for the residents of Bañado Sur, this is their home. Yet, they don't have a legal claim to the land other than having lived there - for most - all their lives. What they want and feel like they don't have is a voice in determining if and how change will come to their community.

(Picture: Helicopter over the Bañado Sur)

Lea: This is an image of something that shouldn't be. It's a helicopter flying over the Banado Sur, though it shouldn't be there. This is one of the demonstrations that we aren't important to the State, this used to happen before, all of these practicing that they would do over the Rio Paraguay. They don't want to see us here anymore in the Banado Sur. They do this every day on top of our houses, flying over, airplanes too inside the Bañado Sur, because supposedly we aren't on the map. It's also a painful image because, I don't know, we exist and we are here in the Bañado Sur, we don't live in the water. Sometimes we do, with all the flooding, but other times we are here, on our land that our parents and grandparents built. It's been over 60 years since the Bañado was built. The fact that they're doing this to us again is hard, and painful. But this powerlessness of not knowing what to do, of them not recognizing us as Paraguayan citizens is also very powerful for me.

Kimberli: You must work for your community. It is your obligation to work with us, bring us food, help us, not forget about all of us, your neighbors, thanks to us you are where you are. We demand that you respond to us.

(Picture: Luis addressing the crowd.)

Kimberli: This other photo shows people who are mainly from here in the Bañado. One of our friend, who is by the card, is directing, speaking to the group. This day we had a protest where we all went, so he was telling us what we were going to do. This made me feel like we could speak, like we could speak with our peers, that if we organize we can get far. And we demonstrated at this protest that if we work as peers we can go far, that we are only demanding what the law says is our right.

(Picture: A wooden outhouse)

Luis: Here's the bathroom, for example. I took this photo because it was very creative of the people who made it. For example you can see that this one is there in the open, not in a room like many of the bathrooms that you see on TV or in the movies, where someone goes, takes their bath that is near their bedroom and then they go to bed again, refreshed and then they watch TV. Instead, this is very different. It is outside, almost in the street, they enter to do their basic necessities and everything and then they have to go out again, and see the whole horizon of the Bañado. Let's say it's cold, the person still has to go outside and feel that cold, same as when it's hot, it's a bit uncomfortable to go from your room to the bathroom. This is showing that people do these things not because they want to; all the photos that I took show this. Many try to say that poor people do things because they want to even if it doesn't make sense. But this makes sense.

Ña Marisa: We demand to the Emergency administration, which only today went to verify that there are families who have had to leave their homes because of the water. They still haven't verified the entire list that we brought. There isn't food; people are doing everything they can to be able to eat in these locations. We demand that the Emergency administration really treat this as an emergency, something urgent.

[there's some Guaraní here]

We ask the Director, with all due respect…the police want to know who we are, those of us who are here, we are the ones taking responsibility for those who are in need, the families that have had to evacuate their homes.

(Picture: A row of improvised houses)

Lea: This photo represents how people wound up after the flooding, we have floods almost every year, this year has been one of the worst. And we see that the State is absent in these situations, and even moreso in the shelters that are hard to believe anyone can live in, but they're there, trying to overcome it all….

(Picture: Improvised house with water behind it)

Hector: This photo shows especially how people here will wait until the last minute because they don't want to leave their homes. The news has been presenting this, the whole time there's been flooding, the news is saying that people are leaving their homes before the water even reaches them. Why, because they want to receive aid from the state. This photo, I chose it because it shows that this isn't true. This photo refutes this argument that the media is putting forward. This family, although water had completely surrounded their house, and it even started entering a bit on the side, but they stayed there, they resisted leaving until the very last minute.

They said very clearly that if the water entered, it would be very difficult for them to leave their home.

(Picture: House with clothesline, pigs, and water on one side)

Pedro: This photo, I chose it precisely because it hurt me so much because, its showing the woman there, she lives there with her granddaughter, her daughter-in-law, her son, and her husband, but because they have nowhere to go, they are living there in the water, and we can see there is a little water entering their room. There was a group of us, of youth, we were going around to see…and it affected me so much to see how this woman was living. And we were so worried about them, we asked them to please come up to the shelter, we'll build you a house in the shelter, so that at least the daughter-in-law and her child should go sleep there. We were afraid that the child would get sick; we had no idea what she might be able to get from the water. There are lots of animals there, they had maybe 80 pigs, that's why, that was our concern.

(Picture: House frame with water and trash)

Hector: People had to completely take their apart their house, or part of it, to move to somewhere else. I took this photo to show that the help from the government isn't sufficient, they gave some pieces of plywood and corrugated metal to each family. We had to take people's houses apart to build them again in other places, finishing the houses with whatever was left that people had: parts of wood, plywood, in order to finish the houses with the materials that the government had given us but wasn't enough.

(Picture: Two older people sitting in chairs in front of her house)

Sonia: This photo, to me it represents people's perseverance, even when the water has entered into their rooms, they still stayed there. This is what I see, the perseverance of the older people here.

Hector: Precisely this pending work, as part of the assistance that were are demanding, there needs to be some security, for the people here to be able to take care of their families. They need at least the basic conditions so that the water doesn't come back, even if they are on higher land, when the rains come, their homes continue to fill up with water.

Who here is going to let their families go hungry? Is anyone here going to leave their family in the water? Noone's going to leave their family like that. This is why these people are here working on this, because the government isn't doing its job, fulfilling its role.

(Picture: A field with a drainage ditch and a road)

Pedro: This is San Ignacio, where there is a soccer school. I have a soccer school there with 150, 175 kids. From 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, even 16 and 17 years old. And this school, I don't have help from everybody, I just work with my own lungs for these kids. I don't get paid or have a salary or anything, I only do it out of love and care for the kids, I work with them so that they don't get involved in drugs, because here kids get caught up in the sale of drugs. It is for this reason I try to find the way to help them. And I have my wife who helps me with everything that I do.

Narciso: I've been here 50 years, close to where we are now. I was a mason, I worked there first as a helper and then I was in charge, as a contractor. I'm from the neighborhood over there, 20 proyectada and Santa Fe, which was where my mother lived, and then I moved over here.

Interviewer: Why did you move over here?

Narciso: Because my wife was from here. We were poor but we wanted to buy land and a house and everything, so we moved over here.

Sepriana: Here in the weeds…

Narciso: It was all mud, weeds, hills.

Sepriana: There wasn't even water.

Narciso: There wasn't even water. We got water from a well, with our hands. I, over there …we got together with that man over there and another man to put in electricity. Do you remember Joel?

(Picture: A field with a man and two horses)

Fide: We want to recover this space, that helps the kids here a lot, then they could have a space to place sports, to do other activities for the community. This is the only space in the community that is this big. So we are doing this work for the youth, so that they can have a new job and recover this space, we are dedicated to recovering this space again which has been like this for 7 years.

Luis: If we gave the few resources we had to a powerful person and they gave us the resources that they had too, there you could see who is a "good for nothing" and who isn't. If a powerful person came to live here, with the resources we have, not just for a day, when they come 'Aw look at the poor people' and then they wipe their shoes and calmly go home. But if they came to enjoy the good things we have, but also put themselves in our shoes, live here for a month, with the conditions we have, trying to get food every day, trying to bathe in those bathrooms, do their necessities in those bathrooms, and then have to work or study or do whatever they do 100%, and help other people too. To live 100% in the conditions that we live. Then, I think that person would understand why we often have to ask for help.

Episode 2: A Secure Future and Good Reputation

Woman: These kids here are sick. I had a child who was in treatment for 25 days and had two operations and saw Kathy to verify with the people SEN (national emergency assistance organization) and they are still not providing assistance. Only now is help arriving. What can we

do? Do we all have to be under a single tarp? We are 21 families in need but we have only received enough assistance for 5 families. Are we going to all enter in the little tent and sleep on top of one another? And they say they are helping us. It's shameful. What happened to SEN? Everything disappeared. That makes me angry. Not for me, or for my neighbors, but for the children. They don't think about us because they have a roof and air conditioning and heat and will sleep in a warm house. Please think about our children who will be sleeping outside under a tarp in the cold.

Voice Over: Paraguay is a nation of young people. According to the CIA World Fact Book, the median age in Paraguay is 26 years and 47% of the population is under age 25; compared to a median age of 37 years in the United States, with 34% under 25. Although no good statistics are available for Bañado Sur, walking around the neighborhood, one gets the sense that it is even younger than the national average. Given the limited resources of the Bañado, this means that young people in this community often face more than their fair share of health challenges. For instance, a study done on people from Bañado Sur who work as trash pickers found that young people who pick through the trash pile at the city dump were at higher risk than adult trash pickers. They were statistically more likely to come in contact with used syringes and medical waste, more likely to have gotten cut while working on the pile, and less likely to have received any vaccinations.

Dr. Karen Andes: The majority of folks who work that community are trash pickers. So, it means being bent over most of the day. It means reaching into trash, opening bags of trash, reaching in. There are sharp items. There are needles. There are, I would imagine, all kinds of things. You know, there's spoiled food. There is blood. There is everything that people put in trash bags before they throw them away.

Catherine Couper: A lot of the jobs are very physically intensive, especially as far as labor goes. And, so, to have full grown men who are not getting enough nutrition, and a lot of the times if your labor, if your pay is by production, you're really dependent on having energy to kind of get something done throughout the day in order to bring the bread home. And then, because of that, you're seeing certain things like protein get siphoned off more to the males. You have women eating lesser, or you might have things going to older siblings or older bread winners, and then, your children aren't getting as much. It's really kind of a gamble as far as how your divide up the food in the family. It's often not even. I would say that's certainly true.

Dr. Karen Andes: And, I think nutrition is a huge piece of this, and it's not just the developmental nutrition that the very young need. But, it's also questions of how to you work well when you're hungry? How do you study? There are a lot of reports that local families eat very little in the evening. How do they sleep well? If you don't rest well and don't have food in your belly, how do you get up and have energy to put to work or to studying?

Briana Keefe-Oates: I think what I noticed and hear in talking to the professors at Mil Solidarios and my own host family is that it's certainly an issue. People are living from whatever they make that day. So, if they aren't able to earn a lot, then they are not able to eat a lot. And, I think what also happens there that I certainly witnessed is under-nutrition. So, they might have food to fill them up, but It's very little meat, which is a stable in Paraguayan society, a lot of rice, soups, things that don't necessarily have a lot of nutrition in them but might fill someone up. I felt like I saw that people were those things a lot because that's what they could afford.

Catherine Couper: I was living with a family, in particular, that had many members living inside the house, and often times, there were days when food was out on the table. And, there were days when, there just wasn't. And, a lot of the way to suppress hunger was to drink things

like Cosito or Terere or to drink other kind of more highly caffeinated items more to suppress hunger. The fridge was often times empty or might have had one or two items in it. Sometimes, the fridge was broken.

Voice Over: The young people of the Bañado also play into national struggles with sexual and reproductive health. According to Centro Paraguayo de Estudios de Poblacion, the Paraguayan Center for Population Studies, better known as CEPEP – poor urban young women – those who live in urban areas and in poverty - have the highest rates of sexual abuse in the country.

Catherine Couper: The intimate partner violence and lot of other forms of domestic abuse were being rationalized as the source of all of those things was poverty. And, that it was often times the frustration of not having enough to eat, the frustration of being in a job where you are, you know, underemployed, or, you know, things like that. The frustration of poverty, the grind of not having enough, of not being able to meet your needs, not being able to provide for children the way you want to, that a lot of that boils up. And people get frustrated, and they…One gentlemen, actually, he described it as a chain reaction. That you get home and you're angry, and you kick the dog. The dog bites the kid, and the kid yells at the mom, or vice versa. That it's just kind of this vicious cycle of frustration and desperation that explains a lot of why behind why violence happens – especially between people who know each other and love each other.

Voice Over: Teen pregnancy is another important theme that comes up when talking to Bañado community leaders. While there is no data available specifically on the Bañado, the CEPEP study shows that nationally, the pregnancy rate is not decreasing as quickly for teens as it is for older age groups of women. While the national fertility rate in Paraguay fell by almost half between 1987 and 2008, teen pregnancies only fell by roughly one third in that same time period. This means that teenaged girls are now contributing a higher percentage to overall fertility.

Dr. Karen Andes: So, I've done a lot of work in Paraguay on adolescent sexual and reproductive health. And, part of what we've seen, in Banado Sur, is that there is a sense anyway that youth become sexually active earlier. We don't really know. There hasn't been a survey in Banado Sur, so that we could say "Yes, that's the case." There's a sense that adolescents pregnancy is a little more common in the Banado than it is in other parts of the city. This is to be expected, when there's a lack of services and a lack of availability.

Catherine Couper: They definitely, pervasively, recognize, throughout the interviews, we see across the board that they recognize the negative effects of having an unplanned pregnancy or having an "embarazo precos." They definitely see that it is bad because you can't continue going to school, because they realize the social impacts. You can't hang out with your friend anymore. Across the board, all them recognize that. But, then it was interesting, when ask them if they recognized any of the benefits. Some of them named that, you know, your family could help you out with it. Or, some of them said that some girls will become pregnant in order to tie down a boyfriend that they really want to stay with. So, in that sense, there's kind of this double edged sword as far as the way they think about and rationalize becoming pregnant early.

Dr. Karen Andes: And, one of the things that we see pretty frequently is that there is…that people across generations don't know how to talk to each other about this stuff. They don't even really know how to talk to peers about it. But, certainly parents and kids have a lot of difficulties talking to each other even just puberty, just how the body changes and what that means over time. You know, navigating a health adolescence and growing into health young adults is difficult, when you don't have…when you don't sort of understand what the changes are that are happening anyway.

Catherine Couper: I mean, it's an issue everywhere. I feel like, there's always struggles with sexual and reproductive health often times for taboo reasons because people are afraid to talk about it. And, among the Paraguayans, I feel like this is even more so. It's such a conservative society. People just get flustered. They get…They just really react viscerally to the topic. They just can't bring themselves to talk about it with their kids. And, I feel like that's very understandable, but they we're also seeing teen pregnancy. We're seeing kids that are getting STDs without or STIs without knowing what's going on because it's happening before the conversation is occurring.

Brianna Keefe-Oates: The thing that I saw is that people in general might know that they need to use condoms or need to sue birth control. But, one, access to those is not easy, so that does a lot of adolescent pregnancies. A lot of people talk about adolescent pregnancies and abortions, which are illegal in Paraguay. And then what, we also saw is that there is just…because of gender dynamics and cultural expectations, kids tend to start sexual activity fairly early, and they don't receive much education about, you know, why it's important to wait. When I was doing my work, a lot of it focused on how to talk to kids about delaying sexual activity, but also, of course, protecting yourself. And, what we saw is that people are really really interested in kind of the psycho-social aspects. Everybody knew to use a condom or don't have sex that's how you prevent pregnancy, but they were really interested, parents and children, in talking about the psycho-social aspects: what does it mean to have a partner? What does it mean to have respect, I mean, mutual respect? What is love? Kids love, "What is love at first sight?" So, those kind of things that we don't normally touch on, I think, are actually very effective, and the community was very interested in talking about those as a way to improve on sexual health measures.

Voice Over: Many of the following images and interviews come from a Photo Voice project conducted in Bañado Sur. Activists from the community were given digital cameras and asked to take pictures of people, places, and activities in their community that were in some way meaningful to them. They, then, selected their favorite 3-5 images and were interviewed on camera about what was in the image and what made it significant. Thus, the visuals, stories, and themes presented here come from the *people* of Bañado Sur.

(Picture: House in a ditch covered in trash)

Gissela: This is a house made of garbage. It's someone's house. They live under a bridge, they're really poor. They don't have a place to live, because no one helps them. They live in a precarious house. There are a lot of animals there that eat garbage and thrown away clothes. People are unaware, they don't help other human beings. They can't live like this, in a house made of garbage and other people's waste.

(Picture: Boy holding a bathtub)

Sonia: This boy is son of the lady, you can see he is bathing and covering himself with the tub. His bathroom is behind him, but he can't bathe there because the tub is outside. And this day, it was really cold and he was bathing with cold water. They are really poor, they can't even heat the water to bathe. And it's windy, he is bathing in the cold. It made me so angry because he is suffering. I can't even stand to bathe in cold water, even less this child who is suffering there.

(Picture: Cobblestone road with water running through it)

Gissela: This picture is of a street where there is water that gets backed up, breeding mosquitos and creating lots of mud. The motos go past and spray people. The children play in the water, they don't even know what they are doing.

(Picture: Green field with two horses in it)

Fide: This industrial park will affect the ecosystem a lot here in Asuncion. If someone doesn't take this beautiful landscape into consideration, we will be left without a landscape, and without the ecosystem, they will destroy it all just for the benefit of few individuals. We will try to make them listen so they won't build this industrial park here in the Bañado Sur.

(Picture: Ball high above a boy's head)

Luis: The ball is up in the air, and someone enjoys this recreational space that we have in the Bañado. You don't see a plaza here that was put in by the municipality or some government entity so we can benefit from a real recreational space. As for the ball itself, which is not even a brand name, it's not even really a soccer ball, it's a volley ball. There in the background is a little girl with a bike that's for an adult. It's not close to the right size for her age or height. I also see a soccer goal that doesn't even have a net. In the background there is a horse and cart – these are key elements of work here in the Bañado. What calls my attention most is that people still enjoy life, without the knowledge that there could be better places for them and their families. And they still seek – despite everything bad around them – they look for some kind of freedom and ways to enjoy what little they have.

(Pictures: Girl running in front of a house and a fenced in soccer pitch)

Lea: The double image, it's a spontaneous representation of the life of children who can access space for training with grass and a rental field with some open space, green space, where they can spend time, a health space where all children should be. And the other picture is a representation of how cruel and hard it is for a child playing in the Bañado Sur. It's a question of…we know that in this world, in this universe, there are two social classes, and it's a shame. There are those who can access resources and those who can't. And the cruelest part is to see children like us who grew up in the Bañado Sur playing in the mud, in the street, they don't

worry about getting dirty, but when you get to a certain age, you realize that it doesn't have to be this way, and everything is a little messed up.

Voice Over: Despite all the suffering, there is one man who has been leading the fight to improve the lives of the youth in Bañado Sur for nearly two decades. Francisco de Paula Oliva, known locally as Pa'i Oliva, came to Paraguay as a Jesuit missionary in the 1960s but was soon forced to flee to Argentina by the regime of Alfredo Stroessner, Paraguay's long standing military dictator. After the fall of Stroessner and his perpetual martial law in 1989, Pa'i Oliva returned to Paragauay in 1995 and settled in Banado Sur, where he has been working ever since.His organization, Mil Solidarios, provides before and after school classes, tutoring, a focus on character development, and small financial scholarships as an incentive for youth to stay in school and finish their education. He has been a tireless advocate for his adopted community and is an important figure throughout Paraguay.

Roque: We have…lights, a school, a church, a clinic….

Catherine Couper: The very very first time that we went down into the Bañado, and we were driven around by Soria who is now the Director of Mil Solidarios, and she drove us. We were all in this SUV, and we were kind of like going over this very rocky road. And, she was taking us down to Cateura, which is the municipal landfill, and it was just this horizon of trash and recycled goods and squalor – honestly. And, she said to us, "How can the children here really believe in themselves if all that they're looking at, literally, their horizon is trash?" Literally. That image of being in that moment and seeing Cateura and seeing the children that were around there collecting recyclables and your reality was this, your reality was sorting through items in the trash that really stayed with me. What stayed with me for the rest of the time there was that image and a deep and deepening respect for Mil Solidarios and the work that they do with the youth down there – making sure that those circumstances are not…do not overwhelm the youth – like the future that they're trying to pursue.

Pa'i Oliva: I've always worked with university students. When I came back, I wanted to work with the poor in Chacarita, another Bañado. But things were very dangerous, so they wouldn't let me go there. Since we – the Jesuits – had people working in the Bañado, I thought that would best, it was what Paraguay needed most. The Bañado has 16,000 people living here, of whom 14,000 are very very poor. There must be about 500 children who are at risk of becoming mentally handicapped, these are children between one and five years of age who don't drink milk, who have poor nutrition, so their neurons don't develop properly. This is brutal poverty. The first thing is that deep down, every person has a real goodness, but what happens is that this goodness is beaten down by poverty, broken into pieces, but it isn't destroyed. But this goodness, when you see that a person is honored, a person who loves others, it's easier because there's so much need that everyone wants to help, feels the need to help others, there is so much poverty that people have a kind and compassionate heart and wants to help. When a person is honored, when a person has hope, he won't be lost because of these circumstances. So I think that in some ways, the Bañado is like the reserve of goodness and hope, because if you have it there, you will never lose it, because it presents all the human conditions that would make you lose these values.

Voice Over: Pa'i Oliva and Mil Solidarios champion the issues that confront poor and under-represented people in Bañado Sur, and have been instrumental in inspiriting a generation of young activists who have taken up the mantel of fighting for their community.

Brianna Keefe-Oates: The support of Mil Solidarios, of Pa'i, has helped them really actually analyze what their community is and how the outside society treats them, and then, reflect on that and really see how they want to change it. I really think that there's a lot of analysis even from kids that are about "what is the Bañado?," people's rights, how they're perceived, and how they should be perceived, how they

want to be perceived. And, I think a lot of that is fostered from the work that Mil Solidarios does. It encourages people to keep going and keep fighting for those rights.

(Picture: Three boys with one pushing another in the back)

Mathias: In this photo, I want to show that there's not only anguish and pain; there is also happiness, games, fun. But we also can't forget what's happening to the children. They're children. They need to play, in an appropriate place, it's their right, but their right isn't achieved here. It's really hard, many times…when people had to move, very few had any food, but they shared. Even though they had very little, they shared. It doesn't matter that they have little food, they still shared. Because these are not bad people. They are not people who are seeing things for the first time. They are people who are kind, and they are trying to survive, for the good of their families, for the good of their children. They are constantly struggling, so that these same children, when they decide to move ahead, they can become good people. Because it's not just thieves and drug addicts in this place. There are people who fight for the good of the children. There are people who help each other, who give what they don't have so the children can have a better future. And this is what we will always live. We will do the impossible so that some day, these children can say, "I come from the Bañado Sur, I was born there, I grew up there, I live there, and I will continue to live there."

(Picture: Three people marching with protest signs)

Kimberli: In this photo, there are three people carrying three signs. Each sign says something different, for instance, one says, "The Bañado is fighting back," another says "Solutions now," and "We Demand Answers," and these three sayings are the ones that we're using the most right now, because we're not ignorant just because we're from the Bañado, and things don't have to be this way. They need to give us the same attention that they would give to anyone else. They can't just walk all over us, we demand our rights. We are poor, but humble. We fight every day

for our bread, to be able to support our parents, our friends, our brothers fight every day, to support their families.

It's hard, the discrimination that we face outside the Bañado. They discriminate against you because you're from "down below," from the Bañado, and it hurts. Its happened to me, and it hurt me so much, and I felt so humiliated because I was from the Bañado, but I have to fight to help change this reality, and this is in our hands. We're from down below, so we have to fight to be able to go far in our lives, and one day, we'll know that we changed the Bañado Sur ourselves, from the inside, that we were able to change the Bañado without the help of those who in power who came to fight with us.

(Picture: Boy sleeping with his head rested on a pile of objects)

Mathias: This is one of the most enthusiastic kids I have ever known, you already saw him in the previous picture, with his brother. It surprises me sometimes…. Children sometimes don't understand what's happening in the world, almost like the animals. They're unaffected by the suffering, by the greed and avarice of others. It's important to know that children, even though they're in a rotten place, they will never stop being children. Just because they live in a marginalized neighborhood doesn't mean that they're marginal. Just because they live among drug addicts doesn't make them drug addicts. They're children. This is what the politicians don't understand, they don't understand. They think that where you live defines you, and that's not true. It's frustrating that many people who live "up above," and the politicians, earn more than 35,000,000 Guaraníes but they can't send 500,000 Guaraníes here. When the politicians come here, they give away toys that don't last even one day in order to buy votes. But this isn't our problem anymore. People need to realize that it's enough. Not only for their own good, not to fight for themselves, but to fight for their children, for their future. This is going to be our

priority. This is the priority of all of the youth in the Bañado – to allow the children to have what we didn't have – which is a secure future and a good reputation.

Voice Over: Overall, life in Banado Sur is a carefully balanced tension of extremes. On the one hand, there is great poverty, suffering, and struggle. And, still, on the other hand, Banado life is alive with community, solidarity, and above all – hope. From a landscape dominated by water and other people's trash comes a vibrant community that stands up for itself. To close, however, the final word belongs to the community

Ña Marisa: We live here in the Bañado, that's why we want – why we demand development here. We don't want an industrial park destroying our two islands, which are the green spaces of the Bañado Sur. The islands should be declared a natural area; it is the green space of the Bañado Sur. And they want to destroy these natural islands in order to build buildings and earn money. And we will have to leave our places here in the Bañado. The first settlers of the Bañado, they the built it up by sheer will with their neighbors. They started neighborhood associations that laid cobblestones, paved the roads, build bridges to cross the drainage ditches, built schools and churches. All of this, we want all of this to remain here - our reality and our lives – in the Bañado. We want the future to bring development for everyone, especially for the youth who don't have work, for the children who need a good education, and we want the state to be present.

Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations

What leaps out from the participants is a profound sense of marginalization. The cries that they do not feel recognized or that they are subjected to unfair monikers serves almost as a refrain throughout the entire piece. These are certainly over-arching structural issues, and while Public Health works on the population level, it is often easier to ignore the truly intractable social issues in favor of single disease focus interventions.

One of the ways that the community experiences marginalization, as they consistently described in the film, is being surrounded by water and trash. For outsiders and the community alike, this is the Bañado's most silent visual characteristic. The community sits the shadow of a mountain of trash, in the form of the city dump. The streets are constantly choked with mud, running water, and litter. The area surrounding many people's homes are also filled with trash because they make their living sorting through it. Sitting in the flood plain of the river, even when it is not flooding, life is generally damp. They are also downriver from the rest of the city, so whatever goes into the river upstream, ends up in Bañado Sur.

This connects in the work of a Christian theologian, Steve de Gruchy. In de Gruchy (2009), he looks at the link between sewage, water, and poverty – making the point that humanity's lack of environmental care is born first by people living on the margins. He is trying to resolve the seeming tension that social justice, the care for marginalized people, and environmentalism, the care for the planet, are separate fields. In de Gruchy's argument, developing and developed societies' familiar to care for marginalized people is connected to its familiar to care for the planet and vice versa. As he phrases it, "Rather than just a brown agenda that focuses on poverty, or a green agenda that focuses on the environment, we need an olive agenda that blends both and finds a new way of being human that recognizes that the earth does

not belong to us but that we belong to the earth" (de Gruchy 2009, p. 58). As theologians are then apt to do, he proposes a utopic vision were societies hold people and spaces in a common sense of care.

Yet, despite the utopic nature of this idea, it rings true with what the reality in which the participants of this project live. The Spanish word bañado can be translated as wetland, which since Bañado Sur was literally built on top of a marsh, is probably the operative translation in this case. However, it seems oddly appropriate that bañado can also be translated as chamber pot. In most cases, the fact that Asuncion is developing can be considered a good thing. Paraguay, as a country, is small and generally poor. The slow transformation of its capital, on a macro scale, is something to be desired. The fact still remains that as Asuncion develops, the residents of Bañado Sur live increasingly in the city's waste and risk losing their homes to further development. The basal aspect of the activist's argument, just like de Gruchy, is that Asuncion's development hold the land and the people of Bañado Sur in common care. Periodically, they hear rhetoric to that exact end but seldom see any actual results that they can trust.

Marginalization was also not the whole story that the participants shared. They also spoke of and to an abiding hope. It's most prescient representation is the consistent tone of fighting back and seeking a better life for the community. Activism is an inherently optimistic exercise. They may be dissatisfied with the way things are, but they have even of a sense that a better reality can exist that they fight for it.

The literature on youth psychological development speaks of this power of hope to do real work in a community. Callina, et al (2014) summarizes the literature in this way, "Such work has found robust associations between hope, conceptualized as emotions and cognitions that energize behavior in the directions of future goals and various aspects of youth thriving"

(Callina, et al 2014, p. 869). These hopeful future expectations (HFEs) are linked to the six Cs of positive youth development (PYD) – competence, confidence, character, connection, caring, and contribution. Of particular importance here is this last one, contribution. Having hope increases the likelihood that a youth will contribute to her or his society, but this hope does not arise in a vacuum. The literature sees an intimate link between a youth's context and the presence of hope. Specially,

> Hope theory identifies hope is a key individual strength that contributes to the agency of the individual in successfully regulating his or her relations with the context. As such, we expect that hope develops in a dynamic relationship with various aspects of the context and in turn, plays an important role in the nature of the relations between the individual and his or her environment. (Callina, et al 2014, p. 870)

This is somewhat a cycle. Hope, in youth, grows out of a context because hope has the ability to promote well-being and action towards collective goals. There is a virtuous cycle where the presence of hope forms youth who can make a contribution, which then is itself a source of hope.

In this way, hope and solidarity are the Bañado's greatest resource. Despite the harsh conditions, the residents share strong community bonds. They, also, have seen positive change. This is certainly one of Mil Solarios and Pa'i Oliva's greatest contributions. The impact that they make have helped to form these young activists and imbue them with hope. In addition, older residents have seen a time when the Bañado was in much worse shape than it is now, when it was truly the wilderness with no running water, roads, churches, or electricity. For both young and old, there is a reservoir of experience that maintains the dynamic relationship between hope and context and enables hopeful youth to make their own contribution.

From a researcher's perspective, this was project was a lesson in what Paulo Friere (1970) calls "generative themes." This is key to his problem-posing education that an animator, the phrase Friere used instead of facilitator, must help the community find an issue that strikes a chord with them, rather than imposing an issue for the community to work on. The first eight weeks that the Emory team spent in Bañado Sur was spent researching sexual and reproductive health interventions targeting both youth and families. The community was certainly supportive of the work and sees particularly teens as an important issue. However, when the flood hit in mid-July of 2013, and the team shifted to working on the Photovoice project, the work took on an entirely different character. This letting the community set the script and the path for investigation brought about a much greater connection between the research team and the community. They were clearly more interested in talking about marginalization as what they felt drove their various struggles. For them, this is what was generative.

Thus, the strength of this project is participating in an important aspect of Public Health that the community is deeply interesting in pursuing. It is neither the start nor the end to the fight against marginalization in Bañado Sur, but it is an important attempt at participation that could prove meaningful. It takes seriously Public Health's socially determined nature and a ground-up emic perspective.

There are two major limitations of this project that need to be addressed. First, as the Emory team did a large percentage of the filming, selected the clips, and did the editing/assembly work, the project is not truly emic and allows an element of voyeurism to creep into the mix. On a level, this is a valid concern, the clip selection and editing was somewhat a logistical choice based on how much time those tasks take and how long the team had left in the country. In an ideal world, the Emory team could have trained interested community members in

how to select clips and edit, but the three week timeline for the in Paraguay part of this project simply did not allow for it.

In addition, significant effort was made to maximize the emic perspective and minimize the voyeurism. All the selected clips were shown to the participants and other community members at the end of the three weeks in August 2013. They approved of what was shown and of the basic grouping of the clips. It was the participants themselves who selected the photos. The interview questions and prompting were kept to a minimum, and in selection and editing, longer clips that the represent a greater percentage of the actual interview than is normal in documentary filmmaking were used. All of these pieces were in order to keep what the audience sees as the final product as emic as was logistically feasible.

Addressing the issue of voyeurism, the Emory team lived in the community for a total of eleven weeks. At the end of every day of the project, team members stayed with Bañado families. Eleven weeks is not enough time to move completely from outsider to insider, but it did make the Emory team well known and recognized outsiders rather than people who simply came in, shot some video, and left. Whenever one is pointing a camera at another person who is living out their daily life, there is an element of voyeurism. However, in being well known for weeks before starting filming, and generally, having another member of the community present for the shooting of additional footage, this was kept close to a minimum.

The other key limitation is that the work itself took so long, almost two years, that the state of the Bañado is not what it was at time of filming. Floods hit again in 2014, but they were even worse than the 2013 floods discussed in this project. Some estimate that around 90% of the Bañado residents had to flee, and it is not entirely clear how many have returned. This does not take away from the sentiments expressed, but it does make the piece immediately recognizable

as behind the times, and if the project was being done now, the particulars expressed might be vastly different.

Given that, a recommendation for further study is to go back to Bañado Sur, now two years later, and seek to have an emic discourse again. As this is about capturing and amplifying voices, a key variable has shifted already – time. It is important to understand how an even worse round of flooding have changed the community's perspective.

References

Bader, R., et al. (2007). Global Youth Voices: Engaging Bedouin Youth in Health Promotion in the Middle East. *Canadian Journal of Public Health 98*(1), 21-5.

Berbes-Blazquez, M. A. (2012). Participatory Assessment of Ecosystem Services and Human Wellbeing in Rural Costa Rica Using Photo-Voice. *Enivronmental Management 49,* 862-75.

Callina, K. S., et al. (2014). Hope in Context: Developmental Profiles of Trust, Hopeful Future Expectations, and Civic Engagement Across Adolescence. *Journal of Youth Adolescence, 43*. 869-83.

Candia Baeza, D. (2005). Metas del Milenio y tugurios: una metodología utilizando datos censuales. *Serie Población y Desarrollo 63*. Centro Latinoamericano y Caribeño de Demografía (CELADE), División de Población. http://www.eclac.org/publicaciones/xml/2/25972/lcl2456-P_1.pdf, accessed 4/22/2015.

Carlson, E. D., et al. (2006). Photovoice as a Social Process of Critical Consciousness. *Qualitative Health Research, 16*(6), 836-52.

Cunningham, R. N., et al. (2012). Hazards faced by informal recyclers in the squatter communities of Asuncion, Paraguay. *International Journal of Occupational and Environmental Health, 18*(3). 181-7.

de Gruchy, S. (2009). Dealing with our Own Sewage: Spirituality and Ethics in the Sustainability Agenda. *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa, 134.* 53-65.

Hofrichter, R. (2010). Tackling Health Inequalities: A Framework for Public Health Practice. In R. Hofrichter and R. Bhatia (Eds.), Tacking Inequalities through Public Health Practice (3-19). New York: Oxford University Press.

Hope, A, and Timmel, S. (1984). *Training for Transformation: A Handbook for Community Workers, Book I.* London: ITDG Publishing.

Kramer, L, et al. (2013). Using Photovoice as a Participatory Evaluation Tool in Kaiser Permanente's Community Health Initiative. *Health Promotion Practice 14*(5), 686-94.

Moletsane, R., et al. (2007). Photo-voice as a tool for analysis and activism in response to HIV and AIDS stigmatization in a rural KwaZulu-Natal school. *Journal of Child and Adolescent Mental Health 19*(1), 19-28.

Oliva, Francisco de Paula. (2007). Narratives: Francisco de Paula Oliva SJ, Asunción, Paraguay. Jesuits and Partners together for Justice. Social Justice Secretariat. http://www.sjweb.info/sjs/headlines/newsShow.cfm?PubTextID=8252, accessed 4/22/2015.

Satcher, D. (2010). Include a Social Determiants of Health Approach to Reduce Health Inequities. *Public Health Reports, 125*(Supplement 4), 5-6.

Wang, C. and Burris, M. A. (1997). Photovoice: Concept, Methodology, and Use for Participatory Needs Assessment. *Health Education & Behavior 24*(3), 369-87.

Wilson, N., et al. (2007). Engaging Young Adolescents in Social Action Through Photovoice: The Youth Enpowerment Strategies (YES!) Project. *Journal of Early Adolescence 27*(2), 241-61.

World Health Organization. (2008). *Closing the gap in a generation: health equity through action on the social determinants of health.* Retrieved from http://www.who .int/social_determinants/th

Yanos, P. T., et al. (2014). Interventions Targeting Mental Health Self-Stigma: A Review and Comparison. *Psychiatric Rehabilitation Journal,* 1-8.

Zibechi, R. (2008). Bañados de Asunción: La Potencia de la Comunidad. Centre Tricontinental (CETRI). www.cetri.be/spip.php?article758 accessed 4/22/2015.