Distribution Agreement
In presenting this thesis as a partial fulfillment of the requirements for a degree from Emory University, I hereby grant to Emory University and its agents the non-exclusive license to archive, make accessible, and display my thesis in whole or in part in all forms of media, now or hereafter now, including display on the world Wide Web. I understand that I may select some access restrictions as part of the online submission of this thesis. I retain all ownership rights to the copyright of the thesis. I also retain the right to use in future works (such as articles or books) all or part of this thesis.

Ryan A. Sutherland April 12th, 2016

Gamelan is in Our Blood.
From Imitation to Internalization: How Appropriation and Assimilation of the "Other" Have Defined Impressionism and Minimalism

by

Ryan A. Sutherland

Dr. Meredith Schweig, PhD
Adviser

Music Department

Dr. Meredith Schweig, PhD
Adviser

Dr. Lynn Wood Bertrand, PhD
Committee Member

Dr. Gray Crouse, PhD
Committee Member

2016

Gamelan is in Our Blood.
From Imitation to Internalization: How Appropriation and Assimilation of the "Other" Have Defined Impressionism and Minimalism

By

Ryan A. Sutherland

Dr. Meredith Schweig, PhD
Adviser

An abstract of
a thesis submitted to the Faculty of Emory College of Arts and Sciences
of Emory University in partial fulfillment
of the requirements of the degree of
Bachelor of Arts with Honors

Music Department

2016

Abstract

Gamelan is in Our Blood.
From Imitation to Internalization: How Appropriation and Assimilation of the "Other" Have Defined Impressionism and Minimalism

By Ryan A. Sutherland

This thesis argues that the gamelan has played a central role in creating a Western musical culture that seeks hybridity with non-Western musics as a means of creating novel soundscapes. I aim to augment the existing corpus of research concerning the influence of the Balinese and Javanese gamelan on contemporary Western art music and on the development of musical modernism, highlighting how hybrid aesthetics have come to not only influence but ultimately define many modern soundscapes. Composers whose works were influenced by the gamelan, such as Debussy, Bartók, Partch, Britten, and others, heralded the advent of modernism and signaled the end of the Common Practice era, emerging stylistically from beneath the shadow of Romanticism. And the influence of the gamelan on Western music is still evident today: its impact is palpable in the minimalist writing of composer Philip Glass, the intricate percussion compositions by set-theorist Iannis Xenakis, and in a variety of new-age ambient, punk, and electronica albums. Thus, this thesis provides a broad-based analysis of the widespread impact the gamelan has had and continues to have on composers, specifically highlighting the movements of Impressionism and Minimalism by analyzing pieces by Claude Debussy and Steve Reich, among others. Global interest in the genre known as "world music" has further popularized the gamelan sound, yet the rich local history and syncretic religious practices associated with this musical lineage remain largely unknown outside academic circles. And even within academic circles the relevance of the gamelan is often questioned. Thus, the significance of this project is multifaceted: it will serve to inform about the impact that Balinese and Javanese gamelan traditions have had on the stylistic development of contemporary Western music, on the establishment of the field of applied ethnomusicology, and on the creation and popularization of the world music genre and its offshoots among global audiences, and will establish an archive of gamelan *karawitan* (traditional repertoire). Furthermore, this thesis will draw on a wide array of interdisciplinary research, citing anthropologists, ethnographers, historians, ethnomusicologists and musicians, and will record cross-cultural perspectives, discussing themes of appropriation, historical practice, and notions of musical change and development.

Gamelan is in Our Blood.
From Imitation to Internalization: How Appropriation and Assimilation of the “Other” Have Defined Impressionism and Minimalism

By

Ryan A. Sutherland

Dr. Meredith Schweig, PhD
Adviser

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Emory College of Arts and Sciences
of Emory University in partial fulfillment
of the requirements of the degree of
Bachelor of Arts with Honors

Music Department

2016

Acknowledgements.

This thesis represents a labor of love. My interest in gamelan began in 2013 after a lecture in Music 204W "Music Cultures of the World" with Dr. Elizabeth Clendinning. After learning about this musiculture and touring the gamelan room as a student in this class, I decided to join the ensemble. And this decision has been the single most rewarding one I've made in my entire life. I consider Professor Clendinning to be the "Mother of the Gamelan" at Emory University and am honored to consider her a close personal friend and mentor — she revitalized the group in 2013 (the year I joined the ensemble), and was instrumental in reopening the ensemble to the community, coordinating its official naming celebration, and for bringing Pak Madé to this campus. For her, I am deeply grateful. Without her encouragement, I doubt the idea for an honors thesis in ethnomusicology would have even crossed my mind.

I must also thank my adviser, Dr. Meredith Schweig, for her countless hours of support and her thoughtful revisions. Her guidance has helped me clarify the *balungan* of this project, its central melody, giving it life. She graciously invited me to lecture in her classes, MUS 200 "Music, Culture and Societies" and MUS 204W "Music Cultures of the world," opportunities which helped me greatly in refining my topic. I could not have completed this project without her support. I thank my committee, Dr. Lynn Bertrand in the Department of Music and Dr. Gray Crouse in the Department of Biology, and also offer my sincerest gratitude to Joyce Clinkscales, Courtney Chartier and John Bence for helping me establish the gamelan archive at Emory University.

Furthermore, I am grateful to Dr. S.C. Wang and Dr. J.C. Wang of Northern Illinois University for their generosity and inspiration. Both have helped me to define my thesis topic, hosted me at NIU, and led the "Experiencing the Arts in Bali" study abroad to Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia. I will never forget their kindness and encouragement. I wish to thank the other participants on this study abroad for their friendship as well as Dr. Jeremy Grimshaw and Tate Grimshaw whom I met at Pak Madé's compound in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia.

I offer my sincerest appreciation to Pak Midiyanto. and to Pak I Madé Lasmawan and his direct family, Bu Ketut Marni, Aji, Ade, and Putu, Tara Hatfield, as well as Pak Madé's family in Baturiti, Bali and the Baturiti men's gamelan group who graciously allowed me to perform with them on selonding, angklung and kebyar at the Ngeratep Ratu Sakti odalan temple ceremony at Pura Pucak Luhur Padang Dawa, a ceremonial blessing of the Nawa Sanga, and sit in on several of their practices. Pak Madé and Bu Ketut gave me countless hours of invaluable instruction in Balinese dance and Javanese and Balinese Gamelan. To them, I say "terima kasih" from the bottom of my heart.

To all of my friends at Emory who have come to my performances, offered their ears to listen to my ideas, and their hugs when I was at wits' end — thank you. I specifically wish to thank Rob Dunn, Bennett Kane, Wyatt Kane, Nick Perry, Gracelyn Miller, Madeline Drace, Michael Van Ginkel, and Rebecca Leff for their reassurances through this process.

But even before my encounter with the gamelan, this topic has been beating in my chest, waiting for the right moment to come to life. At the encouragement of my piano teacher, Sally Robinson, I first played Debussy's *Arabesque No. 1* when I was 13 years old. And my love for his music has never left me. The first time I heard Reich's *Music for 18 Musicians* was just as poignant and memorable.

Above all, I thank my mother for instilling in me a love of music at an early age and my father for never missing one of my many music performances. I also thank my grandmother for supplying her wisdom and praise. At this point, I presume they know just as much about the gamelan and appropriation as I do considering how many times they selflessly lent their ears (at ungodly hours) to listen to me discuss my project.

Finally, I must thank the members of the Emory Gamelan ensemble, specifically Claire Marie-Hefner and Neil Fried, as well as the gamelan itself. Thank you *Paksi Kencono* — and Vishnu, Brahma, and Siva — for giving me good *taksu* through the years.

Om Swastiastu,

R.S.

Table of Contents.

Introduction 1
Relevant Terminology and Discussions 3
Methodology 39
The Javanese and Balinese Gamelan 63
Satie, Debussy, and Stravinsky: Impressionism and Neoclassicism 99
Reich, Glass, and Górecki: Aesthetic and Holy Minimalism 160
Conclusion 212
Bibliography 222

There used to be — indeed, despite the troubles that civilization has brought, there still are — some wonderful peoples who learn music as easily as one learns to breathe. Their school consists of the eternal rhythm of the sea, the wind in the leaves, and a thousand other tiny noises, which they listen to with great care, without ever having consulted any of those dubious treatises. Their traditions are preserved only in ancient songs, sometimes involving dance, to which each individual adds his own contribution century by century. Thus Javanese music obeys laws of counterpoint which make Palestrina seem like child's play. And if one listens to it without being prejudiced by one's European ears, one will find a percussive charm that forces one to admit that our own music is not much more than a barbarous kind of noise more fit for a traveling circus.

— Claude Debussy

Introduction.

This thesis argues that the gamelan has played a central role in creating a Western musical culture that seeks hybridity with non-Western musics as a means of creating novel soundscapes. I aim to augment the existing corpus of research concerning the influence of the Balinese and Javanese gamelan on contemporary Western art music and on the development of musical modernism, highlighting how hybrid aesthetics have come to not only influence but ultimately define many modern soundscapes. Composers whose works were influenced by the gamelan, such as Debussy, Bartók, Partch, Britten, and others, heralded the advent of modernism and signaled the end of the Common Practice era, emerging stylistically from beneath the shadow of Romanticism. And the influence of the gamelan on Western music is still evident today: its impact is palpable in the minimalist writing of composer Philip Glass, the intricate percussion compositions by set-theorist Iannis Xenakis, and in a variety of new-age ambient, punk, and electronica albums. Thus, this thesis provides a broad-based analysis of the widespread impact the gamelan has had and continues to have on composers, specifically highlighting the movements of Impressionism and Minimalism by analyzing pieces by Claude Debussy and Steve Reich, among others. Global interest in the genre known as "world music" has further popularized the gamelan sound, yet the rich local history and syncretic religious practices associated with this musical lineage remain largely unknown outside academic circles. And even within academic circles the relevance of the gamelan is often questioned. Thus, the significance of this project is multifaceted: it will serve to inform about the impact that Balinese and Javanese gamelan traditions have had on the stylistic development of contemporary Western music, on the establishment of the field of applied

ethnomusicology, and on the creation and popularization of the world music genre and its offshoots among global audiences. Furthermore, this thesis will draw on a wide array of interdisciplinary research, citing anthropologists, ethnographers, historians, ethnomusicologists and musicians, and will record cross-cultural perspectives, discussing themes of appropriation, historical practice, and notions of musical change and development.

Relevant Terminology and Discussions.

It is impossible to begin a discussion of traditional music without featuring some discussion of the culture that produced it, its context. The relationship of culture to the sounds and music that are produced by it and strengthen it are central objects of ethnomusicological inquiry. Before proceeding with a discussion of cultural context of this traditional music, it is critical to explore how culture, context, and tradition are defined and operationalized within this thesis. Subsequently, I will discuss the important role that gamelan has served in the development of the field of ethnomusicology, and will outline how Western constructs of orientalism, exoticism, and the "other" have peripheralized it (and other musicultures), preventing it from being viewed as centrally important to the establishment of Western modernism. Furthermore, I will explicate my use of the term "appropriation," one that is featured prominently within this work, taking care to separate it from similar yet distinct terms such as sampling, citation, etc., and will briefly examine a concept that goes hand-in-hand with it: ownership. Although I do not wish this chapter to be exhaustive in its analysis nor entirely obsessed with semantics, it is important for an ethnomusicology paper to vet terminology on the basis of its utility in future arguments and for its ability to add clarity to forthcoming conclusions.

I agree most with Edward Tylor's 1871 definition of culture: "that complex whole which includes knowledge, belief, art, law, morals, custom, and any other capabilities and habits acquired by man as a member of society."[1] This definition is broad, but not infinitely so. With this definition in mind, the assertion that music and culture are inseparable seems plausible, even intuitive. But can this be so? Music is not a collection

---

[1] Tylor, Edward. *Primitive Culture: Researches into the Development of Mythology, Philosophy, Religion, Art and Custom.* New York: J. P. Putnam's Sons, 1871. Vol. 1, 1. Print.

of meaningless sounds, but is meaningful within the societies or imagined communities of the culture from which it arises. It follows logically that since each of us are products of culture, our music should be as well. Therefore, intentionality and the ascription of meaning separates "sound" from "music." Cultures imbue music with meaning. And music, as a product of culture, can serve as a lens through which the careful researcher may investigate how individuals think and behave by viewing how these thoughts and behaviors manifest in musical form (i.e. music can enable us to understand how a culture operates because it is, as has previously been asserted, a cultural phenomenon).

Cultural context, however, is an ever-evolving backdrop that is never immune to influence from within or externally. So important is cultural context to the study of ethnic music that the Society of Ethnomusicology (SEM) includes it in the first sentence of its lengthy definition of "ethnomusicology": "the study of music in its cultural context. Ethnomusicologists approach music as a social process in order to understand not only what music is but why it is: what music means to its practitioners and audiences, and how those meanings are conveyed."[2] Music is therefore shaped by its cultural context. My favorite definition is attributable to Thomas Turino who describes context as "an ever-expanding series of concentric rings with pathways that cross and connect them,"[3] a definition that holds especially true when considering the impact of religious and colonial influences on the refinement of gamelan theory and performance practices, influences that have not only left their mark on Javanese and Balinese history and their music but have also served as pathways through which this music has been introduced to the world.

---

[2] "What Is Ethnomusicology?" *Society for Ethnomusicology*. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Also found within Nettl, Bruno. "Contemplating the Musics of the World." The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-three Discussions. Urbana, Chicago and Springfield: U of Illinois, 2015. 6. Print.

[3] Blum, Stephen. "Commentary." *Ethnomusicology* 34.3 (1990): 413. Web. Found within the "Response to Symposium papers" section of *Ethnomusicology.*

Furthermore, varying delineations exist concerning the classification of "traditional" musical styles and practices. Is gamelan traditional? More broadly, what makes a music traditional? Its location of origin? Its history? Its performers? This ambiguity in classifying "traditional" music bespeaks the inherent difficulty associated with the establishment of musical genres and the characterization of music styles for non-Western music. Often, characterization of music as "traditional," "aboriginal," "native," "primitive," etc., as well as the converse classification (i.e. what is not "traditional"), has historically been left up to the Western academic and consumer, a privilege that has proved problematic in the past and remains problematic today. One must ask: in this increasingly globalized and modernized world, do traditional musics still exist? Speaking of the effects of globalization on musical traditions and the relative ease by which the ethnic musics are ferried across the world as a result of modern technological innovation, Carl Rahkonen observes that

> in the past, hardy explorers traveled to 'exotic' locations and discovered different lifestyles, customs, beliefs and musics. These musics were largely 'home grown' and reflected their various indigenous cultures. Later, worldwide systems of transportation and communication broke down the isolation of these cultures and exposed them to new ideas and new music. As long as humans have inhabited the planet, they have been exposed to the processes of acculturation, assimilation and exchange of information, but in the present world this exchange takes place almost instantaneously. Multi-national record companies release and promote music globally.[4]

Informed by similar observations to Rahkonen's, Stuart Hall's global post-modern philosophy states that as cultural identities become increasingly globalized, the vast diaspora and assimilation of musical ideas cross-culturally has made it even more

---

[4] Rahkonen, Carl. "What is World Music?" *World Music in Music Libraries*. Technical Report No. 24. Canton, MA: Music Library Association, December 1994. 13 March 2016. Web.

difficult to distinguish one musical tradition from another; yet, although subtle in some cases, distinctions can be made.[5] In order to make these distinctions and to prove that traditional music still exists and warrants investigation, we must venture at a definition.

According to Lionel Trilling and Charles Taylor, music is classified as "traditional" on the basis of its perceived authenticity: "in music … [authenticity] is an assumption of original, untainted ways of musicking and sounding."[6] While this is a useful definition, it has its limitations. Taylor and Trilling's view of authenticity is, as they mention, an "assumption" of origin and use. And as I have addressed above, usually the Western academic is the individual who has the power and privilege to carefully (or sometimes carelessly) assume. Furthermore, this definition leads the reader to believe that "tradition" is an inflexible ("untainted") construct, that there can be no evolution of traditional styles beneath the umbrella of "authenticity." But gamelan in Bali has changed markedly over the centuries, evolving from the reserved, simple melodies of the 14th century to the flashing timbres of the *gong kebyar* that are heard today. Changes in the construction of the instruments, the addition of new instruments to the ensemble, and the development of new, more complex *pathets* (scales) document this evolution.[7] And yet both styles — old and new — are considered traditional and authentic (at least when played by Indonesian musicians) by most standards, including my own. The *gong kebyar* is part and parcel of the living tradition of gamelan, an evolving tradition that continues to diverge from its ancient roots but yet remains loyal enough to them to retain the designation of "traditional." And considering the impossibility that any art arose in

---

[5] Taylor, Timothy Dean. *Global Pop: World Music, world Markets*. New York: Routledge, 1997. p. xv, 5. Print.
[6] Ibid. 21.
[7] Nettl, Bruno. "A Modern Form of Dance and Music: Kebyar." *Excursions in World Music*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1997. 180. Print.

solitude, completely immune from the creative influences of its predecessors and peers, the term "untainted" in Taylor and Trilling's definition seems inappropriate to use as a qualifier. Gamelan is itself a cultural hybrid, obviously "tainted" (i.e. changed) by its interaction with neighboring cultures: ethnographic records show that it descended from Hindustani, Chinese, and Middle Eastern musics and was deeply infused with the musical languages of indigenous peoples living in the Indonesian archipelago.[8] In fact, as I will argue later, musical modernization in the West has historically resulted from engagement in hybridity resulting from interactions with and subsequent incorporation of sounds authored by musical "others," a process that has been expedited by new technological innovations and globalization. Henry Johnson's 2002 article "Balinese Music, Tourism and Globalization: Inventing Traditions within and Across Cultures" (with a cleverly titled introduction: "GloBALIsation: Locating Bali and Balinese Music") states:

> Globalisation in recent years has provided a means by which Balinese music has been transported around the globe in various ways and for a number of different reasons. While early western observations of gamelan were described by Sir Francis Drake in 1590, more recently it was the nineteenth- and early twentieth-century travellers who did much to increase awareness of Bali to Europeans. Such western composers as Claude Debussy (1862-1918), Colin McPhee (1900-1964), Benjamin Britten (1913-1976), Olivier Messaien (1908-1992), John Cage (1912-1992), Steve Reich (b 1936), and Lou Harrison (b 1917) have each been inspired and influenced by gamelan music in one way or another.[9]

[8] Koskoff, Ellen. "Java." *The Concise Garland Encyclopedia of World Music*. New York: Routledge, 2008. 1331. Print.

[9] Johnson, Henry. "Balinese Music, Tourism and Globalization: Inventing Traditions within and Across Cultures." *New Zealand Journal of Asian Studies*. 4.2 (2002): 8-32. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Often, these cross-cultural interactions have "tainted" both the non-Western and Western source material, collisions that yield new genres, techniques and compositional approaches that cultivate new musical movements.

Returning to Taylor and Trilling's interpretation of tradition as a product of perceived authenticity, we must now question the relationship between "tradition" and "authenticity." Is traditional music always authentic, and vice versa? If we reframe this question to more precisely relate to the thesis of this essay, can traditional Indonesian gamelan performed by a Western musician ever be considered "authentic" if the performer carefully honors traditional performance practices and respects the ritual significance of this music? Can this music truly be classified as "traditional" if performed by cultural outsiders, detached from ritual and removed from its place of origin? In a article entitled "What is Gained, and Lost, when Indonesian gamelan music is Americanized?" (written by Amelia Mason), Jody Diamond, esteemed ethnomusicologist and the director of the gamelan ensembles at both Dartmouth and Harvard muses this issue: "I've been playing gamelan since I was 17. That's like 43 years ago… so do I have the right to say, 'this is my music?'"[10] Diamond's experience with gamelan does not make this question any less complex. Authenticity and tradition cannot be replicated by Western musicians performing on non-Western instruments. They are inexorably linked. But unlike authenticity, tradition can be approximated by an outsider, a feat that members of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble and other exported gamelans constantly try to accomplish when performing traditional *karawitan* (gamelan repertoire). At base, gamelan ensemble members appreciate the sound of gamelan, its aesthetic; but as any

---

[10] Mason, Amelia. "What Is Gained, and Lost, When Indonesian Gamelan Music Is Americanized." *Artery*. 19 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Publication of 90.9 WBUR, Boston's NPR News Station.

novice quickly discovers after being scolded “don’t step over the instruments! They are sacred!,” members of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble appreciate the music for much more than its beauty — they respect the culture that produced it and attempt to follow the tradition by approximating ritual and performance practices.

Overall, defining tradition can leave the researcher perplexed — and it is likely an impossible feat. The definition of “traditional” music is an approximate one that is inherently flawed and subject to change. Even a simple Google search yields ambiguous, conflicting definitions that prove the impossibility of pinning down a singular explanation: “tradition” can be defined as 1) “existing in or as part of a tradition; long-established,” and 2) “produced, done, or used in accordance with tradition.”[11] According to one of these definitions, the performer must therefore be a part of the tradition; in the other, they might be an outsider who aims to perform in accordance with tradition. Deeper investigation adds little clarity. Even the records of the International Council of Traditional Music yield no precise definition of “tradition.” The closest they get to defining the term is in their charter, which states “the aims of the ICTM are to further the study, practice, documentation, preservation and dissemination of traditional music, including folk, popular, classical and urban music, and dance of all countries,”[12] a listing of traditional music types that is as broad as it is vague. The ambiguity surrounding the term is, in itself, instructive: it instructs us that cultures — the mothers of tradition — are flexible, evolving, and coalescing entities, and that the perception of what is and is not “traditional” is contingent. In light of this understanding, Georôid Ó Hallmhuráin’s

---

[11] Google Definitions: “Traditional.” Google Search. 13 March 2016. Web. Taken from *Oxford Pocket Dictionary of Current English*.

[12] “Rules of the International Council for Traditional Music.” *The International Council for Traditional Music*. 16 July 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. ICTM is a Non-Governmental Organization in Formal Consultative Relations with UNESCO.

definition of tradition from his text *A Pocket History of Irish Traditional Music* most closely approximates my understanding of this concept and represents how I will use this term throughout subsequent arguments. While Ó Hallmhuráin precedes his definition by asserting that there is “no iron-clad definition of ... traditional music,” he maintains that traditional music is

> best understood as a broad-based system which accommodates a complex process of musical convergence, coalescence and innovation over time. It involves different types of singing, dancing and instrumental music that developed ... over the course of several centuries. [T]he oral base of ... traditional music allows it to be more fluid than written music.[13]

Tradition is therefore a fluid concept that is often constituted by the same factors that influence the classification of music generally – it can be defined on the basis of cultural or geographic endogeny, social usage or audience. Moreover, traditional music can be demarcated by technique, instrumentation or period, or by the ways its lineage is cultivated and transmitted, specifically within societies that pass on their music via aural and oral routes (i.e. non-written).

These characteristics establish a broad category of music referred to as “world music,” a genre to which all so-called traditional, non-Western music is quite awkwardly assigned. From a practical standpoint, genres are helpful indexing tools, psychological constructs that exist and arise to assist the consumer in searching through vast amounts of data (music) for selection purposes. These genres are established according to certain unique styles (“norms”) as well as social context. As Stephen Blum articulates, “the definition of stylistic norms evolves from both the actual practice of performing musicians and the verbal statements, evaluations, [and] justifications which attach

[13] Hallmhuráin, Gearóid Ó. *A Pocket History of Irish Traditional Music*. Dublin: O'Brien, 1998. 1. Print.

themselves to practice. [R]ecurrent traits or patterns … might be said to constitute a style,"[14] and styles inform the creation of, and highlight the distinction between, genres. Musical genres consist of similar musical styles that are often assumed to shared a similar lineage or tradition. But does all traditional music categorized as "world music" share similar musical styles, lineages, traditions? Herein lies the issue. Can one say, because the Japanese *shakuhachi* and Javanese *suling* are both end-blown flutes, and because both are associated with religious ritual and are deemed "traditional" according to the stipulations of the definition cited above, that these instruments collectively constitute a style, a singular "genre," merely because they are alike in their function, construction, and history? Without fail both are classed within the "world music" mega-genre by the average consumer, a genre that is almost impossibly broad. Even the 1999 publication "world music: the Rough Guide" admits that "the guide sets itself a clearly impossible task: to document and explain the popular, folk, and (excluding the Western canon) classical music traditions around the globe,"[15] lamenting the broadness of its scope. While Western genres have become increasingly specific, progressively more hyphenated to accommodate for genre-bending and evolving musical tastes (such as "steampunk," "urban cowboy," "indie pop," "surf rock," etc.), CDs of Tuvan throat singing, didgeridoo, and gamelan are likely to be lumped together under the broad and relatively meaningless category of "world music." And as a result of the lack of specificity in this genre, and the fact that "of all the new styles that have appeared recently, world music is perhaps the

[14] Blum, Steven and Margaret J Kartomi. *Music-cultures in Contact: Convergences and Collisions*. Basel, Switzerland: Gordon and Breach, 1994. 5, 4, v. Print.
[15] Broughton, Simon, and Mark Ellingham. World Music. Africa, Europe and the Middle East. London: Rough Guide, 1999. ix. Print.

most successful at crossing or ignoring musical and cultural boundaries,"[16] this category is less helpful at categorizing and distinguishing between musics than other genres. It is a category that, by default, ghettoizes or marginalizes the gamelan and other non-Western musics.

I have already established the problems associated with the institutionalization of the "world music" genre, but have yet to explore how "world music" fits into the broader discussions of this thesis and ethnomusicological investigation in general. To help frame this discussion, I will begin with an anecdote. At Bananas Records in St. Petersburg, FL, touted as the "largest record store in the world," I found an eclectic array of CDs and vinyl in their diminutive, closet-sized "world music" room: a compilation of Astor Piazzolla's most popular Argentinian tangos, recordings of Pavarotti singing Italian Opera, and an abundance of CDs of Irish Celtic folksongs (most in the Gaeilge language). I managed to find one CD of traditional Chinese guqin. Even though Celtic folksongs, Italian Opera, and Argentine tangos are products of the West, their placement in the "world music" section at Bananas was unsurprising. In this case, record store employees — who undoubtedly were informed by consumers' search preferences and record distribution instructions — associated "world music" with a foreignness demarcated by linguistic and cultural divergence from the English-speaking West. This exposes an interesting paradox: in this case, world music is a genre to which music is contextually assigned on the basis of its perceived "otherness," an imprecise and problematic measure that is not defined universally but provincially by what we perceive is "not us or ours." world music is "everything else," relegating it to the periphery. Maria Belville rather

[16] Schaefer, John. *New Sounds: A Listener's Guide to New Music*. New York: Harper & Row, 1987. 122. Print.

obviously describes “otherness” in the journal *Otherness: Essays & Studies* published by the Centre for Studies in Otherness as “that which is not ‘self.’” Making a less apparent argument, she also speaks about how the “other and self are inherently joined and so when [academics] ‘speak’ of otherness, [they] inevitably ‘speak’ of its other: selfhood.”[17] Thus, “otherness” relies not only the perception of difference, but on the perception of “self.” And when the perception of cultural “self” is in transition — like when, at separate times, Debussy (modernist) and Reich (postmodernist) upset the conception of the Western musical “self,” distancing themselves from the sonic status quo (“West”) by looking East and appropriating these sonorities and structures within their works — that which is considered different can easily be adopted and mistaken (or misattributed) for what is “self.” We have now uncovered a primary theme in this investigation: the “other.”

The particular brand of “othering” that manifests in this paper is labeled “orientalism,” a term that was described by Edward Said in his eponymously titled 1979 publication. This term is inherently linked to colonial power dynamics, perhaps the reason why many of the techniques we find in the music of Western colonial powers that stem from (i.e. have been appropriated from) their colonial subjects — such as Indonesia — are unattributed or only cursorily credited. In his text, Said states:

> The French and British… have had a long tradition of what I shall be calling Orientalism, a way of coming to terms with the Orient that is based on the Orient's special place in European Western Experience. The Orient is not only adjacent to Europe; it is also the place of Europe's greatest and richest and oldest colonies, the source of its civilizations and languages, its cultural contestant, and one of its deepest and most recurring images of the Other. In addition, the Orient has helped to define Europe (or the West) as its contrasting image, idea, personality,

[17] Belville, Maria. “Introduction.” Otherness: Essays and Studies 1.1 (2010): Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Published by the Center for Studies in Otherness (UK).

> experience. Yet none of this Orient is merely imaginative. The Orient is an integral part of European material civilization and culture. Orientalism expresses and represents that part culturally and even ideologically as a mode of discourse with supporting institutions, vocabulary, scholarship, imagery, doctrines, even colonial bureaucracies and colonial styles.[18]

Remember the purpose of this paper as set forth in the first paragraph of the introduction: to assert the fact that gamelan is not peripheral, but has been central to the development of Western modernism. In order to deconstruct the notion that gamelan is peripheral, the idea of "otherness" must be deconstructed by recognizing how encounters with the "other" (Orient) have "helped to define Europe (the West)"[19] both musically and culturally. In fact, as Schaefer notes in *New Sounds: A Listener's Guide to New Music*, "many Westerners are now discovering, to their considerable surprise, that a number of other highly developed musical cultures do exist, and that some of them are more ancient, and, in the case of rhythm, even more complex than Western music."[20] The concepts of orientalism and "otherness" are somewhat pejorative designators: they do not represent cultures as different than ours but no less capable in their abilities to produce complex musics; music of the "other" has historically been viewed as less than and certainly not equal to the products of the West, a viewpoint that this paper calls into question. These terms are, themselves, "otherizing."

Let us return momentarily to our discussion of world music. Generally, for reasons observed in the discussions above (the controversial nature of the "other," orientalism, authenticity, tradition, ideas of ownership, etc.), few sources venture to

---

[18] Said, Edward W. *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient*. New York: Vintage, 1979. 5. Print.
[19] Ibid. 5.
[20] Schaefer, John. *New Sounds: A Listener's Guide to New Music*. New York: Harper & Row, 1987. 122. Print.

define world music. Rahkonen's paper entitled "What is world music?" surveys several music librarians, asking them to define the term. One would assume that reference librarians would know precisely how to index world music and define this concept. Here are some of their responses. Surprisingly, none are definitive, and most describe this concept through example (e.g. how it sounds, how it does not sound, what it is not, etc.) rather than offer a definition:

> World music means different things to different people, making it difficult to define. One thing is certain — we see more of it coming into our music libraries every day and we know it when we hear it!
>
> World music might best be described by what it is not. It is not Western art music, neither is it mainstream Western folk or popular music. world music can be traditional (folk), popular or even art music, but it must have ethnic or foreign elements. It is simply not our music, it is their music, music which belongs to someone else.
>
> A review of the literature shows that "world music" is a relatively recent term, and one appearing in ever wider contexts. Only since 1989 has the Music Index given a cross reference for the term, one which directs us to see "ethnic music," "folk music," and "popular music--styles." This seems to imply that world music is a large category, which encompasses ethnic music, folk music, and certain popular styles with non-Western elements.[21]

In my observations of academic literature, world music is a term applied chiefly to non-Western musics that remain faithful to tradition (i.e. not popular music). Academic distinctions are often made between world music and the similarly-titled genre of "world beat" on the basis of a music's perceived authenticity, fealty to historical performance techniques, and seeming resistance against globalization and modernization. That which is traditional remains relatively static over time, whereas that which is popular is more

[21] Rahkonen, Carl. "What is World Music?" *World Music in Music Libraries*. Technical Report No. 24. Canton, MA: Music Library Association, December 1994. 13 March 2016. Web.

dynamic, reacting more markedly to global trends. There is also a distinction between the two based on its marketing and consumership: world beat is concerned with marketing popular music to consumers whose tastes have been informed by globalized traditional and modern soundscapes (i.e. popular trends). As noted in *Global Pop: World Musics, World Markets*, "world beat, when used at all, usually applies to popular musics from non-European cultures."[22] By contrast, world music is not particularly obsessed with self-promotion, but rather with cultural preservation, and its "object and characteristic . . . is invariance."[23] For example, Indonesian gamelan *karawitan* (traditional, static, i.e. world music) varies markedly from the Indonesian folk genre of dangdut (popular, dynamic, i.e. world beat) in these ways. Outside academic circles, however, these terms are used interchangeably or not at all.

Frustratingly, these distinctions are not universally held in the academy, either. Dale A. Olsen describes world music as "ideally, the music of the whole earth, including music of European art traditions."[24] This is similar in scope to Jeff Todd Titon's broad definition of ethnomusicology: "the study of people making music,"[25] a definition which does not separate the West from the rest. In opposition to his idealized definition, Olsen observes that many music departments use the terms ethnomusicology and world music when referencing "musics outside the European and European-derived art music traditions." He favors these terms over "non-Western" because he claims that "to do so would be to divide the world into two unequally-proportioned parts… essentially, 'us'

---

[22] Taylor, Timothy Dean. *Global Pop: World Music, world Markets*. New York: Routledge, 1997. 3. Print.
[23] Hobsbawm, Eric and Terrence Ranger. *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1983. 3. Print.
[24] Olsen, Dale A., and Robert E. Brown. "World Music and Ethnomusicology: Two Views." College Music Society Newsletter (May 1992). UCLA Department of Ethnomusicology. Web. 17 Feb. 2016. Brown, R. E. "World Music: Past, present, and future;" Olsen, D. A. "World Music and Ethnomusicology-Understanding the Differences."
[25] Titon, Jeff Todd. *Worlds of Music* (2nd ed.). New York: Schirmer, 1992. xxi. Print.

and 'them.'"[26] But with a similar argument, Jody Diamond finds fault with the term world music, claiming that it segregates cultures and their soundscapes, creating a divide between researcher and subject. To this end, she asserts that

> world music is a dangerous idea. If 'world music' means all music except Western music, it perpetuates a hierarchy of knowledge. It separates Western Culture, 'reality', from Other Culture, 'an exotic variation to be observed.' 'We' know who 'they' are but they don't know who we are. We understand the entire world but they only understand part of it. We decide what is good for our world and for theirs. We can participate in their world but should not have too much influence. We study 'them' and don't share the results; they don't need information.[27]

This expresses a power dynamic that views musical subjects pejoratively, that "otherizes" and "exoticizes" them. She is not alone in this sentiment. In a 2012 article published on *The Guardian's* world music blog titled "The term 'world music' is outdated and offensive," Ian Birrell writes in support of Diamond's assertion, arguing that the term world music should not be used in this "mixed-up, messy and shrunken world. It feels like an outdated and increasingly offensive term. For a start, it implies cultural superiority. Artists from America and Europe tend not to get stuck in the world section, just those that do not speak English or come from 'exotic' parts of the world. They can be consigned safely to the world music ghetto, ignored by the mainstream and drooled over by those who approach music as an offshoot of anthropology."[28] As the field of ethnomusicology continues to evolve, so too does its terminology and research methodologies — these discussions can be observed in Jaap Kunst's *Ethnomusicology: A*

---

[26] Olsen, Dale A., and Robert E. Brown. "World Music and Ethnomusicology: Two Views." College Music Society Newsletter (May 1992). UCLA Department of Ethnomusicology. Web. 17 Feb. 2016. Brown, R. E. "World Music: Past, present, and future;" Olsen, D. A. "World Music and Ethnomusicology-Understanding the Differences."

[27] Diamond, Jody. "There is No They There." *Music Works*, 47 (Summer, 1990), 12-23. Web.

[28] Birrell, Ian. "The Term 'World Music' Is Outdated and Offensive." *The Guardian*. Guardian News and Media, 22 Mar. 2012. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Study of its Nature, its Problems, Methods and Representative Personalities, Andy Nercessian's *Postmodernism and Globalization in Ethnomusicology: An Epistemological Problem*, Laurent Aubert's *The Music of the Other: New Challenges for Ethnomusicology in a Global Age*, and in many other scholarly works. Over the past century, the field has become more aware of its shortcomings and has attempted to shore up its limitations. To this end, Helen Myers writes, accurately capturing my feelings as I compose this paper, that the "conscientious ethnomusicologist is often at a loss for descriptive words to explain his enterprise, having been stripped during the last several decades of his working vocabulary of vivid, colourful terms. In the kingdom of exiled words live the labels condemned as pejorative: the old timers, 'savage,' 'primitive,' 'exotic,' 'Oriental,' 'Far Eastern;' some newcomers, 'folk,' 'non-Western,' 'non-literate,' 'pre-literate;' and recently 'world [music].'"[29] So how do we, as researchers, appropriately classify the Indonesian gamelan and embark on a discussion of the culture that produced it without "otherizing" it? We must tread carefully when deliberating terminology: selecting terms based on their utility, outlining their associated connotations, uncovering their problems, and contextualizing their use.

Throughout the course of this chapter, I presume the reader has already come to the conclusion that, much like with the terms "tradition," "context" and "authenticity," there is no universally established definition of world music. And as I also mentioned previously, this ambiguity can be instructive. What does it tell us? Likely, ambiguity surrounds this definition (and all of the previously analyzed terms) because of the relatively recent inception of the field of ethnomusicology and its associated terminology. In fact, "world music" is a concept that is, according to Tim Taylor, only thirty years old:

[29] Myers, Helen. *Ethnomusicology, an Introduction*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1992. 11. Print.

"the name [world music] was dreamed up in 1987 by the heads of a number of small London-based record labels who found their releases from African, Latin American, and other international artists were not finding rack space because records stores had no obvious place to put them,"[30] a way of marketing and palletizing this music to the masses. However, Robert E. Brown, a famous ethnomusicologist and long time professor at San Diego State University who founded the Center for world music, claims to have come up with the term years earlier, asserting that it was actually academia that first proposed the term, not the record industry. He states the following on the subject: "To my knowledge, the origin of the term world music dates to the early 1960s at Wesleyan University, when I thought it up in order to distinguish a new Ph.D. program there from ethnomusicology programs already in existence. Nothing else, however, seemed to suit the approach we were taking… Although the other academic programs mentioned above included performance as part of the plan of study, their primary concern was, and still is, the '-ology' of ethnomusicology, that is, investigative research with the ultimate goal of writing about music."[31] In this way, he distinguishes the field of world music from ethnomusicology by coining "world music" as a term used to describe the immersive and subjective study of music through performance, distinguishing it from ethnomusicology, which he felt was more objective and removed from the subject, focused on research rather than performance. Interestingly enough, Brown was instrumental in purchasing the Emory Gamelan in 1997 and personally brought Pak I Madé Lasmawan, my guru, a

---

[30] Broughton, Simon, and Mark Ellingham. *World Music. Africa, Europe and the Middle East*. London: Rough Guide, 1999. Unpaginated. Print.
[31] Olsen, Dale A., and Robert E. Brown. "World Music and Ethnomusicology: Two Views." College Music Society Newsletter (May 1992). UCLA Department of Ethnomusicology. Web. 17 Feb. 2016. Brown, R. E. "World Music: Past, present, and future;" Olsen, D. A. "World Music and Ethnomusicology-Understanding the Differences."

gamelan master who has visited Emory on several occasions, to the United States.[32] Also important to address, Brown was a student of Mantle Hood, a gamelan scholar considered to be the "Father of the Gamelan" in the United States and who devised the concept of bimusicality. Hood's view of the bimusical stresses the importance of performance, similar (almost identical, in fact) to Brown's view of world music as a field. According to Molly Jeon in the encyclopedia Music in the Social and Behavioral Sciences,

> Bimusicality is defined as fluency for two distinct musical systems. Bimusicality normally results from technical training and aesthetic understanding of music from a different ethnic group while maintaining one's native music. For ethnomusicologists, the extent of study in the new music results in varying degrees of understanding, from the technical to the aesthetic and social. In 1960, when Mantle Hood coined the term bimusicality, fieldwork in ethnomusicology was evolving from the collection of data about music through observation to the understanding of music through participation. While the exact meaning of the term bimusicality has undergone analysis over the years, researchers have used it mainly to refer to a participant-observation approach of studying ethnic music. Researchers have become active participants in music rather than only observers and have found that being involved with actual music making has assisted them in understanding the music and culture to a greater extent.[33]

Just as someone can best achieve bilingualism through immersion, the same is true of bimusicality, an approach that valorizes in vivo fieldwork and demands that researchers become proficient in performing the instruments they are investigating. Much like language can serve as medium through which a researcher can understand cultural identity, the same is true of music. Brown's and Hood's arguments for the bimusical

[32] I discovered this through a personal conversation with Dr. Lewis Peterman, President of the Robert E. Brown Center for World Music (San Diego, CA) and Professor Emeritus of Music and Dance at San Diego State University. He was a personal friend of Dr. Brown. I met with him in July 2015 at the house of Pak Weten in Denpasar, Bali. Wenten is a professor at Cal Arts.

[33] Jeon, Molly. "Bimusicality." Music in the Social and Behavioral Sciences: An Encyclopedia. Ed. William Forde Thompson, Alexandra Lamont, Richard Parncutt, and Frank A. Russo. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, 2014. 137. Print.

expose the fact that both felt the divide between researcher and subject had become too pronounced. As Brown mentioned, ethnomusicologists' "primary concern was, and still is, the '-ology' of ethnomusicology, that is, investigative research with the ultimate goal of writing about music." In an article entitled "Whose Ethnomusicology?" by J. Lawrence Witzleben, he asserts that "ethnomusicology is still widely perceived as ethnocentric and predominantly oriented towards the study of "others" music by Western Scholars."[34] This raises questions about the proposed audience of this scholarship: is it for Westerners or for ethnic subjects? At least in its infancy, ethnomusicology's hands-off approach and focus on producing scholarship for Western audiences was "otherizing." Furthermore, the way that it often pejoratively viewed its subjects not as authorities, but as informants (i.e. the Western researcher is the "authority"), was also "otherizing." Hood and Brown felt that previous approaches to the study of world musics actually peripheralized their ethnic subjects, a problem they felt bimusicality would remedy.

Bimusicality is the approach that I took when undertaking this thesis, quite a commonplace approach in current ethnomusicological research. Perhaps this methodology is so popular not only because of its effectiveness, but because Mantle Hood founded the first ethnomusicology graduate program in the United States in the 1960s at UCLA, a curriculum that stressed the importance of the bimusical researcher-performer. In a 2005 obituary for Hood, Christopher Waterman, dean of the School of the Arts and Architecture at UCLA (which oversees the UCLA Herb Alpert School of Music) stated that "Hood was a seminal figure in the field of ethnomusicology and his influence was far reaching… he trained numerous young scholars who went on to found

[34] Witzleben, J. Lawrence. "Whose Ethnomusicology? Western Ethnomusicology and the Study of Asian Music." *Ethnomusicology*. 41.2 (1997): 220–242. Web.

ethnomusicology programs at the University of Washington, Brown, UC Berkeley, Wesleyan University, Florida State University, as well as programs and research institutes in many other countries."[35] UCLA's program is also well known among Indonesian artists, a program from which Pak Susilo, Pak Dibia, and Pak Wenten among many other native gamelan masters received their doctorates, a result of Hood's visionary leadership and global focus.[36]

But the influence of the gamelan on ethnomusicology goes far deeper than Hood's fascination with and subsequent incorporation of it into the curriculum of his ethnomusicology program. We must ask: when did the field of ethnomusicology arise? And how was its beginning related to gamelan? Ethnomusicology was a term that was conceived by Dutch gamelan scholar and musicologist Jaap Kunst. His 1950 publication *Musicologica: A Study of the Nature of Ethno-Musicologie, its Problems, Methods, and Representative Personalities* was the first text to feature the term. So important has Kunst been to the field of ethnomusicology that the Society for Ethnomusicology honors his legacy by offering an endowed prize in his name: the Jaap Kunst Prize is awarded "to recognize the most significant article in ethnomusicology written by a member of the Society for Ethnomusicology and published within the previous year."[37] To this day, his text "Music in Java" (1949, trans.) remains a foundational work for gamelan researchers. Furthermore, the "Father of Ethnomusicology" in Britain, A.J. Ellis, was the first scholar to conduct analyses on Javanese and Balinese gamelan tuning systems that he explored in

---

[35] "In Memoriam: Mantle Hood." UCLA Department of Ethnomusicology. 13 Sept. 2005. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[36] Pak Dibia mentioned this to me when I met with him in July in Baturitui, Bali, at the compound of Pak I Madé Lasmawan. He is an internationally renowned gamelan scholar who lectured NIU participants on the "Experiencing the Arts in Bali" study abroad about Kecak.
[37] "Jaap Kunst Prize." Society for Ethnomusicology. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

his publication "On the Musical Scales of Various Nations (1885)." It was Ellis who developed the standardized system of cents for measuring and notating musical intervals, a system we still employ today. [38] And in addition to writing early scholarship on the gamelan and heading the graduate program at UCLA in ethnomusicology, a model on which many other ethnomusicology graduate programs were based, Mantle Hood wrote *The Ethnomusicologist* (1971), an often-cited text that was one of the first to comprehensively outline the field. Slowly, musicologists studying non-Western musics began to describe themselves as ethnomusicologists, a more fitting term than the previous one: "comparative musicologist." As Haydon acknowledges, "the term [comparative musicology was] not entirely satisfactory… for the comparative method is frequently used in other fields of musicology, and studies in this field are often not directly comparative."[39] Erich von Hornbostel expressed a similar sentiment, favoring the replacement of this term "because we [comparative musicologists] do not compare any more than anyone else does."[40] Thus, ethnomusicology, defined as "the study of music in its cultural context"[41] without the need for a comparative approach was born out of this discourse, pioneered by gamelan scholars and enthusiasts like Colin McPhee, Mantle Hood, Lou Harrison, Charles Seeger and others who popularized the field of ethnomusicology and the gamelan to Western audiences.

---

[38] Kunst, Jaap. "Introduction to Ethnomusicology." *Ethnomusicology: a Study of Its Nature, Its Problems, Methods and Representative Personalities to Which Is Added a Bibliography*. The Hague: M. Nijhoff, 1959. 2. Print. In this text, Kunst refers to A.J. Ellis as "the father of ethno-musicology."
[39] Merriam, Alan P. "Definitions of "Comparative Musicology" and "Ethnomusicology:" An Historical-Theoretical Perspective." Ethnomusicology 21.2 (1977): 192. Jstor. Web. 17 Feb. 2016.
[40] Ibid.
[41] "What Is Ethnomusicology?" Society for Ethnomusicology. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Also found within Nettl, Bruno. "Contemplating the Musics of the world." *The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-three Discussions*. Urbana, Chicago and Springfield: U of Illinois, 2015. 6. Print.

As these examples illustrate, gamelan has played a significant role in the development and modernization of the academic field of ethnomusicology in the United States and internationally, serving as a major area of scholarship. For this reason, it is well known in academic circles. I will never forget when, at the 2014 Society for Ethnomusicology conference in Pittsburg, one experienced academic, after asking me what my field of study was, said with interest "ah, yes, the gamelan: the gateway into ethnomusicology. I remember studying that when I was in grad school!" I would agree: while gamelan certainly was not the first non-Western music to be investigated, I see it as among the first musical cultures to legitimize the field of ethnomusicology and consider it one of the principal "gateways" into ethnomusicological research, an example (perhaps tokenized) of how researchers should approach the study of ethnic musics generally. Regardless, even if ethnomusicology is less "otherizing" than comparative musicology, it still "otherizes" its subjects to a certain extent: Bruno Nettl once said that "ethnomusicology as western culture knows it is actually a western phenomenon,"[42] one that divides Western researcher and non-Western informant. As a young field, ethnomusicology is still evolving and, according to some arguments, has not yet reached maturation — the inconsistency and somewhat ambiguous definitions of its terminology reflect this fact. It is much less established than historical musicology programs, and is much more interdisciplinary, leading some to question its legitimacy — as Fredric Lieberman wrote in 1976, "ethnomusicology… gives no evidence of having become an independent scholarly discipline… [s]ince its inception, ethnomusicology has been searching for a definition of itself. There is still very little agreement as to its goals,

[42] Nettl, Bruno. "The Art of Combining Tones: The Music Concept." *The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-One Issues and Concepts*. Urbana: U of Illinois, 2005. 26. Print.

boundaries, methods, requisite skills, or curriculum."[43] To this effect, George Starks writes "there may be as many approaches to the field as there are ethnomusicologists."[44] Although ethnomusicology has changed drastically since Lieberman wrote his denunciation of it (one I do not agree with in the least), it still is relatively niche. Wake Forest University just hired its first full-time ethnomusicologist in 2014. And Emory possesses only one ethnomusicology position among a staff of theorists and musicologists, although many of the faculty do teach History and Culture Category B courses which are "designed to build knowledge of musics outside of the Western classical tradition."[45] Overall, what this paragraph has attempted to illuminate is that the subjects ethnomusicology investigates are more niche, more peripheral: gamelan, as a subject of ethnomusicological interest, is therefore "otherized" to a certain extent by default.

Despite this, gamelan has had and continues to have a marked effect on the way that we approach music in general not only as scholars, but as musicians, composers and consumers, affecting the broader musical language and listening preferences of the modern "West" that remains fascinated with "otherness." As Joseph Eisentraut astutely notes

> The interest in music from different cultures demonstrates that listeners are sometimes attracted to what they do not know. Music is not accessible only through familiarity, but also because it engages and interests the recipient. This it sometimes does by incorporating novelty of some kind,

[43] Lieberman, Fredric. *Should Ethnomusicology be Abolished?* Position Papers for the Ethnomusicology Interest Group at the 19th Annual Meeting of the College Music Society, Washington D.C., November 1976. Web. 13 March 2016.
[44] Starks, George L. "Ethnomusicology and the African American Tradition." African American Jazz and Rap: Social and Philosophical Examinations of Black Expressive Behavior. Ed. James L. Conyers. Jefferson, NC: McFarland, 2001. 224. Print.
[45] "Bachelor of Arts in Music." Emory University College of Arts and Sciences – Department of Music. 2016. Web. 12 March 2016. Found beneath the "History and Culture Category B" heading.

> which can derive from fashion change, formal innovation, or extraneous or exotic elements. A further point of access is finding some subjective or objective use for a musical style. A foreign music may lend itself to uses and interpretations not readily available in local genres and thus appear accessible to people who are receptive to such meanings and applications.[46]

The "other" (comprised of the real or imagined "exotic," i.e. "what [we] do not know") is not only attractive to consumers for aesthetics reasons, but because of its difference from mainstream musicultural products. Conceptions of "otherness" simultaneously bolster and threaten the gamelan and all non-Western musicultures for that matter. Gamelan's position as "niche," "high-brow," etc., is hazardous because this designation isolates (peripheralizes) it. And in the cases where Western music appropriates it or hybridizes with it, rarely is it given enough credit. For example, Debussy's compositions are regarded as nationalistic examples of "French Exoticism," not exercises in appropriation of the "Indonesian Exotic." Oppositely, its position (as "niche") is also protective: while it is relatively obscure, those that are specialists, aficionados, and scholars of it often study it in earnest, promote it zealously, and create close-knit cyber and physical communities as can be seen among members of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble and the gamelan ListServ (gamelan@listserv.dartmouth.edu) that advertises local and international gamelan gatherings, disseminates recently published scholarship, and constantly reaffirms connection with Bali and Java by advertising programs such as the Center for world music's "Flower Mountain" program in Girikusma, Payangan, Bali. And in my experience, the field is so small that even the least active participants know at least some of the major goings-on in the gamelan world. Regardless, the "mainstream"

[46] Eisentraut, Jochen. "An Outline Topography of Musical Accessibility: Society, Atonality, Psychology." The Accessibility of Music: Participation, Reception and Contact. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2013. 61. Print.

consumer does not know too much about this music or the culture that produced it. I contend that this is because the Western listener is more interested in the aesthetic products of appropriation and hybridity (i.e. novel instrumentation, rhythms, etc.), rather than the ethical problems of appropriation.

The term "appropriation" is often seen in a negative light, frequently described as the act of taking music from another culture (a subset of cultural appropriation) and incorporating it into one's own, usually without formal acknowledgement. Paul Ricoeur held a more moderate view: he declares that appropriation, defined as "the act of making one's own that which was previously alien,… ceases to appear as a kind of possession, as a way of taking hold of… [rather] it implies instead a moment of dispossession of the narcissistic ego."[47] Thus, appropriation distances us from our egoistic cultural "self," taking us beyond the realm of our tonal orbit across the novel frontier of the "other." Appropriation is a product of this sojourn into "otherness." As Greg Barz notes about the importance of "distanciation" (distancing oneself from the "self") that is concomitant with appropriation:

> Because ethnomusicologists often find themselves at some cultural or historical distance from the traditions they study, appropriation is the dialectical counterpoint of that initial distanciation… all individuals operating within a tradition continually reappropriate their cultural practices, give them new meaning, and in that process create a continually evolving sense of self, of identity, of community, and of 'being in the world.'[48]

Therefore, constant external and internal reappropriation, facilitated by interactions with the "other" and reflections on the "self," helps to cement our own cultural identity. Why

---

[47] Ricoeur, Paul. *Hermeneutics and the Human Sciences: Essays on Language, Action, and Interpretation*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge: 1981. 190-92. Print.
[48] Barz, Gregory F., and Timothy J. Cooley. *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology.* New York: Oxford UP, 1997. 58. Print.

have I selected this polarizing term over “citation,” “sampling,” etc.? Could not these also sufficiently describe the ‘incorporation of another’s cultural elements within music?’ Yes and no. Appropriation is problematic but inevitable, an intentional or unintentional act of borrowing (an unconscious or conscious exercise). I feel the terms “sampling” and “citation,” both intentional acts of borrowing, are not polarized enough; they illusorily suggest that traditional musicians are in fact “cited” or given credit for their music when it is the source of influence within Western compositions. This is often not the case. The term “appropriation” (by Ricoeur’s definition) also sets up a duplicity that I wish to explore: that of “self” and “other,” a dichotomy that is not set up as well by other terms. As subsequent chapters will illustrate, melding of the “self” and “other” occurs when cultures collide.

This melding, a by-product of appropriation, produces hybrid cultures and “for fans of ‘world music,’ cultural hybridity is valued… because it combines desirable aspects of several identities (thus representing the possibility of having the “best of all worlds”).”[49] Sumarsam offers that one can think of hybridity as “a space of liminality between two worlds (neither here nor there but in between) that can just as easily be emancipatory or tragic or as a source of potential strength since cultural hybrids can free themselves from the chains of tradition by adding on successive layers of strategic identity.”[50] There is a notion that music cannot be pure, and that hybridity is the mark of cosmopolitanism in this globalized world. As Roman philosopher Seneca stated, “the

[49] White, Bob W. Music and Globalization: Critical Encounters. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 2012. 195. Print.
[50] Sumarsam. “Performing Colonialism.” Javanese Gamelan and the West. Rochester: U of Rochester, 2013. 11. Print.

whole world is my native land."[51] This idea summarizes the way that Western composers view global soundscapes. To this end, much has been written about hybridity: Martin Stokes argues that the "purity of musical expression is not possible… the building blocks of every musical style are themselves hybrids."[52] In agreement with this assertion, composer Christopher Adler stresses "the act of composing is an engagement with hybridity."[53] Perhaps the most often cited scholar within ethnomusicological and sociological discourse surrounding issues of multiculturalism and transnational hybridity, Stuart Hall asserts that "modern nations are all cultural hybrids," a sentiment he expressed further within his pivotal treatise that outlined the theory of "Global Postmodernism" cited above. [54]

Hybridity can be freeing or limiting: it is often freeing for the Western composer and limiting for composers of so-called traditional musics. In a paper entitled "Hybridity, So What?" Jan Nederveen Pieterse states "according to anti-hybridity arguments, hybridity is inauthentic."[55] As we have seen earlier, traditional music, by Taylor's definition, is classified as such on the basis of its perceived authenticity, a concept that Sarah Weiss asserts "is a primary determinant of the valuation of world music."[56] Western music is not required to be authentic, but traditional non-Western music is. For these reasons, it is difficult for non-Western composers to compose hybrid musics with

[51] Seneca, Lucius Annaeus. *Hoyt's New Cyclopedia of Practical Quotations*. Ed. Kate Louise Roberts. New York and London: Funk and Wagnalls, 1922. 916. Print. From *Epistles 28*. Full quote: "I am not born for one corner. The whole world is my native land."
[52] Stokes, Martin. "Music and the Global Order." Annual Review of Anthropology 33 (2004): 60. Web.
[53] Adler, Christopher. *Cross-Cultural Hybridity in Music Composition: Southeast Asia in Three Works from America*. Unpublished, 1998. 1. Web. 13 March 2016. Taken from christopheradler.com. Ph.D. Dissertation, Duke University.
[54] Hall, Stuart. "The Question of Cultural Identity." *Modernity: An Introduction to Modern Societies.* Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1996. 617. Print.
[55] Pieterse, Jan Nederveen. "Hybridity, So What? The Anti-Hybridity Backlash and the Riddles of Recognition." *Theory, Culture & Society*. 18.2.3 (2001): 219. Print.
[56] Weiss, Sarah. "Listening to the world but Hearing Ourselves: Hybridity and Perceptions of Authenticity in World Music." *Ethnomusicology* 58.3 (2014): 506. Web.

traditional ensembles without it being seen as inauthentic and devalued. Pieterse goes on to say "hybridity is a problem only from the point of view of essentializing boundaries,"[57] boundaries that are reflected clearly in the terms "self" and (the fetishized term of) "other." These boundaries express social, political, cultural, and economic power differences that I feel are best captured by the term appropriation: generally, it is my view that those with power have "permission" to appropriate (and do so often without giving credit to source cultures), while those without it cannot without being seen as inauthentic ("selling out"). These are problems that this brief paragraph fails to fully address, but are important to consider particularly when evaluating how the uniquely Western fascination with "exoticism," "orientalism" and "otherness" have valorized hybridity through appropriation of ethnic musics, a process that ultimately founded Western modernism.

Can appropriated music be seen as truly original, modern? As Steinberg posits in his 1978 publication "The Glorious Company," "there is as much unpredictable originality in quoting, imitating, transposing, and echoing, as there is in inventing."[58] Thus, the products of innovation are not always original, but represent the reworking of the familiar in a new (modern) way. Composers like Debussy and Satie did not seek to directly replicate native musics, but rather they sought symbolic inspiration from them, recording their musical impression of the gamelan that differed markedly from the reality of its sound: they abstracted these sounds almost to the point of unrecognizability (for the untrained or unaware listener) and made them their own. Even Pak Madé Lasmawan, when listening to Debussy's "Pagodes," told me that it "is not gamelan." Indeed, it is not. But it is the impression of gamelan. And for Debussy and Satie, the sounds of gamelan

---

[57] Pieterse. 219.

[58] Steinberg, Leo L. "The Glorious Company." *Art About Art.* Ed. John Lipman and Rchard Marshall. E.P Dutton, New York. 1978. 25. Print.

floated in the collective French memory following the 1889 Paris Exposition, clear source materials for their work. Similarly, Hood's work in the United States revitalized an interest in gamelan and world music that added it to the collective American memory.

In a conversation I had with Pulitzer Prize- and Charles Ives prize-winning composer Joseph Schwantner, a longtime professor at the Eastman School of Music, Yale, and Juilliard, he stated of the gamelan: "It was quite the fad in the 1960s and 1970s [to study gamelan]. Many music departments taught gamelan because of an increased interest in world music. Many composers were influenced by this music, such as Debussy and others."[59] His Naxos biography found in the liner notes of his 2004 CD "Sparrows / Music of Amber" does not conceal his inspirations:

> The music of Joseph Schwantner is at once identifiable, so unchanging is his musical language. He has been principally influenced by three… composers, George Crumb, Olivier Messiaen and Debussy. The first of these is perhaps the most important. Crumb, also an American, distinguished internationally for his refined, delicately drawn chamber works, like Schwantner, is fond of luminous sounds and unusual effects. We also find with him the frequent direction to hold the sustaining pedal of the piano, to allow resonances to be heard. He also prefers mystical, symbolic poems as inspiration for his vocal and also for his instrumental works. Both composers are distinguished by their free use of tonality and atonality. Messiaen's music is marked by its use of harmony, which is very consistent and gives unequalled attention to sound colour within a formal section. Schwantner too seeks a sound system that gives certain direction to his harmonic practice, and is like Messiaen, who, in his piano music, seeks a placing of notes that gives bright, clear sounds. In spite of his modern musical language Messiaen, incomparably, never gave up tonal writing, but expanded tonality in a very individual way. The same is apparent in Schwantner's music from the late 1970s. Debussy set music free from the chains of functional harmony and was

[59] I talked informally with Joseph Schwantner prior to the Emory Wind Ensemble's debut of his piece *Luminasity* in Spring 2015.

> a pioneer, followed by such composers as Stravinsky, Bartók, Crumb, and also by Schwantner. He was the founder of a musical aesthetic expanded by French and American composers, not least through the teaching of the legendary Nadia Boulanger.[60]

I am fascinated by this passage because it reveals a complex, intergenerational and intercultural hierarchy of influence. When Emory University debuted Schwantner's piece *Luminosity* for wind ensemble in 2015, a concert on which I performed, I could not help but notice the Reichian, Minimalist traces of gamelan: repetitive arpeggiated figures, simple harmonies, pedal points, its highly percussive nature, resonances and stereo effects. Reich and Schwantner owe these techniques to the early modernists whose appropriation of the "other" and exploration of the "exotic" spelled the end of previously-held Western harmonic, melodic, and rhythmic conventions: Debussy and Messiaen (as well as Ravel, etc.), who composed pieces that appropriated gamelan techniques and sonorities, were credited for the birth of modernism (much as Columbus was "credited" for the discovery of America). Even famed pedagogue and composer Nadia Boulanger, with whom a generation of composers studied — including minimalist Philip Glass — and whose works revolutionized compositional techniques, was not immune to this hierarchy of influence: As Caroline Potter writes in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, Boulanger's "musical language is often highly chromatic (though always tonally based), and Debussy's influence is apparent."[61] The Minimalists followed suit, morphing the musical language of the Impressionists and Neoclassicists into something "novel," a reworking of the musical language that Debussy's generation had devised but

---

[60] Schwantner, Joseph, Kobayashi Issa, and Agueda Pizarro. *Schwantner: Sparrows / Music of Amber*. Naxos Digital Services US Inc., 2004. CD. Quotation taken from the Liner notes. Underscoring added by the author for emphasis.

[61] Potter, Caroline. "Boulanger, Nadia." Grove Music Online (Oxford Music Online). 13 March 2016.

which was decidedly appropriated, to a significant extent, from the “other” (gamelan, etc.).

It is perhaps inaccurate to use the term “hierarchy” of influence to underline the connection between source and beneficiary. I believe it is more fitting to view chains of influence not as unidirectional, linear hierarchies, but as circuits that permits bidirectional flow — one that is in constant connection with the source, either consciously or unconsciously. After my interview with Schwantner, he referred me to a former student of his, composer Evan Ziporyn, director of Gamelan Galak Tika at MIT. I was unsurprised by this connection. Gamelan and the musical “other” have served and continue to serve as the source material for generations of Western composers: it is indeed “familiar” to us because it defines us. Cultural cryptomnesia — unconscious “plagiarism” that occurs when an idea that is suppressed in “hidden memory” is assumed to be one’s own — is so ubiquitous in music and the arts that it cannot be ignored. After hearing gamelan, Debussy internalized it and made it his own. Schwantner’s musical language (and those of his generation) was informed by Debussy’s innovations and by the recent development of the field of ethnomusicology in the 1960s that revitalized interest in gamelan and world music, a time when studying gamelan “was quite the fad.” After internalizing what he heard, Schwantner personalized this sound, interpreting it in a different and modern way (Steinberg’s idea of “quoting, imitating, transposing, and echoing”). This sound has come to define American and Western modernism: Schwantner was, after all, awarded the Pulitzer and Charles Ives Prizes, both offered to American composers who have made significant contributions to the composition world. In this way, I view Ziporyn’s affiliation with the gamelan as a musical “homecoming” of

sorts, completing this cycle of influence and demonstrating the close ties between modern Western music and the "other." In my view, world music is therefore not subaltern or marginal when compared to Western musical traditions, but is in fact the (often unrecognized) parent of these traditions.

Regardless of how "hybridized" and "globalized" modern nations are, ownership is important to discuss because it affirms origin and intellectual property, at least in a legal sense. I would have to disagree with Sean Wilentz's claim that "crediting bits and pieces of another's work is [a] scholarly tradition, not an artistic tradition."[62] The history of Western copyright law opposes this assertion and exposes a striking double standard: while countless copyright lawsuits exist in the West (see Allison McCabe's 2015 NPR Music News article "Inspiration Or Appropriation? Behind Music Copyright Lawsuits"), the music of the gamelan has, in my opinion, entered public domain and is beyond the reach of copyright. Seemingly, its position as "other" exempts it from being "owned" in the proprietary sense. Even scholars are unsure exactly of how to deal with issues of ownership. Anthony Seeger discusses this point in an article entitled "Ethnomusicology and Music Law:"

> The International Council for Traditional Music's Copyright Committee sent a letter to ICTM members asking for information about music ownership in the countries in which they lived and in the communities in which they did their research. The form included questions about both formal copyright rules and traditional notions of ownership. A relatively small percentage of those queried responded — although most of us recognize the issue to be an important one… many of those who did respond appeared to know little about music ownership in either of their communities.[63]

---

[62] "Musical Plagiarism." Project Gutenberg and the world Heritage Encyclopedia, Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[63] Seeger, Anthony. "Ethnomusicology and Music Law". Ethnomusicology 36.3 (1992): 345–359. Web.

Overall, the intent of this section is not to directly investigate the ways in which music of different cultures is used exploitatively nor is it to discuss ethical arguments concerning its appropriation (direct or indirect borrowing) or hybridization, or to call into question the cultural authenticity and ownership of traditional music that becomes incorporated into Western compositions. Nevertheless, these themes are inextricably linked to ethnomusicological discourse and should implicitly be observed and reflected upon constantly while reading this paper.

At this point in history, I believe it would be impossible to tease out the gamelan's influence (indirectly or directly) because the scope of its impact is enormous. It is my view that gamelan has become so deeply engrained in the fabric of Western musical identity, subsumed so deeply into the musical unconscious, that it has ceased to be considered "other" and is now considered "self." Andrew McGraw states "in America, gamelan may function as an apparatus of aesthetic transgression. Generations of American composers have been drawn to gamelan partly because its unique tuning is radically divergent from Western models… Many American composers have heard in gamelan tunings a form of symbolic resistance… gamelan can represent a pseudo-disorder, a potentially subversive noise."[64] I agree with McGraw that the gamelan initially served as a vehicle for "aesthetic transgression." But it is my argument that movements such as Impressionism and Minimalism were built on subversion and transgression, the "distanciation" from previous movements that were not as fascinated by music of the "other." The West is no longer defined by the music of Beethoven and has emerged from the shadow of Romanticism entirely, converging with the "other."

---

[64] McGraw, Andrew. "The Gamelan and Indonesian Music in America." OUP Blog. Oxford University Press, 27 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Perhaps indicative of this convergence, the gamelan's tunings no longer seem as radical to Western composers, expressing the evolution of soundscapes (modernism). Yet even the term "modernism" presently seems outdated: Dahlhaus describes the term as "an obvious point of historical discontinuity....the 'breakthrough' of Mahler, Strauss, and Debussy implies a profound historical transformation.... stylistically open-ended 'modernist music' [extends] (with some latitude) from 1890 to the beginnings of our own twentieth-century modern music in 1910."[65] It is quite strange to think that "modernism" is a movement that began and ended over 100 years ago. Eero Tarasti writes that modernism represented "the dissolution of the traditional tonality and transformation of the very foundations of tonal language, [a] searching for new models in atonalism, polytonalism or other forms of altered tonality,"[66] but have we not already embraced this shift?

As a movement, Modernism was built on "innovation," but this innovation has long since become commonplace and is now viewed as a part of the Western musical vernacular. The music of Schoenberg, Stravinsky, and Debussy has benefited from interactions with the "other" in its quest for innovation, and so too has its successor: "Postmodernism." As Kramer puts forth in his 2002 publication *The Nature and Origins of Musical Postmodernism*, Postmodernism "is not simply a repudiation of modernism or its continuation, but has aspects of both a break and an extension… [and] includes

[65] Dahlhaus, Carl. *Nineteenth-Century Music*. Translated by J. Bradford Robinson. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989. 334. Print.
[66] Tarasti, Eero. *Myth and Music: A Semiotic Approach to the Aesthetics of Myth in Music, Especially that of Wagner, Sibelius and Stravinsky*. Acta Musicologica Fennica 11; Religion and Society 51. Helsinki: Suomen Musiikkitieteellinen Seura; The Hague: Mouton, 1979. 272. Web. 13 March 2016.

quotations of or references to music of many traditions and cultures."[67] Temporally significant, David Beard and Kenneth Gloag assert, "the radical changes of musical styles and languages throughout the 1960s [are] now seen as a reflection of postmodernism,"[68] a period that corresponds exactly to the institutionalization of ethnomusicology programs that, to a certain extent, revitalized an interest in world music and gamelan. And the importance of polystylism in Postmodern music, undoubtedly an effect of globalization and modernization, has invited appropriation of the "other." Both Modernism and Postmodernism sought innovation and distanciation from previous movements — and they found this inspiration in the "other." While the progression from Modernism to Postmodernism may reflect the desire to depart from previous Western musical movements ("transgression"), it highlights an interesting trend: the gradual convergence with the "other" over time.

Overall, the Gamelan as an instrument and Indonesian culture is still viewed as "other," but their effects on Debussy (Modernist, Impressionist) and Reich (Postmodernist, Minimalist), who reinterpreted it through "quoting, imitating, transposing, and echoing," have become "self." As I mentioned above, I think this is because the Western listener is more interested in the aesthetic products of appropriation and hybridity, rather than the ethical problems of appropriation or the cultures from which world musics stem. This investigation will broadly focus on determining these tenets of the Modern era that have been directly influenced by the spread of musical ideas from the Indonesian gamelan and that are so foundational to modern Western music that

[67] Kramer, Jonathan D. "The Nature and Origins of Musical Postmodernism." Postmodern Music/Postmodern Thought. By Judith Irene Lochhead and Joseph Henry Auner. New York: Routledge, 2002. 16. Print.
[68] Beard, David, and Kenneth Gloag. 2005. Musicology: The Key Concepts. New York: Routledge. 142. Print.

they seem "Western" and "modern" themselves: atypical rhythmic and melodic motives, uncharacteristic harmonization, the presence of polyphony, etc. And perhaps this realization is enough to prove the central role the gamelan has occupied (and other ethnic, "otherized" musicultures) in the development of Western musical modernism. These are the thoughts that have perplexed me as I have, as they say colloquially, fallen "down the rabbit hole" into the endless layers of nuance.

As fleshed out through the discussions above, gamelan can be viewed as traditional and authentic when performed by Indonesian musicians who are inculcated in the tradition, approximately traditional when performed by culturally informed outsiders, distinctly Indonesian, and can (problematically and imprecisely) be classed under the genre of "world music," but is almost never considered world beat unless it is hybridized. I will continue to use the term world music, only in the general and idealized sense that Olsen proposed: as a way to describe music of the whole earth, a categorization that certainly includes gamelan. One must also note that I described this music as being distinctly Indonesian, directly crediting its source rather than sloppily describing it as "non-Western." Although I consider it inappropriate to currently use in 21st century discussions of musics and cultures, I do use the terms non-Western, oriental, etc., to evoke the psychological construct of "otherness," to distance the Orient from the Occident. This is particularly relevant in the chapter on Debussy, Satie, and Stravinsky, nationalistic composers who viewed the "exotic" as very much distinct from the West. Ironically, as I will attempt to prove in this paper, these exotic sonorities have come to define Western soundscapes. The use of these terms is not meant to be pejorative, but rather historically instructive. I do this to accomplish the main objective of the paper: to

assert that gamelan is central, not peripheral, to our understanding of the Western musical "self" and to emphasize how the concepts of ownership, authenticity, appropriation, and hybridization establish and influence this peripheral-central, self-other duality that creates "otherizing" boundaries.

Methodological Approach.

In the subsequent section of the paper, I will outline my methodological approach to dissecting this topic and will illuminate several experiences that have allowed me to learn more about the gamelan and Indonesian culture through immersion and performance. In fact, as stated above, the performative aspect of this project reflects my desire to pursue this topic in accordance with Hood's view of bimusicality. Put simply, I tackled this prompt in one of two ways: 1) through culturally-informed musical analyses, and 2) through musically-informed cultural analyses, citing excerpts from my fieldwork in Bali, Indonesia, and my travels around the United States. This section is written in first person narrative because it is deeply personal. As Marcia Herndon mentions in her 1993 article in "The World of Music," a sentiment that I feel accurately describes my approach, "I speak as myself; neither fully insider nor outsider, neither fully emic nor etic."[69]

Performance and Bimusicality: A General Overview.

First, I will outline experiences in which I have assumed the role of performer. A significant portion of this project has been spent learning the musical language of gamelan and outlining the ways in which the Western musical movements of Impressionism and Minimalism were inspired by it. However, this thesis' major focus on performance reveals my attempts to immerse myself in Indonesian arts and culture as a practitioner, not just a scholar. As a performer, being able to interact with gamelan karawitan as a musician and Balinese dance as a dancer (and not just as a researcher)

[69] Herndon, Marcia. "Insiders, Outsiders: Knowing Our Limits, Limiting Our Knowing." *The world of Music* 35.1 (1993): 77. Web.

stresses the importance that I placed on conducting this project in accordance with Mantle Hood's view of bimusicality: to not just interact with the subjects and topics objectively, but to relate to them subjectively. Over coffee, my friend Mori Hensley, a graduate student at Emory, said to this effect "objectivity only gets us so far as researchers. At some point, we must cross over into the realm of subjectivity to truly understand [our subjects]." To this end, I'll never forget wandering past the Anthropology building freshman year and stumbling upon graduate students using primitive hammers and stone tools to fashion Neolithic spear tips. They, as researchers, were not satisfied with merely studying the objects. In order to truly understand these objects and the cultures from which they came, these doctoral students had to physically make the spear tips to understand their subjects. And by doing so they revealed hidden layers of nuance that otherwise would have remained obscure. That is why, as a friend humorously mentioned, I perform my own "stunts" in this project. Beyond the desire to perform this music, to metaphorically "fashion my own spear tips," I also felt the spiritual need to journey to this music's source: Indonesia.

With the generous support of the William Lemonds scholarship, the Bradley Currey, Jr., grant from the Stuart A. Rose Manuscript, Archives and Rare Book Library, and the Friends of Music "From the Heart" award, I conducted ethnomusicological field research in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia, during July and August of 2015. In Indonesia, I studied Central Javanese gamelan and Balinese gamelan with Pak I Madé Lasmawan and traditional Balinese dance with Bu Ketut Marni from July 2nd to August 5th, 2015, opportunities that allowed me to experience the joy of cultural exploration and ethnographic research through immersion and performance. I was a participant on the

program "Experiencing the Arts in Bali," offered by Northern Illinois University, co-instructed by Dr. J.C. Wang, Assistant Professor of Ethnomusicology, and Dr. S.C. Wang, Assistant Professor of Art at Northern Illinois University. To get a broad-based understanding of Indonesian culture and the arts, I performed with the Baturiti, Tabanan, Bali men's gamelan group for performances at several *odalan* temple ceremonies, studied traditional mask making with I Madé Suratha; interviewed Pak Midiyanto (Professor at U.C. Berkeley), Pak Suadin (Professor at Eastman School of Music), and Pak Made (Professor at Colorado College); attended a lecture with Pak Dibia (kecak scholar) and a dance performance in Sukawati with Pak Wenten (Professor at Cal Arts). I attended the Bali Arts Festival in Denpasar, considered to be the premiere cultural event of the year in Bali, and toured Gong Bali, a gong manufacturer in Sukawati. Below is an excerpt of my field journal from July 25th, 2015 that documents my experiences dancing *Baris*, the mythological Balinese warrior, in Baturiti, Bali. This story has been reproduced in the Emory *Frequency*, a publication of WMRE (Emory's student-run radio station), and was published in the Rose Library's online blog on February 8th, 2016.

Excerpt from Field Journal: Performances Abroad.

July 25th, 2015

I awoke early to prepare for the day's festivities. In the distance, the faint echo of neighboring gamelans broke through the morning's shadow and mixed with the eerie calls of mantra singers and the cackling cries of wakening roosters. Bu Ketut had been awake for hours. She had already been to the Baturiti market to purchase jackfruit and rice for the *selametan* feast, the communal meal preceding our performance. She was

quickly slicing tofu and molding tuna sate onto bamboo twigs when I walked into the kitchen. After downing a glass of piping hot White Koffie, I returned to the stage to move the gamelan semar pegulingan and the gamelan angklung into their proper locations. The faint smell of incense met my nose, evidence that Bu Ketut and her sister-in-law Bu Pinti had already made ritual offerings to appease the gods and evil spirits. Last night, they had decorated the stage with intricate palm leaf adornments and ticker-tape-like streamers that twirled in the breeze, suspended from the pavilion's ceiling.

After a very short practice session, we ate a small lunch and began to dress and apply makeup. As some of the village girls in Bu Ketut's dance classes arrived, more and more sequined costumes emerged from the storage closet and were passed around to the performers. They glistened pleasantly in the afternoon light. Loh Deh beckoned me, earnestly calling "Come, come. Baris. Come." She began to apply my makeup, first covering my face with ghostly white foundation, then arching my eyebrows sharply with a deep black pencil that she also used to accentuate my sideburns. With another brush, she applied bright pink makeup above my eyebrows that she blended like a Rothko painting with sapphire blue. She rimmed my eyes with black eyeliner, taking care to draw in upturned wings at their corners like cat eyes. She smiled as she worked, admiring the results of her efforts, and concluded by drawing a small downward facing arrow on my forehead that she dotted with white pearls of cream. She worked quickly, rapidly transforming me into Baris, the warrior of mythology.

I began to feel the power of Baris come into me with each stroke she painted on, with each layer of foundation that expunged my identity and replaced my face with Baris'. Just as Loh Deh finished, we heard Pak Ris shout, "Must go. Taksu, Taksu." It

was time to visit the Taksu temple. I had only a faint understanding of what Taksu was. From what I understood, Taksu was the designation for a temple that directly funneled the prayers of artists to the deities responsible for assuring a good performance. Thus, it was only natural that before we performed, we would meet with a Brahmin priest and pray to the gods and spirits for Taksu to inhabit our bodies, giving us the spiritual energy to become subsumed in our characters.

As the priest at the Taksu temple chanted mantras, Pak Made accompanied him on suling flute. We performed Panca Sembah, the Hindu ritual of "five prayers," beginning with Sanghyang Atma, the prayer to the soul, and ending with Sangyhang Dharma Santi, a prayer giving thanks to the universe and to the many manifestations of the supreme deity. I prayed that I wouldn't forget my dance moves, that the Baris spirit would inhabit me and take charge if I failed to remember my choreography. But more than that, I thanked the Balinese gods for their compassion, for their guidance, and for their hospitality in allowing me to spend a month in their country with their people, learning and reveling in their culture. After dousing ourselves with holy water, we emerged from the temple with rice pasted to our foreheads and flowers tucked delicately behind our ears.

The concert didn't start for another hour. However, I was far from ready. Once we had returned to Pak Made's compound, I raced over to Loh Deh and Bu Ketut who were busy tucking, tying, and fitting costume after costume on the performers. Next came my turn. The dance was hard enough by itself with my arms and legs unhindered, and now the daunting realization that I had to twirl and crouch and leap with 20 pounds of layered ribbons and ties strung across my torso down to my legs was almost more than I could

bear. The Baris, a warrior, even had a heavy Keris (a curved sword) attached diagonally across his back. Once ribbon after ribbon were strung onto me, I felt like a mummy, like the Michelin man, a human marshmallow — I felt like I had layered for a brutal winter blizzard only to realize that the weather was incongruous with my attire; my horror was reflected by the beads of sweat pooling down my face as I trudged around under the tropical sun dressed for a Siberian winter. Each tongue of fabric was covered in sequins delicately sewn with golden thread. The undergarment was a stretchy, white cotton tunic with matching pants edged by sequins and intricately beaded bands of black velvet.

With my makeup finished and my body completely mummified in the Baris costume, there was nothing left for me to do but wait… and worry. And I'm good at worrying. Every few minutes I snuck away to the safety and solace of my room to practice one more agam just to make sure that I remembered the right dance steps. "Right agam, step, step, step," I muttered under my breath. At one point, I forgot the beginning of the dance. My heart stopped. In terror, I mumbled to myself, "was it right agam, turn, stomp, stomp? or left agam, stomp, stomp, turn?" I took a deep breath. Then two more. The panic soon subsided. I trusted in my body's magic, just as I always have. I had been practicing this dance for a month, waking each morning before the sun rose, dancing until my feet blistered. Repetition after repetition cemented it in my sinews. Perhaps it was the energy of Taksu that all performance majors felt in moments when the mind froze during a recital, when some unexplainable, divine muse took control of the body and twirled it perfectly across the stage. My body hadn't failed me yet. I trusted it now to remember. Once the familiar "ch-ch-ch-clang-clap-tap-tap-ta-ta" from the gamelan started, I trusted that my muscles would contort in the right orientation and I, a walking pom pom, would

marvel in surprise as I glided across the stage without any mental input, my feet and arms dragged up and down like a marionette possessed by Taksu.

As six o'clock neared, my heart rate increased and I again began to panic. "What if I mess up? What will they think?" I must have looked terrified and confused because several of the members of the Baturiti men's gamelan came up to me and patted me sympathetically on the back, encouraging me with reassurances — "Bagus" ("good"), they said, as they mimed the dance I would do on stage in less than half an hour. It was in that moment that my nerves were pacified completely — all of them knew this dance, they'd all danced it before, they didn't care that I wasn't a professional. They were excited to see an American make an attempt, thankful that a foreigner was so eager to partake in their cultural rituals and study their performing arts. Whatever I looked like on stage didn't matter — I was Baris, no matter how clumsy, and that was enough to garner their praise and respect. These men had Baris in their blood, and they accepted me as an outsider, a fellow artist. And that was the greatest gift of all.

As the sun went down and the familiar evening mantras played out over the radio and village loudspeakers, it was time to begin. My dance was sixth to be performed. We first played two gamelan Angklung pieces, followed by a two-piece interlude performed by the Baturiti men's gamelan group. Next came pandet, a dance which all of the girls executed masterfully, throwing flowers in the air with gracefully arched backs and beautifully contorted hands, kneeling at one point before exiting the stage in a serpentine line to the clangs of the gongs and the beating drum. Now it was my turn to perform.

I walked to the back of the stage, to where Bu Ketut and Loh Deh were hidden behind a vibrantly decorated scrim that would conceal me from view before my entrance.

The scrim looked like the entrance to a temple, intricately painted with delicate flowers and scowling dragons that looked as if they had been carved from stone. Bu Ketut adjusted my costume for the last time, making sure all of the pleats and tongues were attached and straightened. She silently took off my *udeng* (hat) and placed a triangular headdress atop my head, bejeweled with shells and plastic frangipani flowers that quivered as she worked it down onto my forehead. As she pulled down the neck strap, her eyes whispered "good luck" to me. I heard the drumbeat, the signal that it was time to begin, to face the fifty Balinese people in the audience who waited eagerly to see Baris, the commanding young warrior headed off to battle, a symbol of the strength and triumph of the Balinese and the masculinity of their warriors. As I swiveled my leg, dangling my naked foot beyond the painted scrim and into the eye line of the audience, I heard a collective gasp of excitement.

In that instant, I was no longer myself — I had become Baris, a transformation not merely facilitated by the costume and makeup I wore, but by spiritual inhabitation down to my core. My timid, ponderous steps at the beginning of the dance gave way to the self-assured, machismo motions of a seasoned warrior gliding into battle with confidence. I twirled and stomped, extended my arms dramatically, squinted or opened my eyes wide with intimidating vivacity all while holding my elbows aloft and my chin raised imperiously. As the music swelled, I contorted myself in different, menacingly powerful poses. As the dance came to an end, I swiveled my hip and raised my foot, bowing to the audience with my hands clasped together, upwardly pointed in prayer.

"Thank you," I prayed to Siva, Wishnu, and Brahma. "Thank you." As I *mapaled* off stage, I was greeting by Ketut's warm smile — joyful tears streamed down my face

with the knowledge that I had done what I never thought I would in a place I never thought I'd be. Bu Ketut embraced me, congratulating me on a job well done. I heard people in the audience faintly shouting, "Taksu, Taksu!" As I hugged her, my chest filled with pride and I looked up at the ceiling and again thanked the gods above for giving me good Taksu and for deeming me worthy to have become the Baris.

After the concert concluded, I asked Benong, a close friend of mine from the village, to drive me to a local warung to buy some celebratory beers and kretek clove cigarettes. I clung to him tightly as we whipped around the sharp mountain curves on his scooter, letting the cold wind dry my tears. All of the American students stayed up late, dancing, smoking clove cigarettes, drinking Bintang, embracing our village friends, happy to have performed in a remarkable place so far away from our homes, so unlike anything we could ever have dreamed. We were saddened by the bittersweet realization that tomorrow would spell the end of this trip for many of us. As we talked and laughed, we tried not to think about how hard it would be to say goodbye to each other tomorrow morning. As more and more of us trickled off to bed, saying our penultimate goodbyes, the compound became stiller and stiller, darker and darker, finally enveloped completely by night. The evening darkness was set with a smiling moon and filled with the sound of nature's gamelan, its rhythms lulling us to sleep.

One thing that I must highlight from this reflection: the idea of *Taksu*. As I mentioned in my journal, *Taksu* is the designation for a temple that directly funnels the prayers of artists to the deities responsible for assuring a good performance. If someone has "good Taksu," they have been physically inhabited by the spirit of *Taksu*: the gods and spirits provide the spiritual energy to performers and allow them to become

subsumed in their characters. While I will highlight the relationship between the arts and religious practice in more detail in the next section, I wanted to highlight the impossibility of gaining *Taksu* without performance, necessitating the bimusical approach to be able to appropriately study this interesting facet of Balinese Hinduism.

Performances in the United States.

Additionally, to gain a deeper understanding of Indonesian music and culture, I have performed both as a musician and dancer at Emory University, Wake Forest University, Northern Illinois University, and the Indonesian Consulate of Chicago. Furthermore, on March 15th, 2015, I traveled to Vanderbilt University in Nashville, TN, to attend a concert entitled "VORTEX and the American Gamelan with New Dialect," a concert that featured the works of Henry Cowell, Lou Harrison and John Pennington. At this concert, Vanderbilt's percussion ensemble Vortex performed on an American Gamelan, one of only four built in the world.[70]

With the assistance of the Emory Scholars Travel Grant, I traveled to Winston-Salem, NC, on Thursday, October 29th, 2015, to attend Wake Forest University's ritual dedication of their Balinese Gamelan at the request of Associate Professor of Ethnomusicology Elizabeth Clendinning. She taught at Emory during the 2013 – 2014 school year on a one-year interim appointment while she was finishing her doctoral dissertation. At 7:30 p.m. in Wake Forest University's Brendle Recital Hall, the gamelan ensemble, comprised of eighteen Wake Forest University students and Piedmont Triad community members, presented a sold-out concert of Indonesian dance and music. This

[70] "American Gamelan" refers to gamelan built in the United States. They are often tuned to the Western 12-tone equal temperament. See Gamelan Son of Lion (NYC), Gamelan Pacifica (Seattle, WA), or Gamelan Si Betty at Harvard University (Cambridge, Mass.) for other examples.

celebration was especially significant for the Wake Forest University community because Dr. Clendinning had recently been hired as the first ethnomusicologist on faculty and, through her efforts and visionary leadership, the university was able to acquire its first Balinese gamelan set. Furthermore, the ceremony not only featured an exhibition of dance and music, but included a ritual dedication of the ensemble: as part of this ceremony, Pak I Madé Lasmawan named the gamelan *Giri Murti*, which means "Magical Forest," and propitiated the gamelan's spirit by providing ritual offerings of fruit, Rupiyah, and incense to bless the ensemble's gong, the holiest instrument in the ensemble. In this way, Emory and Wake Forest are sister schools — they share their "Mother of the Gamelan" and guru, bearing in mind the fact that Pak Madé also conducted the ritual blessing and name dedication of Emory's gamelan ensemble in 2013 at the behest of Dr. Clendinning, a celebration for which I was also in attendance and at which I performed At Wake, I performed two dance pieces with *Giri Murti*: Baris Tunggal (a solo Balinese Warrior dance) and as the leader of the *Raksasa* in *Kecak Rama Sita* (a Ramayana dance drama). As *Raksasa*, I accompanied the 80-person Wake Forest University Concert Choir in a performance of vocal gamelan. In a review article written by Anthony Harrison titled "Peace which Passeth Understanding," published on November 4th, 2015, in the Greensboro, Winston-Salem, and High Point publication TriCity Beat, Harrison described my performance in the following way: "Ryan Sutherland… performed '*Baris Tunggal*,' a warrior dance, in severe makeup, a crown shaped like a silver spade and a coat of tapestry armor which splayed like wings with Sutherland's wild twirls and stuttering, wide-kneed steps."[71] Additionally, Harrison

[71] Harrison, Anthony. "Peace Which Passeth Understanding." *Triad City Beat* [Greensboro]. 04 Nov. 2015. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

described the kecak performance: “the concert ended with Lasmawan’s arrangement of the traditional ‘*Kecak Rama Sita*,’ a ballet depicting a story from the Hindu epic Ramayana. Choreographer Marni, Clendinning, Sutherland and Sammy Moorin featured as characters in the tale of kidnapping and the triumph of good over evil, accompanied by the Wake Forest University Concert Choir.”[72] I Madé Lasmawan, who conducted the ritual blessing and naming of the gamelan, was the instructor with whom I had studied Javanese and Balinese gamelan this past summer at his home in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia as a participant in a study abroad program entitled “Experiencing the Arts in Bali” offered by Northern Illinois University. Pak Madé has come to Emory on several occasions, performing with the Emory Gamelan Ensemble in Spring 2013, Spring 2014 (for a Wayang Kulit performance, an Indonesian shadow puppet play, with Pak Midiyanto from U.C. Berkeley), and Fall 2015 (for an evening of Indonesian dance and music as well as an accompanying lecture-performance). Furthermore, I reconnected with Ni Ketut Marni at the Wake performance (Pak Madé’s wife) with whom I had studied traditional Balinese dance, also an instructor who I had met through the Northern Illinois University study abroad program and who had accompanied Pak Madé to perform at Emory with the Gamelan Ensemble during the Fall 2015 Indonesian dance and music concert.

On Friday, October 30th, 2015, I traveled from Greensboro, NC, to Chicago’s O’Hare International Airport and drove to Dekalb, Illinois, to perform the Balinese warrior dance *Tari Baris* at Northern Illinois University at the request of Associate Professor of Musicology and Ethnomusicology Dr. J. C. Wang and Associate Professor of Art and Design Education Dr. S. C. Wang. At 12:00pm in the Recital Hall at the NIU

[72] Ibid.

School of Music, I was accompanied by Professor I Gusti Ngurah Kertayuda and the NIU Balinese Gamelan Ensemble on a concert entitled “A Showcase of Balinese Music, Art, and Dance: A Multimedia Presentation.” This concert featured performances by undergraduate and graduate participants on the 2015 NIU study abroad program “Experiencing the Arts in Bali.” As described in the concert program, “music, dance and theater along with art and crafts are important parts of Balinese culture. The ceremonial nature of the arts reflects the multiple layers of religious practices and philosophies embedded in a complex sociocultural structure of Balinese society. The inseparable relationships among these arts provide a vivid soundscape and landscape for students to experience the functions of the arts in a living environment.” The program featured several traditional pieces performed on Gamelan Angklung such as Sekar Sandat and Capung Gantung, as well as examples of traditional Balinese dance and popular Balinese music, a short video presentation, and a display of Balinese woodcut prints. In addition to performing Tari Baris, I also presented my research poster that had been featured at Emory’s 2015 Fall Research Symposium on Saturday, October 24th, 2015 that discussed themes of exoticism and appropriation, outlining the influence of the gamelan on Western music. This poster outlined the core areas of research that I explore within this paper.

On Saturday, October 31st, I was invited to attend a Balinese gamelan rehearsal at the Indonesian Consulate by Pak I Putu Tangkas Adi Hiranmayena, musical director of the Indonesian Consulate General of Chicago. We practiced excerpts from the piece I had danced (Baris Tungaal, Tari Baris) and practiced several *Kotekan* (interlocking) parts, all on the Indonesian Cultural Center. I felt the need to journey to Chicago because, in a way, this was the place where the *North* Western fascination with the gamelan began.

The gamelan set that was performed at the 1893 world's Columbian Exposition — the first performance of gamelan in the United States — is still on display at the Field Museum.

Finally, this thesis is accompanied by piano performances of Debussy's *Pagodes* and Satie's *Gnossienne No. 1*, a celeste performance of Bartók's *From the Isle of Bali*, and a saxophone performance of Lou Harrison's *for Carlos Chavez*, a piece that was originally written for gamelan and viola but that I transposed and arranged for Tenor saxophone. A video of my dance performance (*Baris*) at NIU is also included in this thesis. I have performed with the Emory Gamelan Ensemble since Spring of 2013, and have played every instrument in Emory's Central Javanese Gamelan. Having travelled to Bali, I am also proficient in several new and old styles of Balinese gamelan. I will be performing Satie's *Gnossiennes* and Debussy's *Pagodes* for the Spring 2016 Emory Gamelan Ensemble concert on April 15th, 2016.

Establishing an Archive.

With the assistance of the Friends of Music Student Research Grant, I attended the Society for Ethnomusicology's 2014 national conference in Pittsburgh, PA, an opportunity that allowed me to improve my understanding of gamelan repertoire and performance techniques and connect with international gamelan performers and scholars such as Judith Becker, Elizabeth Clendinning, Andrew Weintraub, and Pak Sumarsam. Furthermore, I have extensively utilized the resources offered by the Marian K. Heilbrun Music & Media Library and the Rose Library for this project. This thesis has allowed me

the unique opportunity to interact directly with archival librarians who have assisted me in developing and refining important research skills that have been invaluable to me as an undergraduate researcher, interactions that have equipped me with the skillset to search for, compile, and interpret ethnographic data from a variety of sources. As a result of my collaborations with librarians in the Marian K. Heilbrun Music & Media Library and archivists in the Stuart A. Rose Library, I have added an archival component to my thesis that aims to document the history of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble and preserve gamelan compositions, an archive for use by future researchers and ensemble members. I have worked directly with John Bence, the University Archivist; Joyce Clinkscales, a Music Librarian in the Heilbrun Music & Media Library; as well as members of Emory Center for Digital Scholarship. Why is this archival project of importance to the university, to the Emory Gamelan Ensemble, and to the broader community of scholars and musicians? Without an open-access archive that includes copies of gamelan music, interviews with gamelan experts, and recordings of traditional performances, this culture will die in Indonesia and internationally. As is mentioned by the 1830 publication by Sir Thomas Stamford Raffles, *History of Java*, "the Javans do not note down or commit their music to writing: the national airs, of which I myself have counted above a hundred, are preserved by the ear alone."[73] This practice has not changed over the centuries. A culture that is preserved solely within the collective memories of its members is in a precarious position. In a discussion with Tara Hatfield, a Masters student in ethnomusicology at the University of Illinois at Champaign-Urbana and a close personal friend, she directed my attention to her friend Tyler Yamin, a former member of USD Balinese Gamelan who conducted extensive ethnographic research in a small, mountainous village in Bali with

[73] Raffles, Thomas Stamford. *The History of Java*. London: Murray, 1830. 527. Print.

distinguished gamelan instructor I Wayan Sumendra. According to an article in the *Daily Bruin*, "Tyler Yamin, an ethnomusicology graduate student [at UCLA], was once the only person in the world who knew how to play 'Semar Pegulingan' repertoire of the Klungkung Palace after his teacher passed away."[74] After the instructor died, many members the Semar Pegulingan Bale Batur, Kamasan, in an attempt to revive their cultural heritage, reached out to Tyler for his expertise on their native performance practices as the student of their deceased guru. This story struck me as similar to one that I read about Canadian ethnomusicologist and gamelan champion Colin McPhee whose pivotal text "A House in Bali" is, as Carol Oja claims in *Colin McPhee: A Composer in Two* worlds, not only a record of gamelan *karawitan* but one that documents how McPhee helped to revitalize the tradition in Bali and garner international interest that ultimately *preserved* this music: "through his gamelan revivals McPhee not only preserved a record of dying repertories but also brought the music back to life."[75] As I said to John Bence when we met to discuss the need for this archive, "when a guru dies, a library dies," and a culture gets one step closer to the brink of extinction. Many of the older gamelan scholars and musicians are passing away. I received this email message in December of 2015 from Elizabeth Ozment, a professor of ethnomusicology and a member of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble:

> I learned today that Hardja Susilo passed away… I mention this because I heard several of you mention his name this year. The society [SEM] honored him today for being a prolific teacher/composer, and he had been selected this year for an honorary membership, which he was alerted of before he passed. So we go to UT Austin tonight, but many

[74] Acosta, Gail. "Sounds of Schoenberg: The Balinese Gamelan Ensemble." *Daily Bruin*. UCLA, 16 Oct. 2015. Web. 17 Feb. 2016. Arts & Entertainment Section. Features interview with Tyler Yamin

[75] Oja, Carol J. Colin McPhee: Composer in Two worlds. Washington: Smithsonian Institution, 1990. 134. Print.

people will use that concert to reflect on Susilo's career in Hawaii & California.[76]

Another message, shared by Mindy K. Johnston on Pak Midiyanto's Facebook page in February of 2016, mourned the passing of Vincent McDermott, eminent Javanese gamelan scholar and composer:

> I am sad and shocked to hear the news of Vincent McDermott's passing. He was a teacher and friend these past 20 years, and only recently emailed me to give his praises and support of the gamelan CD we are working on — on instruments he is responsible for bringing to Lewis & Clark over 30 years ago. Vincent changed my life in the most surprising and unexpected way after introducing me to gamelan when I was 18 or 19 years old. His influence on my life sent me running with open arms down a path I couldn't have imagined, first learning gamelan with Midiyanto and that eventually led to living for many years in Solo, a place that feels like home. Vincent was good at getting our youthful brains to dream bigger, and as a result he gave me one of the greatest gifts in my life. I'm grateful to have some of his instruments, and to have had the opportunity to spend some time with him a few years ago when he last visited Portland. Sending love to his wife and children — and everyone else who will miss him in this world![77]

Many of the children of gamelan masters are choosing to pursue other more lucrative careers. At the Bali Arts Festival, Pak Bandem, the past Rector of the Indonesian Institute of the Arts in Jogjakarta, said half-seriously and half-humorously "all of my children are doctors… I am so disappointed."[78] Perhaps most relevant to this project is the fact that I recently received an email from Claire Marie Hefner, the Emory Gamelan Ensemble's artistic director and a PhD student in Anthropology, that stressed the urgent need to

[76] Ozment, Elizabeth. "Susilo." Message to the author. 6 Dec. 2015. E-mail.
[77] Johnston, Mindy K. "Vincent McDermott." Facebook. 11 Feb 2016. Accessed 11 Feb 2016. Addressed to Pak Midiyanto.
[78] Jeremy Grimshaw mentioned this to me after a personal communication with Pak Bandem at the Bali Arts Festival in Denpasar, Bali. July 2015.

establish an archive immediately that contains historical records of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble. Here is an excerpt of her email:

> As many of you know, quite a few gamelans around the country are under threat of being closed these days — including ours. A few years ago, Michigan's Javanese gamelan was going to be dismantled and a petition was sent around to help keep it open. This year, it's UMASS-Darmouth's gamelan and the petition below addresses the call to keep it open. Please consider taking a moment to sign and show your support for the UMASS-Dartmouth ensemble.[79]

Claire's email exposes a sad fact: music departments all over the country are defunding gamelan ensembles. Considering that 60% of ensembles are affiliated with institutions of higher education, this trend is worrisome.[80] Why is this occurring? In my opinion, gamelan is not seen to be as relevant as it used to be to ethnomusicologists or music departments, perhaps because so much scholarship has been published on it in the past fifty years and perhaps because "exoticism," "orientalism" and fascination with southeast Asia is not as pronounced as it was in the 1950s through 1970s. Discussing the history of the gamelan in America, Andrew McGraw notes that

> Gamelan was first performed in America in Chicago at the East Indies pavilion in the world's Columbian Exposition in 1893. The music would not be performed again in America until the mid-1950s when the scholar Mantle Hood brought gamelan ensembles and teachers to UCLA's Institute for Ethnomusicology. During the subsequent two decades gamelan ensembles flourished at colleges and universities across the nation. This was partly a result of governmental research investment in Southeast Asian studies. The production of new knowledge about the region was encouraged by intense cold-war era competition for military and political control in Asia generally. The decades of the New Order [Suharto's stridently pro-

[79] Hefner, Claire-Marie. "Gamelan Petition." Message to the author. 26 Dec. 2016. E-mail.
[80] Benary, Barbara. "Directory of Gamelan Groups: United States." American Gamelan Institute. Ed. Sharon Millman. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

> Western "New Order" (1966-1998)] were the salad days of American gamelan, and ensembles were founded on many liberal arts campuses. The large ensembles fit well into the structure of American academia; the formulaic structuring of parts, most with a gentle learning curve, allowed departments to move up to 30 students at a time through introductory courses and to present end-of-semester concerts on spectacular sets of exotic instruments which became an elite status marker for many American campuses.[81]

While it might be prestigious and (somewhat) accessible, gamelan is certainly not seen as integral to a Western musical education that takes a Eurocentric approach to the study of music. Emory University possesses the sole Central Javanese Gamelan in the state of Georgia, one of only several complete Gamelans with *pelog* and *slendro* tunings in the Southeastern United States. Furthermore, most introductory music theory texts only address Common Practice theory, an approach to Western tonal and harmonic music up until 1900. Foreseeably, an undergraduate in music could graduate from Emory (or any peer institution) by taking courses in performance, research, or composition without having attended more than one lecture on the gamelan or world music in a music history course (such as MUS 200, "Music, Culture, and Society").

At the present, the gamelan is the only world music ensemble active in the Emory department. Alarmingly, Schwantner described gamelan as a "fad," a word that Merriam Webster describes as "something (such as an interest or fashion) that is very popular for a short time."[82] Has the gamelan come to be seen as peripheral in its own department? Or perhaps other methodologies are replacing bimusicality, deemphasizing the ensemble and performance as integral aspects of research. More broadly, is gamelan falling out of

---

[81] McGraw, Andrew. "The Gamelan and Indonesian Music in America." OUP Blog. Oxford University Press, 27 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[82] Webster, Noah. "Fad." *New Collegiate Dictionary*. A Merriam-Webster. Springfield, MA: G. & C. Merriam, 1953. Print.

popularity amongst composers and listeners both in the United States and abroad? In Indonesia, this trend is already pronounced. Sumarsam writes that “members of the younger generation [in Indonesia]…think that gamelan is old-fashioned, irrelevant to the modern world.”[83] He asserts that the “mixture of traditional gamelan and non-gamelan music (in particular Western music) has been popular among the younger generation. By “mixing” with “international” music, gamelan no longer is outdated — it becomes modern.”[84] But its position as “modern” and as “hybrid” jeopardizes its position as “authentic.” Perceived inauthenticity might detract from its international (Western) listenership because, as Eisentraut stated, “listeners are…attracted to what they do not know.”[85] If we ‘know it’ (Western hybrid), it ceases to be “other” and might cease to be attractive. Out of curiosity, I typed in the search terms “Gamelan” and “United States” in Google Trends. This simple search showcased a significant decline in search activity: gamelan was searched almost three times more in the United States in 2004 than it was in 2015 (search volume index).[86] Additionally, in a 2008 *New York Times* article entitled “Is Indonesia’s Native Music Fading?” Sukarna, owner of the Gong Factory, stated that “overall orders [of gamelan] continue to decline.”[87]

However, while Pak Hartana agrees that “the importance of traditional Javanese gamelan performance in everyday life in Java has been decreasing,” he claims that “these

---

[83] Sumarsam. “Performing Colonialism.” Javanese Gamelan and the West. Rochester: U of Rochester, 2013. 30. Print.
[84] Ibid.
[85] Eisentraut, Jochen. “An Outline Topography of Musical Accessibility: Society, Atonality, Psychology.” The Accessibility of Music: Participation, Reception and Contact. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2013. 61. Print.
[86] In Google Trends, I entered the search term: “Gamelan: Musical Instrument.” Next, I entered the Secondary search term “United Sates.” Search was conducted on March 1st, 2016. Results suggest that gamelan was searched almost three times more in the United States in 2004 than it was in 2015 (search volume index).
[87] Gelling, Peter. “Is Indonesia's Native Music Fading?” The New York Times [New York] 27 Feb. 2008 Asia Pacific. Web.

trends in Java conflict with the great growth in international interest in gamelan music (Notes, concerns, and hopes for Javanese Gamelan)."[88] Even the American Gamelan Institution claims that "as of January 2013, there are approximately 170 listings, an increase of about 60 from the version posted in 2011. Of those, approximately 130 are active, 15 are permanently disbanded, and 25 are somewhere in between."[89] I question these statistics. The number of gamelan ensembles in the United States is a poor measure of the vitality and richness of the tradition. In fact, although many see the "contemporary, non-traditionalist Indonesian gamelan scene as healthy and thriving," some scholars like Barry Drummond worry that "the older [traditional] stuff is dying out."[90] This is the realization that has necessitated an archive. With the support of Genevieve Tauxe, Robert Tauxe, Pak Madé Lasmawan, Pak Midiyano, Elizabeth Clendinning, Neil Fried, Scott Kugle, and Steve Everett, as well as many members of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble, I have been able to amass a collection of more than 200 scans of traditional *karawitan*, recordings, interviews, videos of performances, as well as ephemera that document the history of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble. These materials will be deposited in Emory University's archive at the Rose Library for the purpose of preserving this culture and its musical traditions for perpetuity and will be included in the appendix section of my printed thesis and as a supplemental file on the ETD site. Furthermore, a document outlining the history of the Emory Gamelan ensemble will also be included in the

---

[88] Sutrino, Hartana. "Notes, concerns, and hopes for Javanese Gamelan." Unpublished. Appearing on the website for the Institute of Asian Research, University of British Columbia. http://www.iar.ubc.ca/centres/csear/webpage/8-Hartana.pdf. Also see: Hartana, Sutrisno Setya. "Javanese Gamelan in The Paku Alaman palace: The Repertoire of Uyon-uyon Muryararas" A thesis submitted to the requirement for the degree of Master of Arts in the Faculty of Graduate Studies in the University of British Columbia, 2006.
[89] Benary, Barbara. "Directory of Gamelan Groups: United States." American Gamelan Institute. Ed. Sharon Millman. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Found under "Quick Facts."
[90] Mason, Amelia. "What Is Gained, and Lost, When Indonesian Gamelan Music Is Americanized." Artery 19 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Publication of 90.9 WBUR, Boston's NPR News Station.

appendix of this printed thesis and as a supplemental ETD file. I am doing this so that this information will always be searchable through my thesis on Emory's Electronic Theses and Dissertations site.

Public Presentation of Scholarship.

Finally, from the very beginning of this project, I've wanted it to engage the public, to broadcast my results to the world. To do this, I have lectured in MUS 200 "Music, Culture and Society" and MUS 204W "Music Cultures of the world" on the gamelan and Balinese dance, courses offered by the Emory Music Department, and have made it my goal to constantly advertise the gamelan ensemble to students, faculty, and community members. I was selected to speak at the inaugural "Music Major and Minor Mixer" on September 25th, 2015 about my fieldwork experiences in Bali, and was chosen as a semi-finalist for TEDx Emory's "Student Speaker Competition" for a discussion of my thesis research. Furthermore, I received the 2014 Emory Undergraduate Research Award from the Robert W. Woodruff Library for a submission entitled "Exoticism and Musical Appropriation: The Javanese Gamelan in Debussy's "Pagodes" (1903) and Russian Folk Music in Stravinsky's *Le Sacre du Printemps* (1913)," a paper that I have incorporated into this thesis and elaborated upon and I presented at the Spring 2014 Undergraduate Research Symposium held in the Dobbs University Center. I also discussed my thesis research at the Fall 2015 Undergraduate Research Symposium, as well as at NIU following my dance presentation (hosted by the Center for Southeast Asian Studies). I have also sat for an interview on the gamelan ensemble on ARTiculate, Emory's only arts broadcasting radio show on WMRE. I have even requested that my

thesis defense be public. I presented the gamelan among other world music instruments at the American College of Dance Association's Southeast conference, hosted at Emory University from March 9th – 12th, 2016, and have recently been asked to present my research in the format of a research-recital at Northern Illinois University on April 9th, 2016, during their world music festival.

Lastly, I had one inflexible stipulation that I discussed with John Bence, the University Archivist concerning the gamelan archive: the archive must be open-access, freely accessible to the public. In all ways, this project is meant to inform the public about gamelan, one of Emory's most incredible resources — it is, after all, one of the only gamelans in the Southeastern United States and is the only one in the state of Georgia. These are all ways that I have attempted to advertise the world music Program and the gamelan at Emory University and in the city of Atlanta — I have been so adamant about making this project public for the purpose of convincing the public that gamelan is not peripheral, but is centrally important to our understanding of modern Western music ("self"). In this way, this tradition can be preserved and revitalized.

The Javanese and Balinese Gamelan.

Indonesia is a land of over 17,000 islands, each with a unique cultural identity and heritage. In fact, the national motto of Indonesia is *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika,* which means "unity in diversity," a sentiment that adequately encapsulates the diversity of the arts in this archipelago.[91] On first glance, one might assume that Javanese batik, Balinese wood carving, Sumba ikat, pottery from Lombok, and traditional dance from Nusa Tenggara Timur are all expressions of a broader Pan-Indonesian identity. However, while each is indeed Indonesian, it is more accurate to view them as provincial expressions of cultural identity rather than national ones. According to Pak Sumarsam, an ethnomusicologist at Wesleyan University and renowned gamelan scholar, "each of hundreds of ethnic groups and subgroups has its own local characteristic, in language, customs, forms of organization, ritual, dances, music and other cultural expressions."[92] In accordance with this assertion, R. Anderson Sutton mentions in his text *Traditions of Gamelan Music in Java: Musical Pluralism and Regional Identity* that he "heard again and again [from local musicians and other Javanese] that each area (*daerah*) had its own arts (*kesenian*) – or culture (*kebudayaan*) or customs (*adat*),"[93] a sentiment that can be accurately expanded to reflect the regional differences in art and culture within Indonesia. This regional character, what the Balinese consider *lain desa lain adat* ("different village different customs"),[94] is also expressed in the many (over 700) languages that are spoken in the

---

[91] Vickers, Adrian. *A History of Modern Indonesia.* Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2005. 1. Print.

[92] Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 1. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.

[93] Sutton, R. Anderson. *Traditions of Gamelan Music in Java: Musical Pluralism and Regional Identity*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 1991. 235. Print.

[94] Blussé, L. *India and Indonesia from the 1920s to the 1950s: The Origins of Planning*. E.J. Brill Publications: Leiden and New York, 1987. 93. Print.

archipelago. Although the Indonesian Government under Suharto established an official, unifying national language in 1949 (Bahasa Indonesia),[95] regions still maintain their provincial languages in day-to-day use — while I was in Bali, it was pointed out to me that the only people who spoke Bahasa Indonesia daily were mostly Javanese immigrants who had settled in Bali. Even though all Balinese knew the Bahasa Indonesia language as obligate polyglots, they rarely used it on a daily basis, choosing instead to use the Balinese language in the presence of fellow Balinese. Likewise, the Javanese immigrants preferred to speak Javanese around their compatriots. The national language is certainly of functional value, but regionalism (language, culture, traditions, etc.) trumps nationalist sentiments. But the gamelan, despite its regional associations and provincial character, can be considered one of only several truly Pan-Indonesian art forms. While Indonesian arts have long been celebrated for their diversity and regional flair, few would dispute that the gamelan is a cultural icon of national Indonesian identity. Moreover, no other Indonesian music or art form has been celebrated or investigated as enthusiastically as the gamelan by Indonesians and foreigners alike. In the following section, I focus only on Javanese and Balinese gamelan but do so only generally. Many different types of gamelan exist even within Java and Bali, and much has been written about these instruments by scholars such as Michael Tenzer, Michael Bakan, Sumarsam, and Judith Becker. In order to contextualize gamelan, this chapter presents a broad sociocultural background of Java and Bali and delineates aspects of both these lineages that I feel have been appropriated by Western movements.

[95] Sugiharto, Setiono. "Indigenous Language Policy as a National Cultural Strategy." *The Jakarta Post* [Jakarta]. 28 Oct. 2013. Web. 13 March 2016.

There are several reasons that explain why the gamelan is considered a national instrument. Firstly, the gamelan is one of the most ancient arts in the archipelago. According to legend, the ancient god-king Sang Hyang Guru during the Saka era in 230 A.D., who ruled imperiously over Java from a mountaintop palace in Medang Kamulan on the peak of Maendra mountain (presently Mount Lawu), needed a way to communicate with the gods — so he invented the first gong. Unsatisfied with the limited communication potential one gong afforded him, he constructed others so that he could send more nuanced messages to the divinities, and thus the gamelan ensemble was born.[96] While the origination of the gamelan is somewhat speculative when considering this origin myth — in fact, the origin of many sacred musics is rooted in legend rather than historical fact — historical evidence does exist that more accurately proposes the date of its inception.

Historically, Java was not immune from the far-reaching influences of the Indian subcontinent that spread Hindu and Buddhist teachings throughout the South Pacific and Indochina. These sister religions soon took root in Java and Sumatra and carried with them their musics and culture.[97] Although limited evidence exists that tells us precisely when these religions from the Indian subcontinent first arrived in Indonesia, Sanskrit writings mention a Hindu Dvipantara (Jawa Dwipa) kingdom that was already well-established by 200 B.C. Buddhism followed several centuries later. Other clues, such as architectural ruins (temples, statues, etc.), corroborate these claims and highlight this ancient influence: Borobudor, a Mahayana Buddhist temple found in Central Java

---

[96] Warsodiningrat, R.T. Serat Weda Pradangga. Cited in Roth, A. R. *New Compositions for Javanese Gamelan*. University of Durham, PhD Dissertation, 1986. 4. Print.
[97] Lentz, Donald A. *The Gamelan Music of Java and Bali: An Artistic Anomaly Complementary to Primary Tonal Theoretical Systems*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1965. 5. Print.

thought to have been constructed in the 9th century, is the largest Buddhist temple in the world, very similar in construction to Ankor Wat in Cambodia; furthermore, a statue of the Hindu god Ganesha dating back to the 1st century A.D. was found atop Mount Raksa on Panaitan Island that gives us some clue as to when Hindu kingdoms first colonized the archipelago.[98] The Saliendra Dynasty, responsible for the construction of Borabudor, represented the height of Buddhist influence in Java. And the Hindu Muhajapit empire lived in harmony with Buddhists, but both Buddhism and Hinduism quickly eroded after the Muslim invasion.[99] Evidence of their prominence is still seen in *prasasti*, stone monuments that remain in areas where the Mataram kingdom once stood, as well as the four remaining Hindu courts (*kraton*) in Joogjakarta and Solo. Yet their impact persists today—performances of *wayang kulit* (puppetry) and dance-dramas in Java showcase storylines that are excerpted from the Hindu epics Mahabharata and Ramayana, but which feature aspects of Buddhism, animism, and Islam. How old is the gamelan actually? After dating stone reliefs found in ancient Hindu and Buddhist temples, carvings that depict musicians with gong-like instruments and drums that likely represented the earliest gamelans such as those in Borobudur temple in the Megelang Regency of Java from the Srivijaya Empire (6 -13 AD), it seems more plausible that the instrument was developed and came into broader social use closer to the 12th century

[98] Subramuniyaswami, Satguru Sivaya. *Loving Ganesa: Hinduism's Endearing Elephant-Faced God*. Himalayan Academy: India and USA, 1996. 287. Print.
[99] Coedès, George. *The Indianized States of Southeast Asia*. Trans. Susan Brown Cowing. Ed. Walter F. Vella. University of Hawaii Press, Manao: 1968. Print.

(Munggang and Kodokngorek),[100] yet the "golden age" is often cited as the 16th century.[101]

Additionally, Java, the birthplace of the gamelan, was a major hub of commerce and political power in Indonesia since the onset of the 17th century — not only was Java the largest island within the archipelago, but it also was one of the most abundantly resourced. As Pak Sumarsam mentions, "Java has a long and rich history, spanning from the era of the oldest human species, the 'Java man,' to the period of Hinduization, Islamization and Westernization of the island. Significantly, for many centuries Java has been the principal locus both of power and international commerce and communication."[102] After the Javanese dynasty of Mataram fell, Java frequently interacted with European and Middle Eastern merchants, dealings that established a profitable Southeast Asian trade route that exploited these vast resources for centuries and exposed Javanese culture and music to the world. Its position as a powerful trade center straddling the Indian and Pacific Oceans soon attracted the attention of the Dutch who colonized Indonesia in the 18th century. Notwithstanding colonial invasion, Java retained its position as a powerful economic and political epicenter, becoming the regional headquarters of the Dutch government in Indonesia.[103][104]

---

[100] R.T. Warsodiningrat. Serat Weda Pradangga. Cited in Roth, A. R. *New Compositions for Javanese Gamelan*. University of Durham, PhD Dissertation, 1986. 4 - 8. Print

[101] For more information about the ties between Indonesia and India, the reader should direct their attention to a 2015 paper entitled "Socio-cultural Relations between India and Indonesia" written by Mohd Tahseen Zaman. A lengthier introduction to the history of Java and Bali can be provided within M. C. Ricklefs' *A History of Modern Indonesia Since c.1300* (1981) and (for a more modern view) Adrian Vickers' *A History of Modern Indonesia* (2013).

[102] Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 2. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.

[103] "Mataram, Historical Kingdom, Indonesia." *Encyclopaedia Britannica*. ncyclopædia Britannica Online. Encyclopædia Britannica Inc., 2016. Web. 21 Mar. 2016.

[104] Ricklefs, M.C. *A History of Modern Indonesia Since c.1300, 2nd Edition*. London: MacMillan, 1991. 110. Print.

While many early Dutch explorers did much to preserve the cultural heritage of the Javanese and Balinese, these less-than-benevolent colonial overseers exploited the country in the same way that other imperialist nations did during the 18th, 19th and early 20th centuries: they stold many relics from Indonesia, exported its major resources, taxed natives heavily, deposed native leaders and dismantled local government structures that were disloyal to the Dutch while strengthening the *prisaji* (nobility) that were sympathetic to the colonial government. Their "Ethical Policy," spurred by international reaction to harsh Dutch colonial policies and the news of mass *puputan* (suicides) and genocides, did little to better the lives of the average citizen, only fueled nationalistic sentiments.[105] To a certain extent, an anti-Dutch sentiment is observable today. After one rehearsal with the Baturiti men's gamelan ensemble, Pak Madé mentioned that in order to "receive a PhD in Balinese culture, one had to go to the Netherlands." Even the international airport in Denpasar, Bali reflects this sentiment: it is named after I Gusti Ngurah Rai, an Indonesian war hero who was killed in 1946 at the Battle of Margarana during the Indonesian War of Independence against the Dutch. He is also featured on the 50,000 Rp note, a denomination that is second in value only to the 100,000 Rp note, which also features independence heroes Sukarno (first President of Indonesia) and Hatta (first Vice President of Indonesia), who were instrumental in ousting the Dutch and establishing a free Indonesia.

While colonialism certainly had its downsides, it also popularized the gamelan to the world and acted to preserve this musiculture. In fact, Jaap Kunst — who coined the terms "ethnomusicology" and "colotomy" (gamelan repertoire's repetitive, hierarchical

---

[105] Robinson, Geoffrey. "Political Conflict and Violence in Modern Bali." *The Dark Side of Paradise: Political Violence in Bali*. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1995. 1-17. Print.

structure of melody and rhythm), and whose text *Ethnomusicology* established the first approach to this discipline — was employed by the Dutch colonial government; even Sir Stamford Raffles, the Lieutenant-Governor of Java during British colonization, wrote the first history text about the island.[106] And beyond colonialism, western interest in gamelan has, in some ways, revitalized Indonesians' interests in their own culture and has lead to its continued evolution. *Kecak*, or "vocal gamelan," now considered a traditional form, would not have existed had it not been for the inspiration of the German Walter Spies who collaborated with I Wayan Dulu at the behest of the king of Ubud to inspire tourism and to transform Ubud into an "international village."[107] The West has played a valuable role in the preservation of this musiculture in other ways as well: our culture values notation. The *kepatihan* cypher notation method is thought to be a derivative of the Galin-Paris-Chevé system that was imported to Indonesia by Christian missionaries in the 19th century.[108] And the Surakarta notation appears similar to the Parsons Code for Melodic Contours, developed in Germany. Furthermore, as mentioned previously, Colin McPhee's ethnographic research of traditional gamelan sonorities helped to preserve and rejuvenate Indonesian interest in traditional gamelan. Without this early scholarship, it is doubtful that gamelan would have received an international audience, and is likely that many traditional forms would have died out in Java and Bali.

Java's political and commercial eminence is still evident today. The Javanese city of Jakarta, the present capital of Indonesia, is currently home to almost ten million

---

[106] Raffles, Thomas Stamford. *The History of Java*. London: Murray, 1830. Print.
[107] Stepputat, Kendra. "The Genesis of a Dance-Genre: Walter Spies and the Kecak." In *The Ethnographers of the Last Paradise: Victor von Plessen and Walter Spies in Indonesia.* Bielefeld: 2010. 267 – 85., pp. 267–285, online: http://ethnomusikologie.kug.ac.at/fileadmin/media/institut-13/Dokumente/Downloads/Stepputat_Walter_Spies_and_the_Kecak.pdf . Web. 12 March 2016.
[108] Sadra, I. Wayan, et al. "'Komposisi Baru': On Contemporary Composition in Indonesia." *Leonardo Music Journal*. 1.1 (1991): 19–24. Web. 12 March 2016.

people. In fact, while the island of Java only boasts one-third of the national population (roughly 141 million people out of 249 million), its population accounts for a majority of the nation's gross domestic product.[109] The population of Java is defined by extremes: drastic class divisions are highlighted by immense wealth appearing adjacent to extreme poverty, extremely citified and populated regions abut expansive rice fields, and pronounced religious divisions are delimited by geographical and sociocultural segregation. These pronounced religious divisions have existed since the fall of the ancient Hindu kingdoms (the *kraton* palaces are remnants of the powerful Hindu society that once dominated the island around the 12th century) and subsequent Islamicization when the Demak Sultinate took power. Geographically, these religious partitions serve to highlight the historical path of the mass Hindu exodus following the Muslim invasion — today, most Hindus that remain in Java reside in the mountains of East Java, farthest away from the ancient Muslim city-states of invaders who did not venture far from the coastlines into the interior of the island. Although some Hindus fled into the mountains, the majority of Hindus crossed the narrow Java strait and migrated to Bali, an island that remains predominantly Hindu today as a result of this emigration.[110]

With them, these emigrants brought the gamelan; although trade was maintained between the two islands, the "schism" (with most Hindus living in Bali, and few Hindus remaining in Muslim-dominated Java) caused Balinese gamelan types to diverge from those in Java over time. Yet even after Muslim invasion, gamelan persisted on Java and is still observed as an integral but slowly diminishing part of the Javanese society today. The gamelan — a Hindu instrument — is linked so tightly to Indonesian identity that it

[109] "Indonesian Population: 2016." *World Population Review*. 13 Sept. 2015. Web. 13 March 2016.
[110] Midiyanto and Pak I Madé Lasmawan. Personal Interview. March 2015. Atlanta, GA.

occupies an important role in some Indonesian Islamic ceremonies (and even, as Jennifer Lindsay notes in her text *Javanese Gamelan,* is featured in Javanese Catholic ceremonies as well).[111] For example, gamelan *Sekaten* is performed once per year at the sultan's palace in front of the great mosque in Jogjakarta during *Eid Mawlid ul-Nabi*, the celebration of the Prophet Mohammed's birthday. In fact, some claim that the word "Sekaten" is a misspelling or a derivation of the word "Syahadatain," the ritual Muslim declaration that Allah is the one and only true God and that Muhammed was his prophet. Perhaps 16th century Muslims thought that the gamelan could bring them to "Syahadatain," moving them to pledge their love and loyalty to Allah and respect for Mohammed, and was thus named "Sekaten" (sic.) accordingly. Other sources point out that the incorporation of the gamelan into Islamic ritual was an (successful) attempt to encourage Javanese Hindu's to convert.[112]

Today, almost 202.9 million Muslims live in Indonesia, making it the predominant national faith (87.5% of the population) as well as the country with the largest population of Muslims in the world.[113] But by any standard, the Islam of Indonesia is far different than the Islam practiced in the Middle East: it is much less austere, much more syncretic. This is likely a result of its history. Islam was brought from Gujarat, India to Indonesia in the 13th century by Sufi merchants.[114] Sufism is a mystical religion that is much less orthodox than Sunni and Shi'ah, and considers music vital to spiritual devotion. As written by al-Ghazali, a 10th century Sufi mystic, "the purpose of music, considered in relation to God, is to arouse longing for God, and passionate love

[111] Lindsay, Jennifer. *Javanese Gamelan.* Oxford University Press: Oxford, 1979. 45. Print.
[112] Ibid.
[113] "Indonesian Population: 2016." *World Population Review*. 13 Sept. 2015. Web. 13 March 2016.
[114] Miller, Tracy, ed. "*Mapping the Global Muslim Population: A Report on the Size and Distribution of the World's Muslim Population*." Pew Research Center. October 2009. Web. 13 March 2016.

for Him, and to produce states in which God reveals Himself and His favor, which are beyond description and known only by experience. These states are called ecstasy."[115] This is why *Kebatinan* (Javanese syncretic religious tradition) and *Abangan* Islam have remained in Java, both of which are loyal to *adat* (local customary practices). Although a significant portion of the population follows Sharia law and identifies themselves as *Santri* ("pure ones") because they hold more orthodox convictions, *Abangan* ("the red ones") Islam has historically incorporated Hindu-Buddhist-shamanistic-animistic practices into Islamic ritual that, in my opinion, preserved the gamelan in a largely Muslim state.[116] The remaining minority of Hindus and *Abangan* — the Osings in East Java, the Tenggerese, and the Badui — have also conserved this instrument in their ceremony. Overall, Indonesian Islam is certainly a unique, hybridized religion.[117] This is perhaps why the Vice President of Indonesia Jusuf Kalla recently claimed that Indonesia is "the most tolerant Muslim-majority in the world."[118]

But although Java has played an immensely important role in development of the gamelan, its subsequent popularization, and the establishment of its theory, the gamelan of Java has changed little. Why is this? As mentioned previously, the gamelan is largely a Hindu instrument, and although it is incorporated in some Javanese Islamic and Catholic ceremonies, major evolution of its forms have occurred in Bali: a 2010 census found that only 1.7% of the population of Indonesia is Hindu (4.25 million) — of this population,

---

[115] Al-Ghazali. "Sufi Music." *International Association of Sufism*. Web. 13 March 2016.
[116] Ooi, Keat Gin, ed. *Southeast Asia: a historical encyclopedia, from Angkor Wat to East Timor.* Vol 3. ABC-CLIO: Santa Barbara, 2004. 719. Print.
[117] Geertz, Clifford. "The Santri Variant." *The Religion of Java.* The University of Chicago Press: Chicago, 1960. 121–215. Print.
[118] Parameswaran, Prashanth. "Is Indonesia Really the World's Most Tolerant Muslim Country?" *The Diplomat* [Jakarta]. 30 Dec. 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.

3,247,283 lived in Bali.[119] Early Balinese gamelan types appear similar to the Javanese Central gamelan. Around the 14th century, soon after the Hindu flight from Java, these *Golongang Tua* or "old style" gamelans arose in Bali. This style includes the gamelan *gambang* (bamboo) and *selonding* (iron bar) ensembles, both that did not yet include drums or gongs, only metallophones or hollowed bamboo resonators. Among the oldest forms of gamelan in Bali, *selonding* is highly revered.[120] I was honored to perform on the *selonding* at the Ngeratep Ratu Sakti odalan temple ceremony with the Baturiti men's gamelan group at Pura Pucak Luhur Padang Dawa, a ceremonial blessing of the Nawa Sanga (the nine ceremonial Barong masks and costumes). Morphologically, the *selonding* resembles the *saron* of the Central Javanese gamelan. Mantle Hood speculates that gamelan *gambuh, caruk,* and *luang* also originated in Java.[121] Fleeing members of the Muhajapit empire brought ancient gamelan with them to Bali — this is perhaps why Balinese ensembles possess instruments that are more archaic than those found in modern Javanese gamelan ensembles (*rindik, angklung*). And while the Dutch had maintained control over all of Java since the 17th century, they were unable to take control of the entire island of Bali until the beginning of the 20th century.[122] After Indonesian independence, although restrictions had become laxer than they were in the past, austere regulations existed during the Sukarno era that restricted the performance of modern Western music such as Rock and Roll. One well-known example is the Koes Brothers from Bojonegoro-Tuban area in East Java who were imprisoned because their music was

[119] "Indonesian Population: 2016." *World Population Review*. 13 Sept. 2015. Web. 13 March 2016.
[120] Midiyanto and Pak I Madé Lasmawan. Personal Interview. March 2015. Atlanta, GA.
[121] Sumarsam. *Gamelan: Cultural Interaction and Musical Development in Central Java.* University of Chicago Press: Chicago, 1992. 16. Print.
[122] Hanna, Willard A. *Bali Chronicles*. Periplus: Singapore, 2004. 140 – 141. Print.

too modern, considered too Western in its techniques.[123] In this way, gamelan and other traditional musics were protected by legislation that opposed musical modernization and protected tradition. But while the gamelan has become part of everyday life in Bali, its position in Java is still largely in the courts, at *wayang* performances or at the conservatory. Its position is under threat as a result of modernization. As Hartana writes,

> The importance of traditional Javanese gamelan performance in everyday life in Java has been decreasing, especially in social and political contexts, because of political tension, economic hardship, and competition from foreign cultures. It seems to me that most of the younger generation in Indonesia are having problems playing and sustaining traditional gamelan music in their homeland. Many Javanese individuals perceive the activities related to the classical gamelan as out of touch with modern life, and participation in these activities is thus considered static, when compared to the modern social climate in Indonesia [that] favours modernity and Westernization.[124]

What about in Bali? The Balinese are an intensely spiritual people. Spirituality innervates every aspect of their lives until death, from birth ceremonies to weddings to tooth fillings to cremations. In fact, so important is the gamelan to Hindu ritual in Bali (and to a lesser extent in Java) that the axiom a "ceremony isn't official until the gong has been hung" is universal:[125] virtually no ceremony occurs without gamelan present. In fact, the Balinese consider art to be an extension of religion, an expression of devotion, a means of elevating the mundane to the divine. Music and the arts are intrinsically linked,

---

[123] Connoy, Jason and Chandra Drews. "Koes Plus." In *Those Shocking, Shaking Days*. Now-Again Records: Los Angeles, 2010. 13. LP Booklet.

[124] Sutrino, Hartana. "Notes, concerns, and hopes for Javanese Gamelan." Unpublished. Appearing on the website for the Institute of Asian Research, University of British Columbia. http://www.iar.ubc.ca/centres/csear/webpage/8-Hartana.pdf. Also see: Hartana, Sutrisno Setya. "Javanese Gamelan in The Paku Alaman palace: The Repertoire of Uyon-uyon Muryararas." M.A. thesis, University of British Columbia, 2006.

[125] Broughton, Simon, et al. *World Music: The Rough Guide*. London: The Rough Guides, 1994. 419–420. Print.

and are integral to religious ritual and devotion. For this reason, examples of Hindu ritual and religious practice that incorporate gamelan are so noticeable that they can be witnessed casually by the unspecialized observer yet are so numerous that they can provide a religious specialist with enough material to fill a lifetime of academic inquiry. Thus, in order to truly understand the role of gamelan in Balinese ritual, one must first venture to explore the Hindu religion considering that music and ritual are two halves of a whole.[126]

Balinese Hinduism is similar yet distinct from Indian Hinduism, drawing dogmatic inspiration from it but diverging over the centuries in marked ways. This unique brand of Hinduism, referred to as *Agama Hindu Dharma*, has incorporated many facets of mysticism from the *Bali Aga*, a term used to describe the indigenous religion of Bali and its practitioners who predated the Hindu arrival. While practitioners of *Agama Hindu Dharma* subscribe to the Indian Hindu caste system and propitiate the major deities of classical Indian Hinduism (Brahma, Vishnu, and Shiva), they also engage in ancestor worship (deifying ancestors) and animism (the belief that every living thing has a soul), both expressions of religious devotion that arose from Agama Hinduism's association with the pre-Hindu *Bali Aga* culture in the 14th century.[127]

Perhaps most visibly indicative of the intensity of their devotion is the abundance and variety of their temples, classified hierarchically according to their type and function: *Tugu*, small temples that honor the gods of the rice, the trees, or the rivers among other lesser spirits, or that protect the home by warding away evil (*Tugu Karang*); *Sanggah*, family temples that are erected within every Balinese compound; *Panti*, larger family

---

[127] Lasmawan, I Madé. Personal Interview. July 2015. Conducted in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia.

temples for the use of extended family; *Pura*, village temples; and any of the six *Sadkhayangan* or *Khayangan Jaget*, “world temples” that serve to protect the island of Bali from the infiltration of evil and to which people of all faiths are invited to pray, an inclusiveness that exposes Hinduism’s universal acceptance of any form of religious devotion. In fact, religious devotion is so integral to Balinese society that Balinese villages are mandated by law to erect at least three *Pura* temples, spaces of veneration of *Brahma*, the creator; *Wisnu*, the preserver; and *Siwa*, the destroyer or reincarnator (often spelled “Siva” and “Vishnu” in the transliteration of Sanskrit on the Indian subcontinent). At any one of the myriad temples scattered throughout Bali, offerings — *Canang Sari*, *Sodan*, and *Gebogan* — containing fresh fruit, fragrant flowers, rice pastries, sweet-smelling incense, and rupiah, artfully arranged in elaborate coconut or palm leaf baskets, are presented to honor ancestors or the gods. At larger temples, devout Hindus can be observed engaging in *Panca Sembah*, the ritual of “five prayers,” beginning with *Sanghyang Atma*, the prayer to the soul, and ending with *Sangyhang Dharma Santi*, a prayer giving thanks to the universe and to the many manifestations of the supreme deity. Temple-goers pray for *Tri Hitakarana*, the concept of balance and harmony between *Pelemahan*, the respect for the earth, *Pawongan*, the respect for others (especially elders), and *Parahyangan*, the sacred connection between humanity and the divine — after dousing themselves with holy water, they emerge with rice pasted to their foreheads and flowers tucked delicately behind their ears, having spiritually committed to the Hindu tenets of thinking good, speaking good, and acting good. And at all celebrations, the ethereal melodies of the gamelan float in the air against the otherworldly cries of a mantra singer, considered integral to spiritual experience.[128]

[128] Ibid.

This spirituality persists well beyond the temple, however. Traditional Balinese compounds maintain *Asta Kosala Kosali*, a divine measurement system that precisely defines the distance separating buildings to maintain spiritual balance and promote harmony within the family. Each day, before beginning their daily routine, the Balinese serve the evil spirits rice and chili on banana leaves, laying these offerings at the entrance to their compounds and at intersections, etc., places which they believe the evil spirits frequent most. They also make daily offerings to the gods in small shrines that are affixed in the corners of each building in their compound. At 6:00am, 12:00pm, and 6:00pm, considered times when the evil spirits are most active since these are transitional times (i.e. night into morning, morning into afternoon, and afternoon into night), it is common to hear mantras and gamelan piped through village loudspeakers or interrupting radio broadcasts — this is done to reduce the jeopardy of mass-possession by insidious spirits. The Balinese even orient their beds to the north or the east, facing in the direction of the sun or their holiest mountain, *Gunung Agung*, away from the sea. Superstition and the almost obsessive-compulsive engagement in ritual practice are vestiges of Bali Aga animism that have been incorporated into Agama Hinduism and which persist today. The whole island is alive with gamelan music and ritual.[129] Michael Tenzer wrote that "music is ubiquitous in Bali; its abundance is far out of proportion to the dimensions of the island. The Hindu-Balinese religion requires gamelan for the successful completion of most of the tens of thousands of ceremonies undertaken yearly."[130] I believe one would be hard pressed to find a culture that places the same emphasis on music and ritual as in Bali. Sandwiched between Java and Lombok and north of the Australian coast, the

[129] Ibid.
[130] Tenzer, Michael. *Balinese Music.* Periplus Editions: Singapore: 1991. 12. Print.

relative remoteness of Bali and its syncretic blend of animism and Hinduism (*Agama Hindu Dharma*) has lent to the cultivation of many distinct types of gamelan. It is easy to see why McPhee and many other scholars and composers were so enamored by this music and the culture from which it comes. Gamelan is in the blood of the Balinese.

What is gamelan? Gamelan means "to hit," referring to the way it is played with a mallet. Gamelan is a percussive instrument from Bali and Java, Indonesia. In fact, more accurately, it is an ensemble ("orchestra") of instruments. It often accompanies a dance drama or a *wayang* (shadow puppetry) performance, or is performed at the court or temple. The ensemble is comprised of gongs and metallophones, drums, flutes (*suling*), zithers (*ribab*), and often features dancers and (in Java mostly) female (*pasindhèn*) or male (*gerong*) singers.[131] According to Martin Roberts, gamelan "has been fully integrated into the modern Indonesian mediascape. Performances of gamelan music are regularly broadcast on Indonesian radio and television, and gamelan is ubiquitous in everyday media culture, from advertising to fashion shows. It also plays a key role in attracting foreign visitors to the country."[132]

Balinese gamelan is very similar to Javanese gamelan in its structure, sound and instrumentation, albeit it is faster and showier (after all *kebyar*, the most popular Balinese gamelan type, means "lightening" or "flashy"). Balinese gamelan features many abrupt changes in dynamics and tempo, and is much more melodically complex than Javanese counterparts that are more interested in refinement than virtuosic displays. As a result of this complexity, Michael Tenzer wrote that Balinese musicians "rehearse to perfect their

---

[131] Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 1. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Wesleyan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.
[132] Roberts, Martin D, 1998. "World Music: The Relocation of Culture". In UNESCO, ed, *Culture, Creativity and Markets*. Paris: UNESCO, 205. Print.

music more than any other large ensembles in the world."[133] However, it should be known that most Balinese gamelan ensembles are not comprised of professional musicians, but community members. While I was in Bali, many of the musicians were farmers, small business owners, etc. The man who played *jegogan* with me was an economics teacher. All of them had "day jobs," but voluntarily came night after night to learn from Pak Madé and practice their skills as musicians. As Joss Wibosbono asserts directly in the title of his work, the Balinese have "gamelan in their blood."[134] This differs slightly from the aesthetic interpretation of gamelan among Javanese: As Fredric Liberman writes, "[i]n Java a single type of large gamelan, a fine set of instruments perhaps preserved in a royal court, acts as an ideal upon which the surrounding villages model less perfect and less complete ensembles."[135] Hood states to this effect "traditionally, the musicians in service of the Royal Courts of Central Java were palace servants. The music they composed and performed… enjoyed the highest evaluation not only by the elite for whom they performed, but also by all levels of society who emulated the same repertoire through the communal efforts of the village musicians performing on instruments of relatively poor quality."[136] But Bali "did not permit the centralization of the artistic knowledge in a special intellectual class,"[137] perhaps why there are so many forms of gamelan that did not develop in the courts of Bali, but in the paddy fields and *balai banjar* (community pavilion). While both Javanese and Balinese gamelan are

---

[133] Tenzer, Michael. *Balinese Music.* Periplus Editions: Singapore: 1991. 7. Print.
[134] Wibisono, Joss. "Gamelan in the Blood." *Gatholotjo*. No. 65, 2012. 21. Web. 13 March 2016.
[135] Lieberman, Fredric. "Relationships of Musical and Cultural Contrasts in Java and Bali." *University of California Santa Cruz, 1967*. Found at http://artsites.ucsc.edu/faculty/lieberman/contrasts.html. Web. 13 March 2016.
[136] Hood, Mantle. "The Enduring Tradition: Music and Theater in Java and Bali." *Indonesia*. Ed. McVey, et. al. New Haven, 1963. 3. Print.
[137] Covarrubias, Miguel. *Island of Bali*. New York, 1939. 218 – 219. Print. Republished in 2008 as part of the Periplus Classic Series.

largely comprised of lay musicians, the artistic precedent for performance is in the *kraton's pendopo* (court pavilion) in Java while it is in the communities in Bali.

Furthermore, Balinese gamelan ensembles tend to have more members and possess more diverse instrumentation that Javanese sets, observations that can be attributed to the almost homogenous Hindu population in Bali (the gamelan is a Hindu instrument) as well as the diversification of the gamelan over the centuries after it crossed the Java strait with fleeing Hindu emigrants. There are more metallophones than gongs in Balinese gamelan. The metal keys on Balinese metallophones are thicker than those on their Javanese equivalents, producing brighter sounds. Balinese gamelan also features cymbals (*ceng*-ceng) that create a fast rattling sound that usually cannot be found in Javanese Gamelan music, and does not feature vocalists as predominately as Javanese ensembles do. Apart from sonic differences, Balinese gamelan almost never features improvisation while Javanese gamelan does. As Hood mentions, "Balinese musicians seem to operate on the principle that if two players play interlocking parts as fast as possible . . . the result will be a performance twice as fast as either of them can play."[138] This hyper-technicality and speed of this interlocking figuration leaves no room for improvisation, and leads Fredric Lieberman (the same whose 1976 denunciation of the field of ethnomusicology was featured in previous arguments) to assert "Balinese figuration technique, stressing precise rhythmic control, precludes the use of improvisation, and is more direct and potentially more dynamic than Javanese."[139]

---

[138] Hood, Mantle. "The Enduring Tradition: Music and Theater in Java and Bali." *Indonesia*. Ed. McVey, et. al. New Haven, 1963. 455. Print.

[139] Lieberman, Fredric. "Relationships of Musical and Cultural Contrasts in Java and Bali." *University of California Santa Cruz, 1967*. Found at http://artsites.ucsc.edu/faculty/lieberman/contrasts.html. Web. 13 March 2016.

Regardless, their theoretical constructs of time, structure, and melody are virtually the same.[140]

What characterizes gamelan's sound? Wane Vitale notes that "its pentatonic tonal universe is made richly multi-dimensional by the vibrating intensity of the paired tuning system, the dense enharmonic overtone spectrum produced by bronze percussion instruments struck with wooden mallets, and the wide range of frequency and timbre spanned from deepest gong tone to highest splash of the *ceng-ceng* [Bali] cymbals."[141] Balinese and Javanese instruments differ sonically. McPhee articulates their sonic differences best by stating

> Javanese gamelans have an incredibly soft, legato, velvet sound; the hammers and mallets that are used to strike the metallophones and gongs are padded so thickly as to eliminate all shock. Tempos are slow and stately, and there is little change in dynamics; the prevailing mood is one of untroubled calm and mystic serenity. Balinese music, on the other hand, is vigorous, rhythmic, explosive in quality; the gamelans sound bright and percussive; hard hammers of wood or horn are used for many instruments, and the thin clash of cymbals underlies every tone; only the great gongs are gently struck. While the classic calm of Javanese music and dance is never disturbed, music and dance in Bali is turbulent and dramatic, filled with contrast and bold effects. Javanese musicians find the music of Bali barbaric. Balinese complain that the music of Java "sends them to sleep."[142]

Corroborating McPhee's observations, Raden Kartini describes Javanese gamelan poetically by saying that "each note is so soft, so tender, so vaguely thrilling, so changing — but ah! How compelling, how bitterly beautiful: that is no tinkling of glass, of copper,

---

[140] Ibid.
[141] Vitale, Wayne. "Balinese Kebyar Music Breaks the Five-Tone Barrier: New Composition for Seven-Tone Gamelan." *Perspectives of New* Music, 2002. 40.1: 7. Print.
[142] Colin, McPhee. "The Five Toned Gamelan Music of Bali." *Musical Quarterly*, 1949. Vol 35. 251. Print.

or wood; it is the voices of men's souls that speak to me."[143] *Karawitan*, the word for gamelan repertoire, stems from the Javanese word *rawit*, meaning "refinement," characteristic of Javanese gamelan sonically and psychologically. In contract, Beryl DeZoute mentions that Balinese gamelan has "a beauty that depends upon form and pattern and a vigour that springs from a rhythmic vitality both primitive and joyous."[144]

Gamelan is an oral musiculture. Much like the *griot* culture of Western Africa or the *guru-shishya paramapara* tradition of India, Gamelan *karawitan* is an oral tradition that has been devotedly transmitted through the centuries through verbal instruction via hierarchical lineages. Although Gamelan performers do not form an endogamous caste, teacher-student pedigrees tracing chains of instruction often parallel genealogical lineages. Pak Midyanto, a ninth generation *dhalang* who directs the gamelan ensembles at U.C. Berkeley and who has visited Emory University several times, recounts fondly that his earliest instruction in Indonesian *wayang Kulit* was provided by his father and grandfather, an example of familial transmission of Gamelan performance and practice methodologies inter-generationally. Pak Madé also comes from a family of musicians. The oral nature of this musiculture comes across in the way that it is taught as well. Often, when interacting with Balinese musicians, one might hear them sing the melody and embellishment of pieces using syllables rather than scale degrees: nd*ing, ndong, ndeng, ndung*, and *ndang*. This system can be incredibly confusing to neophyte, foreign musicians because the syllables sound frustratingly similar. However, regardless of the tuning of the gamelan, "*nding*" always represents the first note of the scale much like the "movable do" system of *solfege*. This vocalization system is a testament to the melodic

---

[143] Kartini, Raden Adjeng. *Letters of a Japanese Princess*. New York, 1964. 50. Print.
[144] De Zoute, Beryl, and Walter Spies. *Dance and Drama in Bali*. New York, 1939. 6. Print.

nature of Balinese (and Javanese) gamelan compositions. It is not harmonic, but is strictly composed of melody and elaboration.[145]

Perhaps most striking to a Western student of music is the differences in the idea of self within the broader orchestra. In the West, instrumentalists and vocalists are defined by their individual abilities and, even within the context of the larger orchestra in which they perform, remain as individuals working collaboratively to achieve a unified sound. In fact, western musical pedagogy revolves around the pivotal idea that a musician must first refine their individual talent on their chosen instrument and perfect their individual repertoire — often in an isolated practice room separated from their peers — prior to thinking of the needs of the larger ensemble. This could not be more contradictory to the Javanese or Balinese idea of making music: it is a communal activity, through and through. The individual is secondary to the collective. As Sumarsam notes, this "feeling of unity, communality, or totality is based on the interactions or interrelationships among the instruments in the ensemble."[146] Additionally, the idea of "performance" is somewhat different from the Western interpretation. Unlike in the United States, gamelan frequently is not performed in concert in Java and Bali. It is adjunct to ritual, *wayang,* or dance. *Klenèngan*, what Sumasam describes as "performances for their own sake,"[147] are rare: he mentions that "the concept of a 'music concert' in which the music is listened to attentively and in which the separation between the performer and audience is reinforced, is still alien in gamelan performance in present-

[145] Lasmawan, I Madé. Personal Interview. July 2015. Conducted in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia.
[146] Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 6. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.
[147] Ibid. 23.

day Java."[148] The same is true in Bali, although recent government-organized arts revitalization and preservation measures such as the Bali Arts Festival and tourist performances represent exceptions. In fact, for only 20.000 Rp, one can hear non-ritualized performances of Balinese gamelan at the King of Ubud's palace almost every night.

Today, there are more than 30 different types of gamelan in Bali, yet many fewer types exist in Java. This ensemble is much more than a collection of instruments, however. It is considered a *pusaka,* a heritable object that is imbued with spiritual powers. Some ensembles are given the same honorific titles as Indonesian nobility such as Kyai and Nyai (ex. Nyai Sepet Madu, Kyai Muncar, and Kyai Gerah Kapat). And several of the oldest gamelan sets in Java and Bali are so sacred that they are only played on the holiest of holidays.[149] Even Emory's gamelan — *Paksi Kencono* — is named after the mythical garuda-steed of Vishnu, representing its connection to Hindu mythology. Although it is used aesthetically in some contexts (particularly outside of Indonesia), it is inherently linked to religious ritual. Pak Madé pointed out that this veneration of gamelan music even occasionally affects the way that *karawitan* is written in cypher notation (i.e. pitches are represented with numbers): some Indonesian gamelan composers and amateur ethnographers, when notating ancient and highly sacred music, would intentionally write errors in their transcriptions, believing that these pieces were too powerful to be notated precisely.[150] Several of the most revered gamelan in the *kraton* courts of Java are "believed to have so much powers that playing them may exert power over nature. Others

[148] Ibid.
[149] Ibid. 3.
[150] Lasmawan, I Madé. Personal Interview. July 2015. Conducted in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia.

may be touched only by persons who are ritually qualified."[151] In Bali, performers attend a *Taksu* temple before playing gamelan, asking the dieties for "good *Taksu*" (i.e. they are asking to be physically inhabited by the spirit of *Taksu*: the gods and spirits provide the spiritual energy to performers and allow them to become subsumed in their characters). Furthermore, the idea of *rame* ("noisiness") is impossible without the gamelan at temple ceremonies — it is the belief of the Balinese that multiple gamelans performing simultaneously at different levels of the temple, mixing with the sound of prayers and recited mantras (quite "noisy" indeed), confuse evil spirits and distract them from entering temples during holy ceremonies.[152] Historically, gamelan and the performing arts in Bali and Java were performed solely at the temple, but as Sumarsam notes:

> As history has evolved and technology advanced, other contexts have been created, such as performances for independence day, broadcasts from radio or television stations, etc. Occasionally, there is also an informal "jam" session which is sponsored by gamelan patrons or connoiseurs.[153]

Although presently performed in secular contexts, the gamelan is still a sacred instrument. Even in the Emory Gamelan Ensemble, one would never show the instrument one's feet, and must sit before it in the same way one would sit before a Brahman priest or elder: *sila*, or respectfully cross-legged. As Mantle Hood and Pak Susilo point out in their text *Music of the Venerable Dark Cloud,*

> There is an inviolable rule that no one ever steps over one of the musical instruments, since to do so would be considered a breach of respect. If there is not room to pass,

[151] See, Yee-Seer and Han Kuo-Huang. "The Beliefs." *SEAsite.* Northern Illinois University. 1998. Web. 13 March 2016.
[152] Lasmawan, I Madé. Personal Interview. July 2015. Conducted in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia
[153] Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 23. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.

> the musician must move the instrument temporarily to provide space, and when he passes by instruments and other players, he does not stride along erect but bends low, holding one hand before him and mumbling the appropriate Javanese word of permission and apology (*nuwun sewu*) for crossing in front of someone.[154]

Thus far this paper has explored at length the ritual context of gamelan. Following is a discussion of the structure, scales, and techniques of gamelan, much of which I consider to have been appropriated by modern Western movements.

<u>Melody: Tuning Systems and Scales.</u>

Javanese gamelan often features two tuning systems or *laras*: *pelog* and *slendro*. *Slendro*, a five-tone tuning system, is quite similar to the tempered pentatonic scale and is comprised of approximately equidistant intervals. It is represented by the scale degrees 1 2 3 5 6. This roughly correlates to EFGBC on the piano, a subset of the Phrygian mode. *Pelog*, on the other hand, is quite distinct from all Western tunings, sometimes described as a "seven-note subset of a nine-tone equal temperament scale."[155] A seven-tone tuning system, it is comprised of small, medium and large intervals, and can be thought of as a collection of three 5-note pentatonic subsets (as opposed to only one 5-tone grouping in *slendro*): 1 2 3 5 6, 1 2 4 5 6, and 2 3 5 6 7. Collectively, it is often notated with the scale degrees 1 2 3 4 5 6 7; however, this notation is quite misleading as it does not reflect the unequal intervals that characterize this unique mode. Any musician in the Emory Gamelan Ensemble, or most 'complete' gamelans for that matter (with *pelog* and *slendro*

---

[154] Hood, Mantle and Hardjo Susilo. *Music of the Venerable Dark Cloud*. Institute of Ethnomusicology, University of California: Los Angeles, 1967. Booklet accompanying the recording of the same title.
[155] Surjodiningrat, W., Sudarjana, P.J., and Susanto, A. "Tone measurements of outstanding Javanese gamelans in Jogjakarta and Surakarta." Gadjah Mada University Press, Jogjakarta 1972. Web. 13 March 2016. Cited on http://web.telia.com/~u57011259/pelog_main.htm.

tunings), soon realizes that the ensemble is really comprised of *two* complete sets of instruments. Gamelan *pelog* and *slendro* are almost entirely incompatible, sharing only one or two notes in common (*tambuk*). For this reason, pieces in *laras pelog* and *slendro* cannot be played on the same instruments as a result of their tonal irreconcilability. Thus, almost all of the instruments in the ensemble have a pair, of sorts, that is tuned to the alternate mode.[156] That is not to say that pieces do not evoke different tunings. For example, when the Emory Gamelan performed *Bima Kroda* in Fall of 2014, the piece called for a shift from *pelog* to *slendro* after several repetitions. Regardless, *pelog* and *slendro* would never be voiced simultaneously in traditional repertoire.

Furthermore, each instrument often has a counterpart in the same mode — that is, an instrument which, at first glance, appears constructed according to the same specifications. However, these "twins" differ: they are slightly out of tune from one another. The *ombak* or "wave" that results from this slight discrepancy in pitch is much like the celeste button on a church organ, a feature which causes one pipe to sound slightly above or below the tonic pitch, creating noticeable beats. These beats are characteristic of gamelan sound ("resonance"), creating an esoteric vibration and highlighting the overtones of the tonic.[157]

Although cypher notation is often the preferred form of referring to these notes, the *pathets* (modes) are often functionally named according to the traditional names of the pitches that are featured most prominently in them. In *slendro*, the notes are named as such: *barang* (1), *gulu* (2), *dhadha* (3), *lima* (5), *nem* (6). And in *pelog*: *penunggul* (1),

---

[156] Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 3 - 5. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.
[157] Lasmawan, I Madé. Personal Interview. July 2015. Conducted in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia.

gulu (2), *dhadha* (3), *pelog* (4), *lima* (5), *nem* (6), *barang* (7). In *slendro* the *pathet* are *pathet nem*, *pathet sanga*, and *pathet manyura*. In *pelog*, they are *pathet lima*, *pathet nem*, and *pathet barang*.[158] The *pathets* outline which notes are stressed, much like the *vadi/samvadi* system in Hindustani classical music. Often certain *pathets* and *laras* are associated with particular rituals or times of day. In a conversation with Pak Midiyanto, he mentioned that *pathet enam* was played in the morning and symbolized birth*, pathet sanga* was played in the afternoon and symbolized maturity, and *pathet manyura* was played at night and symbolized old age. Even our music for the 2015 *wayang* performance followed this schematic, progressing from *nem*, to *sanga*, to *manyura* at the end of the performance.[159]

The Javanese concepts of melody are the origins for Balinese gamelan theory. The Balinese seven-tone scale (almost identical to the Javanese *pelog*) is called *saih pitu* or *tetekep pitu*. Often, only five-tone subsets of this seven-tone scale are used within Balinese gamelan compositions. These five-tone subsets of the *saih pitu* are called *patutan*, the most widely used of which is *patutan selisir* which employs scale degrees 1 2 3 5 6. *Petutan tembung* features scale degrees 4 5 6 1 2 and *petutan sunaren* tuning contains scale degrees 2 3 5 6 7, also pentatonic like *tembung*; however, both appear less frequently than the *selisir* tuning.[160]

Unlike the Western tempered tuning system, the intervals between scale degrees (i.e. interval between scale degree 1 and 2 in *pelog*) are not established in Balinese and

158 Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 3. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.
159 Midiyanto and Pak I Madé Lasmawan. Personal Interview. March 2015. Atlanta, GA.
160 Tenzer, Michael. *Balinese Music.* Periplus Editions: Singapore: 1991. 28. Print.

Javanese gamelan.[161] Usually, small intervals range from 80-200 cents and large intervals range from 300-450 cents. While these intervals usually remain relatively consistent within an ensemble of instruments, this is not the case between ensembles: other ensembles can exhibit marked intervallic differences between the same scale degrees.[162] In fact, unlike a Western symphony orchestra, Javanese and Balinese musicians almost never bring their instruments with them while on tour, instead performing on the host's gamelan. What is the reason for this? First off, this is a practical decision: considering that a Javanese Central or Balinese gamelan ensemble includes thousands of pounds of larger brass instruments, it is a monumental undertaking to relocate an entire ensemble and, thus, relocation is only done for highly significant temple ceremonies at locations that do not possess a gamelan set. But another reason exists. Because intervals and scale degrees differ in tuning between ensembles, no gamelans are tuned alike (*embat*). As Neil Sorrell mentions, "the Western love of standardization means that such a situation could be regarded as unsatisfactory, but the Javanese attach great importance to *embat*, or intervallic structure. Much of a gamelan's unique personality depends on its *embat*."[163] This resonance and slight discrepancy in tune between these instruments is characteristic of gamelan sound. This incompatibility and tonal variation led Colin McPhee to remark "deviations in what is considered the same scale are so large that one might with reason state that there are as many scales as there are gamelans."[164]

When venturing to Gong Bali, a gong maker in Sukuwati near Denpasar, it was easy for me to understand why no gamelan is tuned alike. After much ceremony

---

[161] Apel, Willi. *Harvard Dictionary of Music*, 2nd Ed. 436. Belknap Press of Harvard University Press: Cambridge, 2000. 436. Print.
[162] Tenzer, Michael. *Balinese Music.* Periplus Editions: Singapore: 1991. 28. Print.
[163] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 56. Print.
[164] McPhee, Colin. *Music in Bali*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1966. 36 Print.

(historically, a regimen of fasting and prayer), the gong maker casts the great gong (*gong ageng*), packing the molten metal in sand and plaster molds. After the brass has set, and after an exhausting routine of hammering and polishing, the gong maker does little to alter the great gong's sound. The gong, imbued with spiritual power, dictates the tonic pitch of the ensemble; only after the *gong ageng* has been fashioned can the gong maker tune the rest of the instruments to it. And while skilled gong makers who have been fashioning instruments for many years from the same molds often approach a similar tuning for the great gong, its tuning is often not precisely the same as the previously or subsequently cast gong from the same gong manufacturer, and certainly is not the case between instruments manufactured at different factories.

Structure and Time.

Another aspect characteristic of Javanese and Balinese music is its structure, timelessness, and lack of directionality. The Javanese and Balinese think in cycles. Those that are Hindu think in terms of cycles of reincarnation, rebirth. Since many Indonesians are farmers regardless of denomination, they often think in terms of agrarian cycles of harvest and planting. Even their calendar requires cyclical thinking: the Bahasa Indonesian word *Bulan*, meaning "moon," is also the word for "month," an association that arises from the fact that the Balinese and Javanese calendars are rooted in lunar cycles. It seems logical, then, that their music — as an extension of their spiritual and sociocultural experience — would have cyclical form as well.[165]

[165] McGraw, Andrew. *Radical Traditions: Reimagining Culture in Balinese Contemporary Music.* Oxford U.P.: Oxford, 2013. 89. Print.

Gamelan *karawitan* is highly stratified and highly mathematical in its organization — four-note *gatra* (quadripartite semantic units, "embryos") form the basic functional units of melody; these combine the *balungan* (structural melody). In Javanese Central gamelan, the *balungan* is performed by *slenthem*, *saron demung*, and *saron barung* that establish the skeletal melody of compositions. In fact, all instruments in the ensemble are organized according to their structural function: "[t]he gamelan is divided into punctuation instruments, *balungan* instruments, and elaborating instruments." [166] Stratification results from different elaborations of the melody combining to create dense hierarchical rhythms. Michael Tenzer describes this further by saying that "melodies… are orchestrated in a stratified fashion, in which several realizations of the same melodic idea are presented simultaneously at different rhythmic densities," creating a heterophonous texture that is characteristic of gamelan sound.[167]

The *kendhang* (drum) is the musical time-keeper, quickening or slowing the ensemble and facilitating transitions between sections and between *irama* (tempo and density). Tenzer goes on to assert that "gongs of different sizes are used to mark off circular segments, or cycles, of musical time."[168] In fact, the *gongan* representing the space between *gong ageng* strikes (the largest division of time) with smaller gongs like the *kempul* subdividing this division further. Particularly, the *gong ageng* or "great gong" initiates each cycle or *irama.* There are five *irama: irama* I (*lancar* or *tanggung*), *irama* II (*dadi*), *irama* III (*wilet*), and *irama* IV (*rangkep*). *Gongan* are further divided by

---

[166] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.
[167] Tenzer, Michael. "Theory and Analysis of Melody in Balinese Gamelan." *Society for Music Theory.* 6.2. 2000. Found in the *Online Journal of the Society for Music Theory*, prepared by Brent Yorgason. Updated 18 November 2002. Web. 13 March 2016.
[168] Ibid.

punctuating instruments, such as the *ketuk* and *kempyang* that serve to establish a steady pulse and help to establish the *colotomic* (*gendhing*) structure of the piece. At each *irama* change (transitioning from *irama* I to *irama* II, etc.), the structural melody becomes sparser and sparser, but the embellishing instruments increase in complexity. Embellishing instruments such as the *bonang* and *gender* elaborate on the melody through ornamentation.[169]

Iramas contribute to a *colotomic* (*gendhing*) structure, the hierarchical and stratified organization of melody and rhythm. *Gendhing* are named according to their length: *lancaran* or *ketawan* — 16 beats, *ladrang* — 32 beats, *ketawang gendhing* — 64 bars, *gendhing* — 64 bars. The rate at which instruments play and the *irama* differ within these *gendhing* lengths. For instance, in *lancaran*, the *balungan* is only played on the 2nd and 4th note of each *gatra*, and is played fast (*irama lancer*), whereas in *ketawan*, every note of the *gatra* is played medium-fast (*irama tanggung*) by *balungan* instruments.

These structural elements are accentuated by characteristic melodic embellishment techniques. Sumarsam describes *gembyangan* technique performed on *bonang* as an "octave playing technique [that features] the simultaneous playing of two tones one octave apart, played on every off beat of the *balungan* (melodic skeleton of *gendhing*) pulse. The tone being played is the last tone of each *gatra* (metrical unit of four beats) of the *balungan*."[170] I offer that this technique relates quite strikingly to "planing," or parallel voice leading, in many composers' works in 20th century modern classical music, particularly Debussy. Paul Roberts even states that Debussy's piano

---

[169] Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 18. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.
[170] Ibid. 23.

music is “fundamentally percussive,” perhaps another parallel between his compositions and the gamelan.[171] Furthermore, we must take note of the rhythmic interlocking found within this music. In Javanese gamelan, *imbal-imbalan* and *pipilan* are performed by the *bonang* and *gender* respectively, and in Balinese gamelan the interlocking of *polos* (on-beat) and *sangsih* (off beat) on the *gansa* creates dense, interwoven melodies. The interlocking found in Reich’s *Electric Counterpoint* is a clear representation of where Balinese gamelan polyrhythms have been internalized by a Western composer: interlocking rhythmic lines are considered characteristic of Minimal compositions, created through phasing or additive melodic lines.

Gamelan in the West.

How do Westerners aurally contextualize this sound? Why are Westerners attracted to it? Who participates in gamelan ensembles located outside of Indonesia? Here is a list of responses from members of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble regarding gamelan’s sonic and structural qualities. I asked them “what makes gamelan sound like gamelan?”

> The deep and evolving rhythms, all synchronized, that speed up and slow down like one vast organism. The dense fractal interlocking that happens between instruments at all levels.
>
> You have to feel the music instead of looking at the score or practicing it a million times on your own.
>
> Surface complexity, due to interlocking parts and connection between those interlocking parts and the underlying pokok.

[171] Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. 157. Print.

> To me it is a very metalic sound with oddly-tuned scales.
>
> The most prominent characteristic of the gamelan's sound to me is the timbre of the instruments as a collected whole.
>
> Gamelan sounds like gamelan because of the particular style of layering in the ensemble. Everyone uses the same simple melody as the basis for deriving his or her part, and despite differences in the complexity of the various parts, the music arises out of the combination of ALL the parts without giving priority to any single instrument.
>
> The unique scales of the gamelan as well as the interlocking rhythms and melodies are what I find incredibly unique to this type of music. The fact that there are no distinct soloists — the gamelan *is* the ensemble — is a really intriguing concept.
>
> The interlocking and rippling nature of the sound. The gong sounds.
>
> The gamelan's sound is characterized by the overlapping timbres all focusing around an underlying structure.

What is so peculiar about gamelan in its form to the Western ear? As Brent Hugh observes, while "[w]estern tonal music… is goal oriented… designed to 'develop' ideas and to move towards carefully designed climaxes, Javanese [and Balinese] music, by contrast, is concerned not with movement in time but with timelessness."[172] This non-directional, non-developmental style is antithetical to the highly directional and developmental nature of Western Common Practice music prior to the 20th century, and represented an attractive alternative for modern and postmodern composers to explore. Furthermore, its structure and modes are appealing: the "overlapping timbers,"

[172] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.

"interlocking," and "oddly-tuned scales" of gamelan represent an "otherness" that many Western composers have explored, appropriated, and assimilated within their works.

Furthermore, gamelan is niche outside of Indonesia. This understanding supports our claim that gamelan is viewed as peripheral, not central to our understanding of Western soundscapes, opposite of our central argument (that it is actually *central*). To support this claim — that gamelan is viewed as "niche" — we must ask "how is it peripheralized?" Isaac Mirza, one member of the Emory Gamelan ensemble and a PhD candidate in religion states that "gamelan is a 'fringe' type of music in the US, and so demographically we tend to be more the college music majors and Burning Man attendees." Most of those that I surveyed at Emory did not consider themselves to be professional musicians. And, as Barbra Benary has shown, "ex-pat" gamelan are largely housed in the academy in the West.[173] Over half of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble is involved in academia, many with doctorates or pursuing doctoral study in anthropology or religion. Only a few have been to Indonesia. Furthermore, although some of the more complex instruments such as the *bonang* and the *gender* take years to perfect, a novice musician can quickly take up the *saron* within the course of twenty minutes. These facts — that gamelan in the West is non-professional, that it is housed in the academy, that it is viewed as "easy" to play, that it is performed by non-native musicians — are peripheralizing, preventing it from being viewed as an equal to other Western musical traditions. I would suspect that these results can be extrapolated to reflect international demographic trends in gamelan communities.

[173] Benary, Barbara. "Directory of Gamelan Groups: United States." American Gamelan Institute. Ed. Sharon Millman. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Using Mirza's term, I believe even those who extensively research and perform this music can demographically be considered "fringe." For example, there were only three Western character types that I observed in Bali who expressed any serious interest in this musiculture: the ethnomusicologist, the musician-hybridist, and the spiritualist, all of whom constitute "subgroups," assemblages that I do not consider mainstream by any approximation. A fourth character, the (average) Western tourist, was only cursorily interested. These observations would require another paper to investigate, but I present them here to demonstrate the "niche" nature of gamelan in the West through the eyes of a Westerner.

What attracts us, as Westerners, to this sound? Hugh mentions that "its freedom from rules of functional harmony, its free forms, unrelated to those of European music, the fascinating timbre of the percussive instruments, and the layered texture, free from the European rules of counterpoint" are certainly attractive to the Western ear that savors "otherness."[174] Speaking on the ways that Debussy appropriated gamelan within his repertoire in his dissertation *Echoes from the East*, Kiyoshi Tamagawa lists the following criteria that suggest gamelan's influence.

> 1. Titles suggestive of the orient or exoticism
> 2. Passages or formal structures built around ostinato techniques or large-scale repetition, including forms which are built on circular or symmetrical patterns, rather than on the tonal logic of western music.
> 3. Pitch materials, motives or scales suggestive of gamelan. Aside from the few examples of direct borrowing, this mostly consists of the use of non-diatonic scales (whole-tone and pentatonic, among others) which suggest *slendro* and *pelog* tunings used in gamelan music, or at least scales and tunings which are different from the major-minor

[174] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.

> system.
> 4. Timbres and tone colors evocative of the gamelan. The resonating piano is perhaps Western music's closest approximation of the sound of the gamelan. Soft, pedalled, staccato notes, soft seconds, low fifths held in the pedal, and high, fast, ostinato-type figures all suggest aspects of the gamelan's timbre.
> 5. Textures reminiscent of layered gamelan texture. The most characteristic texture is a low, slow-moving, sustained gong sound, overlaid by a moderately moving melody in the middle range of the piano, and faster-moving figures in the upper range of the piano.[175]

But cannot these markers of appropriation be applied beyond Debussy's repertoire to the Western cannon of contemporary classical music in general? In my view, appropriation and assimilation of gamelan and world music go far beyond Debussy's use in *Pagodes*, but actually define our broader soundscapes and compositional practices. Ostinato, cyclicality, pentatonicism, interlocking polyrhythms, and other non-Western melodic and rhythmic structures have been inserted into our Western musical vernacular as a result of interactions with the "other," representing the gradual internalization of the "other" and requisite renegotiation of "self" over time.

Our attraction might go deeper than just our sonic appreciation for the music, beyond attraction to gamelan structure and melody. Andrew McGraw observes that for "Western performers [gamelan] has become an incarnation of an idealized humanity, a harmonious, non-conflictual form valuing group over individual. Many Anglo participants come to gamelan seeking, as one musician once put it to me, 'culture, where we had none.'"[176] As tradition-seekers, the gamelan represents an outlet for us to

[175] Tamagawa, Kiyoshi. *Echoes From the East: The Javanese Gamelan and its Influence on the Music of Claude Debussy*. D.M.A. dissertation. The University of Texas at Austin, 1988. 36 – 44. Print.
[176] McGraw, Andrew. "The Gamelan and Indonesian Music in America." *OUP Blog*. Oxford University Press, 27 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

reconnect with an imagined past and commune with an imagined tradition. As this shows, some members of gamelan in the West are not merely attracted to the sound of gamelan, but to the sociocultural and historical context of this instrument. Gamelan is more than the "suburban spa music of middle-aged housewives" as my friend Luke Geaney put it, himself a member of a Math-core, Balinese fusion band who performed with me in the Baturiti men's gamelan ensemble at Pak Madé's compound, Sanggar Manik Galih. Gamelan is a living, breathing, yet often unrecognized parent-culture of the modern musical West. While the musician-hybridist, the ethnomusicologist, and the spiritualist might recognize this connection, I doubt that the mainstream listener does, an obliviousness that this paper hopes to remedy through public presentation and open-access scholarship.

As we will see in forthcoming arguments, Indonesian music has had a major impact on modern Western art music, particularly influencing Western interpretations of time, melody, and rhythm. This is perhaps why Marc Perlman concludes that "the gamelan music of Central Java is one of the world's great orchestral traditions," and the same can be said of Balinese ensembles.[177] Pak Midiyanto mentioned to me after an evening rehearsal that "you can find Beethoven 9th here, in this composition," a metaphor for the complexity of gamelan *karawitan.*[178] And after having been presented with a lengthy inquiry into the theory and performance practice of gamelan as well as its sociocultural context, I would hope the reader agrees. The connections between the West and the "other" are myriad.

---

[177] Perlman, Marc. *Unplayed Melodies: Javanese Gamelan and the Genesis of Music Theory.* University of California Press: Los Angeles, 2004. See back cover.
[178] Midiyanto and Pak I Madé Lasmawan. Personal Interview. March 2015. Atlanta, GA.

<u>Satie, Debussy, and Stravinsky: Impressionism and Neoclassicism.</u>

"Yes, I did break the rules but I got the sound I wanted." — Claude Debussy

Debussy, Satie and Stravinsky are regarded as several of the most prolific *avant-garde* composers of the late 19th and early 20th centuries, and their revolutionary treatment of melody, harmony and rhythm heralded the onset of modernism. Alongside contemporaries such as Ravel, Schoenberg, Poulenc, and Messiaen, these composers distanced themselves from archetypical Western counterpoint and form, choosing, as Rudolph Reti asserts in the case of Debussy, but which also accurately describes Satie's and Stravinsky's compositional aims, to "change the state of harmonic tonality which had characterized the classical period."[179] They detested the Eurocentric tendencies and the prevailing Teutonic hegemony that pervaded Western composition; to remedy this, Satie, Debussy and Stravinsky composed music that extirpated the fundamental pillars upon which this system was built.

Although their musical styles are unique, they cannot be wholly attributed to individual innovation alone — many of the musical elements presented in their works pay homage to cultural musics outside of the Haydn-Mozart-Beethoven hegemony, and represent the clear influence of non-Western and folk music on the development of an authentically 'Modern' style through hybridity. This section will not only underscore the impact of exoticism and hybridization on Western music, specifically referencing the influence of the gamelan within Debussy's *Pagodes* (1903), Erik Satie's *Gnossiennes No. 1, 2* and *3* (1893), and, perhaps surprisingly, within Stravinsky's *Le Sacre du Printemps*

[179] Reti, Rudolph. Tonality, Atonality, Pantonality: A Study of Some Trends in Twentieth Century Music. London: Rockliff, 1958. 59. Print.

(1913), but will aim to define each composer's unique fascination with musical "others" and the way that this fascination impacted their musical language and that of subsequent movements. Furthermore, considering that Satie, Debussy, and Stravinsky knew of each other's work and, as documented by their correspondences, were close acquaintances, the impact of their interactions on their musical style will be speculated. I argue that French exoticism, while still distinctly Western, represented a distanciation from the West via appropriation of "otherized" sonorities, a trend that still persists today and has come to define modern Western soundscapes.

Like many other composers who came to prominence at the conclusion of the 19th century, Debussy, Stravinsky, and Satie aimed to avoid the restrictive forms of their predecessors, choosing to embrace free-form structures and avoid the stagnant Romantic-era forms such as the suite or concert overture. They began to compose shorter works with truncated, more exposed melodies, favoring the arabesque, nocturne, and prelude over the symphony. While many *fin de siècle* composers did write for the symphony at some point in their careers, even their symphonies exhibited this general trend and eventual transformation: movements became shorter, structures became more atypical, and melodies became more concise and pronounced, taking on a more important role than harmony.

In this section of my thesis, I have chosen to focus on Debussy, Satie, and Stravinsky for several reasons. First, because they are historically among the most cited Impressionist and Neoclassical composers and are well known to the public. Second, I have selected them in order to delineate several patterns that will serve as the foundational pillars for subsequent arguments concerning exoticism. It is a truism to state

that all three of these composers engaged in some type of exoticism — and yet, while each created their own unique compositional styles that reflected their distinct encounters with and unique interpretations of the "other," they each wrestled with it in strikingly similar ways. In fact, I argue that each of their compositional styles were informed by each others' techniques that, in turn, were inspired by interactions with the gamelan and world music. They composed their pieces according to a defined chain of influence: Debussy was inspired by Satie, and Stravinsky was inspired by Debussy. All contributed to and composed in the style of the French exotic.

In Stravinsky's case, he listened within to the modal compositions of Russian folksong and found inspiration for his works from the haunting melodies of the hurdy gurdy and the guttural songs of the Russian basso profundi. Yet, as we will see in the subsequent argument, he frequently evaded classification as a "Slavophile" and "Westernizer," consistently denying the incorporation (i.e. direct appropriation) of Russian folksongs in his compositions. This leads me to this argument: if we distance ourselves from the long-established truth that Stravinsky appropriated Slavic folk melodies and incorporated them into his musical idiom, we realize that Stravinsky's take on exoticism is distinctly French. His type of appropriation I will label as endogenous, from within. Although his source materials differ from Debussy or Satie, I argue that his compositional vocabulary followed in the footsteps of French exoticism coined by French Impressionists.

Alternatively, Debussy often directed his ear East toward the exotic sonorities of Asia, seeking inspiration from the pentatonic and whole tone scales of the Orient: he was particularly fascinated by the gamelan from Indonesia. Debussy's appropriation is almost

always exogenous. And Satie, fascinated by multiple "others" (e.g. Hungarian folksong, gamelan, etc.) created a hybrid sonic amalgam that would define his style and, in collaboration with Debussy, establish French exoticism. Below, we will consider his *Gnossiennes* among several other compositions that, according to my argument, heavily allude to Javanese and Balinese gamelan in their structures and melodies. Satie's appropriation is a conglomeration of endogenous and exogenous source material and represents a radical emancipation from the strict stylism of the Romantics, defining the modern era of music making.

Considering the close association of artistic movements that were deeply inspired by exotic themes — as Roberts calls "the contemporary vogue that was orientalism"[180] — as well as the personal friendships between these composers, it is not too far of a stretch to state that the French Impressionists' appropriation of the exotic led to the reconceptualization of music. This retooling of the exotic that, in my opinion, far surpassed the exoticism of the Romantics in its tonal vocabulary, has inspired future movements such as Neoclassicism and Minimalism that have come to define the modern West. I will show this through formal analysis of Impressionist works and historical accounts.

Before analyzing individual pieces, we must investigate French exoticism in more detail. French exoticism, like previous conceptions of the exotic, was deeply nationalistic. As Louis Laloy stated, "Debussy was a nationalist and was to be so to the point of intolerance."[181] Debussy laments the domineering German compositional style of Wagner who himself was swept up in the exoticism vogue, stating that "one is forced to admit

[180] Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. 159. Print.
[181] Laloy, Louis. *Louis Laloy on Debussy, Ravel and Stravinsky,* ed. and trans. Deborah Priest. Hampshire, Vermont: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 1999. 115. Print.

that French music has, for too long, followed paths that definitely lead away from this clearness of expression, this conciseness and precision of form, both of which are the very qualities peculiar to French genius."[182] And in another interview, he mentioned that "there's too much German influence in France and we're still suffocated by it."[183] How is it that nationalism and exoticism go hand in hand? As mentioned previously, *Pagodes* is not considered an example of the "Indonesian exotic," but of the "French exotic." The concepts of nationalism and exoticism seem, at least according to intuition, to be polar opposites. It is no secret that Debussy detested the influence of foreign musics on French style. As Babyak states, "he urge[d] composers to reconnect with their national roots, and he praise[d] French musical traditions such as the 'purely French tradition in the works of Rameau.'"[184] Yet nothing of his style betrays any obvious Frenchness. Babyak notes:

> But if musical Frenchness was a guiding principle for Debussy, we stumble upon a contradiction when we ask how this principle manifests itself in his music. For his music does not seem to signal anything that we might interpret as Frenchness. Surveying the titles of Debussy's works, one is struck by the number of titles that refer, not to France, but to foreign locales: Pagodes, suggesting an Asian (perhaps Indonesian) context; La Soirée dans Grenade, referring to a city in Spain; Pour l'Égyptienne, evoking Egypt; Iberia, evoking Spain… In short, Debussy's output is replete with exotic-sounding titles. And his music, as we shall see, is replete with exotic markers—markers that seem to point away from France toward foreign, exotic locales. Thus, Debussy's music seems to be at odds with his nationalistic politics.[185]

---

[182] Lesure, François. *Debussy on Music: The Critical Writing of the Great French Composer Claude Debussy*. Trans. Richard Langham Smith. New York: Alfred A Knopf, 1977. 112. Print.
[183] Nicholas, Roger and François Lesure. *Debussy Letters*. Trans. Roger Nicholas. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1987. 112. Print.
[184] Babyak, Telka B. *Nietzsche, Debussy, and the Shadow of Wagner.* PhD Dissertation. Cornell University, 2014. Xii. Print.
[185] Babyak, Telka B. *Nietzsche, Debussy, and the Shadow of Wagner.* PhD Dissertation. Cornell University, 2014. Xii. Print.

So how can we conceptualize exoticism as a function of nationalism, of French purism? In light of Said's definition of orientalism, a concept that is inherently rooted to imperialist power dynamics, "exoticism" can be viewed as a type of musical colonialism that exploits native aesthetics to benefit the European colonizer. Colonies have always been viewed as points of nationalistic pride and as symbols of power to European imperialist nations. France, as a European colonialist power, had a long history of colonization of Eastern countries. Perhaps it is this mentality of colony-colonizer that supports nationalistic sentiments when engaging in exoticism, justifying Debussy's desire to compose in the "purely French tradition" that included the musicultures of colonies.

Furthermore, we must consider Locke's definition of absorbed exoticism. As Babyak mentions, Ralphe Locke describes absorption as "the use of exotic musical markers in pieces with no explicit connection to exotic subject matter."[186] This is characteristic of French exoticism. Many examples from the Romantic era exist of exoticism or orientalism: Borodin's *In the Steppes of Central Asia*, Verdi's *Aida* (particularly "Possente Ftha"), Mahler's *Das Lied von der Erde*, Chabrier's *España*, Ippolitov-Ivanov's *Turkish Sketches*, Dvorak's *New World Symphony no.9*. While exoticism was nothing new at the turn of the 20th century, the way that French composers used the exotic was. While other composers used exotic motifs within orientalized pieces, Debussy and Satie used these techniques in non-exotic (i.e. Western) settings.

For a moment, let us revisit our understanding of the exotic: Jonathan Bellman recognizes that "the characteristic and easily recognized musical gestures from the alien culture are assimilated into a more familiar style... exoticism is [therefore] a matter of...

---

[186] Ralph P. Locke, "Cutthroats and Casbah Dancers, Muezzins and Timeless Sands: Musical Images of the Middle East," in The Exotic in Western Music, ed. Jonathan Bellman (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998)

making the notes do something different from what they usually do."[187] Historically, exoticism has been viewed (like Bellman suggests) as the way that composers represent the "other" musically by "making the notes do something different from what they usually do," often in a tokenized, cliché way. However, I believe that Debussy goes beyond that and actually incorporated "otherized" sonorities and structures (not just notes) within his pieces. Thus, it is my argument that both Satie and Debussy's exotic (the French exotic) represent the first wave of assimilation of exotic techniques into the Western musical vernacular. Berlioz, the famed French Romantic, said after hearing a performance of Chinese music "I shall not attempt to describe these wildcat howls, these death-rattles, these turkey cluckings, in the midst of which, despite my closest attention, I was able to make out only four distinct notes."[188] Yet only a few years later, Debussy and Satie's musical language was defined by hybridity with the "other" (i.e. colonial subjects, the Orient, ancient music types). As cosmopolitan French musicians, they felt entitled to use the world as the source of their themes and techniques while remaining staunchly nationalist. After all, France was the artistic Mecca of the world at that time.

[187] Bellman, Jonathan. *The Exotic in Western Music.* Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. ix. Print.
[188] Crumb, George. "Music: Does it have a Future?" from Gillespie, Don. *George Crumb: Profile of a Composer.* C.F. Peters Corporation, New York. 1984. 16. Print.

Erik Satie and Exoticism: *Trois Gnossiennes* (1893).

Eric Satie, a prolific 19th century composer whose characteristically simple, repetitive melodies stylistically foreshadowed the Minimalist movement by almost a century, is an indisputably important figure in the history of Western music. An eccentric whose interest in "forgotten… history and the occult"[189] compelled him to constantly revisit themes of ancient myth and mysticism within both his works and personal life, Satie sought aural horizons previously unexplored by Western composers and found his greatest inspiration within exotic and oriental spheres. Not only has his revolutionary style been credited with the establishment of French Impressionism in collaboration with Debussy and Ravel, but his unconventional ideas of harmony and melody simultaneously influenced and drew inspiration from burgeoning avant-garde artistic and philosophical movements such as Dadaism, Surrealism, Symbolism, and Rosicrucianism, which laid the groundwork for the evolution of compositional styles at the onset of the 1900s. This cross-pollination of creative ideas amongst *fin de siècle* bohemians led to significant changes in the aural landscape, a landscape that soon reflected composers' desire for simplicity over complexity, that idealized both true and imagined foreignness but eschewed convention, and that rejected the emotional subjectivity of Romantic-era compositions while embracing a more objective compositional style that would define the modern Western sound of the 20th and 21st centuries. Specifically, this essay will address Satie's fascination with the "other" and will analyze elements of exoticism and "otherness" found within Satie's *Gnossienne No. 1, No. 2*, and *No. 3* (*Trois Gnossiennes*),

[189] Richardson, Nick. "Velvet Gentleman." Rev. of *A Mammal's Notebook: The Writings of Erik Satie*, by Erik Satie. *London Review of Books* 37.11 (2015): 37. Print. Source edited by Ornella Volta, translated by Antony Melville.

a series of solo piano pieces composed between 1881 and 1891 and published in 1893 that, due to their unique melodic and harmonic ideas, ultimately cemented Satie's legacy in the annals of history as one of Europe's greatest composers of modern Western music and which, in my opinion, incorporate elements that have arisen from interactions with world musics, speculatively gamelan.

Born in 1866 in Honfleur, France, Satie attempted to distance himself from the emotional subjectivity characteristic of the Romantic period, instead choosing to embrace anti-subjective ideals that would influence an array of artistic movements including *théâtre de l'absurde* and aleatory ("chance" compositions), and that would inspire generations of Minimalists and avant-garde composers in two waves: the *fin de siècle* (end of century) composers of the 1890s – 1920s, and those of the 1940s to the present.[190] Although Satie's influence is presently undisputed, Satie was not immediately popular as a composer or musician — though he studied at the prestigious Paris Conservatorie, many of his professors doubted his compositional abilities, recalling that his early compositions were "worthless" and that he was "gifted but indolent… [and was] the laziest student" at the Conservatorie, discouraging sentiments that Satie was keenly aware of and that ultimately influenced his decision to leave the academy without completing his studies.[191] The European public also took little notice of his obscure, experimental compositions at the outset of his career. It was not until Ravel staged Satie's *Gymnopédie No. 3* and *Sarabande No. 2* at the Société Musicale Indépendante in 1910 and Debussy

[190] Richardson, John. An Eye for Music: Popular Music and the Audiovisual Surreal. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2012. 132. Print.
[191] Richardson, Nick. "Velvet Gentleman." Rev. of *A Mammal's Notebook: The Writings of Erik Satie*, by Erik Satie. *London Review of Books* 37.11 (2015): 27. Print. Source edited by Ornella Volta, translated by Antony Melville.

orchestrated and performed his *Gymnopédies* in the same year, and, later still, when John Cage presented a lecture entitled "Defense of Satie" in 1948 that the world began to take notice of his works.

Satie's initial obscurity was due to several factors: his strange, bohemian mannerisms certainly were partially to blame for his initial lack of credibility and patronage among the moneyed Parisian elite, the financiers who had largely delineated what was and was not popular via their patronage and sociopolitical influence. And unlike other composers who had affixed themselves financially to wealthy benefactors, Satie had not, likely due to his reclusive and peculiar personality. Yet his behavior can be considered no less eccentric than his music.[192] Satie's distinctly atypical compositional style differed drastically from that of Beethoven, Haydn and Mozart, Western composers of the First Viennese School who had established the Western theoretical and aural status quo in Common Practice music and whose compositions many aspiring composers strove to emulate. Additionally, while many of Satie's Romantic contemporaries explored Richard Wagner's ideal of *Gesamtkunstwerk* or "Total Artwork," seeking "to refine their emotional response and to exteriorize their hidden dream states" within their compositions, Satie did not.[193] He despised Wagner's approach, deeming it a pandering, overly-emotional compositional practice that plagued Romantic composition. Overall, he detested the Teutonic stranglehold of the German Classical and Romantic composers almost entirely, calling their cloying compositions "Sauerkraut music," and closely aligned himself with the anti-elitist French School that he felt "was the only possible

---

[192] Richardson, Nick. "Velvet Gentleman." Rev. of *A Mammal's Notebook: The Writings of Erik Satie*, by Erik Satie. *London Review of Books* 37.11 (2015): 26-28. Print. Source edited by Ornella Volta, translated by Antony Melville.

[193] Lockspeiser, Edward. "Claude Debussy." *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica Inc., 2016. Web. 19 Mar. 2016. http://www.britannica.com/biography/Claude-Debussy.

opposition to an epoch of excessive refinement."[194] For these reasons, Satie's compositions fundamentally conflicted with the works of German Romantic composers on most every level, chiefly differing in their complexity, subjectivity, and in the source and treatment of their creative inspiration.

Tired of the archetypical Western counterpoint and melodic ideas, Satie sought inspiration in ancient myth and mysticism, incorporating these exotic sonorities and concepts into his compositions to create a uniquely modern sound. Like Satie, many bohemian composers rejected the familiar and wished to "be enchanted by the unknown,"[195] to explore the "the primitive, natural world"[196] through their compositions. Perhaps some of his most strikingly exotic compositions are his *Trois Gnossiennes*. The title of the *Gnossienne* suite is, in itself, exotic. *Gnossiennes* is a term that Satie invented, most likely a bastardization of the Greek word "Gnosis" meaning knowledge, purity or religious insight, and was a clear homage to "Gnosticism," a theological-philosophical movement rooted in the ideology of Joséphin Péladan's Rose-et-croix sect to which Satie belonged in the late 1800s (a movement with which several sources claim Debussy was associated). Another explanation proposes that the title of this suite references the ancient ritual dances of Knossos, the capitol of the Greek island of Crete and the famous setting of some of the most revered stories in Greek mythology, or perhaps it was an allusion to John Dryden's 1697 translation of the Aeneid: "Let us the land which Heav'n appoints, explore;/ Appease the winds, and seek the *Gnossian* shore."[197] This ambiguity betrayed

[194] Fletcher, Peter. *World Musics in Context: A Comprehensive Survey of the World's Major Musical Cultures*. Oxford: Oxford U, 2001. 472. Print.
[195] Pasler, Jann. *Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France.* Berkeley: U of California, 2009. 546. Print.
[196] Ibid. 527.
[197] Dryden, John. *The Works of Virgil: Containing his Pastorals, Georgics, and Aeneis*. London: Jacob Tonson, 1697. Book III, line 153 of the *Aeneid*.

Satie's affiliation with the Symbolist movement, a movement that explored irrational and spiritual questions through music, a medium that Symbolists deemed the most abstract art form. Satie employed Symbolism in his *Gnossiennes* and other compositions, "in order to 'see the truth' in past civilisation and 'suggest the nature of that experience.'"[198] Like Satie, Symbolists viewed art as "a sensation, a translation, an abstraction of reality, [but] not reality itself,"[199] and the ambiguous nature of the title of the piece creates a mysterious psychological landscape of symbolized "foreignness," setting the stage for Satie's exotic sonorities to unfold. This is the approach Debussy would take in future years.

Furthermore, Satie's music was deeply tied to the Dadaist and Surrealist movements, movements that rejected traditional values, criticized conservative thought, and satirized societal conventionality, catalyzing a new era of revolutionary idealism. These movements aligned closely with Satie's eccentric personality and eclectic compositional style. Each began in protest of the atrocities witnessed in World War I and were largely inspired by social insurrection movements — this affiliation would define Surrealism and Dadaism as counter-culture movements that protested social modus operandi and continuously questioned the status quo,[200] affiliations that furthered Satie's 'bad boy' image and increased his appeal among younger generations. Surrealism initially attempted to embody the futility and senseless violence of World War I through eccentric, nonsensical art that was characteristically bizarre; as the movement evolved, it

---

[198] Jaroncinski, Stefan. *Debussy: Impressionism and Symbolism*, trans. Rollo Myers. London: Eulenburg, 1981. 59. Print.
[199] Pasler, Jann. *Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France.* Berkeley: U of California, 2009. 527. Print.
[200] Adamowicz, Elza. *Un Chien Andalou: Luis Buñuel and Salvador Dalí, 1929*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2010. 2 – 5. Print.

broadened its scope, satirizing cultural idiosyncrasies through social commentary.[201] Also, the Surrealist Movement intentionally lacked a defined objective, permitting a wide range of art to be characterized as surreal — this allowed many artists to retain unique personal styles while simultaneously remaining subscribed to this movement.[202] As defined by the founder of the Surrealist Movement André Breton in Manifesto of Surrealism, Surrealism is a "psychic automatism in the pure state, by which one proposes to express — verbally, by means of the written word, or in any other manner — the actual functioning of thought." Additionally, Breton argues that Surrealism is the "dictation of thought, in the absence of any control exercised by reason, exempt from any aesthetic or moral concern." This intentionally ambiguous ideology permitted Surrealist thought to pervade many artistic genres and media.[203] Music was considered inherently surreal because of its ability to convey primitive emotionality on a primordial level, emotions that could be understood in the absence of visual stimuli.[204]

This ambiguity, stemming from Satie's association with Impressionists and Symbolists (and later, Surrealists and Dadaists), is reflected in the piece's performance instructions. In addition to normative performance directions regarding issues of tempo ("Lent") and volume ("*p*"), some instructions delve into the performer's psyche, an inherently subjective realm. Considering that Satie was a proponent of anti-subjectivity, instructions such as "avec étonnement" (with astonishment), "dans une grande bonté"

---

[201] Ibid.
[202] Coombs, Neil. *Studying Surrealist and Fantasy Cinema*. London, England: Leighton Buzzard - Auteur, 2008. 15 – 21. Print.
[203] Breton, André. Manifeste Du Surréalisme; Poisson Soluble. Paris: Éditions Du Sagittaire, 1924. Print. Trans. Kline, A. S. "First Manifesto of Surrealism - 1924: André Breton." Poetry in Translation. MIT Press, 2010. Web. 27 Oct. 2012.
[204] "Surrealism and Music? The Musical World Around Rene Magritte." *American Symphony Orchestra*. Web. 22 Oct. 2012.

(with great kindness), and "postulez en vous même'" (wonder about yourself) seem hypocritical. As Mary Davis claims, these performance instructions redrew "the relationship between composer and interpreter, requiring performers to grapple with interior complexity rather than simply respond to rote technical language."[205] What was Satie hoping to accomplish by using these vague instructions consisting of Romantic language that hinted at religiosity? Jann Pasler argues that they are likely Satie's tongue-in-cheek attempt to satirize the hyper-emotionality of the Romantics, asserting that "Satie was [...] parodying the self-seriousness of Wagner and Wagnerians, taking aim at what performers were supposed to be thinking of when playing this music and how listeners behave at Wagnerian concerts."[206] [207] Corroborating this idea, Davis notes that "one indisputable influence in this regard was the *fin de siècle* cabaret, where language was developing as the centrepiece of a unique mode of ironic humour that was captured in contemporary parlance by the complex term blague."[208] A possible testament to the humoristic superficiality of the performance directions, *Gnossienne No. 1* and *No. 3* were originally published without any performance instructions in the September 1893 issue of the national newspaper *Le Figaro* under the heading "Varieties et Curiosités Musicales," likely because these instructions did nothing to aid the performer in their musical interpretations of these pieces and were added retrospectively in jest.

However, instead of viewing these performance directions as entirely ironic, non-instructional, and anti-establishment, a product of *la blague*, another rationale could

[205] Davis, Mary E. *Erik Satie*. London: Reaktion, 2007. 539 - 540. Print.
[206] Pasler, Jann. *Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France.* Berkeley: U of California, 2009. 62. Print.
[207] Simmons, Alexander. "Erik Satie's Trois Gnossiennes in the French Fin De Siclè." M.M. Thesis. University of Birmingham, 2012. 89. Print.
[208] Davis, Mary E. *Erik Satie*. London: Reaktion, 2007. 85. Print.

account for these “vestiges of Romanticism:” Satie had always been fascinated by medieval Catholicism and spiritual mysticism, inherently subjective and exotic realms that had also provided inspiration to many late Romantic composers including Wagner. This alternative interpretation posits that although Satie might have “ascetically restrained the subjective element in his… music… he did not [entirely] negate it.”[209] While both Wagner and Satie may have been attempting to explore and refine their subjective emotional experiences through their music, their approaches differed dramatically. As Larry Solomon asserts, “Satie’s musical aesthetic is antithetical to Wagnerian emotional indulgence,”[210] because while Wagner sought to “exteriorize…hidden dream states”[211] explicitly through his overtly emotional music-dramas, Satie valued individual introspection, inviting performers to “wonder about [themselves]” by diving deeply into the exotic realm of the psyche to negotiate unanswerable questions of faith and challenging questions of identity on their own terms. Fittingly, the *Gnossiennes* were written for solo piano, stressing the solitary nature of this psychological journey. Thus, the vague performance instructions and ambiguous title might actually have indicated Satie’s genuine attempt to musically and spiritually reconnect to the distant past using myth and mysticism as conduits to better interpret “the self” and the divine, both “exotic” spaces.

Satie, an atypical yet devout Catholic, was so fascinated by religious and spiritual themes that he had not only become a member of the cult-like religious sect of Rosicrucianism, or the “Rose-et-croix” (Rose-Cross) Order, but had actually become its

---

[209] Simmons, Alexander. “Erik Satie's Trois Gnossiennes in the French Fin De Siclè.” M.M. Thesis. University of Birmingham, 2012. 89. Print.
[210] Solomon, Larry J. “Satie, The First Modern.” 2003. Web. 30 Oct. 2015.
[211] Lockspeiser, Edward. “Claude Debussy.” *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica Inc., 2016. Web. 19 Mar. 2016. http://www.britannica.com/biography/Claude-Debussy.

music director in 1891.[212] According to Simmons, this secret order of artists and intellectuals entrusted with upholding the tenets of the Catholic faith “created a modern aesthetic based on an antique past, bestowing the mysteries of Catholic art on contemporary subjects.”[213] Satie’s fascination with the occult, symbolism, and spirituality during this period led him to publish *Gnossienne No.2* in an esoteric journal known as *Le Coeur*, a journal headed by the occult novelist Jules Bois and famed former-*Rosicrucian* Count Antoine de la Rochefoucald. After becoming dissatisfied with the Rose-Cross Order, Satie continued to nourish his curiosity in the occult by establishing his own religion in 1893, L'Église Métropolitaine d'Art de Jésus Conducteur, that he hoped would serve as “a refuge where the Catholic faith and the Arts, which are indissolubly bound to it, shall grow and prosper, sheltered from profanity, expanding in all their purity, unsullied by the workings of evil,”[214] yet this dogma betrayed his allegiance to the rhetoric and practices of the Rose-Cross cult since it was virtually identical. During this time, he also served as the cabaret pianist at popular bohemian cafés Chat Noir and Auberge du Clou, positions that he felt were demeaning but which provided him with a humble stipend. Just as medieval mysticism represented an “exotic” influence on Satie’s music, so too did the cabaret. In fact, if we consider that the *Gnossiennes* are “ancient dances” and understand that the majority of works Satie composed for the cabaret were dance pieces, its easy to comprehend why Satie might have culled inspiration from his cabaret arrangements to inform his more serious compositions like the *Gnossiennes*. To

[212] Lindgren, Carl Edwin. “The way of the Rose Cross: A Historical Perception, 1614–1620.” *Journal of Religion and Psychical Research*, Volume 18, Number 3:141–48. 1995.
[213] Simmons, Alexander. “Erik Satie's Trois Gnossiennes in the French Fin De Siclè.” M.M. Thesis. University of Birmingham, 2012. 69. Print.
[214] Richardson, Nick. “Velvet Gentleman.” Rev. of *A Mammal’s Notebook: The Writings of Erik Satie*, by Erik Satie. *London Review of Books* 37.11 (2015): 26-28. Print. Source edited by Ornella Volta, translated by Antony Melville.

this end, Roger Shattuck observed that there was "a conveniently short distance from esoteric religions to cabaret gaiety"[215] for Satie — while Satie's cabaret songs featured simple harmonies and melodies, so too did Satie's more serious compositions expressing the fact that Satie "favored the angular vitality of the cabaret [compositions] over the lush harmonies and textures" of the Impressionists and Romantics.[216] In addition to displaying similarities to his cabaret works, the compositions Satie completed just after the *Gnossienne* suite was published reflected his continued fascination with Catholicism, mysticism and the exotic directly in their titles (with key words underlined for emphasis): <u>*Messe*</u> *des pauvres* (1895), *9 Dances* <u>*Gothiques*</u> (1893), *Sonneires de la* <u>*Rose + Croix*</u> (1892), and *Pages* <u>*mystiques*</u> (1895).[217] But how did this fascination with the exotic and the occult translate into his compositional style?

As Davis observes, Satie, "drawn to the occult and mystical, … [had the] opportunity to explore the possibilities of translating these qualities into a new mode of musical expression."[218] I argue that it is Satie's view of the "exotic" (as religious, "otherized," mystic) that drew him to the gamelan. Furthermore, he was a close acquaintance of Debussy who undoubtedly was impressed by the gamelan. According to the existing literature, the *Gnossiennes* are often cited as being the "most like gamelan." But does Satie precisely credit gamelan as their inspiration? No. They do, however, give the impression of it. I would perhaps cite his *No. 1 Idylle* (1915) or *No. 3 Méditation* (1915) from *Avant — Derniéres Pensées* as other pieces that most evoke gamelan. It is

[215] Shattuck, Roger. The Banquet Years: the origins of the Avant Garde in France (1885 to World War I). Vintage Books: New York, 1955. 113. Print.
[216] Gagné, Nicole V. *Historical Dictionary of Modern and Contemporary Classical Music*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow, 2012. 237. Print.
[217] Ibid. 236. Underscoring added by the author for emphasis.
[218] Davis, Mary E. *Erik Satie*. London: Reaktion, 2007. 48. Print.

really the structures of these pieces that I find most fascinating, and the psychological space that Satie creates that I feel is quite gamelan-esqe.

None of the *Gnossiennes* possess bar lines or time signatures, written in "free time," leaving the interpretation of the piece largely up to the performer, much like *karawitan's* non-developmental timelessness. This compositional style differed drastically from Romantics and Classicists who aimed to control every aspect of the performance through the abundance of concise performance instructions and a precise compositional "vocabulary." Like the simplicity of Satie's cabaret pieces, the *Gnossiennes* were tonally sparse and possessed static harmonies that changed only slightly but never strayed too far from the tonal center of the pieces. Their repetitive, sleek melodies are simple yet beautiful, embellished with oriental-sounding flourishes that are characterized by thrift: it seems no note is out of place or overused, yet each is just as important as its neighbors in unearthing the complexity and nuance beneath their harmonically barren landscapes. Satie's *Gnossiennes* can best be described as "miniaturist piano works 'stripped' of subjectivity and harmonic development,"[219] devoid of pretentiousness. This deceptive simplicity led Alan Gillmor to remark that the *Gnossiennes* had "breathe[d] fresh air into the decadent humidity of the *fin de siècle*,"[220] lauding Satie's success in invoking the exotic with such tonal simplicity.

Gnossienne No. 1 begins with an unusual, synthetic scale that alludes to F minor, and while no time signature is indicated, the piece is obviously in 4/4 time. The notes C, B natural, E flat, and D natural — clusters of half steps — are featured prominently

[219] Simmons, Alexander. "Erik Satie's Trois Gnossiennes in the French Fin De Siclè." M.M. Thesis. University of Birmingham, 2012. 1. Print.
[220] Davis, Mary E. *Erik Satie*. London: Reaktion, 2007. 51 – 52. Print.

throughout the piece, and the vacillating B natural and A flat (an accidental) interaction bespeaks the piece's Asian (perhaps gamelan) influence. Furthermore, a charming intermittently ascending and descending grace note pattern implies a sense of 'otherness.' Structurally, its form is A - A — B - B — C - C — B - B — A' - A' — B - B — C - C — B - B', with plagal harmonies composing the B - B section, a descending melody that interrupts that static and repeated melodies of the A and C sections.[221] The B melody ultimately concludes the piece, albeit in an abbreviated form.

Like all of these pieces, melodic ideas are usually preserved un-fragmented and unvaried, repeated multiple times, outlining the structural simplicity of the works. As Pasler reports, "Satie reduced his musical materials to a minimum… [and he] worked with short musical ideas … There is intensification, deepening awareness of one idea or state of mind rather than a constant movement from one to the next."[222] Gamelan, as a ritual instrument that has historically been used to induce trance, is certainly obsessed with this 'deepening awareness' in a mystical sense. And the reduction of musical materials can be considered proto-Minimalist. And as illustrated in the next chapter, Minimalism was another genre that was heavily inspired by the gamelan. *Gnossienne No. 2* possibly invokes chant, featuring an A-A' — B - B' — C - C — B - B' — A form that establishes a voice-chorus refrain dynamic and possesses a melody which Simmons describes as "Grecian-oriental styled"[223] and hints at transposed Dorian and Locrian modes. Just like *Gnossienne No. 1*, *Gnossiennes No. 2* and *No. 3*, while unbarred,

---

[221] Baylor, Murray. "Suggestions for Performance." Afterword. 3 Gymnopédies & 3 Gnossiennes: For the Piano. By Erik Satie. 5-6. Alfred Publishing Company, 2007. Printed CD insert. Performance by Klára Körmendi.
[222] Pasler, Jann. *Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France.* Berkeley: U of California, 2009. 541 – 543. Print.
[223] Simmons, Alexander. "Erik Satie's Trois Gnossiennes in the French Fin De Siclè." M.M. Thesis. University of Birmingham, 2012. 86. Print.

establish a firm 4/4 pulse and exhibit similar verse-chorus forms that differed strikingly from more traditional structures such as the sonata-allegro form. Furthermore, all possess "aphoristic language"[224] that Verzosa claimed expressed "mystical truths,"[225] assisting the performer in connecting with the musical "other" and spiritual "other." *Gnossienne No. 3*, composed soon after the 1889 Universal Exposition in Paris, presents a melody that "is deliberately haunting, utilising fluid and melancholic oriental scales,"[226] likely an allusion to the gamelan, yet which could also have been inspired by ancient Greek or Hungarian scales — it appears that the melody implies a B Phrygian dominant scale, at times inferring the Hungarian minor scale or the Aeolian mode. Satie's incorporation of the "hypnotic effects of the repetition from the Javanese gamelan, and the acciaccaturas and melodic style of the Romanian folk ensembles, both of which had impressed him at the Universal Exposition of 1889"[227] into his pieces underscored a marked divergence from his typical "exotic" palate which consisted of Catholic symbolism and Greek mythology from which he had previously drawn and would continue to draw inspiration.

Satie's influence is widespread. One composer who was greatly influenced by Satie was John Cage, and the parallels between Minimalist music and the *Gnossiennes* are unmistakable. As Davis notes, "Cage brought Satie to the attention of the postwar American avant-garde across the arts and promoted his aesthetic as a powerful alternative to more hermetic modes of modernism – an antidote to the control-orientated approaches of Schoenberg, Boulez and Stockhausen."[228] In fact, in 1963, it was Cage[229] who

---

[224] Verzosa, Noel Orillo. *The Absolute Limits: Debussy, Satie, and the Culture of French Modernism, Ca. 1860-1920.* PhD Dissertation. University of California, Berkeley, 2008. 125. Print.
[225] Ibid. 108.
[226] Simmons, Alexander. "Erik Satie's Trois Gnossiennes in the French Fin De Siclè." M.M. Thesis. University of Birmingham, 2012. 84. Print.
[227] Orledge, Robert. *Satie the Composer*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1990. 190. Print.
[228] Davis, Mary E. *Erik Satie*. London: Reaktion, 2007. 9. Print.

organized the first successful, 19-hour-long performance of Satie's *Vexations* (1893), a simple yet hauntingly menacing melody that mirrored John Cage's nihilistic compositional dogma that he popularized almost four decades later. The melody of *Vexations* consists of 18 notes with two static harmonizations, a tempo marking of "very slow" (*très lent*), and the following rather cryptic (and perhaps ironic) performance direction: "to play this motif 840 times in succession, it would be advisable to prepare oneself beforehand, in the deepest silence, by serious immobilities." Perhaps this aversion to harmonic composition can best be articulated by John Cage who, in a 1958 lecture *Indeterminancy*, remarked: "after I had been studying with [Schoenberg] for two years, Schoenberg said, 'In order to write music, you must have a feeling for harmony.' I explained to him that I had no feeling for harmony. He then said that I would always encounter an obstacle, that it would be as though I came to a wall through which I could not pass. I said, 'In that case I will devote my life to beating my head against that.'"[230] Satie assuredly felt similarly — in the *Gnossiennes*, the harmonies reflect Satie's lack of interest in harmonic progression, remaining static throughout the entirety of each piece. Furthermore, of interest to future discussions, Satie composed this work after his encounter with gamelan at the French Exposition, and "may well have a spiritual implication that suggests more than 'just sounds' 'folk tunes' and 'unresolved ninth chords,'"[231] but an attempt to evoke the timelessness, cyclicity, and religiosity of gamelan. Considering the other major sources of his inspiration — Greek mythology and

---

[229] Solomon, Larry J. "Satie, The First Modern." 2003. Web. 30 Oct. 2015.
[230] Cage, John. "Indeterminacy: New Aspect of Form in Instrumental and Electronic music." *Silence*. 1958. 261. Print.
[231] Konstelanetz, Richard. *John Cage: An Anthology*. Da Capo Press. New York, 1991. 80. Print. Quote by John Cage.

Catholic symbolism — it seems only natural that he would find gamelan congruent with his musical tastes.

Cage wasn't the only composer enthralled by Satie's works. Larry Solomon asserts that while "Debussy, who was four years older than Satie, is usually given the credit as 'the father of modern music,'…a careful comparison of the chronology and content of [Satie's and Debussy's] early music shows that Satie had priority and preempted Debussy in most or all of the techniques to which the latter is usually attributed."[232] Furthermore, while "Satie's early music reveals a dramatic break with that tradition … [it also] points the way to Debussy's future, as well as the future of music in general."[233] In fact, Debussy was so enamored by Satie that he sent him this note:

> Satie, you never had greater admirers than Ravel and myself; many of your early works had a great influence on our writing. Your *Prelude de La porte héroïque du ciel* was to us a revelation, so original, so different from that Wagnerian atmosphere which has surrounded us in late years. I liked your *Gymnopedies* so much that I orchestrated two of them. You have some kind of genius.[234]

To Erik Satie, the past and the inner workings of the mind represented two ethereal spaces that were just as "exotic" as folksongs or distant lands, subjects he exploits and explores within the *Gnossiennes* with remarkable sensitivity and nuance. These themes would influence Satie's decidedly modern, innovative style. Yet as Larry Solomon asserts, these innovations cannot be considered completely original or imagined: "Satie's innovations came from his long interest in and study of Medieval French music that included plainchant and parallel organum. He contemplated for long

---

[232] Solomon, Larry J. "Satie, The First Modern." 2003. Web. 30 Oct. 2015.
[233] Ibid.
[234] Golschmann, Vladimir. "Golschmann Remembers Satie." *High Fidelity/Musical America*, Aug 22, 1972. 11. Print.

hours in the gloom of Notre Dame and studied chant and Gothic art in the Paris Bibliothecque Nationale. He… took an active interest in various quasi-religious, mystical ideas… [and in the] other-worldly, unemotional detachment of Gregorian chant and medieval asceticism."[235] I argue that it is very possible that he would also consider gamelan an inspiration as well, although he never openly avows this connection. These conceptions, in collaboration with Debussy, created a French "exotic" that became the precedent for musicians at the beginning of the 20th century. While J. Peter Burkholder observes that "Satie used [these] melodic formulae and fragments from chant to suggest an ancient sacred style,"[236] his compositional techniques were constantly evolving, a factor that reflected Satie's unwillingness to be pigeonholed and his openness to new ideas. As outlined in this argument, facets of exoticism and "otherness" are undeniable in Satie's *Gnossiennes*. Satie's novel use of exogenous and endogenous exotic sonorities and structures within this work and others not only ordained him as one of the founders of contemporary classical music, but influenced the styles of other influential composers such as Debussy and John Cage whose compositional innovations have come to constitute the pillars of the modern Western cannon. By infusing fresh sounds from the East into his compositions, Satie broke free of the restraints of Romanticism and Classicism and pioneered techniques that heralded the onset of modernism, inspiring generations of *avant-garde*, Impressionist, and Minimalist composers. This paper now shifts attention to Debussy who, in addition to openly proclaiming his appreciation for the gamelan, is the most famous Impressionist and is considered the "Father of modern Music."

---

[235] Solomon, Larry J. "Satie, The First Modern." 2003. Web. 30 Oct. 2015.
[236] J. Peter Burkholder. "Borrowing." Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online. Oxford University Press. Web. 30 Oct. 2015.

Claude Debussy and Exoticism: *Pagodes* (1903).

Frederick Franck, a prominent Buddhist philosopher, asserts the following sentiment: "on the summits of awareness, [the] East and West have always met."[237] Prior to the late 19th century, however, as evidenced by the relatively recent advent of the field of ethnomusicology, the musical interactions between the East and West were limited and rarely yielded the opportunity for the detailed study or appropriation of autochthonic music. The East and West have always occupied cultural and musical antipodes: although Western composers might have been distantly aware of musical traditions in the East, the dissimilarities of oriental and Asiatic music did not easily foster their incorporation into Western composition. It was not until the conclusion of the 19th century that the Western appetite for orientalism and exoticism reached its zenith, a phenomenon that Paul Roberts describes as "the contemporary vogue known as orientalisme."[238] Certainly, while Debussy's fascination with the gamelan (and subsequent incorporation into his own compositions) might represent "a celebrated theme in musicology,"[239] it is not the first or the only example of Western encounters with this Javanese art form. In 1580, Sir Frances Drake recorded a brief encounter with Javanese natives in the ship's log of the *Golden Hind* that made explicit reference to a traditional musical practice: "[the natives] presented our Generall with his country musick, which though it were of a very strange kind … was pleasant and delightfull."[240] While the gamelan is not expressly referenced in Drake's commentary, its ancient origin prior to the establishment of the Hindu-Buddhist

---

[237] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 23. Print.
[238] Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. 159. Print.
[239] Ibid.
[240] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 1. Print.

culture of Indonesia — already long established by the time Drake arrived aboard the *Golden Hind* — would not have precluded it from being present. It was not until 1885 that A. J. Ellis began to formally archive and analyze Javanese gamelan repertoire, conducting research on *laras* (tuning systems) including the *slendro* and *pelog* tunings (5-note and 7-note scales, respectively) of the instruments in this ensemble. His research was incredibly important to comparative musicology and established the notion and notation of "cents" for measuring music intervals. Ellis's writings, however informative, appealed more to the academic and philologist than the musician, and did not directly promote an increased popularity of this music among amateur European audiences. Ultimately, although the West had maintained limited awareness of Eastern musical practices for centuries, Asiatic and oriental music represented a relatively unexplored frontier that presented many composers — including Debussy — with inspiration.[241]

In commemoration of the centenary of the French Revolution, the 1889 Exposition Universelle was hosted in Paris on the Champ de Mars, an expansive tree-lined promenade directly adjacent the site where the Eiffel tower had recently been erected. The Exposition represented one of the greatest social and cultural exchanges in history and epitomized the height of cosmopolitanism, a striving toward a universally shared global community. Perhaps the ancient Greek philosopher Diogenes' interpretation of the cosmopolite articulates the spirit of the times best: "The question was put to him what country he was from, and he replied, 'I am a citizen of the world.'" Eiffel's tower represented the triumphs of Western industriousness, of worldliness, of superiority and technological prowess, and yet despite its commanding presence as the

[241] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 1. Print.

centerpiece of the exposition a different spectacle captured Debussy's attention. Debussy was transfixed by a small exhibition of Javanese music, dance and culture at the Dutch pavilion, Le kampong Javanais. In the heart of Paris, a Javanese *kampong* (village) had been situated and within it performances of Javanese *bedaya* (dance), *wayang kulit* (puppetry), and gamelan were hosted. And while this was not the first time that a gamelan orchestra had performed in Europe — M. Van Vlenten, Minister of the Interior in the Dutch Indies, had gifted a gamelan set to the Paris Conservatoire in 1886 and 1887, and several performances of gamelan by native musicians had been held in the Netherlands — it received a larger international audience than any previous encounters. In fact, the kampong was one of the most popular pavilions with over 875,000 people visiting. The Parisians were so smitten by the gamelan that it also captured much attention at the 1900 and 1931 expositions. Much has been written about it by the likes of Julien Tiersot, who undertook quite an ethnographic study of it, as well as other composers like Camille Saint-Saëns, who described it as "dream music which had truly hypnotized people."[242] France was the center for art and culture in Europe, and the Paris expositions served a vital role in broadcasting the gamelan to the world.

It was in this setting, in the shadow of the Eiffel tower, where Debussy first became acquainted with this foreign music, a source that represented a "new type of exoticism"[243] which Debussy was eager to explore. Robert Godet, a close friend of Debussy's and political editor of *Le Temps*, mentioned that Debussy spent many hours "in the Javanese *kampong* (village) . . . listening to the percussive rhythmic complexities of the gamelan

---

[242] Fauser, Annegret. *Musical Encounters at the 1889 Paris World's Fair*. Rochester: U of Rochester, 2005. 182. Print.

[243] Thompson, Oscar. Debussy: Man and Artist. New York: Dodd, Mead, 1937. 257. Print.

with its inexhaustible combinations of ethereal, flashing timbres."[244] Debussy himself poetically described the encounter *many years* afterward in a 1913 interview with the Parisian magazine *Revue S.I.M.*: "There were, and still are, despite the evils of civilization, some delightful native peoples for whom music is as natural as breathing. Their conservatoire is the natural rhythm of the sea… and the thousands of sounds of nature… and if we listen without European prejudice to the charm of their percussion we must confess that our percussion is like primitive noises."[245] In a letter he addressed to Pierro Louÿs in 1895, he asks "Do you not remember the Javanese music, able to express every shade of meaning, even unmentionable shades, and which makes our tonic and dominant seem like ghosts?"[246] Gamelan undoubtedly had a profound effect on his style and interpretation of the exotic. What was this "new type of exoticism" that Thompson referenced? It was distinctly nationalistic, but, as observed by Debussy's appropriation of foreign sonorities and emancipation from European harmony, went beyond the cliché exoticism of the Romantics: it represented appropriation and assimilation with the "other." As an aside, the reader should remember 1913 as an important year. Its importance becomes evident in a subsequent section in this chapter where I outline Debussy's close relationship with Stravinsky, the Russian Neoclassical composer who debuted *Rite of Spring* in Paris that same year.

While the apparent usage of gamelan sonorities are observed in Debussy's *Cloches á Travers Les Feuilles*, *Et la Lune Descend Sur le Temple Qui Fut*, *La Fille aux*

[244] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture-recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.
[245] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 2. Print.
[246] Cooke, Mervyn. "'The East in the West': Evocations of the Gamelan in Western Music." *The Exotic in Western Music. Ed.* Bellman, Jonathan. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. 259. Print. Originally found in Correspondence de Claude Debussy et Pierre Louÿs (1893-1904), ed. Henri Borgeaud. Paris: Librairie Jose Corti, 1945. 41. Print.

Cheveux de Lin and *Canope* among others, the most famous example of intentioned appropriation, and the only considered extensively in this chapter, is *Pagodes* (1903). Perhaps surprising, one of the first individuals to draw parallels between Debussy's *Pagodes* and gamelan was Percy Grainger, the eccentric Australian-American composer, scholar and arranger renowned for his experimentation with music machines and his peculiar orchestrational style. In a 1915 essay entitled "A Blossom in Time in Pianoforte Literature," Grainger asserts that Debussy "opened our eyes to the entrancing beauties of certain long pedal effects which are particularly convincing in Debussy's *Reflets dans l'eau* [and] *Pagodes*."[247] He continues, arguing that "there are, after all, many very purely percussive and bell-like and gong-like effects peculiarly native to the nature of the metallic modern piano which lay dormant until so wonderfully developed by… Debussy, which no doubt they owe, in part, if not chiefly, to their contact with gamelans and other Eastern instruments and musics."[248] In addition, Oscar Thompson asserts "*Pagodes* systematically employs the five-note scale assumed to have been brought to Debussy's attention by Javanese… musicians at the Paris exposition in 1889,"[249] yet Neal Sorrell counters this argument, stating that the five-note *slendro* (pentatonic) scale that Debussy incorporates into this composition was "so common in Europe and throughout the world that its frequent occurrence… cannot be attributed solely to Javanese sources."[250] However, Sorrell does assert that Debussy's use of gamelan sonorities in *Pagodes* was "not a matter of imitation… but rather a product of remarkable imagination" [251] and that

---

[247] Grainger, Percy, Gilles, Malcolm, and Clunies Ross. *Grainger on Music*. "A Blossom in Time in Pianoforte Literature." Oxford U.P. Oxford, 1999. 63. Print.
[248] Ibid.
[249] Thompson, Oscar. Debussy: Man and Artist. New York: Dodd, Mead, 1937. 257. Print.
[250] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 4. Print.
[251] Ibid.

this appropriation "went far deeper than a desire to imitate something new and exotic,"[252] instead representing a convergence of similar musical ideals. Thusly, Sorrell argues that the musical effects accomplished through the use of *gamelan sepangkon* ("incomplete" gamelan, only tuned to the *slendro* tuning in this instance) paralleled the opinions Debussy may always have maintained concerning the treatment of harmonic and melodic textures within his own compositions, representing a "confirmation of [Debussy's] own musical imagination." [253]

I disagree with this assertion: describing this encounter as a "confirmation" downplays the important influence the gamelan had on Debussy's style, which I argue dictated his future interactions and appropriations of the "other" (i.e. his view of the exotic). In this way, Debussy's interaction with the gamelan far exceeded a mere confirmation — it served as a crucial turning point for Debussy's conception of the exotic, and ultimately defined the direction French exoticism. Nicholas Cook's argument supports my opinion that "confirmation" is an understatement:

> On one hand we have appropriation without modification, a matter of imitation or pastiche rather than Howat's 'really profound and creative influence'; on the other we have a degree of musical and conceptual preparedness that reduces the impact of the Other to 'confirmation', so ruling out 'a change of course'. In effect, an impermeable distinction is drawn between an ideologically valorised idea of influence and an idea of imitation seen as both aesthetically and ideological suspect, and the result is to rob the idea of influence of its usefulness.[254]

---

[252] Ibid.
[253] Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. 161. Print.
[254] Cook, Nicholas. "Anatomy of an Encounter: Debussy and the Gamelan, again." *Cultural Musicology iZine.* 2015. Web. http://culturalmusicology.org/nicholas-cook-anatomy-of-an-encounter-debussy-and-the-gamelan-again/. 13 March 2016.

Certainly, Debussy was no composer-ethnographer, not like Bartók at least. However, he took a more scientific approach to the "oriental pastiche," fusing authentic and not clichéd exotic techniques with his incredible French imagination. As Debussy states of Delibe's *Lakmé* (1883), it was a "sham, imitative oriental *bric-à-brac*."[255] In his music, through the power of evocation and the inclusion of exotic sounds and structures, he strove toward a more authentic exotic. This is not to say that *Pagodes* is entirely devoid of cliché: Debussy freely admits that he had "written three piano pieces whose titles [he] particularly love[d]: *Pagodes*, *Evening in Grenada*, *Gardens in the Rain*. When one does not have the means to pay for voyages, it is necessary to use imagination to compensate for this."[256] Evident of this imagination, the title of this piece (*Pagodes*, or "Pagodas" in English translation) presents an imagined oriental cliché that immediately delineates its Eastern inspiration. Ironically, however, pagodas are not found in Java — this undoubtedly indicates that Debussy's musical familiarity with Javanese sonorities far exceeded his cultural knowledge of this society. [257] Regardless of his imagination, I argue that this "convergence" of similar ideas that Sorrell discusses represents one of the first moments that a Western composer has striven toward the convergence of "self" and "other" in their compositions, beyond mere pastiche.

Joss Wibisono calls into question the musical and cultural authenticity of Debussy's encounter with gamelan at the World Exposition altogether. Apparently, the Dutch pavilion was "not a state-sanctioned pavilion, as the queen [of Holland] as head of state… had refused to take part in [the Exposition Universelle] commemorating the

---

[255] Cooke, Mervyn. "'The East in the West': Evocations of the Gamelan in Western Music." *The Exotic in Western Music. Ed.* Bellman, Jonathan. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. 258. Print.
[256] Babyak, Telka B. *Nietzsche, Debussy, and the Shadow of Wagner.* PhD Dissertation. Cornell University, 2014. xiv. Print.
[257] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 4. Print.

demise of the French monarchy."[258] Nevertheless, private patronage provided funding for a Dutch pavilion to be erected to showcase Javanese culture. Since professional Javanese gamelan players in Jogjakarta and Solo could only be requested via official channels as many were under government employment, non-professional musicians were hired for this exposition in their stead. In fact, members of Sari Oneng, the gamelan group that had so enraptured Debussy's attention at the Dutch pavilion, were in fact farmhands at the Parakan Salak tea plantation in Sukabumi, West Java, and were selected and led by their Dutch employer, Adriaan Holle, on a Sundanese gamelan. Furthermore, these musicians accompanied four adolescent Javanese *tandhak* (street dancers) from Mangkunegara, in Solo (Central Java) — considering that these professional female dancers were described as *tandhak*, it is unlikely that they were court dancers and therefore it is doubtful that they would have accurately reflected the palace-style Javanese dances that were considered the epitome of this artistic genre. Wibisono aptly describes the collaboration between Javanese dance and Sundanese gamelan analogously as "akin to a rock band accompanying ballroom dancers," asserting that "the result of this effort could be called an innovative mixture or, for those who were attached to tradition, a mixture of nonsense."[259] Nonetheless, Debussy appears to have been profoundly impacted by this encounter with the gamelan, nonsense or not. Its influence is confirmed by the many motivic homages appearing throughout Debussy's repertoire that, within the context of this essay, will be considered appropriative regardless of the invalidity of this encounter, the scope of Debussy's creative imagination or his cultural misinterpretations. He would quote this encounter for many years after.

[258] Wibisono, Joss. "Gamelan in the Blood." *Gatholotjo*. No. 65, 2012. 21. Web. 13 March 2016.
[259] Ibid.

While contextualizing Debussy's compositional approach, it is important to note that Debussy's musical style is closely associated with the Symbolist movement, a burgeoning philosophical movement in the late 19th century that was dictated by subjective perception — instead of depicting objective reality, Symbolist artists strove to evoke the emotional "impression" they perceived from experiences that inspired their work.[260] As Mallarmé, founder of the Symbolist Movement, eloquently asserts, "to name an object, is to suppress … the pleasure of the [art]…to suggest it, there is the dream."[261] In fact, indicative of Debussy's friendship with Mallarmé and sympathy toward the Symbolist ideologies, his *Prélude à l'Après-Midi d'un Faune* shares its name with one of Mallarmé's poems. Considering that Debussy affixed himself closely to this movement, a movement that favored ambiguity and shrouded its allusions in symbolism, it is difficult to isolate or agree upon what features in his music constitute indirect appropriation, leading some, perhaps, to fallaciously assert that Debussy did not borrow from the gamelan at all. Furthermore, could not Debussy's "misinformed" appropriation be a manifestation of this symbolic, impressionistic treatment of native melodies and the culture from which they originated? Anyone with any knowledge of gamelan would counter this assertion at least sonically: Debussy's appropriation is actually quite researched, albeit these gamelan sounds are "westernized." Even though Mervyn Cooke asserts that "no convincing argument has yet been advanced to support the view that Debussy borrowed specific musical material from the Javanese performances he heard in

---

[260] Lockspeiser, Edward. *Debussy: the Master Musicians*. London: J.M. Dent and Sons, 1936. 136. Print.
[261] Maurer, Naomi E. *The Pursuit of Spiritual Wisdom: The Thought and Art of Vincent Van Gogh and Paul Gauguin*. Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson UP, 1998. 23. Print.

1889,"[262] I argue that if we look at Debussy's exotic musical vocabulary and his view on exoticism, its impact is evident.

We must look deeper, beyond the superficial: while Debussy, the master of symbol and impression, might have obscured any direct melodic reference to gamelan beyond pentatonicism and a rather inaccurate titular nod (i.e. *Pagodes*) to the culture from which this instrument stems, the impression of gamelan is omnipresent and is asserted strongly when comparing the structure (not necessarily the melody) of gamelan *karawitan* to Debussy's *Pagodes* and even his other compositions. In other words, Debussy never in his compositions directly coopts gamelan melody, yet the piece is a product of gamelan inspiration in its structure, timbre, and melodic treatment.

While considering the similarities between Debussy's piece and the actual music itself, it is important to make this distinction: obvious difficulties arise when "transcribing five-tone music onto an instrument with twelve equal tones,"[263] bespeaking the impossibility of reconciling the incompatible tuning of gamelan with the Western tempered tuning of the piano. However, while gamelan melodies cannot directly be reproduced through piano sonorities, they can be emulated and evoked by this "instrument of illusion."[264] In fact, while both the *pelog* and *slendro* tunings cannot be precisely replicated on the piano as a result of their microtonal tunings that differ from the Western tempered scale, the *slendro* scale, due to its relative similarity to the pentatonic scale, can be implied using scale degrees 1 2 3 5 6 in a corresponding key (although some notes in the gamelan *slendro* scale might be slightly out of tune

---

[262] Cooke, Mervyn. "'The East in the West': Evocations of the Gamelan in Western Music." *The Exotic in Western Music. Ed.* Bellman, Jonathan. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. 259. Print.
[263] Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. 7. Print.
[264] Ibid. 159.

intervallically by several microtones when compared to the tempered interpretation of the pentatonic scale; i.e. gamelan *slendro*: 1 2+ 3 5 6+; tempered pentatonic: 1 2 3 5 6). Debussy also alludes to the whole tone scale (e.g. C Whole Tone Scale: C, D, E, F♯, G♯, A♯, C), a scale composed entirely of whole steps that can, with a little imagination, be likened to the *pelog* scale. Since this paper is in no way intended to offer a complete theoretical analysis of this piece, I would suggest interested readers look at an article written by Jeremy Day-O'Connell entitled "Debussy, Pentatonicism, and the Tonal Tradition" which presents a much more in depth theoretical analysis. Interestingly enough, Day-O'Connell cites David Kopp whose 1997 publication "detailed the almost minimalistic shifts of pitch- content throughout the piece, gradual additions to and deletions from a pervasive B-pentatonic scale."[265] As discussed in the following chapter, many Minimalist composers were inspired by the revolutionary techniques of the Impressionists, specifically Debussy, Ravel, and Messaien, and both groups looked to the gamelan for inspiration.

Pagodes is the first movement of a suite entitled *Estampes*, and like many of Debussy's pieces features flourishing embellishment and mellifluous overtones. These features can be closely correlated with the Javanese gamelan as "both the gamelan and Debussy's piano release an extremely rich pattern of overtones."[266] While the presence of overtones had long been commonplace in Eastern composition, their incorporation into Western music had not widely been attempted prior to Debussy's experimentation. This mostly has to do with the construction and type of the instruments used in gamelan

---

[265] Day-O'Connell, Jeremy. "Debussy, Petatonicism, and the Tonal Tradition." *Music Theory spectrum*. Vol 31, 2009. 226. Web. A version of this research was first presented at the joint meeting of the American Musicological Society and the Society for Music Theory (Los Angeles, 2006).
[266] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 6. Print.

ensembles. The gamelan, as previously mentioned, consists of a series of resonant metallophones, idiophones and gongs — these are all bell-like instruments. Auxiliary instruments include zithers (strings) and end-blown flutes, and singers and dancers might also participate in larger ensembles, but these all are subservient to the metallophones and gongs in establishing melodic structure. The piano is an acceptable approximation (although fundamentally inaccurate) of gamelan sound in that it is a percussion instrument that employs hammers and strings, a construction that produces a rich array of overtones.

Directing our attention to form, many parallels exist between Debussy's voice leading and the gamelan. Concerning structure, Brent Hugh mentions that "[t]he gamelan is divided into punctuation instruments, *balungan* [structural melody] instruments, and elaborating instruments."[267] In *Pagodes*, Debussy divides the voices in a similar fashion: the droning, resonant pedal tones found in the bass clef signify the rich, prolonged vibrations of the gongs (punctuating instruments), while the melody and its embellishment exist entirely in the treble clef and evoke the higher-pitched *balungan* and embellishing instruments of the gamelan. Specifically, *Pagodes* invokes the pentatonic scale, features cyclic repetition, and showcases gong-like or bell-like sounds, all characteristics of gamelan compositions.

Furthermore, we must consider the development — the "function" — of these musics. According to Hugh, "Western tonal music… is goal oriented; musical forms are carefully designed to 'develop' ideas and to move towards carefully designed climaxes. Javanese music, by contrast, is concerned not with movement in time but with

---

[267] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.

timelessness,"[268] a feature which is developed through repetition and cyclicality. This aspect of cyclicality relates to the Hindu belief in reincarnation and Tantric philosophy,[269] and its appearance in *Pagodes* promotes an ethereal, atmospheric sound quality. Not only are the introductory chord progressions recapitulated almost identically in mm. 52, but many of the flourishing treble motifs are repeated *ad nauseam*. Additionally, the fast-moving upper melody (representative of the higher pitch *balungan* instruments in the gamelan orchestra, as we mentioned earlier) is offset by rhythmic syncopation (symbolizing the embellishment instruments), while the slower bass line is indicative of the lower pitch punctuating instruments that establish the *colotomic* structure (rhythmic and metric pattern) through subdivision and metric accentuation. Its four-voice texture, "stratification, isorhythms and multiple ostinati, look like 'gamelan-music'"[270] a factor which might explain Debussy's choice for the title of the piece considering that its transcribed appearance, with its multiple ostinati, closely resembles the steeply sloped roofs of pagodas or even the waves of the sea pounding against the Balinese or Javanese shore (or, more generally, nature imagery). These features do not feel "Western."

As yet another example, Debussy's atypically placed *ritardando* appearing in m. 30 puzzles the Western performer. As Roy Howat states, this *ritardando* is often "overlooked by pianists who do not understand this allusion."[271] While it is hard to articulate why this ritardando seems strangely placed in words, it is entirely evident musically: at this measure, the performer desires nothing more than to speed into the

---

[268] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.
[269] Becker, Judith O. *Gamelan Stories: Tantrism, Islam, and Aesthetics in Central Java*. Tempe, Ariz.: Program for Southeast Asian Studies, Arizona State University, 1993. 38, 78. Print.
[270] Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 4. Print.
[271] Howat, Roy. "Debussy and the Orient." In Recovering the Orient, edited by Andrew Gerstle and Anthony Milner, 45–81. Chur: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1994. 50. Print.

subsequent section. Why? Because the entire page (beginning at mm. 27) feels as though it is building into the climax at m. 41. Viewed through the lens of gamelan theory, this ritardando (where an accelerando seems better placed) is distinctly Indonesian — m. 30 represents a transition from one *irama* (section) to the next, a transition that is always accentuated in Balinese and Javanese gamelan with a ritardando of *balungan* (melodic) instruments. Debussy's characteristic "planing" (parallel voice leading of octaves and fifths) might also allude to the *gembyang* (literally "octaves") way of playing *bonang.* And even his two-against-three patterns of triplets overlapping duplets might be understood as an evocation of *imbal-imbalan* (interlocking) or *sekaran* (literally "flowering"). Debussy indicates a gradual accelerando followed by a rhythmic decrescendo through tempo markings written in the score — similar drastic alternations in tempi can often be found in gamelan repertoire, particularly cued by the *kendhang* at transitions from one *irama* to the next. He finally concludes the piece on a strikingly dissonant chord which directly precedes a dramatic ritardando, suggestive of a final gong strike.[272]

I will now provide a short but more technical investigation of *Nuages*, one of the *Trois Nocturnes* published in 1889, in order to show the reader that many of the techniques observed within *Pagodes* are used liberally in many of his other compositions. Much information can be ascertained merely via aural inference. Metric ambiguity developed through hemiola (by notes tied over bar lines, half notes, etc.), phrasing, meter (lilting feel developed by a 6/4, compound duple meter), and the use of rubato, creates a

---

[272] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.

timelessness and exoticism that are characteristic of Impressionist works. Furthermore, sustained notes, mellifluous whole tone- and pentatonic-sounding progressions, and furtive harmonies coupled with a flowing, melismatic treble voice (played by right hand in piano reduction) make it distinctly Debussyan.

After attempting to conventionally analyze the piece using functional harmonic analysis, the theorist quickly deduces that the presence of embellishment and atypical tonalities would not support straightforward methods of chord-by-chord functional harmonic analysis. The departure from the key signature (the piece begins in the key of B minor) and the impractical use of tonal Roman numeral analysis to decipher musical progressions in the score were, in themselves, didactic. Additionally, ambiguous and tonally nonfunctional progressions contained abundant neighbor-tone or arpeggiated embellishments, such as within the progression $i^{4/2}$ - $ii^{6/4}$ - VI^{7} - III^{+6} (or VI^{+6}/V?) - v^{7} - VIII (one bar after rehearsal 6), an indication that Debussy was not afraid to experiment with modern compositional techniques beyond the theoretical boundaries of common practice music.

Other elements demand recognition: at the commencement of the excerpt, the abundance of open fifths (P5s that lack a third, e.g. G - D) along with the similarly hollow-sounding intervals of P4 and the dissonant intervals of tritones (A4/d5) create otherworldly sonorities that develop an esotericism found frequently in Impressionist compositions. Intervallic repetition of m3 or M3 intervals intermittently oscillating with P5 or d5 intervals (e.g. P5 - M3 - P5 - M3 progression in right-hand treble voice in m.1 of rehearsal 6 in the piano reduction), descending chromaticism (m.2 of rehearsal 6), and the presence of lush 7th chords (a diatonic chord type found within the brackets and

elsewhere) is archetypical of this piece and creates floating and light (dynamically soft, legato) yet dense texture. A reduction of treble sonorities (played by right hand in the piano reduction) results in the descending progression F# - E - D - C# - B - G# - F - Eb - C - Bb from rehearsal 6 to 7. Harmonic motifs (such as motive A, X, Z, and H) are developed through two-measure contiguous (motives A, X and Z) or noncontiguous repetition (motive H) in two-measure phrases. "Harmonic Planing," a technique defined by parallel movement (i.e. parallel voice leading in chord progressions) of musical lines, is present within the bracketed sections and can be considered characteristic of Debussy's sound. Moreover, the harmonic and melodic voice leading of this piece is often restricted to steps and skips with very few leaps (intervals greater than a third), further highlighting the harmonic parallelism present in this piece. At the onset of rehearsal 7, the opaque harmonies present at the beginning of this excerpt end abruptly, illustrating a dramatic change in color. This change is heralded by a rolled D# minor extended chord (notes extended, or added, beyond the seventh chord; for example: ninth, eleventh, and thirteenth chords) and a change in the key signature from B minor to D# minor. The dense texture in rehearsal 6 gives way strikingly to a stark melody played solely by the flute and the harp above a sustained pedal chord; this melody, defined as melodic motif Y, spans approximately 1 ½ measures and is repeated slightly altered the second time it is iterated. The focal pitch of this melody is an F#, foreshadowed two measures before rehearsal 7 by the neighbor tone movement of the upper voice in a parallel chord progression (upper voice: F# - G# - G# - F# - F#). The melody is defined by the progression C# - D# - F# - G# - A#, a pentatonic scale in C# major.

So, in summary, what compositional features are appropriative within Debussy's compositions? Rudolph Reti outlines several characteristics of Debussyan composition, characteristics that almost identically match those of the gamelan. These characteristics include the frequent use of pedal points, parallel chords, bitonality created by the interaction of two distinct overtone series that, when combined, evoke a single harmony, and the intricate "web of [glittering] passages and figurations"[273] which arose from harmonic abstraction that obscured the affiliation with any individual tonal orbit. Furthermore, Reti asserts that Debussy's pieces are structurally "melodies uttered in a swirling flash of polyphonic color,"[274] an observation that emphasizes the dominance of melodic texture (and the resistance of harmonic classification) in Debussy's compositions. The dominance of melody within Debussy's style can directly be compared to the solely melodic nature of gamelan compositions, and Reti's aforementioned characteristics of Debussy's music — which appear frequently in modern compositions — directly appear in gamelan *karawitan* (gamelan repertoire). Debussy's ingenuous and untraditional treatment of harmony and melody, and his experimentation with overtones and other Eastern compositional techniques heralded the advent of the modern era. And yet, while *Estampes* presents "all the nuances and color and sonority that are recognized as characteristically Debussy's,"[275] *Pagodes* is a clear example of musical appropriation.

---

[273] Reti, Rudolph. Tonality, Atonality, Pantonality: A Study of Some Trends in Twentieth Century Music. London: Rockliff, 1958. 27. Print.
[274] Ibid.
[275] Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. 5. Print.

As Rollo Myers notes, Debussy "aspired towards complete emancipation from the rules and regulations of the [Western European] theorists,"[276] feeling that traditional compositional techniques were too restrictive and conventional. For these reasons, he largely drew his inspiration from the tonalities of the East that "developed totally outside, and often in contradiction to, the established rules and conventions of western European music."[277] Eric Satie, a contemporary Impressionist composer and one of Debussy's lifelong acquaintances, is said to have exclaimed with frustration, "[m]ight it not be a good thing if the French could have a music of their own — if possible, without sauerkraut,"[278] protesting the Teutonic stranglehold on western compositional techniques. Debussy would have agreed with this sentiment. This statement exposes Satie's desire (and undoubtedly Debussy's desire, too) to develop a uniquely French sound. While both were inspired by gamelan, they did not seek to replicate it but to use it to inform their uniquely French compositional choices and styles. While imitation might be the highest form of flattery, it represents the lowest form of creativity. Debussy's compositions are distinctly nationalistic and are considered products of his unique imagination. Although they pull from exotic sources like the gamelan for inspiration, they remain characteristic examples of French Impressionism and French exoticism.

---

[276] Myers, Rollo H. Debussy. Westport: Hyperion, 1979. 12. Print
[277] Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.
[278] Myers, Rollo H. Debussy. Westport: Hyperion, 1979. 40. Print

Igor Stravinsky and Exoticism: *Le Sacre du Printemps* (1913).

Stravinsky's *Le Sacre du Printemps*, a pivotal surrealist performance that investigates primal sexuality and taboos, employs Slavic folk motives as a means of exploring primitive emotionality. While *Le Sacre* does not directly appropriate gamelan sonorities, I have included it as an example of music that theoretically follows in the footsteps of Impressionism. The piece, chiefly classified as a Neoclassical composition that exploits primitive themes, undoubtedly was a product of the ingenious (re-)thinking of the classical approach to music making. Why include it in a paper on gamelan and "otherness"? It has been included here to argue that Stravinsky, largely heralded as a major innovator in 20th century music, was perhaps less innovative than has been asserted: his techniques, beyond those that he appropriates from Russian folk music, are actually much more traditional than has been asserted by past scholarship. And of those techniques that are *avante-garde*, many are reassertions of what Debussy, Ravel, and Satie had already established. This is not to say that Stravinsky was not a talented composer — *Firebird, Petruschka,* or any of his other compositions confirm his genius. But this paper argues that rather than a genius innovator, he was a genius appropriator, weaving Russian themes so seamlessly into the texture of his pieces in such as skillful manner that they became almost unrecognizable. And he was not just an appropriator of Russian folk melodies but of the broader musical language that had been developed by his predecessors, a musical style that had been informed heavily by the gamelan, a broader "exotic," distinctly French. These speculations will be addressed toward the conclusion of this chapter and will in no way be as exhaustive as the analyses of Satie and Debussy for whom the gamelan represented a more pronounced source of influence

and appropriation. This approach looks mainly at how movements inspire each other (macro-relationships), although it will also focus on micro-relationships (i.e. tonality, structures) that allude to the importance of the French exotic within Stravinsky's score. Even the French title of the piece — *Le Sacre du Printemps* — betrays its affinity toward the French exotic. After all, Ravel was the first to use Stravinsky's characteristic "Petruschka Chord" in *Jeux d'eau* (1901). And it was Stravinsky himself who stated that "the musicians of my generation and I myself owe the most to Debussy."[279]

The use of phrasing, articulation, and harmony in Debussy's *Pagodes* and Satie's *Gnossiennes* closely imitates the Javanese and Balinese gamelan and directly capitalizes on the exoticism via exogeny of this cultural lineage in portraying Impressionist themes. Distinct from the relatively unambiguous attribution and musical appropriation of source melodies within these pieces, Stravinsky hides his sources. He engaged in endogenous appropriation, a term which I define as internal exoticism or exploitation of "foreignness" within one's own country or culture of origin. As asserted by Meredith Oakes, *Le Sacre du Printemps* "was the moment where Stravinsky's Russian folk heritage and the European idiom converged and the excitement of the resulting crash is still enormous today."[280] The innovative (and remastered) harmonic complexity of Stravinsky's dodecaphonic compositions during his "Russian Period," the time during which *Le Sacre* was produced, expanded the harmonic horizon and represented a definitive departure from the strict regulations that governed acceptable compositional techniques in common practice music. In collaboration with the *Ballet Russes* under Diaghilev, *Le Sacre du*

[279] Noble, Jeremy. "Portrait of Debussy. Debussy and Stravinsky". *The Musical Times* 108.1487 (1967): 22. Web.
[280] Oakes, Meredith. *Mr Modernsky: How Stravinsky Survived Schoenberg*. London: Oberon, 2011. 55. Print.

Printemps (*The Rite of Spring*, trans. from the French) positioned Stravinsky as one of the greatest composers of the 20th century and constituted a paradigm for modern composition. And his legacy persists today. Even my most non-musical friends are able to pick out Stravinsky's Rite of Spring, bespeaking the fact that even those who are not music majors or musicologists know Stravinsky for the mere fact that his music defines the modern soundscape, that it has been absorbed in the aural collective.

Pieter C. van den Toorn lauds the compositions published during Stravinsky's "Russian Period" on the basis of their ingenuity, citing "their advanced craftsmanship, their superiority as musical structures, and, above all, their *rhythmic innovations*… not [solely] because of their soulful ties to 'Mother Russia.'"[281] And yet, while Debussy expressly admitted his appropriation of Javanese gamelan sonorities in *Pagodes*, Stravinsky conceals his sources within *The Rite of Spring*, a factor that added to the aspect of mystery and intrigue surrounding it. Bela Bartók, an avid ethnomusicologist and successful Russian composer whose melodies often feature allusions to traditional Slavic folk music, corroborated this opinion by stating that "Stravinsky never mentions the sources of his themes… [and does not] allude to whether a theme of his is his own or whether it is taken from folk music."[282] As a result, these ties to Mother Russia, as emphasized by appropriation of autochthonous folk music, have been the subject of significant controversy and speculation within Stravinsky's works because Stravinsky often negated these associations.

[281] Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. 7. Print.
[282] Suchoff, Benjamin. Béla Bartók's Essays. Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 1993. 343. Print.

Could Stravinsky have been inspired by the percussive nature of the gamelan? Likely, he was inspired by gamelan secondhand. Even Bartók, whose pioneering studies of native musics Stravinsky cited as a major inspiration, heavily evokes gamelan in his *Mikrokosmos No. 109*, *From the Isle of Bali*. In fact, this piece goes beyond Debussy in its evocation of gamelan: it seeks to replicate gamelan, and does quite a good job of it. Is it possible that Stravinsky never mentions the 'sources of his themes' (i.e. Russian folksong themes) because the Russian idiom only confirmed, as with Debussy and the gamelan, his unique compositional style? Perhaps the Russian melodies represented a point of embarkation, used only as a source for melodic motifs and rhythms. As an aside, the reader can find Bartók's *From the Isle of Bali* in this thesis' accompanying performance recordings — although this piece is originally written for piano, I perform it on celeste to accentuate its gamelan-like qualities.

And yet another reason exists. Stravinsky may have originally denied incorporating Russian folk melodies into *Le Sacre* as a result of internal policy changes within the *Ballet Russes* that favored modernization and rejected neoclassical views. These policies paralleled the changing political climate in Russia — an abrupt regime change occurred that replaced the Tsar with the communist party following the Bolshevik Revolution in 1917. The communists felt the *The Rite of Spring* was profane and labeled the *Ballet Russes* as an example of bourgeoisie excess, banning them from returning to Russia because of their refusal to adhere to an artistic model that promoted the socialist movement.[283] They felt it was not Russian enough. To them, this piece sold-out: it represented the cosmopolitanism and globalization that they feared was a threat to nationalism. And considering the fact that *Le Sacre* debuted in Paris in 1913, perhaps

[283] Joseph, Charles M. Stravinsky's Ballets. New Haven: Yale UP, 2011. 73. Print.

they were right. It continues the legacy of the French impressionists in the way that it deals with melody, harmony, and meter, differing only in the source of its themes.

Additionally, attempts to conceal his inspiration for melodies within *Le Sacre* perhaps reflected his desire to distinguish himself musically from composers such as those of the New Russian School, also known as "The Five" — Mily Balakirev, César Cui, Modest Mussorgsky, Nikolai Rimsky-Korsakov and Alexander Borodin. Their nationalistic compositions were credited with re-popularizing traditional Russian folk music, earning them the nickname of *Moguchaya Kuchka* or "the Mighty Little Heap" for their successful campaign to reshape the compositional landscape and reorient the compositional focus of many Russian composers at the turn of the 19th century.[284] However, not everyone agreed with this approach. The other camp of composers, deemed "Westernizers," were headed by Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky. They favored traditional European compositional styles that were informed by Western European counterpoint and compositional techniques. While "The Five" hoped to explore native Russian themes within their music through primitivism, and were staunchly anti-academic and anti-Western European in their approach, Tchaikovsky and other "Westernizers" desired to beat European composers at their own game by composing higher caliber music that, while allegiant to Western compositional standards, transcended national borders yet was still unmistakably Russian. But was Stravinsky's music truly "unmistakably Russian?" Certainly, many composers from Eastern Europe such as Chopin benefitted from their status as composers of "otherized," native musics. Unlike Rimsky-Korsakov and Glazunov who attempted to directly emulate folk music within their compositions,

---

[284] Taruskin, Richard. "Russian Folk Melodies in The Rite of Spring." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*. 33.3 (1980): 502. Print.

Stravinsky desired mainly to call on his native folk memory for inspiration alone. But by admitting to directly appropriating folk melodies, he feared that his compositions would not be considered meritorious on the basis of their innovation, and instead would be classified as modern interpretations of traditional music. For this reason, Stravinsky denied full subscription to the ideals of the *Kuchka* for fear of being defined and confined by their compositional dogmas. And yet, while he did not wish to appear a "Slavophile," he also never openly embraced the title of "Westernizer." He straddled these movements, benefiting from his associations with them when opportunities arose and disassociating himself quickly from them when subscription to these movements was inopportune.

For this reason, Stravinsky represents a unique case: he was a chameleon, unwilling to divulge the source material from which he drew inspiration (at least early in his career) and equally reluctant to pledge himself to either the "Slavophile" or "Westernizer" camps for fear of appearing unoriginal. Yet, I cannot help wonder if Stravinsky was a victim of his nationality. The world knows him as a "Russian nationalist composer," and his pieces (fortunately and unfortunately) fall prey to this designation — they are "Russian," "nationalistic," "Slavic," "primitive," etc. Instead, it is my argument that the world must view him as an expert "exoticiser" who, in the style of the French "exoticizers" Satie, Ravel, and Debussy, was more international in his compositional approaches and perhaps his search for source material (i.e. not *just* Russian melody, but broader trends in 'exoticism'). I argue that Stravinsky's knowledge of the French exotic enabled him to distance himself from his Russian prejudices, emancipating him (at least for a part of his career) from his heritage.

While earlier works published during Stravinsky's "Russian Period" incorporated folk melodies, such as *Les Noces, Firebird* and *Petrushka, Le Sacre* is regarded as the most famous example of appropriation as a result of its current artistic and scholarly appeal. Stravinsky composed the majority of *The Rite* at his summer home in the rural Russian province of Ustilug, a conservative locality that remained devoted to maintaining the cultural heritage of the Russian past.[285] These surroundings perhaps presented Stravinsky with the musical and cultural inspiration for *The Rite*. The premise of the ballet is likely derived from a poem entitled *Staviat Iarilu* ("*They are Building Iarila,"* trans. from Russian) written by Russian poet Sergei Gorodetsky, a poet who inspired Stravinsky's "Two Melodies of Gorodetsky, op. 6" published in 1906. This poem features "images of pagan rituals, wise elders, and the sacrifice of virgin maidens,"[286] all themes which are evident in *The Rite.* Yet despite these obvious homages to Russian folk culture and music, in an article published in *L'Étoile belge* in 1930 — almost two decades after *Le Sacre* had premiered — Stravinsky asserted that "[s]ome composers have found their most potent inspiration in folk music, but in my opinion popular music has nothing to gain by being taken out of its frame… it loses its charm by being uprooted."[287] Furthermore, he claimed that "if any of [his] pieces sound[ed] like aboriginal folk music, it may be because [his] powers of fabrication were able to tap some unconscious 'folk' memory."[288] And yet, this sentiment is directly contradicted in a 1931 interview with his biographer André Schaeffner — ironically in the same year

[285] Taruskin, Richard. "Russian Folk Melodies in The Rite of Spring." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*. 33.3 (1980): 505. Print.
[286] Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. 10. Print.
[287] Stravinsky, Vera, and Robert Craft. *Stravinsky in Pictures and Documents*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1978. 202. Print.
[288] Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. 12. Print.

Bartók claimed "Stravinsky never mentions the sources of his themes."[289] In that interview, Stravinsky candidly revealed that the exposed bassoon solo at the commencement of the piece is directly appropriated from *Melodje ludowe lietweskie* (no. 157, "Tu, manu seserélé"), a collection of Lithuanian folk songs compiled by Anton Juszkiewicz. This disclosure promoted the idea that the opening bassoon melody represented the *only* instance of appropriated folk music throughout the entirety of the piece, and Stravinsky maintained that "the opening bassoon melody … [was] the *only* folk melody in that work (Stravinsky and Craft 1978, 202)" for the remainder of his career. Regardless, many parallels exist between motives present in endogenous folk music and those of *Le Sacre*, of which the opening bassoon melody represents only one example. Other aspects of appropriation are not as evident, considering that the "abstraction of stylistic elements from folk music"[290] made folk melodies virtually indistinguishable within the score. Nonetheless, the extent and intentionality of Stravinsky's appropriation of folk melodies in this piece remains a source of debate. In light of this information, I argue that the source material, the idea of "exoticism," was championed by the French, and idea that was informed by Debussy's interaction with the gamelan.

No source better delimits the relationship between this production and the Russian folk music from which it draws its influence than Stravinsky's original annotated sketchbook. Stravinsky's sketchbook differs very little from the final score for *Le Sacre,* evidence of Stravinsky's laborious and economical habit of thrashing out melodies at the

[289] Suchoff, Benjamin. *Béla Bartók's Essays*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 1993. 343. Print.
[290] Taruskin, Richard. "Russian Folk Melodies in The Rite of Spring." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*. 33.3 (1980): 512. Print.

piano and only entering them into the sketchbook when they had been sufficiently developed.[291] Although the sketchbook contains mostly finalized motivic ideas, several key differences exist between it and the final score. Van den Toorn considers four melodies in the sketchbook integral "source melodies" that provide the thematic structure for each subsection in the ballet.[292] While these "source melodies" appear strikingly simplified when presented in the sketchbook, they reappear diminished, augmented, embellished, inverted, metrically distinct, etc., within the finalized score to the point where they become "absorbed into Stravinsky's musical fabric to such an extent that without the sketchbook their presence could never be suspected."[293] Even Robert Craft, another of Stravinsky's many biographers, felt compelled to comment on these simplified "source melodies" presented in the sketchbook, keenly observing that they were stylistically distinct from Stravinsky's other motives: it "is so unlike any [tunes] I can imagine Stravinsky composing in 1911 that I suspect (and the composer does too) it may have been copied from a folk-music anthology."[294] After a meticulous analysis of *Melodje ludowe lietweskie,* Anton Juszkiewicz's compilation of 1,785 Lithuanian folk songs from which Stravinsky derived the opening bassoon melody, Lawrence Morton outlined several melodic motives presented in this anthology that Stravinsky almost directly incorporated into the "Augurs of Spring," the "Introduction to Part I," the "Ritual Abduction" and the "Spring Rounds," all subsections of the ballet as indicated by the

[291] Taruskin, Richard. "Russian Folk Melodies in The Rite of Spring." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*. 33.3 (1980): 509. Print.
[292] Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. 12. Print.
[293] Taruskin, Richard. "Russian Folk Melodies in The Rite of Spring." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*. 33.3 (1980): 512. Print.

[294] Stravinsky, Vera, and Robert Craft. *Stravinsky in Pictures and Documents*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1978. 91. Print.

score. In addition to the opening bassoon melody, Morton observed "Spring Rounds" featured a direct incorporation of a melody featured in Rimsky-Korsakov's *One Hundred Russian National Songs* (no. 50, "Nu-ka kumuska, my pokumimsja"), and later features an inversion of this theme.[295] As Bartók observes, "these short recurring primitive motives are very characteristic of Russian [folk] music"[296] Additionally, in correspondence with a friend, Stravinsky requested a copy of Linëva's 1909 phonographic transcription entitled "Great Russian Songs in Folk Harmonization" while he was immersed in his work on *Le Sacre.* Although none of the 23 melodies appearing in Linëva's work are directly reflected in motives from *The Rite*, its lengthy discussion of polyphony and irregular rhythmic patterns characteristic of Russian folk music no doubt assisted Stravinsky in his composition.[297] These sources only represent several confirmed examples from which Stravinsky drew his inspiration. Here is what is known so far: Stravinsky was steeped in the Russian tradition, but openly admits Debussy's influence.

On the topic of rhythm, Stravinsky is said to have quipped "I haven't understood a bar of music in my life, but I have felt it."[298] The rhythm throughout the piece feels palpable, and constantly alternates as if to protest the confines of the bar line and meter; this has caused some critics, such as Cecil Gray, to state that this piece is solely metrical, featuring "musical rhythm, divorced from melodic implications… rhythm [that has] degenerated into meter,"[299] percussive in its quality. Harmony, like metrical accent, also

---

[295] Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. 12. Print.
[296] Suchoff, Benjamin. *Béla Bartók's Essays*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 1993. 593. Print.
[297] Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. 12. Print.
[298] Hume, Ernest. *Supermusicology: A New Way to the Heights of Music*. London, Ont.: Daisy House Pub., 1999. 91. Print.
[299] Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. 59. Print.

references the clear influence of Russian folk music on Stravinsky's style. As Van Den Toorn proposes, the central conflict of the piece is embodied in the "vertical-horizontal, chromatic-diatonic opposition"[300] represented by the static chord structures: the piece features harmonically dissonant block chords established through chromaticism, but these chromatic chords move diatonically. The simple nature of the chords, which rarely exceed more than four notes, and their simple resolutions allude to the simplicity of Russian folk music, certainly. As Rudolph Reti asserts, bolstering this claim, these "familiar, simple elements were combined to ever-richer, more diversified and more complex patterns of rhythm and accentuation."[301] Yet while these chords are simple in structure, they are harmonically complex. They feature abundant chromaticism, polyphony, and invoke fragments of the whole tone scale, another clear representation of the infusion of folk compositional techniques into Stravinsky's work and their facilitation into modern musical composition. But the role of harmony is subservient to melody and rhythm: the lush, complex harmonies that Stravinsky employs do not necessarily make functional sense (i.e. they do not always develop a logical progression toward cadences or serve a structural role by asserting the tonic, dominant, etc.). Many chords serve to accentuate and, in some instances, obscure the melody. Furthermore, what can be said about Stravinsky's radical bar-by-bar shifts in time signatures (3/16 to 2/8 to 1/16 to 4/8)? In the memoirs of musicologist and polymath Nicholas Slonimsky, we see that this complex metrical progression can be simplified to 4/4. According to an article in the *New York Times*, conductor

[300] Ibid.
[301] Reti, Rudolph. Tonality, Atonality, Pantonality: A Study of Some Trends in Twentieth Century Music. London: Rockliff, 1958. 85. Print.

> Serge Koussevitzky was utterly incapable of negotiating the complex rhythmic changes in the score [Le Sacre] and relied on Slonimsky's mathematical skills to aid him. Slonimsky was able, for instance, to combine a succession of bars of 3/16, 2/8, 1/16, 4/8 into a single bar of 4/4 (with irregular downbeats, of course). After Slonimsky rebarred Stravinsky's entire work in blue pencil, a grateful but mystified Koussevitzky used the score for the rest of his life.[302]

And another famous conductor, the American Leonard Bernstein, was thankful as well for Slonimsky's simplification: "Every time I conduct 'Le Sacre,'… (and always… with your [Slonimsky's] rebarring), I admire and revere and honor you as I did the very first time. Bless you, and more power to you. Lenny B." It seems Stravinsky's works are not only harmonically simple, but also metrically simple when re-barred.[303] I speculate that Stravinsky used the odd, changing meters to create a psychological "otherness," a primitive exoticness, that was important in creating the pagan images Stravinsky wished to evoke in this piece.

Overall, although Stravinsky openly distanced himself from the New Russian School shortly after the Bolshevik Revolution and appeared disinterested in their ethnomusicological interest in the study of Russian folk music, he identified strongly as a Russian nationalist composer toward the end of his career, fascinated aesthetically by native melodies and rhythms and, to a lesser extent, harmonies. Metrical accent, aspects of chromaticism, and the direct appropriation of motives and folk-inspired melodies transcribed from traditional Russian folk sources permeate all of his compositions and are strikingly evident throughout *The Rite of Spring*. Although the techniques appropriated from Russian folk music represent a musical heritage that is centuries old, one cannot

---

[302] Mitchinson, Paul. "Difficult Rhythms, Grateful Conductors." *New York Times.* Letters to the Editor. 9 February 1997. Web. 13 March 2016.
[303] Ibid.

deny that their resurgence within the context of Stravinsky's works assisted in defining a truly "modern" style.

After reading this section, the reader must wonder why Stravinsky has been cited in a paper that claims to be concerned about the influence of Javanese and Balinese gamelan on Western composition. Clearly, as articulated above, were not Stravinsky's influence and musical contributions a result of his encounters and appropriation of Russian folk music? Herein, I make yet another bold claim: while Stravinsky betrays no direct inspiration from the gamelan, his compositional style was undoubtedly indirectly influenced by his predecessors whose works bear striking formic and sonic resemblance to Javanese and Balinese gamelan compositions. While it might seem so, this section is not tangential but is entirely integral to the broader argument. If Stravinsky and other composers who had succeeded Debussy and Satie had asserted an entirely new compositional style by disassociating themselves from the innovations that Debussy and Satie had formulated, this section would indeed be irrelevant. But they did not. Many of the features found in Stravinsky's music feature aspects that originated within Debussy and Satie's compositions, aspects that only originated within their compositions after encounters with the gamelan and appropriations of the "other." While I could have chosen to analyze Poulenc's *Concerto for Two Pianos* or Messaen's *Turangalîla-Symphonie*, I chose this piece in order to frame the Impressionist movement by showing what came after it.

Before proceeding with my final arguments, I must preface the rationale behind this claim. Musicologists often look at the study of musical trends in one of two general ways. They either attempt to outline and define these trends broadly by employing

nomothetic approaches (studying trends brought about by musical movements that are comprised of cohorts of individuals) or idiosyncratic ones (studying the contributions of one member within these groups and their impact on general trends). As a requisite of these approaches, researchers often include exhaustive theoretical analyses of an individual's compositions or, broadly, a distillation of general compositional trends within movements. Much emphasis is placed on the physical composition, the score. This is understandable — the score is the repository of compositional elements that define personal style and provide the foundation for musical movements. It is no surprise then that discussions of Stravinsky's *Le Sacre*, and myriad compositions by other eminent composers, often begin with analyses of the score. However, this is often impossible in ethnomusicology considering that many musics are aurally transmitted and exist in the realm of cultural memory. Ethnomusicology is obsessed with ethnography, with spoken narrative rather than physical score. That is why, as mentioned previously, it would have been so difficult to pinpoint Stravinsky's source melodies had Morton not conducted his analysis of Anton Juszkiewicz's compilation of 1,785 Lithuanian folk songs. Furthermore, discussions of 'Stravinsky the composer' are usually framed by defining the movements to which he is ascribed (neoclassicism, primitivism, etc.). However, as is the case with many composers, artists, writers, poets, etc., they often compose their craft in accordance with personal aesthetic convictions rather than conscious fealty to larger movements. Stravinsky was no exception. He was fascinated by the aesthetics of native, primitive sound, not necessarily (at least at first) the culture from which this sound originated. So, rather than focus on Stravinsky's appropriation of Russian folksong, I

suggest that we shift our focus to center on his view of exoticism and appropriation generally, a view that I argue was heavily influenced by Debussy.

According to the literature, Stravinsky's subject of exoticism — within — was very different than Debussy's: Debussy focused his attention mostly on Asian melodies, beyond European sources. What did both have in common? They both valued the musical "other," the "exotic" within their compositions. They were both nationalists. And the both composed in the style of French exoticism: they went beyond the pastiche of the Romantics, and incorporated aspects of "otherness" directly in their pieces in non-exotic contexts — they not only took snippets of melody and harmony, but appropriated and assimilated aspects of the musical "other" that would revolutionize their styles and define modernism. The exotic represented a new frontier that was ripe for exploration. What about this musical "other" did they like? Polyrhythm, repetition, atypical chordal resolution (or lack thereof entirely), unusual ethnic scales, etc. Let us now discuss their friendship.

Stravinsky's relationship with Debussy is relatively unexplored in literature that discusses the *Sacre*, mostly because it is easy to see the allusions Stravinsky makes to Russian folksong and somewhat more obscure to trace the inspiration he gleaned from the French Impressionists. Capital figures in musicology like Taruskin have even gone so far as to assert that previous analyses of the work have underestimated the amount of Slavic themes Stravinsky used within this composition. But, in order to support my argument, I will conclude this chapter by exploring Debussy's friendship with Stravinsky, which will hopefully provide the reader with enough insight to draw this conclusion: Debussy was such an important figure for end-of-century composers and his

view of exoticism was so ubiquitous that no one was exempt from his influence. And although this paper does not go into detail about the history of French and Russian interactions, the reader should know that

> From the age of Louis XIV, French became a language of international communication that increasingly replaced Latin, Europe's lingua franca in the Middle Ages… All European countries—albeit in varying degrees—underwent the influence of French culture in the eighteenth or nineteenth centuries. French was a powerful means of negotiation, exchange, and transfer in European space. It pervaded the spheres of diplomacy, science, learning, art, literature, and other forms of culture (in the comprehensive sense of the word), such as cuisine, leisure pursuits, etiquette, polite conversation, and cultivation of the art of living. It was largely thanks to knowledge of French that certain societies on the margins of Europe were able to gain access to the culture of the Enlightenment. Russia was affected strongly—or even to an exceptional degree, some would argue—by this cultural and linguistic influence.[304]

In 1911, two years before the premier of *Le Sacre*, Debussy wrote of his admiration of Stravinsky's works to Robert Godet:

> Are you aware that a young Russian musician named Igor Stravinsky with an instinctive genius for color and rhythm lives near you in Clarens? I'm sure that both he and his music will give you infinite pleasure. […] His music is full of feeling for the orchestra […]. He is afraid of nothing nor is he pretentious. It is music that is child-like and untamed. Yet the layout and the co-ordination of ideas is extremely delicate. If you have an opportunity of meeting him do not hesitate![305]

Debussy first met Stravinsky after the premier of *Firebird* in 1910 and a fast friendship ensued. Stravinsky states that Debussy's *Nocturnes* and *L'après-midi d`un faune* were "among the major events of [his] early years." Previous to their encounter, any of

---

[304] Argent, Gesine, Derek Offord and Vladislav Rjéoutski. "Foreward: French Language Acquisition in Imperial Russia." *Вивліоѳика: E-Journal of Eighteenth-Century Russian Studies*, Vol. 1 (2013): 1. Print.
[305] Lockspeiser, Edward. *Debussy: His Life and Mind*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 1978. 180. Print.

Stravinsky's works completed in St. Petersburg that bore any French resemblance ('Debussyisms') were likely because "Debussy's deliberate jettisoning of academic formalism had made an immediate appeal to the young and provoked an equally intense reaction among elders... if the musical establishment was alarmed by Debussy's music, Stravinsky and his friend were excited by its freedom and freshness."[306] The Western world was distinctly aware of Parisian fashions at the turn of the century, particularly of Debussy's form of exoticism. Just over a year before the debut of *Le Sacre*, Debussy was invited to perform it with Stravinsky as a four-hand piano reduction. One attending critic writes:

> Debussy agreed to play the bass. Stravinsky… pointing his nose to the keyboard and sometimes humming a part that had been omitted from the arrangement, he led into a welter of sound the supple, agile hands of his friend. Debussy followed without a hitch and seemed to make light of the difficulty. When they had finished there was no question of embracing, nor even of compliments. We were dumbfounded, overwhelmed by this hurricane which had come from the depths of the ages and which had taken life by the roots.[307]

Debussy even asked Stravinsky to assist him in orchestrating his symphony *Jeux* (1913). Other evidence of their friendship exists. For instance, Debussy's *En blanc et noir* for two pianos (1915) was dedicated to Stravinsky, and Stravinsky had previously dedicated his cantata *Le roi des étoiles* (1911-12) to Debussy. Furthermore, explicit Stravinskyisms can be seen in Debussy's *Jeux*, *La boîte à joujoux*, and *Préludes* that allude to *Petrushka,* a work that Debussy lauded for its "sonorous magic," "orchestral

[306] Noble, Jeremy. "Portrait of Debussy. Debussy and Stravinsky". *The Musical Times*.108.1487 (1967) 23. Web. 13 March 2016.
[307] Bleek, Tobias. "Stravinsky and his World: Igor Stravinsky and Claude Debussy." *Ruhr Piano Festival Foundation.* Web. 13 March 2016.

infallibility" and "unbridled power."[308] The same can be said of Debussyisms in Act I of Stravinsky's *Le rossignol*. When Debussy died in 1918, Stravinsky stated:

> I was sincerely attached to him as a man, and I grieved not only at the loss of one whose great friendship had been marked with unfailing kindness towards myself and my work, but at the passing of an artist who, in spite of maturity and health already hopelessly undermined, had still been able to retain his creative powers to the full, and whose musical genius had been in no way impaired throughout the whole period of his activity.[309]

I argue that the relationship between Debussy and Stravinsky was not one of teacher and pupil, but was of contemporaries who were interested in reshaping the West. Nonetheless, Stravinsky learned much from Debussy. He was certainly not exempt from Debussy's school of French exoticism, and, in this way, definitely benefitted from the interactions that Debussy had with the gamelan secondhand. Debussy's view of appropriation and the exotic dictated the way that Stravinsky himself approached endogenous appropriation. As Debussy stated to Stravinsky, "you will go much further than *Petrouchka*, it is certain,"[310] foreshadowing Stravinsky's future success that largely depended on his exploitation of the exotic in a decidedly French manner, albeit with Russian flair.

In conclusion, the intent of this essay was to present an investigation of "modern" music that appropriates cultural elements from non-Western and folk traditions, specifically citing Debussy's *Pagodes* (1903), Satie's *Gnossiennes No. 1, 2,* and *3* (1893), and Stravinsky's *Le Sacre du Printemps* (1913). As evident through these examples, the diaspora and assimilation of non-Western cultural music and traditional folk song into

[308] Ibid.
[309] Ibid.
[310] Ibid.

Western composition has acted to define "modernism," and many of these techniques are still widely utilized today. Although these techniques were considered *avant-garde* within the context of Western music, the adoption of atypical rhythmic and melodic motives, the prevalence of uncharacteristic harmonization through chromaticism, the evocation of atypical key areas, and the presence of polyphony and tonal ambiguity, among other techniques expounded upon within this paper, cannot be considered unique. While Debussy, Satie and Stravinsky's distinct management of melody, harmony and rhythm might have set a standard for modern composition in the Western tradition, these innovations were appropriated from cultural heritages outside of the West. This observation represents the clear influence of non-Western and folk music on the development of an authentically "modern" style, and asserts the importance of exoticism and cultural appropriation in defining new stylistic techniques in Western music. Of all of them, however, we owe the most to Debussy. As Mechkat argues, Debussy's music "virtually defines the transition from late-Romantic music to twentieth century modernist music… Debussy's harmonies, considered quite radical during his time, were extremely influential to almost every composer of the 20th century."[311] Even Ravel, a fellow establisher of French Impressionism, mentioned "upon hearing [Debussy's] work, so many years ago… [he] first understood what real music was."[312] Debussy's fascination with rhythm, time, tone color and texture, his novel approach to the exotic, and his unique voice leading stemmed from a "notably early fusion of Eastern and Western tonal

[311] Mechkat, Farhad. "Three Musical Precursors: Beethoven, Debussy and Stravinsky." *Nour Foundation.* 2009. Web. 13 March 2016. Lecture Series.
[312] Andres, Robert. "An Introduction to the solo piano music of Debussy and Ravel." *BBC Radio.* 2005. Web. 13 March 2016. Introductory Essay by Robert Andres to accompany performances of Debussy and Ravel by Arturo Pizarro.

procedures."[313] Aptly, Lockspeiser lauds him as "the father of us all."[314] Debussy, a Symbolist, leaves us guessing about the extent to which he was inspired by the gamelan — after all, as Mallarmé stated "to name an object, is to suppress … the pleasure of the [art]…to suggest it, there is the dream."[315] However, considering that Debussy wrote about the gamelan twenty-three years after first hearing it at the Universal Exposition with as much passion as when he first encountered it, one can speculate the profound influence it had on his musical aesthetic and that of his contemporaries and future composers.

[313] Cooke, Mervyn. "'The East in the West': Evocations of the Gamelan in Western Music." *The Exotic in Western Music. Ed.* Bellman, Jonathan. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. 259. Print.
[314] Noble, Jeremy. "Portrait of Debussy. Debussy and Stravinsky". *The Musical Times.* 108.1487 (1967): 22. Web.
[315] Maurer, Naomi E. *The Pursuit of Spiritual Wisdom: The Thought and Art of Vincent Van Gogh and Paul Gauguin*. Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson UP, 1998. 23. Print.

Reich, Glass, and Górecki: Aesthetic and Holy Minimalism.

"How small a thought can fill a whole life."
— text by Ludwig Wittgenstein,
featured in *Proverb* (1995) by Steve Reich

Originating in the 1960s in New York City, Minimalism is an experimental methodology, genre, and aesthetic closely associated with the works of prominent composers Louis Andriessen, John Adams, Terry Riley, La Monte Young, Philip Glass, and Steve Reich. Characterized by constant pulse, prolonged harmonic stasis, motivic reiteration with gradual rhythmic and melodic evolution, shifting phases, and ostinatos, the structural simplicity and objectivity of this musical type became immediately popular.[316] [317] The inaccessibility of the hyper-intellectual and esoteric dodecaphonic music of Schoenberg and other serialists, the atonal compositions of Webern, the aleatoric music of John Cage, and the acousmatic sonorities of *musique concrète* developed by Pierre Schaeffer had driven the public away from the orchestra hall.[318] As Grammy Award-winning composer Steve Schwartz humorously wrote in a 1999 review of Schoenberg's Piano Concerto, Op. 42 (1942) as performed by Alfred Brendel, the American public in the early 1960s "looked at [Schonberg's] name on the rare concert program as a child looks at Brussels sprouts on the dinner plate – with at least a sense of affront and perhaps a little despair." [319]

---

[316] Sande, Kiran. "A Brief History of Minimalism." *FACT Magazine: Music News, New Music*. 1 Feb.2015. Web. 03 May 2015. This article originally appeared in *The Daily Note*, the official newspaper of the Red Bull Music Academy.
[317] Johnson, Tom. *The Voice of New Music: New York City, 1972-1982: A Collection of Articles Originally Published in the Village Voice*. Eindhoven: Apollohuis, 1989. 742-44. Print.
[318] Mertens, Wim. *American Minimal Music: La Monte Young, Terry Riley, Steve Reich, Philip Glass*. London: Kahn & Averill, 1983. 11. Print.
[319] Schwartz, Steve. "Schoenberg - Piano Concerto, Chamber Symphonies." *Arnold Schoenberg*. Classical Net, 2009. Web. 03 May 2015. Summary for the "Busy Executive."

Minimalism was a revolution stemming from a yearning to remedy the "maximalist" tendencies of the Romantics and postmodern Serialists in favor of harmonic and melodic simplicity. Michael Gordon stated that, prior to Minimalism, "[t]he music establishment basically [stank] and there [was] nowhere to go."[320] Minimalism represented an escape, a new perspective. Peter Guttman writes in an article entitled "Steve Reich: Reinventing American Classical Music" that

> over the past century, the emotional satisfaction of soaring melodies, rich harmonies, exciting progressions and cathartic conclusions has been eroded by intellectual gamesmanship – first serialism trashed tonality with an attempt to equate the twelve chromatic notes and then indeterminacy dictated content largely by chance. While serial and indeterminate music may be governed by strict logic, it sounds like random noise, dissonant and arbitrary, inaccessible to all but a handful of theorists (or perhaps psychics). Something vital got lost - human communication. And without that, music becomes aloof and frustrating and loses its point.[321]

In protest of the rigid micromanagement or, conversely, the unbridled freeness these serial, atonal, and aleatoric composers exercised when inscribing their works, Minimalist composers strove to pare music down to its unembellished essentials: meter, rhythm, and mode.[322] Atonal music was soon eclipsed in popularity by tonal, diatonic music. As Minimalist Philip Glass declared, "certainly, music today can be strongly tonal which it couldn't be in my generation… tonal music was considered 'over,' it was finished. The future of the music was indicated to be in quite a different direction. We simply paid no

---

[320] Scheffer, Frank. "In The Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Documentary on modern composers in New York: Julia Wolfe, Michael Gordon and David Lang who founded 'Bang on a Can,' Steve Reich, Philip Glass, Louis Andriessen, Elliott Carter, John Cage, Frank Zappa and Brian Eno.
[321] Guttmann, Peter. "Steve Reich: Reinventing American Classical Music." *Goldmine Magazine.* Classical Notes. 2004. Web. 13 March 2016.
[322] Service, Tom. "Minimalism at 50: How Less Became More." Review. The Guardian: Classical Music. 24 Nov. 2011. Web. 3 May 2015.

attention to that whatsoever and we began… reinventing the idea of tonality."[323] The hypnotic, kaleidoscopic sounds and polyrhythmic textures that arose from this compositional approach represented an aurally appealing change that was more accessible to the uninitiated audience. Dissenting against the sterile and dull intellectualism of their serialist and modernist predecessors, Minimalist composers experimented with psychedelic drugs and looked to the Eastern "other" for secular and spiritual inspiration, drawing heavily on Asiatic and African cultural and musical lineages for influence, particularly the gamelan.[324]

But what exactly is Minimalism? According to famed program annotator and music scholar Richard E. Rodda, "'Minimalist' music is based upon the repetition of slowly changing common chords in steady rhythms, often overlaid with a lyrical melody in long, arching phrases...[It] utilizes repetitive melodic patterns, consonant harmonies, motoric rhythms, and a deliberate striving for aural beauty."[325] Sprechstimme, loop tracks, and nontraditional instrumentation are often employed within these pieces; these techniques express the counter-cultural vibe of the Minimalist aesthetic (somewhat niche, peripheral, not interested in following classical "tradition"). Initially known as the New York Hypnotic School due to the entrancing, psychedelic repetition that would become characteristic of Minimalist sound, the term "Minimal Music" to describe this movement was coined by composers Michael Nyman and Tom Johnson. According to Johnson, Minimalism is

---

[323] Scheffer, Frank. "In the Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[324] Sitsky, Larry. *Music of the Twentieth-century Avant-garde: A Biocritical Sourcebook*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2002. 361. Print.
[325] Rodda, Richard E. (1999). Liner notes, Violin Concertos of John Adams & Philip Glass, Robert McDuffie (violin). Telarc, CD-80494.

> by definition, any music that works with limited or minimal materials: pieces that use only a few notes, pieces that use only a few words of text, or pieces written for very limited instruments, such as antique cymbals, bicycle wheels, or whiskey glasses. It includes pieces that sustain one basic electronic rumble for a long time. It includes pieces made exclusively from recordings of rivers and streams. It includes pieces that move in endless circles. It includes pieces that set up an unmoving wall of saxophone sound. It includes pieces that take a very long time to move gradually from one kind of music to another kind. It includes pieces that permit all possible pitches, as long as they fall between C and D. It includes pieces that slow the tempo down to two or three notes per minute. [326]

This term, however, is one that many composers such as Reich and Glass have avoided affixing to their own works to circumvent being pigeonholed by this genre — Glass prefers to describe himself as a composer of "music with repetitive structures"[327] while Reich considers "Drumming (1970)" — what Robert Schwartz considers the "Minimalism's first masterpiece"[328] — his final authentically Minimalist work. Perhaps this is an attempt to avoid stigmatization: Minimalism, by nature, is less harmonically complex than other classical music types; this might lead people to believe that it is not as difficult to perform or compose than Baroque or Romantic compositions, for instance. But this logic is flawed: comparing Minimalism to Romanticism is like comparing apples to oranges. As a less clichéd analogy, while most Emory students vocally denounce the austere character of Cannon Chapel (or it's even plainer cousin, White Hall) as "ugly," scholars view Hornbostel's architectural contributions to the field of Brutalism on Emory's campus as some of the most exquisite examples. Brutalism is a direct result of

[326] Johnson, Tom. *The Voice of New Music: New York City, 1972-1982: A Collection of Articles Originally Published in the Village Voice*. Eindhoven: Apollohuis, 1989. 742-44. Print.
[327] Brooks, Anthony, and Meghna Chakrabarti. *Composer Philip Glass On How His 'Way Of Hearing' Transformed*. Radio Boston. 30 Mar. 2015. Web. 03 May 2015.
[328] Schwarz, K. Robert. *Minimalists*. London: Phaidon, 1996. 73. Print.

this Minimal aesthetic revolution in the '60s and '70s — it eschewed frivolity and favored simplicity, much like Minimalist music. Nonetheless, while Glass and Reich may not consider themselves Minimalists, they have not evaded this label and are regarded as two of Minimalisms most prolific composers. Several canonical examples of Minimalist music include John Terry Riley's "In C (1964)," John Adams' "Shaker Loops (1978)," and Philip Glass's *Einstein on the Beach* (1976).

Minimalism continues to shape our musical identity. In fact, Reich was recently awarded the BBVA Foundation Frontiers of Knowledge Award in 2013 for "bringing forth a new conception of music, based on the use of realist elements from the realm of daily life and others drawn from the traditional music of Africa and Asia… [he] has carved out new paths, establishing a dialogue between popular and high culture and between western modernity and non-European traditions, and achieving a rich combination of complexity and transparency."[329] This quote reflects the meta-argument of this thesis: new conceptions of music arise as a result from the reworking (the "familiarization") of the "other." Gamelan is not peripheral to our understanding of our musical selves, it is central. Reich's reworking of the "other" is not tangential, but foundational to the Minimalist genre — more broadly, it continues to influence his musical style and Western modern music generally. Corroborating this assertion, Kyle Gann writes that the Minimalists such as Reich, Glass, Young, and Riley developed "our current musical language."[330] Movements that followed Minimalism inherited its stylistic accomplishments:

---

[329] "Steve Reich: Contemporary Music Edition (2013)." BBVA Foundation Frontiers of Knowledge Awards. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[330] Gann, Kyle. "Forest from the Seeds of Minimalism: An Essay on Postminimal and Totalist Music." Music After Minimalism. 1998. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Written for the program of a 1998 Minimalism Festival of the Berliner Gesellschaft fur Neue Musik.

> Often the inheritance is structural, in the use of additive process, or in the overlapping of rhythmic cycles out of phase. Sometimes it's melodic, in the preference for linear, hard-edged melodies and focus on a few pitches for long passages of time. Sometimes it's harmonic, in the use of a seamless tonality cleansed of goal-oriented European associations. Sometimes it's rhythmic, in the tendency to create geometric illusions from steady pulses. Sometimes it's textural, in the orchestration of mixed ensembles to create a fused, non-soloistic sound, often playing in rhythmic unison. Little post-Minimalist or totalist music exhibits all of these characteristics, but most of it exhibits more than one.[331]

The Minimalist movement was not just a musical revolution, but reflected a large-scale social paradigm shift. Artists such as Sol LeWitt, Carl Andre, Robert Morris, and Dan Flavin popularized the counterpart of this movement within the visual arts.[332] Dogmatically identical to musical Minimalism, Minimalism within the visual arts sought to stylize simplicity, protesting the extravagance and gluttonous hyper-emotionalism of abstract expressionists and artists of concurrent *avante-garde* visual arts movements. This close doctrinal association between musical and artistic Minimalism invited collaboration and fostered co-evolution. In fact, many instances exist in which installation art, process art, land art, conceptual art, and performance art were either inspired by or themselves inspired Minimalist musical compositions: it created a broad minimal aesthetic, a philosophy that has come to define the modern (technically, "postmodern") West.[333]

Considered by some as the most significant "-ism" within 20th century music, Minimalism's influence can be heard across a wide variety of sources from Pärt to

---

[331] Gann, Kyle. "Forest from the Seeds of Minimalism: An Essay on Postminimal and Totalist Music." Music After Minimalism. 1998. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Written for the program of a 1998 Minimalism Festival of the Berliner Gesellschaft fur Neue Musik.
[332] "Minimalism: Minimalism in the Visual Arts." 2015. Web. 12 March 2016. Online encyclopedia; accessed from the Columbia Electronic Encyclopedia, 6th ed. Columbia University Press, 2012.
[333] Ibid.

Radiohead and, as it continues to influence new generations of new age and electronic producers, its continued significance is indisputable.[334] As Gann states, Minimalism acted as an electric shock for "hundreds of young composers… The Deutsche Grammophon recording of Reich's 'Drumming' appeared in 1973; Glass's *Einstein on the Beach* hit the Metropolitan Opera in 1976. At that moment an entire generation was beginning its musical education."[335] In my opinion, the increased interest in world music and the growing popularity of Minimalism in the 1960s and '70s are not unrelated events: they are inherently interconnected phenomena. And more than that, Minimalism approximates a technological artificiality (ex. Dubstep, EDM, etc.) based on the rhythms of world music that I believe reflects the future of music.

What does this future of music look like? In his text *Re-drawing Boundaries: The Kronos Quartet*, Dave Headlam coins the term "world Minimalism," a "[hybrid, cross-cultural] style that combines musical traits shared among some world musics with analogous elements found in classical Minimalism," a mixture of the terms "world music" and "Minimalism."[336] Philip Glass highlights this trend by declaring that "[t]he spirit of experimentation and inclusion is much stronger in this [current] generation. Younger composers no longer have to have an allegiance to a musical ideology,"[337] authorizing them to sample and appropriate sonic textures from global genres. It is my belief that Glass' statement and Headlam's idea of world Minimalism can be generalized

---

[334] Service, Tom. "Minimalism at 50: How Less Became More." Review. The Guardian: Classical Music. 24 Nov. 2011. Web. 3 May 2015.
[335] Gann, Kyle. "Forest from the Seeds of Minimalism: An Essay on Postminimal and Totalist Music." Music After Minimalism. 1998. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Written for the program of a 1998 Minimalism Festival of the Berliner Gesellschaft fur Neue Musik.
[336] Headlam, David. "Re-drawing boundaries: The Kronos Quartet." *Contemporary Music Review*, 19:1, 2000. 113. Web. 13 March 2016.
[337] Scheffer, Frank. "In the Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

to reflect broader, cross-cultural trends in musical evolution, emphasizing the eventual convergence of the West and "other."

In fact, perhaps it is this perceived "otherness" (primitive, ancient, etc.) in Minimalism that has legitimized this genre: as Sande writes, Minimalism "feels as old as the world itself – but it's relatively new."[338] What does this statement tell us? Minimalism feels traditional. As Barry Drummond mentions, "aren't we in the West, or the United States, in some ways cultureless, so that we appropriate other cultures? I mean we appropriate everything."[339] Similarly, Julia Wolfe asserts that "we [Americans] don't really have a lot of tradition… we are a tradition of non-tradition in a way. And that is both terrible and liberating. The renegade artist [with] renegade creativity… throws the world wide open."[340] Minimalist music is, in someway, an attempt to reconnect with or establish tradition (real or imagined) via the appropriation of globalized sounds. As Henry Cowell, noted pedagogue and composer, stated "[i]t seems to me certain that future progress in creative music for composers of the Western world must inevitably go towards the exploration and integration of elements drawn from more than one of the world's cultures."[341] Similarly, the "interpenetration of cultures" that John Cage cites as being foundationally important to our modern musical identity supports Hall's idea of Global Postmodernism — we are now citizens of the world, conscious and unconscious

---

[338] Sande, Kiran. "A Brief History of Minimalism." *FACT Magazine: Music News, New Music*. 1 Feb. 2015. Web. 03 May 2015. This article originally appeared in *The Daily Note*, the official newspaper of the Red Bull Music Academy.
[339] Mason, Amelia. "What Is Gained, and Lost, When Indonesian Gamelan Music Is Americanized." *Artery*. 19 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Publication of 90.9 WBUR, Boston's NPR News Station.
[340] Schaeffer, Frank. "In the Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[341] Bellman, Jonathan. *The Exotic in Western Music*. Boston: Northeastern UP, 1998. 258. Print.

consumers of world music.[342]

As a variety of sources show, Minimalism largely draws its inspiration from appropriated sonorities and techniques from the "ancient" and "primitive" Eastern "other." As we will see in the ensuing paragraphs, holy Minimalists and aesthetic Minimalists owe their musical styles in a large part to interactions with this "other," demonstrating the central importance of gamelan and other World Music styles in developing "modern" and "Western" sounds. Beyond similarities in structure, I offer several parallels between Minimalism and world music, particularly focusing on the ways that both are "otherized," arguing that Minimalism is not as widely accepted currently among lay audiences as some scholars assert (i.e. it is also somewhat peripheral). Also in the following analysis, I will discuss elements present in Steve Reich's "Electric Counterpoint (1989)" with specific attention devoted to Movt. III "Fast," in order to gain a more refined understanding of this musical genre, drawing parallels between it and gamelan *karawitan*. I mainly cite Reich because he, of all of the Minimalists, has received the most commendation and is most well known to the public. And his techniques have most significantly influenced his Minimalist contemporaries. To bolster my argument, I will cite a performance by Philip Glass and the Emory Symphony Orchestra's performance of one of Henryk Górecki's symphonies. Both were performed at Emory University's Schwartz Center for the Performing Arts.[343] I cite these performances to counter the belief that Minimalism is dead, proving that Minimalism is (at least in the academy) alive but evolving. I will also include excerpts from an interview

[342] Schaeffer, Frank. "In the Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[343] Górecki's *No. 3* ("Symphony of Sorrowful Songs") was performed on 6 March 2014. Glass performed on 27 September 2013. Both performances were held at the Schwartz Center for Performing Arts at Emory University in Atlanta, GA.

I conducted with Minimalist scholar and university administrator Jeremy Grimshaw (Brigham Young University). Overall, I will highlight both aural and visual observations attained from an in depth score analysis supplemented by evidence gleaned from repetitive contextual listening and historical research.

Excluding Reich's philosophical *Music as a Gradual Process* (1968) and *Writings on Music: 1965 – 2000* (2004), or Michael Nyman's musings on the Minimalist genre within *Experimental Music: Cage and Beyond* (1999), little theoretical rhetoric has emerged to operationalize and unify techniques of analysis for Minimalist music. The lack of a prescriptive categorization of Minimalist composition has spurned a variety of labels such as "trance music," "process music," "systems music," "solid state music," "structuralist music" and "repetitive music." Detractors labeled the music "going-nowhere music" and "wallpaper music." The original lack of a definitive category added to the confusion in systematizing theoretical analysis techniques for this genre. As Dan Warburton, a theory professor at the University of Rochester's Eastman School of Music aptly points out, typical Schenkerian or Forte lattice analysis techniques would be of little use when analyzing Minimalist music as they failed "to take into account the in-time listening experience."[344] Most "serious" musicians in the '60s and '70s were still composing 12-tone, serial music *à la* Webern that was easily analyzed with these techniques. In light of Warburton's critique, the analysis methodology employed within this section will not only descriptively focus on "underlying deep structure" but will remain keenly aware of "how the selected material unfolds during the course of a

[344] Warburton, Dan. "A Working Terminology for Minimal Music." Paris Transatlantic Archives, 1988. Web. 03 May 2015. Originally written for and published in the magazine *Intégral* (Vol. 2, 1988).

performance."[345] "Piano Phase," for instance, consists of a simple 12-note melody: E4 F♯4 B4 C♯5 D5 F♯4 E4 C♯5 B4 F♯4 D5 C♯5. It is impossible to theoretically annotate the canonic structures of *Piano Phase* as it phases in and out, creating intricate polyrhythms. As Reich says in an interview with Jonathan Cott, phasing is "a process of gradually passing through all the canonic relationships making an entire piece and not just a moment in time."[346] Minimalism is more than the sum of its parts; it is synergistic in the fact that it evolves from simple melodic lines into highly stratified polyrhythmic textures.

According to Kiran Sande, "Minimalism wasn't just a movement, it was a paradigm shift: it brought about a sea of change in the way that sound is made, heard and thought of."[347] This is perhaps what the title of *In the Ocean*, a documentary about the classical avant-garde, alludes to: Minimalism has been carried downstream by Reich and Glass and has entered into the philosophical "ocean." It has become increasingly "mainstream" but is not yet entirely mainstream.[348] Nonetheless, critic Andrew Clements writing for the UK publication *The Guardian* praised Reich as one of "a handful of living composers who can legitimately claim to have altered the direction of musical history"[349] due to his contributions to Minimalism. Reich's ingenious orchestration of "Electric Counterpoint (1978)" as well as "Music for 18 Musicians (1978)" ranks them as foundational examples of Minimalism — both have garnered Reich significant

---

[345] Ibid.
[346] Cole, Ross Graham. *Illusion / Anti-Illusion: the Music of Steve Reich in Context, 1965–1968*. University of York, 2010. 40. Web. M.M. Thesis. This source cites an interview between Reich and Jonathan Cott from which this quote was taken.
[347] Sande, Kiran. "A Brief History of Minimalism." *FACT Magazine: Music News, New Music*. 1 Feb. 2015. Web. 03 May 2015.
[348] Schaeffer, Frank. "In the Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[349] Clements, Andrew. "Composer of the Week, Steve Reich (b. 1936)," *The Guardian*. BBC Radio 3 Programmes. Episode 1. 25 October 2010. Web. 13 March 2016.

international commendation. But perhaps what is most incredible about Reich's career is the limited number of compositions he has produced: the fact that his minimal (pun intended) forty-piece corpus of compositions "altered the direction of musical history" is incredibly impressive. Reich's works represent a confirmation of what we as a society envision the future of music to look like. And this future is defined by interactions with and incorporation of "otherized" sonorities that become "self" over time.

Born in New York in 1936, Steve Reich[350] has been lauded by *The Village VOICE* as America's "greatest living composer," the *New Yorker* as "…the most original musical thinker of our time," and the New York Times as "...among the great composers of the century."[351] He studied philosophy at Cornell University in Ithaca, New York, and graduated with honors in 1957. From 1958 to 1960, Reich studied composition with Hall Overton, William Bergsma and Vincent Persichetti at the Julliard School of Music in New York City and received an M.A. in music composition from Mills College in Oakland, California in 1963 after studying with Darius Milhaud and Lucio Berio.[352] Reich is undoubtedly the most famous of the Minimalists, with his compositions such as "It's Gonna Rain (1965)," "Come Out (1966)," and "Different Trains (1988)" receiving widespread acclaim. "It's Gonna Rain" features a phased and looped recording of Brother Walter, a Pentecostal preacher, proselytizing about the apocalypse. Reich describes the piece as "a heavy piece written in the shadow of the Cuban Missile Crisis, and the voice

[350] If the reader wishes to learn more about Reich, interviews by Emily Wasserman in *Art Forum* (vol. 62, 1971) and Michael Nyman in the *Musical Times* (vol. 62, 1971), several articles in *Virtuoso* (1981) and the *New York Art Journal* (vol. 17, 1980), and David Ewen's *American Composers* (1982) discuss his rise to prominence and his innovative musical style that takes a global, hybrid focus.
[351] Reich, Steve. "The Steve Reich Website." Web. 03 May 2015.
[352] Ibid.

is a spectacularly moving, intense voice about the end of the world."[353] Certainly, as Reich's first commercially successful composition, this piece signaled the end of the musical world (status quo) as the West knew it.

Perhaps most relevant to this discussion, Reich studied African drumming at the Institute for African Studies at the University of Ghana, Accra, during the summer of 1970 and performed in Balinese Gamelan *Gambang* and Gamelan *Semar Pegulingan* ensembles at the American Society for Eastern Arts in 1973 and 1974. In addition to his fascination with African polyphonic drumming rhythms and cyclical gamelan melodies among other non-Western musical sonorities such as microtonal Hindustani ragas, Reich extensively researched the traditional forms of Hebrew scriptural cantillation and liturgical music in Jerusalem and New York, frequently drawing on his Jewish heritage. "Different Trains (1988)," for example, praised by the *New York Times* as "a work of such astonishing originality that breakthrough seems the only possible description... [and that] possesses an absolutely harrowing emotional impact,"[354] was inspired by Reich's memory of travelling by train from New York to Los Angeles to visit his parents shortly after the commencement of World War II, trains that in Europe, he realized, would have carried Jews like himself to Bergen-Belsen and Auschwitz. He received a Pulitzer Prize in Music in 2009 for "Double Sextet (2008)," two Grammy Awards, the Praemium Imperiale award in Music, and the Polar Prize presented by the Royal Swedish Academy of Music, and has held endowed professorships and artist fellowships at many universities including Yale, Dartmouth, and the University of California at Berkeley. His pieces have been performed by his ensemble, Steve Reich and Musicians, to sold-out

---

[353] Dayal, Geeta. "Steve Reich: 'Radiohead is my kind of music.'" *The Guardian*. 11 Sept. 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.
[354] Reich, Steve. "The Steve Reich Website." Web. 03 May 2015.

crowds at Carnegie Hall and at major concert venues across the globe as well as by major orchestras such as the London Symphony Orchestra and the New York Philharmonic. Due to his immense contributions to Minimalism, he was elected to the American Academy of Arts and Letters in 1994 and continues to actively compose and perform this repertoire.[355]

Minimalism has become the sonic and artistic precedent whether we realize it or not. It is similar to and distinct from the Symbolist and Impressionist movements in the way that it deals with the exotic. These movements valorized implication and evocation over explicitness when crafting soundscapes: they desired to tell a story, to use music as a means of transportation. As Debussy notes "music alone has the power to evoke, at will, those imaginary sites and that fantastic but indubitable world which is secretly at work in the mysterious poetry of the night, in the thousand anonymous noises of the leaves, caressed by the rays of the moon."[356] As discussed in Chapter 3, since evocation is much more abstract than replication, it is somewhat difficult to know precisely what is appropriated and from whom. Unlike the Impressionists, Minimalism is not necessarily interested in harmonic or melodic abstraction, but in succinctness. Since it is so skeletal in form, would it not be easier to pick out appropriated textures from Minimalist compositions than Impressionist ones? Not necessarily. This "less is more" approach leaves much to be implied, a striking similarity to the Symbolists' abstraction of the exotic. But at least as my investigations have uncovered, Minimalism appears much more interested in appropriating exotic sonic textures than engaging in full-on exoticism (i.e. "Westernizing" Eastern sounds). Minimalists are not necessarily as interested in using

[355] Ibid.
[356] Orledge, Robert. *Debussy and the Theatre*. Cambridge, Cambridge U.P., 1982. 281. Print.

music as a means of creating imagery, storytelling or transportation to a place (the physical “exotic”), but instead to facilitate spiritual transcendence or simply for aesthetic reasons. At least to accomplish spiritual transcendence, it makes sense that many of the West African and Indonesian techniques that Minimalists borrowed and incorporated into their works were originally used to induce trance. Regardless of objective, however, the French exotic of Debussy and Satie — that used exotic sonorities in non-exotic settings — was the precursor to Minimalists’ method of appropriation. To this end, Philip Corner asserts

> “Minimalism,” even in the restricted sense of repetitively simplified music, begins with l’Ecole de Notre Dame in the 12th century- the medieval rhythmic modes as spectacularly presented by Leonin and Perotin. One could say that the French have continued to lead the field: Satie with his unsurpassable ‘Vexations,’ ‘Musique d’ameublement’ and the ‘Cinéma-Entr’acte’, not to speak of the ensemble of Rosicrucian pieces; from Ravel, there's obviously ‘Bolero;’ even some moments in Debussy. But these are precursors. [357]

Furthermore, Minimal music differs from Impressionism and Neoclassicism in its directionality and subject. Johnson writes in his 1994 treatise “Minimalism: Aesthetics, Style, or Technique?” that Minimal music was non-teleological, non-narrative, and non-representational.[358] While Debussy’s *Pagodes* strove to evoke gamelan, Reich’s *Music for 18 Musicians* — while it is certainly inspired by gamelan — does not necessarily attempt to reproduce or evoke gamelan sound. Reich’s intention was never to directly replicate non-Western musics within his compositions, but to find structural and tonal inspiration from them, creating a “music with one’s own sounds that is constructed in the

---

[357] Corner, Philip. “How Minimal is Minimal?” *Perfect Sound Forever*. April 2012. Web. 12 March 2016.
[358] Johnson, Timothy A. “Minimalism: Aesthetic, Style, or Technique?” The Musical Quarterly 78.4 (1994): 742–773. Web.

light of one's knowledge of non-Western structures."[359] This goes beyond the French exotic, beyond a desire to create musical pastiche. Reich goes on to assert that

> The question then arises as to how, if at all, this knowledge of non-Western music influences a composer. The least interesting form of influence, to my mind, is that of imitating the sound of some non-Western music. This can be done by using non-Western instruments in one's own music…This method is the simplest and most superficial way of dealing with non-Western music…Imitating the sound of non-Western music leads to 'exotic music' – what used to be called 'Chinoiserie.'"[360]

Thus, Reich does not wish to create an exotic aesthetic, to make 'Chinoiserie,' but to create a modern, Western aesthetic. In an interview with Bloc, a British electronic music festival, Reich discusses his view of appropriation further, stating that

> Everything that happens in out lives has played some role. Most of the time… it is very hard to understand how that works. I mean, sometimes it is very clear... I went to Africa, I learned how to do so and so… But many things, you know, you even forget about, but they have not been forgotten subconsciously and affect how you are.[361]

Interestingly, he describes his visit to Africa just as Sorrels describes Debussy's 1889 encounter with gamelan: as a confirmation. Reich stated that this visit was "basically [a] confirmation: that writing for acoustic instruments playing repeating patterns of a percussive nature was a viable means of making music, and had an ancient history."[362] He also mentioned that reading Colin McPhee's *Music in Bali* represented a *confirmation* as well: "the interlocking rhythmic patterns of short duration that I discovered in

---

[359] Reich, Steve. *Writings about Music*. Halifax: The Press of Nova Scotia College of Arts and Design; New York: New York University, 1974. 40. Print.
[360] Ibid. 40.
[361] Terranova, David. "Influences: Steve Reich." Bloc. 2012. Web. 12 Mar. 2016. Bloc "Influences series." Reich discusses Ghanian drumming and a project with Radiohead.
[362] Reich, Steve. *Writings about Music*. Halifax: The Press of Nova Scotia College of Arts and Design; New York: New York University, 1974. 106. Print.

McPhee's book were already in my music."[363] But describing these encounters as a mere "confirmation" of his own musical intuition is hard for me to believe, especially when he admitted that his first encounter with Ghanaian music and gamelan — years before his actual visit to Africa or Indonesia and before he had attained commercial success — was in A.M. Jones' *Studies in African Music* and in McPhee's text.[364] Reich describes his experience in Ghana as such:

> I studied music from the Ewe tribe… I would record lessons and when I would come home, [I would] write them down. I was working at the same time with tape loops that produced "It's Gonna Rain" and "Come Out"… and I though, wow, these African patterns, going over and over again, they are like tape loops. So I got very interested in African music by seeing the notation, hearing recordings, and seeing the analogy between what I was doing with tape and Africans were doing with drums. All roads pointed… to Ghana.[365]

Without a doubt, Ghanaian drumming and gamelan inspired his technique. Thus, while both Debussy and Reich have made major contributions to Western modernism and postmodernism, their contributions are definitely not wholly unique. I argue that while both were innovators, the materials that they used to gain this status are fundamentally non-Western ("other"). We must not solely approach Minimalist music or any music for that matter theoretically, but must think about how it has been molded by its sociocultural context and how ethnic music influences (both conscious and unconscious) have been appropriated, assimilated, and abstracted within Western repertoire.

Beyond these differences in approaches to the exotic, Reich and the Minimalists

---

[363] Ibid.
[364] Ibid. 56.
[365] Terranova, David. "Influences: Steve Reich." Bloc. 2012. Web. 12 Mar. 2016. Bloc "Influences series." Reich discusses Ghanian drumming and a project with Radiohead.

have been heavily impacted by the Impressionists. Reich stated "I am often moved to tears by Stravinsky… Bartok and many others from before 1750 and after Debussy, so my emotional musical life is complete without 'romantic' music."[366] Debussy and Satie viewed the past and foreign (endogenous or exogenous) musics as sources for exotic themes, much in the same way that Reich does. And in an article by Robert Morris entitled "Steve Reich and Debussy: Some Connections," Morris states that "[t]he textures that [Debussy's] repetitive techniques produce suggests a connation with what is today called… systemic or process music [Minimalism]. [And] repetition is the first word that comes to mind with considering Steve Reich's methods of generating basic texture and constricting full-length pieces."[367] Perhaps Impressionism and Minimalism are not so different after all.

Before continuing, I will draw several controversial parallels between Minimalism and World Music. Previously, I discussed several ways in which World Music is "peripheralized" by the academy and the consumer. There is a clear division between "the West" and "the rest." Although this division has shrunk in recent years as a result of globalization, its presence is still detectable as shown through my discussions in Chapter 1. Although "world music" is a much larger category, I would argue that Minimalism is similarly "otherized." This claim is verified by the conspicuous absence of Minimalism in introductory music theory and history classes and, at least according to the observations of my friends in other music departments and conservatories across the United States, is quite universal across American undergraduate music curriculums. As

[366] Reich, Steve. "The Steve Reich Website." Web. 03 May 2015. Steve Reich is interviewed by Anne Teresa de Keersmaeker.
[367] Morris, Patrick. "Steve Reich and Debussy: Some Connections". *Tempo* 160 (1987): 8. Web. 13 March 2016.

already established, World Music is sometimes marginalized or "otherized" by the very scholarship that aims to preserve and promote it. Similarly, Minimalism has been historically "otherized" in music departments because it has been stigmatized as overly simplistic and not worthy of serious consideration. As Adrian Baker states, "Minimalist music was, for the most part, ignored or vilified by the 'classical' music establishment who often labeled it as 'banal,' 'retrogressive' … even today, a significant number of European university music departments do not include it in their undergraduate modules, regarding Minimalist music as unworthy of academic study."[368] We take Minimalism and World Music for granted. Just at Schwantner stated of the gamelan, can Minimalism be viewed as a fad?

While most progressive concert halls and audiences have welcomed high Minimalist compositions, not all seem too keen to see it programmed these days. In a rather humorous article published in *Slipped Disc* on February 29th, 2016, famed critique Norman Lebrecht reports that "the international virtuoso Mahan Esfahani faced what may be the first recorded riot at a harpsichord recital yesterday when a conservative Cologne audience objected to him playing Steve Reich on a baroque instrument."[369] Esfahani stated that "the hall… was more or less in pandemonium on a scale that [he'd] never seen in a concert hall for classical music," noting that Reich's "Piano Phase" is "not even all that modern – it'll turn 50 years old next year!"[370] Can Minimal music still be viewed as cutting edge, avant-garde, experimental? For Esfahani, "Piano Phase" is 'classical' ("it'll turn 50 years old next year!"); others would undoubtedly disagree. What does this tell us?

---

[368] Sim, Stuart. *The Routledge Companion to Postmodernism*. London: Routledge, 2005. 273. Print.
[369] Lebrecht, Norman. "Noisy Dissent Disrupts a Harpsichord Recital." *Slipped Disc*. 29 Feb. 2016. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[370] Lebrecht, Norman. "Noisy Dissent Disrupts a Harpsichord Recital." *Slipped Disc*. 29 Feb. 2016. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Both gamelan and minimal music often fall victim to stigma — that they are "simplistic" and "non-developmental" and therefore 1) are not worthy of (further) academic study and 2) are not fit to be programmed — this stigma further peripheralizes them by casting them from the curriculum and the concert hall.

Certainly, Philip Glass' 5-hour-long opera *Einstein on the Beach* cannot be viewed as the antithesis of the complex pieces of the Romantics who strove toward sensationalism (sensory overload via hyper-emotional compositional techniques). As Sande states, Minimalism is based on "the idea that there is virtue in stripping away, that simplicity can be beautiful, and give rise to its own special kind of complexity."[371] Minimal compositions are complex, just perhaps not in the conventional (harmonic) sense. As Salzman points out, Minimalism succeeds in "deepening… experience in certain highly limited perceptual areas"[372] and takes an "enormous amount of mental energy… focused on an absolute minimum of sensory data."[373] This sensory underloading might actually be overwhelming to listeners. In fact, in a review of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble's Fall 2015 *wayang kulit* performance, Arts ATL critic Gresham stated that the ensemble "wisely chose to make a relatively short work of [the *wayang*]" and pointed out that the performance "progressively bordered on risking tediousness."[374] The tedious task of listening to the same patterns recurring again and again with little variation might turn someone off to this music: when Philip Glass came to Emory in 2013, a friend of mine angrily stormed out of the concert after only twenty

[371] Sande, Kiran. "A Brief History of Minimalism." *FACT Magazine: Music News, New Music*. 1 Feb. 2015. 03 May 2015. Web. This article originally appeared in *The Daily Note*, the official newspaper of the Red Bull Music Academy.
[372] Salzman, Eric. *Twentieth-Century Music: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1974. 186. Print.
[373] Ibid. 188.
[374] Gresham, Mark. "Review: Emory Gamelan Ensemble Treats a Full House to Javanese Shadow Puppets Concert." *Arts ATL*. 8 April 2015. Web. 13 March 2016.

minutes, irritably whispering "there is only so much you can do with a D minor chord!"

I suspect even Glass is aware of this tediousness. Glass, when premiering *Einstein on the Beach,* mentioned to audience members that they were permitted to wander in and out of the concert hall freely during the performance — Minimalism is a spectacle, but is also ambient (background). This idea can be expressed best in the words of ambient music pioneer Brian Eno: "a drift away from narrative and towards landscape, from performed event to sonic space."[375] In someway this is comforting: one has the liberty to let their mind drift in and out of focus, or to wander in and out of the concert hall and, upon returning, realize that they haven't missed much. As Gann states, it feels "comfortable and familiar."[376] There is some security in this sameness. For others, this sameness might be exasperating. Beyond the high-art aficionados, academics and experimental music specialists, it appears that there is a growing aversion to "Minimalism proper" among the general lay population.

Why is this? It is my view that Western audiences still have not fully accepted these musics because they do not know exactly how to listen to them. Eric Tamm mentions that "Reich's phase shifts constituted a use of repetition inviting or requiring a new mode of listening: if one listened in the old way, all one heard was hundreds of boring repetitions of the same phase."[377] In the '60s and '70s, Minimalism was a more accessible alternative to the serial compositions of Berg, Webern and Schoenberg, but I argue that it was still not entirely accessible, and it still is not. It was a tamer option. As

---

[375] Ross, Alex. The Rest Is Noise: Listening to the Twentieth Century. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2007. Print.
[376] Gann, Kyle. "Forest from the Seeds of Minimalism: An Essay on Postminimal and Totalist Music." Music After Minimalism. 1998. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Written for the program of a 1998 Minimalism Festival of the Berliner Gesellschaft fur Neue Musik.
[377] Tamm, Eric. *Brian Eno: His Music and the Vertical Color of Sound*. Boston: Faber and Faber, 1989. 24. Print.

Reich put it in *Music as a Gradual Process,* listening to Minimalist compositions is like "watching the minute hand of a watch – you can perceive it moving only after you observe it for a while."[378] But listening to Minimalism takes more than just patience. My friend's detestation of Glass' music betrays the fact that (most) Western audiences do not yet have the ear for foreign cadences that do not resolve according to Western conventions nor for exotic, cyclical structures that are repeated with limited variation. Beside non-Western influences, technology might also be to blame for this repetition: Elizabeth Hellmuth Mergulus writes that "[t]echnology […] has always been a force in the development of musical styles, but since recording technologies are essentially repetition machines, the advent of these capacities is particularly relevant to practices of repetition in music."[379] It is my belief that Minimalism, protesting the aleatoric and serial music of its predecessors, perhaps went too far (at least in the publics' eyes) in its quest to reclaim tonality, revitalize melody and rhythm by appropriating exotic structures, and avoid harmony. There has been a certain level of backtracking in which modern movements have striven to find a middle ground between "minimal" and "maximal." Post-Minimalism and Neo-romanticism are key examples of this: while both strive toward the lyricism of 19th century Romanticism, they are not as cloyingly emotional; yet they are also not as repetitive or harmonically barren as Minimalism.

Furthermore, there remains a certain level of haughtiness in the academy that still values counterpoint as proposed by Fux's 1725 *Gradus ad Parnasum* over non-Western techniques. Debussy realized this and even wrote a song titled *Doctor Gradus ad*

---

[378] Sande, Kiran. "A Brief History of Minimalism." *FACT Magazine: Music News, New Music*. 1 Feb. 2015. Web. 03 May 2015. This article originally appeared in *The Daily Note*, the official newspaper of the Red Bull Music Academy. Quote from Reich's text *Music as a Gradual Process*.

[379] Margulis, Elizabeth Hellmuth. *On Repeat: How Music Plays the Mind*. Oxford and New York: Oxford UP, 2013. 80. Print.

Parnasum (1908), poking fun at the Eurocentric compositional cult of Czerny, Clementi, and other predecessors. Minimalism is preserved but restricted by its classification as a genre of contemporary "classical" music (i.e. it is not a "popular" music type). In the same way that gamelan is peripheralized by its designation as traditional, Minimalism is marginalized as a result of its classification as classical art music. As we have seen, Minimalism proper no longer is as accessible to audience members as it once was in the '60s, '70s, and '80s. It has become intellectualized, elite. And by nature, classical music has and will always be somewhat elite. I would argue against Fred Child's assertion on an NPR Music segment *Steve Reich: Minimalism in the Mainstream* that Minimalism is fully mainstream: Child states "sometimes, we only know a revolution [Minimalism] has succeeded when the ideals it fought for have become so mainstream that it's impossible to imagine it was ever revolutionary in the first place."[380]

In my opinion, Minimalism proper is still a subculture, it is still niche, and is still revolutionary. Statistics rank the most performed pieces at symphony halls worldwide as coming from the Classical, Baroque, or Romantic eras (i.e Common Practice music), not Minimalism — in a recently published list of the top ten most performed works, several of Beethoven's symphonies and piano concerti claimed five spots.[381] Minimalism seems to be doubly "otherized." Classical music is "otherized" as a result of its elite status. But even within classical music, Minimalism is "otherized." It straddles two worlds: it is not popular music, but is also not quite classical music. While Reich was awarded the Pulitzer Prize in 2009 for his "Double Sextet," this is not in and of itself an indication that

---

[380] Child, Fred. "Steve Reich: Minimalism in the Mainstream." NPR Music. 20 April 2009. Updated 8 February 2012. Web. 13 March 2016.
[381] "2014 in Classical Music Statistics: A Changing of the Guard." *Bachtrack*. 15 Jan. 2015. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. https://bachtrack.com/classical-music-statistics-2014.

this music is mainstream. I ask the reader: when was the last time you heard Reich played on the radio? I have not ever heard it. To same can be said of many 20th century composers such as Crumb, Carter, and Adams. This is because Minimalism proper (i.e. high Minimalism) and contemporary classical music is distant from the mind of the average consumer. To prove my point, take for instance contemporary classical composer Caroline Shaw — her composition "Partida for 8 voices" was awarded the Pulitzer Prize in 2013. Although the classical music world certainly took notice of her accomplishment, Shaw has mainly been popularized by her collaborations with Kanye West ("Say You Will" ft. Caroline Shaw), much in the same way that Brian Eno, David Bowie, Radiohead, Velvet Underground, and other popular musicians have popularized Reich.

In this way, aspects of Reich have become mainstream not because of consumer listenership to Minimalism proper, but because his contributions in the classical arena have trickled down into an eclectic variety of popular musics. Is it the case that Minimalism — an experimental, unconventional, globalized movement — is relegated to the periphery because of its distanciation from the both the popular and classical West? Is it also the case that Minimalism is peripheralized because it is considered a type of contemporary classical music, restricted to the concert hall, a space in which it is seldom programmed except on niche concerts (i.e. it is not a popular music type)? I can only imagine the reaction of the audience when listening to the premier of Young's droning 1960 composition, "Composition 1960 #7" that consists of two notes and one performance direction: B and F# should be "held for a long time." It is so minimal and so foreign — reflective of the droning *alap* section in a Hindustani raga — that the audience probably did not know what to think of it. Was it a serious work? Even though

Minimalist music is no longer as shockingly *avant-garde* as it was in the '60s, audience members are still divided in their appraisals of Minimalist works. Is it accessible or inaccessible? Is it worthy or unworthy to be performed in the concert hall or included in the curriculum? Is it so ambient that it cannot be considered spectacle? In the case of Esfahani, audience members very likely wondered: is Reich really worth a 35€ ticket and is "Piano Phase" worthy to be played in the Kölner Philharmonie?

These observed contradictions seem to be widely corroborated. On a Reddit.com discussion thread from April 2015 that posed the question "what is the most inaccessible music you've ever listened to?" the Minimalists were listed alongside the usual suspects — the Serialists like Schoenberg and noise artists like Merzbow. This is unsurprising to me. While several contributors vehemently argued that everything about Reich and the Minimalists was accessible, a contributor under the handle Writingtoss mentions that "in characterizing the discussions of Minimalist music I've had with various people, Steve Reich does become more accessible over time… but a lot of people I've talked music with just do not like it and do… not want to spend the time to develop an appreciation for his work."[382] Writingtoss goes on to declare that the reason some audiences are averse to this music is because

> It does come down the issue of time… [N]ot everyone wants to spend fifteen minutes listening to a piano riff build on itself over and over again, let alone if that fifteen minutes should be but the first part of a three-part work… I have found that convincing someone to listen to four marimbas playing the same notes but texturing them differently and varying the tempos over the course of half an hour is a hard sell. I would disagree in saying that "everything about his work is very accessible." But, then, I think we might [be] looking at different audiences. Sure,

[382] "What is the most inaccessible music that you know of?" Reddit Music. Discussion post. 20 April 2015. Web. 13 March 2015.

> Reich has acclaim and influence, but one only needs accessibility to critics and musicians to attain that. Inaccessible to whom? To everyone? I [don't know] a piece [that] has yet been written that is wholly inaccessible to all who listen.[383]

This discussion leads to answers to the questions that the following paragraphs have attempted to address: is Minimalism accessible to the general public? Is it still a vital genre? The vitality and importance of Minimalism appear to be simultaneously questioned and accepted. Gann describes this through yet another interesting contradiction: "[m]inimalism is dead as a doornail, of course, and Minimalism is also thriving splendidly, thank you."[384] But the title of his essay implies the departure from the Minimal aesthetic — "A Forest from the Seeds of Minimalism: An Essay on Postminimal and Totalist Music." Have we in the West departed fully from Minimalism, sprouting new musical forests from its seeds? Yes and no. As Diana Blom proposes in the title of a 1999 paper, "Minimalism isn't dead… it just smells funny."[385] It has been retooled, repackaged, re-mastered. The fact that, within only a year's time, Emory hosted Philip Glass and its symphony orchestra performed Henryk Górecki's *Symphony No. 3* indicate that both aesthetic and holy Minimalism still have a place in the academy. But as Tom Service notes, "the impulse for any composer who uses Minimalism as a style today – whether you're Thom Yorke or Nico Muhly – is the diametrical opposite of what Reich and Riley were up to half a century ago. Stylistic free-for-all has replaced forensic,

---

[383] "What is the most inaccessible music that you know of?" *Reddit Music*. Discussion Post. 20 April 2015. Web. 13 March 2015.

[384] Gann, Kyle. "Forest from the Seeds of Minimalism: An Essay on Postminimal and Totalist Music." *Music After Minimalism*. 1998. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Written for the program of a 1998 Minimalism Festival of the Berliner Gesellschaft fur Neue Musik.

[385] Blom, Diana. "Minimalism isn't dead: it just smells funny: phases in the Australian experience of Minimal Music." Paper presented at "Minimalism — Architecture, Art, Performance," a conference presented by Artspace and the University of Technology Faculty of Design architecture and Building, Saturday 3 July, 1999. Web. 10 March 2015.

monomaniacal obsession."[386] Composers have the world's music at their feet, and Minimalism represents "one option among hundreds for composers to choose from,"[387] resulting in its dilution. Yet while the genre of Minimalism proper may have piqued and waned in popularity, the idea of Minimalism still persists and is fresh on the minds of American and international composers of modern Western music.

Just as Impressionism laid the groundwork for Neoclassicism and Minimalism, genres such as Electronica, Dub, House, Psychedelic Rock and even Punk likely would not exist were it not for Minimalism. The musical vocabulary of the Minimalists has been consumed and internalized by subsequent generations. But as a type of classical music, Minimalism has failed to reach as many people as the music of famous ambient music composer Brian Eno. As Jason Ankeny observes, Eno "forever altered the ways in which music is approached, composed, performed, and perceived, and everything from punk to techno to new age bears his unmistakable influence,"[388] but Eno himself noted in a 1985 interview that "It's Gonna Rain" by Reich was singularly "the most important piece that I heard, in that it gave me an idea I've never ceased being fascinated with – how variety can be generated by very, very simple systems."[389] Interestingly, Eno stresses the difference between himself and Reich, stating:

> in Reich's world there was no real feedback… As a listener who grew up listening to pop music I am interested in results. Pop is totally results-oriented and there is a very strong feedback loop. Did it work? No. We'll do it differently then. Did it sell? No. We'll do it differently then. So I wanted to bring the two sides together. I liked the

---

[386] Service, Tom. "Minimalism at 50: How Less Became More." Review. The Guardian: Classical Music. 24 Nov. 2011. Web. 3 May 2015.
[387] Ibid.
[388] Bogdanov, Vladimir, Chris Woodstra, and Stephen Thomas. Erlewine. *All Music Guide: The Definitive Guide to Popular Music*. San Francisco: Backbeat /All Media Guide, 2001. 138. Print.
[389] Tamm, Eric. *Brian Eno: His Music and the Vertical Color of Sound*. Boston: Faber and Faber, 1989. 23. Print.

> processes and systems in the experimental world and the attitude to effect that there was in the pop, I wanted the ideas to be seductive but also the results[390]

Eno, among many other modern composers, have rebranded Minimalism as "popular" (*Reich-lite*), tweaked it to include more palatable popular harmonies, and resold it with major success. While Eno, David Bowie, Thom Yorke, Hans Zimmer, and other popular artists are undoubtedly very familiar with Reich, Glass, Riley, and other Minimalists, I'm not entirely convinced that their audiences are as well versed in Minimalism.

In my opinion, both Minimalism (as the quasi-"other") and gamelan (as the authentic "other") have both been "otherized." This status has been protective and restrictive. They both appeal to curious listeners and popular composers because they are different, exotic, novel. I make this argument to assert that both gamelan and Minimalism, while perhaps seen as "peripheral," have actually served central roles in the establishment of Western modernism and postmodernism. Considering recent trends that reflect the importance that Minimalism has had on the construction of the Western musical "self," it is my argument that "world Minimalism" is the direction of the future of music that valorizes hybridity with these "others." In this way, the "other" becomes "self" overtime through appropriation and gradual assimilation. I argue that it is in the perceived simplicity and hybridity of Minimalism that modern music found new life and inspired a new generation of artists that would transform the musical landscape into what it is today. Conductor Michael Tilson-Thomas best sums up its legacy: "while most other contemporary music is at best admired, Reich has given us back its elemental joy."[391]

---

[390] Bemis, Alec Hanley. "Brian Eno has beef with Steve Reich, enjoys musical seduction." *Arcade: Literature, the Humanities and the World*. Stanford University. 22 Jan 2010. Web. 12 Feb 2016.
[391] Guttmann, Peter. "Steve Reich: Reinventing American Classical Music." *Goldmine Magazine.* Classical Notes. 2004. Web. 13 March 2016.

It is clear that Reich's music has been integral to the establishment of Western postmodernism, and it is also clear that globalized soundscapes have infused his compositional style. His popularity has marketed Minimalism and world music to the masses. Overall, I have demarcated the macro-relationships (i.e. movement level) between Minimalism and world music in previous paragraphs, but will now discuss the micro-relationships between gamelan and Minimalism by looking at formal elements in particular pieces. I asked the question: what structural and sonic elements did Minimalists take away from their interactions with the gamelan and world music? In a conversation with Minimalist scholar and ethnomusicologist Jeremy Grimshaw at BYU with whom I performed in a *gamelan selonding* ensemble in Bali, he mentioned that gamelan had

> The most direct influence [on] Steve Reich… I really hear a lot of gamelan influence in how his overlapping canonical figures line up. Also, some of the canonical figures themselves sound to me a bit like a *polos* [onbeat] or *sangsih* [offbeat] parts played by itself. I hear something of the same thing in the *Sunday Morning Interlude* from Britten's Peter Grimes, which was influenced by Britten's time with Colin McPhee. Beyond that, and speaking more generally, we could probably speculate that the generation of the Minimalists is really the first generation of American composers who went through music schools with ethnomusicology in the curriculum — so all of them likely had exposure to gamelan in that context, at least to some extent. La Monte Young actually pursued a degree in ethno for a while. Another speculation I might make is that there's a certain similarity between the Minimalists' desire to eschew modulatory harmonic progression in favor of modal stasis, and gamelan's modal stability.[392]

Rhythm seems to play a more important role in modern music, a takeaway from interactions with the "other." Reich himself admits the influence the gamelan and the West African Ewe tradition have had on his style:

[392] Grimshaw, Jeremy. "Gamelan and minimalism." Message to the author. 25 Jan. 2016. E-mail.

> When I was a kid, I was a drummer. At the end of my studies, I realized, however, that I wanted to keep my drumming part of what I was doing. I asked myself: In what tradition is percussion the dominant voice of the orchestra? And the answer was West Africa and Indonesia. So from 1970 through 1974, I proceeded to study both of those musics – I traveled to Ghana in 1970 and then later studied Balinese gamelan music in Seattle and Berkeley. What really interested me about this music was that it was put together in different ways from how western music is generally constructed, so that several repeating patterns are superimposed; it was the rhythmic structure that interested me.[393]

To best answer these questions, we must analyze one of Reich's pieces to understand how gamelan rhythms and techniques have influenced his style. "Electric Counterpoint" was written for American composer and jazz guitarist Pat Metheny who debuted the work in 1987. This piece prominently features looping, requiring a pre-recorded multi-tracked loop tape of two electric bases and seven guitars over which Metheny performed on an amplified live guitar. According to Reich, the use of "overdubbing" as a compositional technique represents the idea of "writing basically unison canons… [with] the same timbre playing against itself, so that when they intertwine, you don't hear the individual voice; you hear the composite." [394] This piece was released on the same album as "Different Trains," a piece premiered by the Kronos quartet. A characteristic example of the Minimalist cannon, "Electric Counterpoint" features three movements organized in a fast-slow-fast arrangement. It includes diatonic harmonies, slow rhythms, motivic and figural repetition, layering, and, considering that the piece solely requires prerecorded electric guitars and electric basses accompanied by

---

[393] "Steve Reich: Contemporary Music Edition (2013)." BBVA Foundation Frontiers of Knowledge Awards. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Also found on Steve Reich's website, Interview with J. Cott.
[394] Huizenga, Tom. "Steve Reich Wins Music Pulitzer." *National Public Radio: Music*. 20 Apr. 2009. Web. 13 March 2016.

a live electric guitar, features little variation in instrumentation. Aspects of held notes (droning), ostinato, augmentation, diminution, polyrhythm, note subtraction and addition on a repeated melody, and static harmony with gradual metamorphosis can also be observed within this piece, all takeaways from interactions with the ‘other’ (gamelan).

At 140 bars in length and featuring a constant quarter note = 192 pulse, Movt. III “Fast” lasts approximately 4.5 minutes. This movement starts at rehearsal marking 70 within the larger piece. The movement can be divided into an A (mm. 1 – 73) and a B (mm. 74 – 113) section with a Coda (mm. 114 – 140). Sections A and B are further divided into four subsections. These sections are similar yet distinct in texture and are differentiated mainly by a shotgun modulation in mm. 74. The texture thins immensely in the coda with only Guitars 1, 2, 3, 4 and the Live Guitar featured, however, approximately mirrors the texture of Section A. The piece is tonally ambiguous and can best be described as fitting within the mode of E Aeolian. Although harmonies at the beginning of the piece suggest E minor, the alternation between C minor and E minor in Section B (C minor-E minor-C minor-E minor) create harmonic opacity (for example, at the transition between mm. 89 and 90). Furthermore, the chord progressions employed in section A, best described as “static harmony” in which one chord is morphed gradually into another by single-note alterations, are C-D-Em, C-Bm-E5, and C-D-Bm, which further assert this piece’s atypical, modal tonality. The note E is featured prominently within the bass guitar parts; furthermore, the piece ends on a sustained E5 chord and the tonic-dominant relationship between the E and the B support the conclusion that the tonal center of the movement is E and that the movement is generally asserting E Aeolian (E minor) sonorities.

The melody of the piece comprises a one-measure-long motif that is developed through syncopated ostinato throughout the entire piece. Following the entrance of Guitar 1 at the outset of the piece with this melody, the Live Guitar, Guitar 2, Guitar 3, and Guitar 4 parts enter canonically in that order creating an intricate, interweaving rhythmic counterpoint as the title of the piece suggests ("syncopated eighth note motif"). Guitar 4 doubles the Live Guitar at rehearsal marking 73, while Guitar 5, 6, and 7 enter much later and echo the rhythmic motives introduced by the Live Guitar. Dramatically, the Live Guitar introduces block chords at rehearsal marking 78 that differ sharply from the eighth note motives at the beginning of the piece and cut through the ensemble. Guitar 5, 6, and 7 enter sequentially at rehearsal marking 79 to create an interesting sonic dimensionality of intersecting block chords ("sustained motif"). Also of importance to note is the manner in which Reich introduced motives. At the beginning of the piece, the Live Guitar enters with a three-note motive in mm. 2 that is repeated over two measures. Three notes are added to this original motive in mm. 5 and 6. Finally, in mm. 7 and 8, the motive reaches maturity, consisting of 9 notes. Later, at rehearsal marking 80, the Live Guitar, after having passed its melody off to Guitar 4, strums one block chord over two measures. By measure 53, however, this part matures, consisting of three majestic block chords strummed over the same interval and interwoven with offset block chords in other guitar parts. The technique of note addition is used effectively to introduce and accentuate the main motif and its figural counterpoint. This block chord technique can be construed as a quasi-augmentation of the melody, exposing its simplified chordal underpinnings. Additionally, the Lead Guitar performs an amalgam of melodic fragments gleaned from other parts that can best be described as "resultant melody." As demonstrated through

these observations, the Live Guitar plays an important role in introducing new motivic elements that are then echoed in other parts. Lastly, motives are often displaced within the parts where they appear. Guitar 2 enters at rehearsal marking 71 with the same rhythmic motive as Guitar 1 except that it is displaced by a quarter note. Similarly, Bass Guitar 1 and Bass Guitar 2 enter at rehearsal marking 75 with identical rhythmic motives, displaced from each other by a half note ("bass syncopated eighth note motif"). This rhythmic displacement adds to the frenetic, stereo effect feel of the piece developed through these interwoven rhythmically contrapuntal lines. In summary, three specific motives create intricately related layers within this piece: 1) the "syncopated eighth note motif" presented by Guitar 1, 2, 3, and 4 and the Live Guitar sequentially, 2) the "bass syncopated eighth note motif" presented by the Bass Guitars, and 3) the "sustained motif" that is initiated by the Live Guitar and echoed with modification by Guitars 4, 5, and 6. These three layers are presented together until mm. 113 after which only layer 1, the "syncopated eighth note motif" played Guitars 1, 2, 3, 4 and the Live Guitar, persists until the end of the piece.

The piece mainly features constant dynamics for the looped instruments Guitar 1, 2, 3, and 4 and Bass Guitars throughout, however, the live guitar part features cues such as "fade out" (mm. 40) and dynamic markings such as diminuendos and crescendos that have the major responsibility of breaking the cycle of dynamic consistency within the piece. This is not the rule, however, as Guitar 4, 5 and 6 are instructed to "fade out" over the course of mm. 68 – 73, and the bass guitars are given the dynamic cue of *sub. ff* in mm. 78, among several other exceptions. The *sub. ff* cue for Basses can be described as "rhythmic displacement" in which one note is accented more loudly within repetitions of

a particular motive to create aural variance. Instructions to “fade out” are written directly preceding transitions between sections. Furthermore, meter shifts are important in emphasizing counterpoint, specifically at transitions between sections or subsections — in particular, although the texture remains the same, the counterpoint and polymeter are amplified by the 3/2 against 12/8 meters when these occur simultaneously. The piece begins in 3/2 and features 3/2 against 12/8 beginning at rehearsal marking 91. Since the guitars are playing in triple time in section B, a 4-beat feel is imbued. Although these meters fit together without requiring bar line displacement as they are both divisible into 12 eight notes, these meter shifts still generate audible tension between the counterpoint of Guitars 5, 6 and 7 and the Bass Guitars until these parts exit from the texture at mm. 106. In the coda, the melody metamorphoses slightly within the remaining looped parts and Live Guitar at rehearsal marking 111 (mm. 134) to create aural contrast but also to premeditate the encroaching conclusion of the work.

How does this relate structurally and sonically to gamelan? As mentioned previously, gamelan means “to hit,” and is an ensemble of percussive instruments. And as Reich stated, percussion is essential to his musical style and to most Minimalists for that matter. I speculate that Reich chose the guitar for its resonance and percussive nature (plucking), inherent to gamelan sound. *Electric Counterpoint* features three movements organized in a fast-slow-fast arrangement, a tempo variation scheme archetypical of gamelan repertoire (fast – slow – fast alternation) as cued by the *kendhang* player. Even the very definition of Minimalist music is gamelan-like: according to Rodda, “‘Minimalist’ music is based upon the repetition of slowly changing common chords in steady rhythms, often overlaid with a lyrical melody in long, arching phrases...[It] utilizes

repetitive melodic patterns, consonant harmonies, and motoric rhythms."[395] Gamelan is static, modal yet tonal, and melodic, all adjectives that accurately describe this piece. And gamelan is inherently melodic — even the *pesindhèn* (female singers) do not harmonize when they are singing. Furthermore, considering that the piece solely requires prerecorded electric guitars and electric basses accompanied by a live electric guitar, *Electric Counterpoint* features little variation in instrumentation, and the simultaneous variation of the melodic line produces a heterophonic texture. Since the gamelan is mostly comprised of metallophones and gongs, it also features little variation in instrumentation and can also be described as heterophonic in the way that the elaborating instruments abstract the melodic line (additive rhythms put melodic lines slightly off-kilter). The entering riff of *Electric Counterpoint* sounds like the *buka* (opening), a riff usually played on the *bonang* to initiate most pieces on the Central Javanese Gamelan. Reich uses this riff to establish the base melody of the piece (fragment, similar to a *gatra* or formal unit in gamelan), a melody that cycles until the end of the piece, slightly changed via addition of pitches and transformations of rhythms. In fact, all Minimalist pieces are characterized by repeating cycles that often vary intermittently in speed and volume, a takeaway from gamelan and West African musics. But these cycles don't just get louder and softer, faster and slower. They get denser. This exposes one of the most interesting parallels between this piece and gamelan *karawitan*. With each *irama* change, structural instruments (*balungan* melody) become sparser and elaborating instruments come to the fore creating a denser texture. This can be seen until mm. 103: more and more instruments enter the texture, resulting in melodic obscuration. Unlike gamelan,

[395] Rodda, Richard E. (1999). Liner notes, Violin Concertos of John Adams & Philip Glass, Robert McDuffie (violin). Telarc, CD-80494.

however, bass instruments (*colotomic* structure) enter this piece after the elaborating instruments have played for quite a while (until mm. 75). Regardless, it creates a structure that is strikingly similar to gamelan: instruments function as either elaborating instruments (Guitars 1, 2, 3, 4, and Bass Guitars 1 and 2) or the *colotomic* instruments (Guitar 5, 6, 7) — the Live Guitar varies its roles between these two.

But where is the *balungan*, the central melody? This is another aspect about this piece that is very Indonesian, particularly Javanese: the idea of "hidden melody," described by Sumarsam as "inner melody," the idea that "no instrument is solely responsible for the melodic motion… it is the individual musicians' conception of melody… that is sung by musicians in their hearts [*rasakno suradaning lagu* — to "feel for the soul of the melody"]."[396] In *Electric Counterpoint*, the melody is hidden within the elaborating instruments. At least according to the accentuation patterns (1 – 1 – 2; three eighth note groupings), it seems that the melody is only three notes long, structurally defining the pattern of embellishment of the piece yet never explicitly revealed.[397]

Aspects of held notes (droning) assert the tonic and likely imitate prolonged gong vibrations, and looping alludes to the cyclical *colotomic* structures found within gamelan repertoire. Furthermore, canon-like repetition of motivic elements in *Electric Counterpoint* mirror the intricate imitative counterpoint of the Balinese and Javanese Gamelan as the syncopation and interlocking rhythms allude to *kotekan* or *imbal-*

[396] Sumarsam. "Inner Melody in Javanese Gamelan Music." *Asian Music* 7.1 (1975): 7. Web. 13 March 2016.

[397] If the reader is interested in learning more about this topic, consult Sumarsam's 1975 article "Inner Melody in Javanese Gamelan Music" or search for videos or audio clips of the gadhon chamber music of Central Java that predominantly operates according to this concept of "hidden melody." One should consult Diamond and Suraji's 1989 text for more information about the interaction of *balungan* and elaborating parts with *irama*.

imbalan, the complex pattern of interlocking in *karawitan*. On-beat (*polos*) and off-beat (*sangsih*) interlocking patterns sonically seem distinctly Indonesian. While it certainly is not a replication of gamelan on Western instruments, influences of gamelan are clearly visible in *Electric Counterpoint* and in many other examples of Minimalism. For instance, the marimbas and xylophones in *Music for a Large Ensemble* (1978), a piece which had evolved from *Music for 18 Musicians* (1974 – 76) and *Music for Mallet Instruments, Voices and Organ* (1973), approximate *gambang*, *saron*, and *Bali rindik* sounds.

We must now talk for a moment about the two camps of Minimalism and their differences, similarities and influences: holy Minimalism and aesthetic Minimalism. I do this to understand why Eastern cultures and religions factor so heavily into Minimal music. It is not merely because of their aesthetics, but because of their spiritual energy. We have talked at length about aesthetic Minimalism. Reich, Glass, and Riley are largely classified as aesthetic Minimalists. Reich was fascinated with the rhythmic vocabulary of African and Indonesian musics, both musics deeply rooted in ritual. Reich has however composed music with religious source materials, and stated "[m]usic and religion seem to be intimately tied together. Every society has always had religious music. I am merely part of a long tradition that is still alive." Glass is even a devout convert to Tibetan Buddhism. However, while aesthetic Minimalist pieces might feel spiritual in nature, they don't necessarily draw inspiration from the divine beyond religious source material or general concepts — but holy Minimalists do. Several key figures in holy Minimalism are Arvo Pärt, Henryk Górecki, John Tavener, Alan Hovhaness, Sofia Gubaidulina, Hans Otte, Giya Kancheli, Jocelyn Morlock, Vladimír Godár and Pēteris Vasks. Do their

influences differ from those of aesthetic Minimalists? How has gamelan affected their sound? As Terry Teachout mentions:

> Pärt uses the word 'tintinnabulation,' a term meant to evoke the bell-like repetition of chordal tones typical of his mature style. Górecki's more conventional array of compositional techniques includes both elaborate counterpoint and the ritualistic repetition of melodic fragments and harmonic patterns. Tavener's music relies primarily on the deployment of florid, chant-derived melodies over static chordal backdrops.[398]

Certainly "bell-like repetition" sounds very much like the gamelan. At least from this observation, it appears that holy and aesthetic Minimalism are technically similar. And there is no question that holy Minimalism stemmed from aesthetic minimalism: Teachout notes that "the long road away from Schoenberg and Cage to Henryk Górecki was paved in part by the easy-on-the-ear minimalism of Philip Glass."[399] But for holy Minimalists, the divine becomes a spiritual (not just aesthetic) "other," something novel that these composers have explored within their music: for them, music serves as a means of spiritual transcendence. In this way, globalized textures are not just used aesthetically, but for their spiritual energy. It makes sense that many of their influences are Impressionist and Neoromantic composers who have interacted with gamelan (a sacred instrument) or have been heavily influenced by Debussy's 'cult of personality' and French exoticism. For example, Daniel Asia highlights these influences in an article entitled "Sacred Music: The Holy Minimalists and James Primosch":

> In their music, there is [a] clear reference to their forebears: the Stravinsky of *Symphony of Psalms* and the *Mass*; Britten, whose name is in a title of a work by Pärt, and particularly, in the case of Górecki, to plainchant. If there is one other composer around whom all of these composers

[398] Teachout, Terry. "Holy Minimalism." *Commentary*. 1 April 1995. Web. 13 March 2016.
[399] Ibid.

orbit, it is assuredly Olivier Messiaen.[400]

Britten's ballet *Prince of Pagodas* (1957) and Messiaen's *Turangalîla-Symphonie* (1948) directly use gamelan; and as I have argued in the Impressionism chapter, Stravinsky's close friendship with Debussy and his composition style that was heavily influenced by French exoticism do not exempt the gamelan entirely from influencing him secondhand.

Some holy Minimalists directly utilize gamelan to achieve spiritual transcendence. For example, Jocelyn Morlock 2004 composition "Demon Snail" is written for Balinese gamelan — as Frank J. Oteri writes, the piece "is a completely convincing internalization of centuries-old non-Western musical traditions."[401] Besides Lou Harrison and Henry Cowell, however, it is rare for Minimalists and experimental composers to directly use gamelan in their compositions, especially in recent years. In a conversation with Jeremy Grimshaw, I asked him if he felt the gamelan continued to serve as a source of influence for Minimalists' compositional style, sound, and aesthetic. He stated:

> I don't know that any prominent Minimalist composers are currently very engaged with gamelan in a serious way. However, there are confluences. For example, the beating of paired tuning in gamelan bears a certain acoustical resemblance to the kinds of acoustical beating found in the Dream House sound installations of La Monte Young, as well as to some of the very small intervals in the tuning Young uses for the "Well-Tuned Piano."[402]

In other words, some aspects of the gamelan and other world musics have, as Oteri explicitly mentions and Grimshaw alludes to, become internalized into our musical vernacular, a convergence of "self" and "other." While it might not be in vogue to use the

[400] Asia, Daniel. "Sacred Music: the Holy Minimalists and James Primosch." Web blog post. *The Huffington Post* — Arts and Culture, 2015. Web. 12 March 2016.
[401] Oteri, Frank J. "Jocelyn Morlock." *Music on Main.* July 2013. Web. 13 March 2016.
[402] Grimshaw, Jeremy. "Gamelan and minimalism." Message to the author. 25 Jan. 2016. E-mail.

gamelan within compositions or even to cite it as an influence among Minimalist composers, its influence is undeniable as shown through theoretical and historical analyses.

In the following section, I will present ethnographic concert reviews of Philip Glass' performance at Emory in Fall of 2013 and the performance of Henryk Górecki's *Symphony no. 3* (which has sold over one million CDs since it was released in 1977) for the purpose of showcasing Minimalism's persisting relevance in the academy and its different flavors. I also cite these performances to demonstrate that Reich is not alone in his use of Minimal techniques, and that high Minimalism — holy and aesthetic Minimalism — utilize the same globalized techniques to achieve different objectives: spiritual transcendence or for aesthetic reasons. Gamelan, as a spiritual instrument, has served as a direct and indirect influence on Minimalists, endowing their music with beauty and/or intrinsic meaning. Although Riley is credited as the first Minimalist, Reich is the most popular and in a way, Minimalism — although it continues to evolve — continue to follow in the footsteps of Reich. Since Reich has been so heavily influenced by gamelan, it is understandable that both holy and aesthetic Minimalists writing in the '60s up to the present have also been (consciously and unconsciously) influenced by this musiculture. After having exhaustively outlined the influences of the gamelan on Reich's *Electric Counterpoint*, I leave it to the reader to extrapolate these findings to Glass' and Górecki's pieces.

Philip Glass, an aesthetic Minimalist and graduate of the University of Chicago

and Juilliard, began the September 27th, 2013 program at Emory[403] with a solo piano piece entitled "Mad Rush." This piece lasted approximately 15 minutes and presented rhythmic and harmonic repetition as well as syncopated rhythms. Beautiful in its simplicity (at least on a superficial level), it was, like most of Glass's music, deceivingly complex. This piece provides an excellent opportunity to discuss Glass' style and aesthetic Minimalism generally. It featured drastic dynamic contrasts (abrupt transitions from the dynamic level of piano to forte with no gradual decrescendo). Additionally, the frequency of motivic repetition and the recurrence of familiar chord progressions invoke a sense of timelessness, continuity and cyclicality, almost meditative in quality. Glass varied the time signatures and tempi of the accompaniment in contrast with the static, ostinato bass line melody comparable to that of a passacaglia (a set of continued variations with a repeated bass line). This resulted in an interesting interplay between the bass line melody and the accompaniment in the treble voice.

It is clear to me why Glass's music is often associated with Minimalism (or "music of repetitive structures") as a result of its simple structure, repetitive melody and heterophonic texture. As in "Mad Rush," Glass's pieces typically start with a repeated arpeggiated musical theme followed abruptly by a variation in dynamics, mood, and texture. Transitions from the major mode to the minor mode affect the mood of the piece, while alterations in the musical texture can be made by employing denser, fuller chords that differ from simpler voiced progressions. After each variation the theme is recapitulated — this theme-variation alternation continues until the conclusion of the piece. It is clear in "Mad Rush" that the 'rush' Glass investigates manifests itself in the

---

[403] Glass, Philip. Emory University Schwartz Center for Performing Arts, Atlanta. 27 September 2013. Performance. See concert program for historical information about Glass and Tim Fain (violinist), the pieces they performed, etc.

abrupt, fervorous section that features rhythmic and dynamic crescendo interspersed between recapitulations of the theme.

The next piece in the program was “Chaconne from Partita for Solo Violin in Seven Movements,” featuring Tim Fain on solo violin. Tim Fain, a graduate of Juilliard and the Curtis Institute of Music, virtuosically performed this piece, and his wide range of emotional expressiveness was not only evident through his musical prowess, but also through his physical demeanor, which varied dramatically at each musical transition of tempo or dynamics, etc. Next, Philip Glass accompanied Tim Fain in *Music from the Screens*, including movements entitled “France,” “The Orchard,” and “The French Lieutenant.” Glass collaborated with Mandingo Griot Foday Muso Suso in composing this set of pieces that were written in 1989 specifically for a production of Jean Genet’s The Screens (1966) at the Guthrie Theater in Minneapolis, Minnesota, directed by JoAnn Akalaitis. Each movement complements each other nicely in this arrangement; this suite invokes a sense of nostalgia as a result of its simple, more conservative contrapuntal texture, its slow harmonic rhythm, and its intimacy when arranged for chamber ensemble. The titles of the works also allude to Glass’ affinity for the compositional styles of composers like Debussy and Ravel who founded French Impressionism. Furthermore, Glass studied with Nadia Boulanger for many years in France, perhaps another parallel.

Glass then performed on solo piano in “Wichita Vortex Sutra,” accompanying a 1988 recording of the voice of famed American poet Allen Ginsberg. After a brief interlude, Ginsberg begins with “I’m an old man now, and a lonesome man in Kansas…” Ginsberg’s poem is a prime example of Beat generation poetry, and its interaction with Glass’s accompaniment is haunting and beautiful — Ginsberg died in 1997, and this fact

makes this performance more poignant and transcendent. The Minimalists often interacted with artists in other media and experimented with mixed media compositions, representing the broader 'Minimal aesthetic' that broke free of the confines of any "allegiance to [any one] musical ideology." This is perhaps why Glass' works appear in the cinema, in the concert hall, on stage, and across a wide variety of artistic disciplines. This cross-disciplinary approach might also have its ideological roots in the Indonesian (and African) notion that all arts are inherently connected, not separate.

Lastly, Fain took the stage to perform "Pendulum" with accompaniment provided by Glass, a bombastic ending to the evening's concert (perhaps an allusion to Reich's *Pendulum Music* (1978)?). This piece was my favorite of those performed this evening, and was performed meticulously by Fain, whose paramount interpretation was delicately passionate at times during legato phrases, and appropriately austere as required during staccato phrases. The audience reacted to this final piece with a standing ovation, requiring Fain and Glass to return several times to the stage to receive their applause. The Emerson Concert Hall was completely sold out, with neither the Mezzanine nor the Orchestra levels having unfilled seats.

At a "Creativity Conversation" held with Glass on Wednesday, September 25th, 2013, at 2:30pm in the Emerson Concert Hall, Glass stated that he had been a pupil of Ravi Shankar, and had assisted him in transcribing Sitar ragas into Western notation. I cannot help but think that this experience greatly impacted Glass's style: many parallels exist between Hindustani classical music and Glass's style in regard to his use of repetition and heterophony.[404]

---

[404] Prior, Richard, and Philip Glass. "Creativity Conversation" at Emory University's Schwartz Center for Performing Arts. 25 September 2013. Discussing Glass' inspiration and compositions.

To gain a deeper understanding of holy Minimalism, I attended a performance of Henryk Górecki's 1976 *Symphony No. 3*, op. 36 "Symfonia pieśni żałosnych" (Trans. "Symphony of Sorrowful Songs") in the Emerson Concert Hall at the Schwartz Center for Performing Arts at Emory University on Thursday, March 6th, 2014.[405] The one-hundred member Emory University Symphony Orchestra (EUSO), comprised mostly of Emory University students with several alumni, faculty, staff, and community members, performed this profoundly moving piece under the direction of Richard Prior. This piece was written for solo soprano and orchestra, and featured appropriated lyrical excerpts from Polish ecclesiastic and folk poetry, indicative of the composer's Polish nationalistic sentiments and firm Catholic religious convictions. In addition, the ingenious staging and artful lighting design employed during this performance created an ethereal framework that successfully collaboration with the music to communicate the emotional and transcendent nature of this piece. The rousing multi-faith prayer vigil that preceded this performance established a mood of solemnity more likely to be found in a sanctuary than in a concert hall; this reverential atmosphere transfixed itself to the actual performance, imbuing it with spiritual meaning, and further assisted in outlining the religious significance of this piece. But, in essence, this feeling of solemnity was always present in the work: Górecki considers himself a holy Minimalist, composing Minimal music that strives for the divine. This striving was obvious from the first downbeat.

This performance showcased the talent of the widely acclaimed Russian-American soprano Yulia Van Doren, a 2014 Donna and Marvin Schwartz "Artist In Residence" at Emory University, a recipient of the prestigious Soros Fellowship for New

---

[405] Gorecki's *Symphony no.3* ("Symphony of Sorrowful Songs"). Cond. Richard Prior. Emory University Schwartz Center for Performing Arts, Atlanta. 6 Mar. 2014. Performance. See concert program for historical information about Górecki, the movements, etc.

Americans and a Naxos recording artist (BM, New England Conservatory; MM, Bard College). Prior, who currently occupies the Edward Goodwin Scruggs Conducting Chair at Emory University and serves as the Director of Orchestral Studies within the Emory University Music Department, discussed the thematic inspiration for this piece with Van Doren during a Creativity Conversation held at 11:00am in the Schwartz Center on Wednesday, March 5th. After citing the religious significance of this piece, Prior stated "the powerful and universal themes of motherhood and separation from a child in times of war and conflict dominate the work as it weaves an exquisite musical tapestry that simply cannot be missed where there is an opportunity for live performance."[406] In addition, Van Doren described her impressions of this work, addressing its soteriological and religious undertones and the emotions she hoped to convey through her performance. Her impassioned performance certainly did justice to this piece: Van Doren's deep, sonorous voice endowed with a rich vibrato exquisitely conveyed the mournful lyrics featured in Górecki's composition.[407]

Directly preceding this performance, a reception entitled "A Vigil of Compassion and Recollection" was held in the second floor lobby of the Schwartz Center to reflect on violence and oppressive totalitarian politics that were affecting the Ukrainian people at the time. It featured a discussion with Olha and Viktoriya Seredyuk, daughters of the Ukrainian Consul and undergraduates at Emory, who provided their perspectives on the recent uprisings in Ukraine. Referencing the Ukrainian conflict, Prior mentioned that "the texts sung by the soloist [in Górecki's symphony] are… on the themes of survival under

---

[406] Prior, Richard and Yulia Van Doren. "Creativity Conversation" at Emory University's Schwartz Center for Performing Arts. 5 March 2014. Discussing Górecki's *Symphony no. 3* and its relation to political violence in Ukraine.
[407] Ibid.

oppression [and] loss through conflict, making it the perfect work of art to truly speak to a moment in history as it unfolds around us."[408] Prior's thematic juxtaposition between the Ukrainian uprising and the nature of Górecki's piece further espoused the reverent atmosphere that surrounded this performance. Five individuals of different faiths concluded the vigil by presenting sung or spoken prayers from their respective religions. Christianity, Tibetan Buddhism, Judaism, Hinduism and Islam were represented. While this information seems tangential, I will be discussing the differences between aesthetic and holy Minimalists in a subsequent paragraph and wanted the reader to be aware of the sanctified frame of this performance that goes beyond Górecki's piece itself. I wish the reader to consider the following questions: why was Górecki's piece programmed on a concert that aimed to reflect on (and protest, perhaps) global violence? Why does Minimalist music, aesthetic or holy, seem otherworldly, fitting for expressions of religiosity? I believe it is because of its interactions with and influences from the sacred "other."

The symphony was comprised of three movements: Lento; Sostenuto tranquilo ma cantabile which lasted approximately 25 minutes; Lento e Largo; Tranquillissimo which lasted approximately 10 minutes, and Lento; Cantabile-semplice which lasted approximately 15 minutes. Overall, the entire performance lasted just under one hour without an intermission. In reference to the title of the piece ("Symphony of Sorrowful Songs"), the lyrics of each movement present sorrowful lamentations that conveyed emotions of mourning and anguish. The lyrics of the first movement (Lento; Sostenuto tranquilo ma cantabile) were appropriated from a 15th century Roman Catholic folio of

---

[408] Prior, Richard. "A Vigil of Compassion and Recollection" at Emory University's Schwartz Center for Performing Arts. 6 March 2014. Discussing Górecki's *Symphony no. 3* and its relation to political violence in Ukraine.

poems compiled by the Holy Cross Monastery entitled "Lysagóra Songs." This lamentation was written from the point of view of Mary, the mother of Christ, during her final discussion with her dying son, Jesus, as he is crucified. The first movement began with a melancholic ostinato theme performed as a canon by the double basses. Slowly, the other instruments of the orchestra entered and echoed this theme, building in intensity. After an extended rhythmic and dynamic crescendo that lasted approximately 10 minutes, the soprano entered to lead the orchestra to a point of climax. The ostinato featured in this movement consisted of a simple three-note refrain that, after being echoed and embellished by every section of the orchestra and the soprano, ultimately faded to silence. One cannot help but affix religious significance to this simple theme: perhaps the three note refrain within the context of this three movement symphony presents an allusion to the Holy Trinity, consisting of the Holy Sprit, God (the father), and Jesus (the son).

The poetic lyrics for the second movement (Lento e Largo; Tranquillissimo) were written by Helena Wanda Blazusiakówna, an 18-year-old imprisoned by the Gestapo in 1944. These words, written as a poem and prayer to Mary, were found inscribed on the wall of a prison cell in the "Palace," a Gestapo outpost in Zakopane. This short, four-line prayer ended with the words "Zdrowas Mario" (Translated as "Ave Maria"), the opening line to a well-known Catholic supplication appealing to the mercy of Mary. The musical theme from the first movement reappeared within this movement, however, the ostinato theme was varied, sometimes punctuated by periods of prolonged tremolo amongst the strings. The lush yet somewhat chaotic ostinati within the strings conjured the notion of Penderecki's *Threnody for the Victims of Hiroshima*; perhaps Górecki desired to achieve

a similar effect. The overlapping ostinati created an endless shield of sound, developing a sense of serene wholesomeness that could reference the feeling of spiritual fulfillment achieved by placing one's faith in a divinity; yet the cacophonous and seemingly uncoordinated entrances of the strings articulating these ostinati might also indicate a simultaneous sense of hopelessness or bereavement. Due to the shortness of this poem, the soprano repeated the lyrics of this song several times with each successive repetition sung softer (and more poignantly) than the last. After the soprano finished her lament, the orchestra performed a brief postlude and faded to silence just as in the first movement.

Finally, the lyrics for movement three (Lento; Cantabile-semplice) were taken from a popular Polish folk song from the Opole region. This folk song was written from the perspective of a grieving mother whose son had died—the mother laments her son's death and prays for his salvation in Christ (soteriological characteristic). This movement featured exposed piano and harp melodies that were echoed and developed by the orchestra. While movements one and two were solidly composed in minor modes, Górecki instituted a striking modulation from the minor mode to the major mode within movement three that ultimately created a satisfying sense of finality and resolution to this movement and to the symphony as a whole. This musical innuendo could be interpreted as a direct reference to the spiritual transcendence and enlightenment achieved through salvation, an allusion to the Christian interpretation of the glories of heaven.

Another remarkable aspect of this performance was its staging. The orchestra was arranged according to the typical fashion of the modern Western symphony orchestra but was situated in front of a floor-to-ceiling, sheer white drapery that concealed Emory's Wortsman Memorial Organ (Daniel Jaeckel Op. 45) from view. The orchestra began the

performance in complete darkness that was interrupted only by a solitary spotlight that dimly illuminated the soprano when she began singing. Additionally, the curtain behind the ensemble served as a projection screen upon which celestial images (i.e. an image of the moon, a star, etc.), religious symbols, and a variety of lighting patterns and colors were projected throughout the performance. This ingenious visual backdrop worked in collaboration with the music to communicate the emotional nature of each movement and further heightened my enjoyment of this performance.

The audience applauded earnestly at the conclusion of the concert and delivered a standing ovation. The 800-seat Emerson Hall at the Schwartz Center was approximately half-filled, with most patrons electing to sit in the orchestra (the lower tier). This performance delineated an interesting meeting of secular and sacred ideologies: the composition was inspired by Polish prayers and folk songs in the Roman Catholic tradition, yet was performed at an academic institution by musicians that potentially did not share the same religious or cultural convictions as the traditions that inspired it.

To summarize, these are the techniques that I consider appropriated from non-Western musical lineages, particularly the gamelan, which have come to constitute Minimalism in all of its forms regardless of its objective:

Ostinato
Static harmony
Symmetrical forms
Melody (serves a more important role than harmony)
Unusual modes (E Aeolian, pentatonicism, etc.)
Layered textures (produced by looping, stratification)
Fragmentation (short, repeated motives)
Ornamentation (interlocking rhythms)
Atypical meters
Diatonic progressions (not chromatic)
Repetition (cyclicity)
Heterophony

In conclusion, this chapter addressed the importance of the Indonesian gamelan on Minimalism by particularly focusing on the career of Steve Reich. Reich was selected because of his widespread popularity and commercial success, considered by many sources to be the most popular Minimalist composer. I analyzed Steve Reich's "Electric Counterpoint (1989)" Movt. III "Fast," devoting precise attention to both aural and visual observations supplemented by research and comprehensive contextual listening that attempted to reveal the broad influence of the gamelan on Reich's style and on modern Western music in general. For instance, this paper elucidated archetypal examples of Minimalist compositional methodologies within "Electric Counterpoint" Movt. III "Fast" that were inspired by the West African Ewe tradition and the Indonesian gamelan such as the presence of ostinato, polyrhythms, note addition, phrase displacement, layering, cyclicality (loop tracks), and melodic inversion, that outlined the significance of this academic inquiry and affirmed the importance of this piece as a canonical example of Minimalism written by one of the most prolific and acclaimed American composers within this artistic genre. I also included ethnographic concert reports of two other famous Minimalists: holy Minimalist Henryk Górecki and aesthetic Minimalist Philip Glass. I did this to demonstrate that, while Minimalism might have different functions (i.e. to facilitate spiritual transcendence or simply for aesthetics), the sonic techniques that they employ and their cited influences remain relatively the same. I articulated the ways in which musical Minimalism has contributed to the broader Minimal aesthetic, and how this aesthetic has become the current precedent. I argue that while Minimalism proper has not necessarily become entirely mainstream, contradicting previous scholarship that states that it is entirely accessible, its influences on popular musicians

have ferried its contributions to the masses and have popularized world musics. I also delimit the ways in which Minimalism proper, just like world music, is "otherized" as a classical music type as a result of its distanciation from the West.

Moreover, I make many claims in this chapter about the future of Western music, suggesting that "world Minimalism" is the direction that modern soundscapes will take. In a 1970 article entitled "Some Optimistic Predictions about the Future of Music," Steve Reich stated that "non-Western music in general and African, Indonesian, and Indian music in particular will serve as new structural models for Western musicians… [but] not as new models for sound. That's the old exoticism trip."[409] Different from the French exoticism of Debussy, I argue that "otherized" sonorities have, as a result of Minimalisms' fascination with the East, become incorporated within our conception of our modern, musical "self." This has been made possible by globalization and technological innovations, and demonstrates how gamelan is not peripheral, but central to our understanding of modern Western music. After all, Michael Tenzer's foundational book on gamelan *gong kebyar* (*Gamelan Gong Kebyar: The Art of Twentieth-Century Balinese Music*) features a forward written by Steve Reich.[410] And my friend I Putu Tangkas Adi Hiranmayena, director of the Balinese Gamelan at the Chicago Consulate's Indonesian Cultural Center and an accomplished Jazz drummer, wrote his Master's thesis on Math Rock, a genre of music that has been heavily influenced by the gamelan and Minimalism. Even many Indonesians recognize Minimalism as a byproduct of Western interactions with gamelan and world music. For example, many of Reich's pieces have

[409] Reich, Steve. "Some Optimistic Predictions about the Future of Music." *Writings on Music: 1965 – 2000.* Oxford UP: Oxford, 2002. 51. Print.
[410] Tenzer, Michael. Gamelan Gong Kebyar: The Art of Twentieth-Century Balinese Music. University of Chicago Press: Chicago, 2000. Print. Forward by Steve Reich.

been set for gamelan: Iwan Gunawan arranged a version of Reich's "Six Marimbas" for gamelan *pelog slendro*. Furthermore, Evan Ziporyn's "Lapanbelas ('18')," a homage to Reich, was commissioned and performed by one of Bali's most well-known gamelan ensembles, Semara Ratih. Furthermore, Nonesuch records, which has produced many collection of gamelan *karawitan* and world music on its Explorer series — *Bali: Music from the Morning of the World* (1966), *Bali: Gamelan Semar Pegulingan/Gamelan of the Love God* (1972), *Java: Court Gamelan* (1971), and *The Jasmine Isle: Gamelan Music* (1969) — has also produced recordings by Western contemporary classical composers such as George Crumb, Elliott Carter, William Bolcom, John Adams, Steve Reich, Kronos Quartet, Philip Glass, Louis Andriessen, Frederic Rzewski, and Henryk Górecki. Myriad connections exist between Minimalism and the East. These connections have revitalized modern classical music and have had an equally significant impact on popular genres. As Taruskin eloquently stated, Reich gave "classical music back… its youth and finally its soul in the waning years of the 20th century. It is something for which the musicians of the 21st century will remember him and be grateful."[411] Minimalism's influence is still felt today.

[411] Broyles, Michael. *Mavericks and Other Traditions in Amrcan Music*. Yale University Press: New Haven, 2004. 320. Print.

Conclusions.

"Folk music is the 'original melody' of man;
it is the 'musical mirror' of the world."

\- Nietzsche

This thesis has covered a lot of ground. In Chapter 1, it began with a conceptual discussion of how culture, context, and tradition were defined and operationalized, and illuminated the important role the gamelan has served in the establishment of the field of ethnomusicology and the popularization of the world music genre. Next, it outlined how the Western concepts of orientalism, exoticism, and the "other" have peripheralized the gamelan, preventing it from being viewed as centrally important to the establishment of Western modernism and postmodernism. Additionally, I justified the use of the term appropriation, one that has been featured prominently within this work, distinguishing it from similar yet distinct terms such as sampling and citation. As Colin McPhee stated, "The difference between a pastiche and a creative work in which foreign material has been so absorbed by the artist as to become part of his equipment is something which has never been completely recognized,"[412] necessitating its discussion in this paper. Finally, I concluded this chapter by briefly examining "ownership," a concept that goes hand-in-hand with appropriation, and arguing that at this point in history, it would be impossible to tease out the gamelan's influence (indirectly or directly) because the scope of its impact has been enormous. I asserted that gamelan has become so deeply engrained in the fabric of Western musical identity, subsumed so deeply into the musical unconscious, that it has ceased to be considered "other" and is now considered "self." Similar to this

[412] Lechner, Ethan. *Composers as Ethnographers: Differences in the Imaginations of Colin McPhee, Henry Cowell, and Lou Harrison*. PhD Dissertation, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 2008. 96. Print.

argument, I Wayan Sadra argued that "like Western modernist music, gamelan had achieved the status of a 'global culture' owned by no one in particular and open to transformation by anyone."[413] Gamelan has become part of the aural collective.

Chapter 2 explored Mantle Hood's concept of bimusicality and outlined the general methodologies that I followed to conduct this investigation, citing excerpts from my fieldwork in Bali, Indonesia, and my travels around the United States. Through performance and cultural immersion, I felt that I could better understand this subject as an active participant, more so than as a passive observer. I tackled this prompt in one of two ways: 1) through culturally-informed musical analyses, and 2) through musically-informed cultural analyses. This chapter concluded by discussing the importance of establishing an open-access archive at Emory University to preserve *karawitan*, an oral musiculture, and showcased examples of public performance that have served to inform Western audience members of the central importance of the gamelan on the development of modern Western soundscapes.

Informed by the definitions addressed in Chapter 1 and employing the methodological approach I outlined in Chapter 2, Chapter 3 discussed Balinese and Javanese sociocultural and historical context in relation to Indonesian traditional music and the performing arts. In this chapter, I discussed structures, scales, and techniques of gamelan that I considered to have been appropriated by modern Western movements. As I contended, ostinato, cyclicality, pentatonicism, interlocking polyrhythms, and other non-Western melodic and rhythmic structures have been inserted into our Western musical vernacular as a result of interactions with the Eastern "other," and this

[413] McGraw, Andrew. "The Gamelan and Indonesian Music in America." *OUP Blog*. Oxford University Press, 27 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

confluence represented an important trend: the gradual internalization of the “other” and requisite renegotiation of our musical “self” over time. I concluded the chapter with a brief discussion of gamelan in the West, particularly arguing that it is a “fringe” ensemble for the purpose of emphasizing its peripherality, and answered the following questions in the form of a survey that I disseminated to members of the Emory Gamelan Ensemble: “How do Westerners aurally contextualize gamelan sound? Why are Westerners attracted to gamelan? Who participates in gamelan ensembles located outside of Indonesia?” Overall, despite its marginalization, I claim that gamelan is an (often unrecognized) parent-culture of the modern musical West, particularly citing its effect on our notions of time, melody and rhythm.

In Chapters 4 and 5, I spoke at length about the Minimalist and Impressionist movements. While both Debussy and Reich have made major contributions to Western modernism and postmodernism, I argued that their contributions were not wholly unique. While both were innovators, the materials that they used to gain this status were fundamentally non-Western (“other”). Through in depth score analysis and ethnographic reports, I demonstrated how these movements had been molded by their interaction with the “other,” and how their relationships with contemporaries and successors established compositional precedents that would define the modern era of music making in the West. According to my findings, ethnic music influences (both conscious and unconscious) have been appropriated, assimilated, and abstracted within Western repertoire extensively, particularly within the genres Impressionism and Minimalism, movements that were built on subversion and transgression and sought “otherness” as a means of distanciation from the status quo.

Satie and Debussy went beyond the cliché, programmatic compositions of the Romantics and were the first to use "exotic musical markers in pieces with no explicit connection to exotic subject matter,"[414] revolutionizing Western composition. I discussed the importance of French nationalism and "purism" in facilitating the shift away from imitation to internalization, mentioning Said's definition of orientalism, a concept that is inherently rooted in imperialist power dynamics. "French exoticism," which both Satie and Debussy instigated, greatly affected the musical language of their successors such as Stravinsky and the Neoclassicists. I disagreed with the assertion that Debussy's encounter with the gamelan was merely a "confirmation." In my opinion, to do so downplayed the important influence the gamelan had on Debussy's style which I argued dictated his future interactions and appropriations of the "other" (i.e. his view of the exotic). In fact, Debussy's interaction with the gamelan far exceeded a mere confirmation — it served as a crucial turning point for Debussy's conception of the exotic, and ultimately defined the direction of modernism. I specifically analyzed Debussy's *Pagodes* and Erik Satie's *Gnossiennes No. 1, 2* and *3,* locating formic elements that I felt sonically or structurally resembled gamelan such as *gempyang* that I felt approximated "planing" (parallel voice leading) and pedal-points which approximated prolonged gong strikes. I also analyzed Stravinsky's *Le Sacre du Printemps* and argued that, if we distance ourselves from the long-established truth that Stravinsky appropriated Slavic folk melodies and incorporated them into his musical idiom, we realize that Stravinsky's take on exoticism is distinctly

[414] Ralph P. Locke, "Cutthroats and Casbah Dancers, Muezzins and Timeless Sands: Musical Images of the Middle East," in The Exotic in Western Music, ed. Jonathan Bellman (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998)

French. As “the father of us all,”[415] we owe the most to Debussy whose fascination with rhythm, time, tone color and texture, his novel approach to the exotic, and his unique voice leading stemmed from a “notably early fusion of Eastern and Western tonal procedures.”[416]

As this paper established, Minimalism was a revolution stemming from a yearning to remedy the “maximalist” tendencies of the Romantics and postmodern Serialists in favor of harmonic and melodic simplicity. As a variety of sources showed, Minimalism has largely drawn its inspiration from appropriated sonorities and techniques from the “ancient” and “primitive” Eastern “other,” demonstrating the central importance of gamelan and other world music styles in developing “modern” and “Western” sounds. Beyond similarities in structure, I offered several parallels between Minimalism and world music, particularly focusing on the ways that both are “otherized,” arguing that Minimalism is not as widely accepted currently among lay audiences as some scholars have asserted (i.e. it is also somewhat peripheral). Through ethnographic review, I cited a performance by Philip Glass and the Emory Symphony Orchestra’s performance of one of Henryk Górecki’s symphonies. Both were performed at Emory University’s Schwartz Center for the Performing Arts.[417] I cited these performances to counter the belief that Minimalism is dead, proving that Minimalism is (at least in the academy) alive but evolving. I also included excerpts from an interview I conducted with Minimalist scholar and university administrator Jeremy Grimshaw (Brigham Young University), and

---

[415] Noble, Jeremy. “Portrait of Debussy. Debussy and Stravinsky”. *The Musical Times.* 108.1487 (1967): 22. Web.
[416] Cooke, Mervyn. “‘The East in the West’: Evocations of the Gamelan in Western Music.” *The Exotic in Western Music. Ed.* Bellman, Jonathan. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. 259. Print.
[417] Górecki’s *No. 3* (“Symphony of Sorrowful Songs”) was performed on 6 March 2014. Glass performed on 27 September 2013. Both performances were held at the Schwartz Center for Performing Arts at Emory University in Atlanta, GA.

conducted a theoretical analysis of Steve Reich's *Electric Counterpoint* Movt. III "Fast." Through my analysis, I discovered that Reich's intention was never to directly replicate non-Western musics within his compositions, but to find structural and tonal inspiration from them, creating a "music with one's own sounds that is constructed in the light of one's knowledge of non-Western structures."[418] I argued that his approach went beyond the French exotic, beyond a desire to create musical pastiche. Much like how Sorrell described Debussy's interaction with the gamelan as a "confirmation," Reich viewed his interactions with Ewe drumming and gamelan as "confirmations" of his musical style. But describing these encounters as a mere "confirmation" of his own musical intuition is hard for me to believe, especially when he admitted that his first encounter with Ghanaian music and gamelan was years before his actual visit to Africa or Indonesia and before he had attained commercial success.[419] Furthermore, I contended that aspects of Reich have become mainstream not because of consumer listenership to Minimalism proper (as the quasi-"other"), but because his contributions in the classical arena have trickled down into an eclectic variety of popular musics. Just as Impressionism laid the groundwork for Neoclassicism and Minimalism, genres such as Electronica, Dub, House, Psychedelic Rock and even Punk likely would not exist were it not for Minimalism. Considering recent trends that reflect the importance that Minimalism has had on the construction of the Western musical "self," it is my argument that "world Minimalism" is the direction of the future of music that valorizes hybridity with the "other." In this way, the "other" becomes "self" overtime through appropriation and gradual assimilation, a marked transition from imitation to internalization. In my opinion, it is in the perceived

---

[418] Reich, Steve. *Writings about Music*. Halifax: The Press of Nova Scotia College of Arts and Design; New York: New York University, 1974. 40. Print.
[419] Ibid. 56.

simplicity and hybridity of Minimalism that modern music found new life and inspired a new generation of artists that would transform the musical landscape into what it is today.

The "interpenetration of cultures" that John Cage cites as being foundationally important to our modern musical identity supports Hall's idea of Global Postmodernism and defined modern Western hybrid soundscapes.[420] Direct homages to gamelan have been composed by Francis Poulenc, Béla Bartók, Olivier Messiaen, Benjamin Britten, Colin McPhee, Pat Metheny, Iannis Xenakis, and Steve Reich. Other composers, such as Philip Glass, Barbara Benary, Lou Harrison, Loren Nerell, Dennis Murphy, Evan Ziporyn, Michael Tenzer, Daniel James Wolf and Jody Diamond have written pieces that directly incorporate gamelan into the composition. Experimental punk, pop, and rock groups such as King Crimson, The Residents, His Name Is Alive, Mouse on Mars, Xiu Xiu, the Sun City Girls and Macha (who have performed with the Emory Gamelan Ensemble) have benefited from the appropriation of gamelan technique such as *kotekan* (interlocking) within their songs, defining new trends in popular music. "Goodbye Sober Day" (1999) by California experimental band Mr. Bungle features *kecak*. Björk's album *Biophilia*, particularly the song "Crystalline," debuts an instrument called the "gameleste," a hybrid between the gamelan and a celeste. "Gamel," a 2013 album by Japanese noise punk band OOIOO, was listed by Rolling Stone magazine as one of the "15 Great Albums You Didn't Hear in 2015."[421] Furthermore, Caitlin Curran notices that Four Tet's "Circling" from *There Is Love in You*, Plaid's "Get What You Gave" from *Spokes*, and Dan Deacon's "USA III: Rail" from *America* all "value patterns, repetition

---

[420] Schaeffer, Frank. "In the Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.
[421] "15 Great Albums You Didn't Hear in 2014." *Rolling Stone*. 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.

and stratification in a strikingly similar way,"[422] indicative of the influence of the gamelan on their music. Mike Oldfield has incorporated the gamelan in several of his albums, including "Woodhenge" (1979), "The Wind Chimes (Part II)" (1987) and "Nightshade" (2005). Furthermore, the popular science fiction series "Battlestar Gallactica" directly incorporates gamelan into its score, as well as several Hollywood blockbusters such as "Girl with A Pearl Earring" and "Golden Compass." In fact, "Merry Christmas, Mr. Lawrence" directed by Nagisa Oshima received the BAFTA Award in 1983 for Best Film Music for a score that directly included gamelan. Myriad examples exist of composers using gamelan sounds within their compositions. However, as Philip Hayward asserts, "[i]nstead of imitation, the influence of non-Western musical structures on the thinking of a Western composer is likely to produce something genuinely new."[423] Composers have looked to the gamelan for "imaginative and creative stimulus,"[424] and have internalized its sound into the Western vernacular. Caitlyn Curran notices:

> When British electronic duo Plaid played New York's Le Poisson Rouge in 2011 to support their album Scintilli, they had an unusual opener: A New York City-based, 26-member Balinese gamelan ensemble called Gamelan Dharma Swara. Seated onstage among bronze metallophones, gongs, flutes, and drums, the group used ice-pick-like mallets to create an intricate, twinkling cacophony that changed tempos frequently and fluidly, following the lead of wooden hand drums. I was initially surprised that Plaid didn't ask a rising electronic musician to kick off the show. But as they recreated the complex layers of Scintilli onstage, I found that certain rhythms and sonorities were suddenly reminding me of the gamelan music I'd just heard.[425]

---

[422] Curran, Caitlyn. "Gamelan, Electronic Music's Unexpected Indonesian Influence." *The Pitch*. 15 April 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.
[423] Hayward, Philip. *Music at the Borders: Not Drowning, Waving and their Engagement with Papua New Guinean Culture (1986 – 1996).* John Libbey Publishers: Sydney, 2000. 41. Print.
[424] Ibid.
[425] Curran, Caitlyn. "Gamelan, Electronic Music's Unexpected Indonesian Influence." *The Pitch*. 15 April 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.

I do not find this surprising. Andy Turner of Plaid stated that "we've been exposed to [gamelan] over the years from various different sources. It's very repetitive. Phrases go on and on for a considerable amount of time. Coming from a dance music background, that made sense to us."[426] Similarly, Jamie Stewart of Xiu Xiu mentioned that "conceptually, we have borrowed from [the gamelan] extensively."[427] And Evan Ziporyn of Bang on a Can and Gamelan Galak Tika states that from "Orbital records [to] Autechre, there's definitely an incredible amount of gamelan influence... whether [we're] aware or not."[428] Connections between the gamelan and the West are myriad. This is perhaps why Gamelan Semara Ratih released an album in 2012 called *Returning Minimalism*, modelled on Terry Riley's "In C" (1964), for the purpose of completing "a cycle of influence and [blurring] the boundaries between contemporary and traditional music."[429] However, I would argue that these boundaries have long been blurred as a result of the Western appropriation and internalization of the "other."

Overall, what defines modern Western soundscapes? If one applies the adage "you are what you eat" metaphorically to the concepts of music consumership and production in globalized societies, are we not just the sum of our influences? Joanna Demers defines transformative appropriation as "the act of referring to or quoting old works in order to create a new work."[430] I believe this is what has occurred with gamelan and with many world musics: we have been transformed through appropriation. As we have shown through the arguments in this paper, many of our influences come from the

[426] Ibid.
[427] Ibid.
[428] Ibid.
[429] Gamelan Semara Ratih of Bali. *Returning Minimalism: In Nem*. Anak Agung Gede Anom Putra, 2012. CD. Liner notes.
[430] Demers, Joanna. *Steal This Music: How Intellectual Property Law Affects Musical Creativity*. Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 2006. 11. Print.

"other." Instead of "confirmation" of our own unique compositional imagination, we can view the incorporation of gamelan sonorities within Western composition as confluences. The progression from modernism to postmodernism reflected the desire to depart from previous Western musical movements, highlighting an interesting trend: the gradual convergence with the "other" over time. In a culture that is "cultureless" and seeks appropriation and hybridity with the "other" to reconnect with a real or imagined tradition, we have, as Julia Wolfe stated, "[thrown] the world wide open."[431] We are a culture of appropriators, of hybridizers. While the gamelan as an instrument and Indonesian culture is still viewed as "other," its effects on Debussy (modernist, Impressionist) and Reich (postmodernist, Minimalist) who reinterpreted it through "quoting, imitating, transposing, and echoing,"[432] have become "self," affecting popular music trends. We are now citizens of the world, conscious and unconscious consumers of world music. The gamelan is in our blood.

---

[431] Scheffer, Frank. "In The Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Documentary on modern composers in New York: Julia Wolfe, Michael Gordon and David Lang who founded 'Bang on a Can,' Steve Reich, Philip Glass, Louis Andriessen, Elliott Carter, John Cage, Frank Zappa and Brian Eno.

[432] Steinberg, Leo L. "The Glorious Company." *Art About Art.* Ed. John Lipman and Rchard Marshall. E.P Dutton, New York. 1978. 25. Print.

Works Cited

Chapters 1 & 2: Relevant Terminology, Discussions, and Methodology.

Acosta, Gail. "Sounds of Schoenberg: The Balinese Gamelan Ensemble." *Daily Bruin*. UCLA, 16 Oct. 2015. Web. 17 Feb. 2016. Arts & Entertainment Section. Features interview with Tyler Yamin.

Adler, Christopher. *Cross-Cultural Hybridity in Music Composition: Southeast Asia in Three Works from America*. Unpublished, 1998. 1. Web. 13 March 2016. Taken from christopheradler.com. Ph.D. Dissertation, Duke University.

"Bachelor of Arts in Music." Emory University College of Arts and Sciences – Department of Music. 2016. Web. 12 March 2016. Found beneath the "History and Culture Category B" heading.

Barz, Gregory F., and Timothy J. Cooley. *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology*. New York: Oxford UP, 1997. Print.

Beard, David, and Kenneth Gloag. 2005. *Musicology: The Key Concepts*. New York: Routledge. Print.

Belville, Maria. "Introduction." *Otherness: Essays and Studies*. 1.1 (2010): Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Published by the Center for Studies in Otherness (UK).

Benary, Barbara. "Directory of Gamelan Groups: United States." American Gamelan Institute. Ed. Sharon Millman. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Birrell, Ian. "The Term 'World Music' Is Outdated and Offensive." *The Guardian*. Guardian News and Media, 22 Mar. 2012. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Blum, Stephen. "Commentary." *Ethnomusicology.* 34.3 (1990): 413. Web. Found within the "Response to Symposium papers" section of Ethnomusicology.

Blum, Steven and Margaret J Kartomi. *Music-cultures in Contact: Convergences and Collisions*. Basel, Switzerland: Gordon and Breach, 1994. 5, 4, v. Print.

Broughton, Simon, and Mark Ellingham. *World Music. Africa, Europe and the Middle East.* London: Rough Guide, 1999. Print.

Dahlhaus, Carl. *Nineteenth-Century Music*. Trans. by J. Bradford Robinson. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989. Print.

Diamond, Jody. "There is No They There." *Music Works*. 47 (Summer, 1990), 12-23. Web. 12 March 2016.

Eisentraut, Jochen. "An Outline Topography of Musical Accessibility: Society, Atonality, Psychology." *The Accessibility of Music: Participation, Reception and Contact*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2013. Print.

Gelling, Peter. "Is Indonesia's Native Music Fading?" *The New York Times* [New York] 27 Feb. 2008. Asia Pacific. Web. 12 March 2016.

Google Definitions: "Traditional." *Google Search*. 13 March 2016. Web. Taken from Oxford Pocket Dictionary of Current English.

Hall, Stuart. “The Question of Cultural Identity.” *Modernity: An Introduction to Modern Societies*. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1996. Print.

Hallmhuráin, Gearóid Ó. *A Pocket History of Irish Traditional Music*. Dublin: O'Brien, 1998. Print.

Harrison, Anthony. “Peace Which Passeth Understanding.” *Triad City Beat* [Greensboro]. 04 Nov. 2015. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Hefner, Claire-Marie. “Gamelan Petition.” Message to the author. 26 Dec. 2016. E-mail.

Herndon, Marcia. “Insiders, Outsiders: Knowing Our Limits, Limiting Our Knowing.” *The World of Music*. 35.1 (1993): 77. Web.

Hobsbawm, Eric and Terrence Ranger. *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1983. Print.

“In Memoriam: Mantle Hood.” UCLA Department of Ethnomusicology. 13 Sept. 2005. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

“Jaap Kunst Prize.” *Society for Ethnomusicology*. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Jeon, Molly. “Bimusicality.” *Music in the Social and Behavioral Sciences: An Encyclopedia*. Ed. William Forde Thompson, Alexandra Lamont, Richard Parncutt, and Frank A. Russo. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, 2014. Print.

Johnson, Henry. “Balinese Music, Tourism and Globalization: Inventing Traditions within and Across Cultures.” *New Zealand Journal of Asian Studies*. 4.2 (2002): 8-32. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Johnston, Mindy K. “Vincent McDermott.” *Facebook*. 11 Feb 2016. Accessed 11 Feb 2016. Addressed to Pak Midiyanto.

Koskoff, Ellen. “Java.” *The Concise Garland Encyclopedia of World Music*. New York: Routledge, 2008. Print.

Kramer, Jonathan D. “The Nature and Origins of Musical Postmodernism.” *Postmodern Music/Postmodern Thought*. Ed. Judith Irene Lochhead and Joseph Henry Auner. New York: Routledge, 2002. 16. Print.

Kunst, Jaap. “Introduction to Ethnomusicology.” *Ethnomusicology: a Study of Its Nature, Its Problems, Methods and Representative Personalities to Which Is Added a Bibliography*. The Hague: M. Nijhoff, 1959. 2. Print. In this text, Kunst refers to A.J. Ellis as “the father of ethno-musicology.”

Lieberman, Fredric. “Should Ethnomusicology be Abolished?” Position Papers for the Ethnomusicology Interest Group at the 19th Annual Meeting of the College Music Society, Washington D.C., November 1976. Web. 13 March 2016.

Mason, Amelia. “What Is Gained, and Lost, When Indonesian Gamelan Music Is Americanized.” *Artery*. 19 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Publication of 90.9 WBUR, Boston's NPR News Station.

McGraw, Andrew. “The Gamelan and Indonesian Music in America.” *OUP Blog*. Oxford University Press, 27 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Merriam, Alan P. “Definitions of ‘Comparative Musicology’ and ‘Ethnomusicology:’ An Historical-Theoretical Perspective.” *Ethnomusicology*. 21.2 (1977): 192. Jstor. Web. 17 Feb. 2016.

“Musical Plagiarism.” Project Gutenberg and the world Heritage Encyclopedia, Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Myers, Helen. *Ethnomusicology, An Introduction*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1992. Print.

Nettl, Bruno. "The Art of Combining Tones: The Music Concept." *The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-One Issues and Concepts*. Urbana: U of Illinois, 2005. 26. Print.

Nettl, Bruno. "A Modern Form of Dance and Music: Kebyar." *Excursions in World Music*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1997. Print.

Oja, Carol J. *Colin McPhee: Composer in Two Worlds*. Washington: Smithsonian Institution, 1990. Print.

Olsen, Dale A., and Robert E. Brown. "World Music and Ethnomusicology: Two Views." *College Music Society Newsletter* (May 1992). UCLA Department of Ethnomusicology. Web. 17 Feb. 2016. Brown, R. E. "World Music: Past, present, and future;" Olsen, D. A. "World Music and Ethnomusicology-Understanding the Differences."

Ozment, Elizabeth. "Susilo." Message to the author. 6 Dec. 2015. E-mail.

Pieterse, Jan Nederveen. "Hybridity, So What? The Anti-Hybridity Backlash and the Riddles of Recognition." *Theory, Culture & Society*. 18.2.3 (2001): 219. Print. Pieterse. 219.

Potter, Caroline. "Boulanger, Nadia." *Grove Music Online (Oxford Music Online)*. 2016. Web. 13 March 2016.

Raffles, Thomas Stamford. *The History of Java*. London: Murray, 1830. Print.

Rahkonen, Carl. "What is World Music?" *World Music in Music Libraries*. Technical Report No. 24. Canton, MA: Music Library Association, Dec.1994. Web. 13 March 2016.

Ricoeur, Paul. *Hermeneutics and the Human Sciences: Essays on Language, Action, and Interpretation.* Cambridge University Press, Cambridge: 1981. Print.

"Rules of the International Council for Traditional Music." *The International Council for Traditional Music*. 16 July 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. ICTM is a Non-Governmental Organization in Formal Consultative Relations with UNESCO.

Said, Edward W. *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient*. New York: Vintage, 1979. Print.

Schaefer, John. *New Sounds: A Listener's Guide to New Music*. New York: Harper & Row, 1987. Print.

Schwantner, Joseph, Kobayashi Issa, and Agueda Pizarro. "Schwantner: Sparrows / Music of Amber." *Naxos Digital Services* US Inc., 2004. CD. Quotation taken from the Liner notes. Underscoring added by the author for emphasis.

Seeger, Anthony. "Ethnomusicology and Music Law." *Ethnomusicology*. 36.3 (1992): 345–359. Web.

Seneca, Lucius Annaeus. *Hoyt's New Cyclopedia of Practical Quotations*. Ed. Kate Louise Roberts. New York and London: Funk and Wagnalls, 1922. 916. Print. From Epistles 28. Full quote: "I am not born for one corner. The whole world is my native land."

Starks, George L. "Ethnomusicology and the African American Tradition." *African American Jazz and Rap: Social and Philosophical Examinations of Black Expressive Behavior*. Ed. James L. Conyers. Jefferson, NC: McFarland, 2001. Print.

Steinberg, Leo L. "The Glorious Company." *Art About Art*. Ed. John Lipman and Richard Marshall. E.P Dutton, New York. 1978. 25. Print.

Stokes, Martin. “Music and the Global Order.” *Annual Review of Anthropology*. 33 (2004): 60. Web.

Sumarsam. “Performing Colonialism.” *Javanese Gamelan and the West*. Rochester: U of Rochester, 2013. Print.

Sutrino, Hartana. “Notes, concerns, and hopes for Javanese Gamelan.” Unpublished. Appearing on the website for the Institute of Asian Research, University of British Columbia. http://www.iar.ubc.ca/centres/csear/webpage/8-Hartana.pdf. Also see: Hartana, Sutrisno Setya. “Javanese Gamelan in The Paku Alaman palace: The Repertoire of Uyon-uyon Muryararas.” M.A. thesis, University of British Columbia, 2006.

Tarasti, Eero. “Myth and Music: A Semiotic Approach to the Aesthetics of Myth in Music, Especially that of Wagner, Sibelius and Stravinsky.” *Acta Musicologica Fennica* 11; *Religion and Society* 51. Helsinki: Suomen Musiikkitieteellinen Seura; The Hague: Mouton, 1979. 272. Web. 13 March 2016.

Taylor, Timothy Dean. *Global Pop: World Music, World Markets*. New York: Routledge, 1997. Print.

Titon, Jeff Todd. *Worlds of Music* (2nd ed.). New York: Schirmer, 1992. Print.

Tylor, Edward. *Primitive Culture: Researches into the Development of Mythology, Philosophy, Religion, Art and Custom.* New York: J. P. Putnam’s Sons, 1871. Vol. 1, 1. Print.

Webster, Noah. “Fad.” *New Collegiate Dictionary*. A Merriam-Webster. Springfield, MA: G. & C. Merriam, 1953. Print.

Weiss, Sarah. “Listening to the world but Hearing Ourselves: Hybridity and Perceptions of Authenticity in World Music.” *Ethnomusicology.* 58.3 (2014): 506. Web.

“What Is Ethnomusicology?” Society for Ethnomusicology. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Also found within Nettl, Bruno. “Contemplating the Musics of the world.” *The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-three Discussions*. Urbana, Chicago and Springfield: U of Illinois, 2015. Print.

White, Bob W. *Music and Globalization: Critical Encounters*. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 2012. 195. Print.

Witzleben, J. Lawrence. “Whose Ethnomusicology? Western Ethnomusicology and the Study of Asian Music.” *Ethnomusicology.* 41.2 (1997): 220–242. Web.

Chapter 3: The Gamelan

Al-Ghazali. “Sufi Music.” *International Association of Sufism*. Web. 13 March 2016.

Apel, Willi. *Harvard Dictionary of Music*, 2nd Ed. 436. Belknap Press of Harvard University Press: Cambridge, 2000. 436. Print.

Benary, Barbara. “Directory of Gamelan Groups: United States.” American Gamelan Institute. Ed. Sharon Millman. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Blussé, L. *India and Indonesia from the 1920s to the 1950s: The Origins of Planning*. E.J. Brill Publications: Leiden and New York, 1987. 93. Print.

Broughton, Simon, et al. *World Music: The Rough Guide*. London: The Rough Guides, 1994. 419–420. Print.

Coedès, George. *The Indianized States of Southeast Asia*. Trans. Susan Brown Cowing. Ed. Walter F. Vella. University of Hawaii Press, Manao: 1968. Print.

Colin, McPhee. "The Five Toned Gamelan Music of Bali." *Musical Quarterly*, 1949. Vol 35. 251. Print.

Connoy, Jason and Chandra Drews. "Koes Plus." In *Those Shocking, Shaking Days*. Now-Again Records: Los Angeles, 2010. 13. LP Booklet.

Covarrubias, Miguel. *Island of Bali*. New York, 1939. 218 – 219. Print. Republished in 2008 as part of the Periplus Classic Series.

De Zoute, Beryl, and Walter Spies. *Dance and Drama in Bali*. New York, 1939. 6. Print.

Geertz, Clifford. "The Santri Variant." *The Religion of Java.* The University of Chicago Press: Chicago, 1960. 121–215. Print.

Hanna, Willard A. *Bali Chronicles*. Periplus: Singapore, 2004. 140 – 141. Print.

Hood, Mantle and Hardjo Susilo. *Music of the Venerable Dark Cloud*. Institute of Ethnomusicology, University of California: Los Angeles, 1967. Booklet accompanying the recording of the same title.

Hood, Mantle. "The Enduring Tradition: Music and Theater in Java and Bali." *Indonesia*. Ed. McVey, et. \ al. New Haven, 1963. 3. Print.

Hugh, Brent. "Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan." Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.

"Indonesian Population: 2016." *World Population Review*. 13 Sept. 2015. Web. 13 March 2016.

Kartini, Raden Adjeng. *Letters of a Japanese Princess.* New York, 1964. 50. Print.

Lasmawan, I Madé. Personal Interview. July 2015. Conducted in Baturiti, Bali, Indonesia.

Lentz, Donald A. *The Gamelan Music of Java and Bali: An Artistic Anomaly Complementary to Primary Tonal Theoretical Systems*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1965. 5. Print.

Lieberman, Fredric. "Relationships of Musical and Cultural Contrasts in Java and Bali." *University of California Santa Cruz, 1967*. Found at http://artsites.ucsc.edu/faculty/lieberman/contrasts.html. Web. 13 March 2016.

Lindsay, Jennifer. *Javanese Gamelan.* Oxford University Press: Oxford, 1979. 45. Print.

"Mataram, Historical Kingdom, Indonesia." *Encyclopaedia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica Online. Encyclopædia Britannica Inc., 2016. Web. 21 Mar. 2016.

McGraw, Andrew. "The Gamelan and Indonesian Music in America." *OUP Blog*. Oxford University Press, 27 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

McGraw, Andrew. *Radical Traditions: Reimagining Culture in Balinese Contemporary Music.* Oxford U.P.: Oxford, 2013. 89. Print.

McPhee, Colin. *Music in Bali*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1966. 36 Print.

Midiyanto and Pak I Madé Lasmawan. Personal Interview. March 2015. Atlanta, GA.

Miller, Tracy, ed. "*Mapping the Global Muslim Population: A Report on the Size and Distribution of the World's Muslim Population*." Pew Research Center. October 2009. Web. 13 March 2016.

Ooi, Keat Gin, ed. *Southeast Asia: a historical encyclopedia, from Angkor Wat to East Timor.* Vol 3. ABC-CLIO: Santa Barbara, 2004. 719. Print.

Parameswaran, Prashanth. "Is Indonesia Really the World's Most Tolerant Muslim Country?" *The Diplomat* [Jakarta]. 30 Dec. 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.

Perlman, Marc. *Unplayed Melodies: Javanese Gamelan and the Genesis of Music Theory.* University of California Press: Los Angeles, 2004. See back cover.

Raffles, Thomas Stamford. *The History of Java*. London: Murray, 1830. Print.

Ricklefs, M.C. *A History of Modern Indonesia Since c.1300, 2nd Edition*. London: MacMillan, 1991. 110. Print.

Roberts, Martin D, 1998. "World Music: The Relocation of Culture". In UNESCO, ed, *Culture, Creativity and Markets*. Paris: UNESCO, 205. Print.

Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. 157. Print.

Robinson, Geoffrey. "Political Conflict and Violence in Modern Bali." *The Dark Side of Paradise: Political Violence in Bali*. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1995. 1-17. Print.

Sadra, I. Wayan, et al. "'Komposisi Baru': On Contemporary Composition in Indonesia." *Leonardo Music Journal*. 1.1 (1991): 19–24. Web. 12 March 2016.

See, Yee-Seer and Han Kuo-Huang. "The Beliefs." *SEAsite.* Northern Illinois University. 1998. Web. 13 March 2016.

Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. 56. Print.

Stepputat, Kendra. "The Genesis of a Dance-Genre: Walter Spies and the Kecak." In *The Ethnographers of the Last Paradise: Victor von Plessen and Walter Spies in Indonesia.* Bielefeld: 2010. 267 – 85., pp. 267–285, online: http://ethnomusikologie.kug.ac.at/fileadmin/media/institut-13/Dokumente/Downloads/Stepputat_Walter_Spies_and_the_Kecak.pdf . Web. 12 March 2016.

Subramuniyaswami, Satguru Sivaya. *Loving Ganesa: Hinduism's Endearing Elephant-Faced God*. Himalayan Academy: India and USA, 1996. 287. Print.

Sugiharto, Setiono. "Indigenous Language Policy as a National Cultural Strategy." *The Jakarta Post* [Jakarta]. 28 Oct. 2013. Web. 13 March 2016.

Sumarsam. "Introduction to Javanese Gamelan." Wesleyan University, Middletown. Oct. 1998. 1. Web. 13 March 2016. Handout Published on Weslayan University's gamelan website, Fall 1999. Last revised, Fall 2002.

Sumarsam. *Gamelan: Cultural Interaction and Musical Development in Central Java.* University of Chicago Press: Chicago, 1992. 16. Print.

Surjodiningrat, W., Sudarjana, P.J., and Susanto, A. "Tone measurements of outstanding Javanese gamelans in Jogjakarta and Surakarta." Gadjah Mada University Press, Jogjakarta 1972. Web. 13 March 2016. Cited on http://web.telia.com/~u57011259/pelog_main.htm.

Sutrino, Hartana. "Notes, concerns, and hopes for Javanese Gamelan." Unpublished. Appearing on the website for the Institute of Asian Research, University of British Columbia. http://www.iar.ubc.ca/centres/csear/webpage/8-Hartana.pdf. Also see: Hartana, Sutrisno Setya. "Javanese Gamelan in The Paku Alaman palace: The Repertoire of Uyon-uyon Muryararas." M.A. thesis, University of British Columbia, 2006.

Sutton, R. Anderson. *Traditions of Gamelan Music in Java: Musical Pluralism and Regional Identity*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 1991. 235. Print.

Tamagawa, Kiyoshi. *Echoes From the East: The Javanese Gamelan and its Influence on the Music of Claude Debussy*. D.M.A. dissertation. The University of Texas at Austin, 1988. 36 – 44. Print.

Tenzer, Michael. "Theory and Analysis of Melody in Balinese Gamelan." *Society for Music Theory.* 6.2. 2000. Found in the *Online Journal of the Society for Music Theory*, prepared by Brent Yorgason. Updated 18 November 2002. Web. 13 March 2016.

Tenzer, Michael. *Balinese Music.* Periplus Editions: Singapore: 1991. 12. Print.

Vickers, Adrian. *A History of Modern Indonesia.* Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2005. 1. Print.

Vitale, Wayne. "Balinese Kebyar Music Breaks the Five-Tone Barrier: New Composition for Seven-Tone Gamelan." *Perspectives of New* Music, 2002. 40.1: 7. Print.

Warsodiningrat, R.T. *Serat Weda Pradangga*. Cited in Roth, A. R. *New Compositions for Javanese Gamelan*. University of Durham, PhD Dissertation, 1986. 4. Print.

Wibisono, Joss. "Gamelan in the Blood." *Gatholotjo*. No. 65, 2012. 21. Web. 13 March 2016.

Chapter 4: Satie, Debussy, and Stravinsky: Impressionism and Neoclassicism.

Adamowicz, Elza. *Un Chien Andalou: Luis Buñuel and Salvador Dalí, 1929*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2010. Print.

Andres, Robert. "An Introduction to the solo piano music of Debussy and Ravel." *BBC Radio.* 2005. Web. 13 March 2016. Introductory Essay by Robert Andres to accompany performances of Debussy and Ravel by Arturo Pizarro.

Argent, Gesine, Derek Offord and Vladislav Rjéoutski. "Foreward: French Language Acquisition in Imperial Russia." Вивліоѳика: E-Journal of Eighteenth-Century Russian Studies, Vol. 1 (2013): 1-4. Print.

Babyak, Telka B. *Nietzsche, Debussy, and the Shadow of Wagner.* PhD Dissertation. Cornell University, 2014. Print.

Becker, Judith O. *Gamelan Stories: Tantrism, Islam, and Aesthetics in Central Java*. Tempe, Ariz.: Program for Southeast Asian Studies, Arizona State University, 1993. Print.

Bellman, Jonathan. *The Exotic in Western Music.* Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. Print.

Collection of essays on exoticism edited by Bellman.

Bleek, Tobias. “Stravinsky and his World: Igor Stravinsky and Claude Debussy.” *Ruhr Piano Festival Foundation.* Web. 13 March 2016.

Breton, André. Manifeste Du Surréalisme; Poisson Soluble. Paris: Éditions Du Sagittaire, 1924. Print. Trans. Kline, A. S. “First Manifesto of Surrealism - 1924: André Breton.” Poetry in Translation. MIT Press, 2010. Web. 27 Oct. 2012.

Burkholder, J. Peter. “Borrowing.” *Grove Music Online/Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press. Web. 30 Oct. 2015.

Cage, John. “Indeterminacy: New Aspect of Form in Instrumental and Electronic Music.” *Silence*. 1958. Print.

Coombs, Neil. *Studying Surrealist and Fantasy Cinema*. London, England: Leighton Buzzard - Auteur, 2008. Print.

Cook, Nicholas. “Anatomy of an Encounter: Debussy and the Gamelan, again.” *Cultural Musicology iZine.* 2015. Web. http://culturalmusicology.org/nicholas-cook-anatomy-of-an-encounter-debussy-and-the-gamelan-again/. 13 March 2016.

Cooke, Mervyn. “‘The East in the West’: Evocations of the Gamelan in Western Music.” *The Exotic in Western Music. Ed.* Bellman, Jonathan. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. 258 – 180. Print.

Crumb, George. “Music: Does it have a Future?” from Gillespie, Don. *George Crumb: Profile of a Composer.* C.F. Peters Corporation, New York. 1984. Print.

Day-O’Connell, Jeremy. “Debussy, Petatonicism, and the Tonal Tradition.” *Music Theory spectrum*. Vol 31, 2009. 226. Web. A version of this research was first presented at the joint meeting of the American Musicological Society and the Society for Music Theory (Los Angeles, 2006).

Davis, Mary E. *Erik Satie*. London: Reaktion, 2007. Print.

Dryden, John. *The Works of Virgil: Containing his Pastorals, Georgics, and Aeneis*. London: Jacob Tonson, 1697. Book III, line 153

Fauser, Annegret. *Musical Encounters at the 1889 Paris World's Fair*. Rochester: U of Rochester, 2005. Print.

Fletcher, Peter. *World Musics in Context: A Comprehensive Survey of the World's Major Musical Cultures*. Oxford: Oxford U, 2001. Print.

Gagné, Nicole V. *Historical Dictionary of Modern and Contemporary Classical Music*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow, 2012. Print.

Golschmann, Vladimir. “Golschmann Remembers Satie.” *High Fidelity/Musical America*. 22 August 1972. Print.

Grainger, Percy, Malcolm Giles and Clunies Ross. *Grainger on Music*. “A Blossom in Time in Pianoforte Literature.” Oxford U.P.: Oxford, 1999. Print.

Hugh, Brent. “Claude Debussy and the Javanese Gamelan.” Brenthhugh.com, 1998. Web. 12 Dec. 2013. http://brenthugh.com/debnotes/gamelan.html. 13 March 2016. This is the script for a lecture-recital given in 1998 at the University of Missouri-Kansas City.

Howat, Roy. “Debussy and the Orient.” In Recovering the Orient, edited by Andrew Gerstle and Anthony Milner. Chur: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1994. Print.

Hume, Ernest. *Supermusicology: A New Way to the Heights of Music*. London, Ont.: Daisy House Pub., 1999. Print.

Jaroncinski, Stefan. *Debussy: Impressionism and Symbolism*, trans. Rollo Myers. London: Eulenburg, 1981. Print.

Joseph, Charles M. *Stravinsky's Ballets*. New Haven: Yale UP, 2011. Print.

Konstelanetz, Richard. *John Cage: An Anthology*. Da Capo Press. New York, 1991. 80. Print. Quote by John Cage.

Laloy, Louis. *Louis Laloy on Debussy, Ravel and Stravinsky,* ed. and trans. Deborah Priest. Hampshire, Vermont: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 1999. Print.

Lesure, François. *Debussy on Music: The Critical Writing of the Great French Composer Claude Debussy*. Trans. Richard Langham Smith. New York: Alfred A Knopf, 1977. Print.

Lindgren, Carl Edwin. “The way of the Rose Cross: A Historical Perception, 1614–1620.” *Journal of Religion and Psychical Research*. Volume 18, Number 3:141–48. 1995.

Locke, Ralph P. “Cutthroats and Casbah Dancers, Muezzins and Timeless Sands: Musical Images of the Middle East,” in *The Exotic in Western Music*, ed. Jonathan Bellman. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. Print.

Lockspeiser, Edward. “Claude Debussy.” *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica Inc., 2016. Web. 19 Mar. 2016. http://www.britannica.com/biography/Claude-Debussy.

Lockspeiser, Edward. *Debussy*: the Master Musicians. London: J.M. Dent and Sons, 1936. Print.

Lockspeiser, Edward. *Debussy: His Life and Mind*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 1978. Print.

Maurer, Naomi E. *The Pursuit of Spiritual Wisdom: The Thought and Art of Vincent Van Gogh and Paul Gauguin*. Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson UP, 1998. Print.

Mechkat, Farhad. “Three Musical Precursors: Beethoven, Debussy and Stravinsky.” *Nour Foundation.* 2009. Web. 13 March 2016. Lecture Series.

Mitchinson, Paul. “Difficult Rhythms, Grateful Conductors.” *New York Times.* Letters to the Editor. 9 February 1997. Web. 13 March 2016.

Myers, Rollo H. *Debussy*. Westport: Hyperion, 1979. Print.

Nicholas, Roger and François Lesure. *Debussy Letters*. Trans. Roger Nicholas. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1987. Print.

Noble, Jeremy. “Portrait of Debussy. Debussy and Stravinsky”. *The Musical Times* 108.1487 (1967) 22-27. Web.

Oakes, Meredith. *Mr Modernsky: How Stravinsky Survived Schoenberg*. London: Oberon, 2011. Print.

Orledge, Robert. *Satie the Composer*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1990. Print.

Pasler, Jann. *Composing the Citizen: Music as Public Utility in Third Republic France*. Berkeley: U of California, 2009. Print.

Reti, Rudolph. *Tonality, Atonality, Pantonality: A Study of Some Trends in Twentieth Century Music*. London: Rockliff, 1958. Print.

Richardson, John. *An Eye for Music: Popular Music and the Audiovisual Surreal*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2012. Print.

Richardson, Nick. "Velvet Gentleman." Rev. of *A Mammal's Notebook: The Writings of Erik Satie*, by Erik Satie. *London Review of Books* 37.11 (2015): 26-28. Print. Source edited by Ornella Volta, translated by Antony Melville.

Roberts, Paul. *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1996. Print.

Shattuck, Roger. *The Banquet Years: the origins of the Avant Garde in France (1885 to World War I)*. Vintage Books: New York, 1955. Print.

Simmons, Alexander. "Erik Satie's Trois Gnossiennes in the French Fin De Siclè." Thesis. University of Birmingham, 2012. Print.

Solomon, Larry J. "Satie, The First Modern." 2003. Web. 30 Oct. 2015.

Sorrell, Neil. *A Guide to the Gamelan*. Portland, Or.: Amadeus, 1990. Print.

Stravinsky, Vera, and Robert Craft. *Stravinsky in Pictures and Documents*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1978. Print.

Suchoff, Benjamin. *Béla Bartók's Essays*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 1993. Print.

"Surrealism and Music? The Musical World Around Rene Magritte." *American Symphony Orchestra*. Web. 22 Oct. 2012.

Taruskin, Richard. "Russian Folk Melodies in 'The Rite of Spring." *Journal of the American Musicological Society*. 33.3 (1980): 501-43. Print.

Thompson, Oscar. *Debussy: Man and Artist*. New York: Dodd, Mead, 1937. Print.

Van Den Toorn, Pieter C. *Stravinsky and the Rite of Spring: The Beginnings of a Musical Language*. Berkeley: University of California, 1987. Print.

Verzosa, Noel Orillo. *The Absolute Limits: Debussy, Satie, and the Culture of French Modernism, Ca. 1860-1920.* PhD Dissertation. University of California, Berkeley, 2008. Print.

Wibisono, Joss. "Gamelan in the Blood." *Gatholotjo*. No. 65, 2012. 21. Web. 13 March 2016.

Chapter 5: Reich, Glass, Górecki: Aesthetic and Holy Minimalism.

"2014 in Classical Music Statistics: A Changing of the Guard." *Bachtrack*. 15 Jan. 2015. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. https://bachtrack.com/classical-music-statistics-2014.

Asia, Daniel. "Sacred Music: the Holy Minimalists and James Primosch." Web blog post. *The Huffington Post* — Arts and Culture, 2015. Web. 12 March 2016.

Bellman, Jonathan. *The Exotic in Western Music*. Boston: Northeastern UP, 1998. 258. Print.

Bemis, Alec Hanley. "Brian Eno has beef with Steve Reich, enjoys musical seduction." *Arcade: Literature, the Humanities and the World*. Stanford University. 22 Jan 2010. Web. 12 Feb 2016.

Blom, Diana. "Minimalism isn't dead: it just smells funny: phases in the Australian experience of Minimal Music." Paper presented at "Minimalism — Architecture, Art, Performance," a conference presented by Artspace and the University of Technology Faculty of Design architecture and Building, Saturday 3 July, 1999. Web. 10 March 2015.

Bogdanov, Vladimir, Chris Woodstra, and Stephen Thomas. Erlewine. *All Music Guide: The Definitive Guide to Popular Music*. San Francisco: Backbeat /All Media Guide, 2001. 138. Print.

Brooks, Anthony, and Meghna Chakrabarti. *Composer Philip Glass On How His 'Way Of Hearing' Transformed*. *Radio Boston*. 30 Mar. 2015. Web. 03 May 2015.

Broyles, Michael. *Mavericks and Other Traditions in Amrcan Music*. Yale University Press: New Haven, 2004. 320. Print.

Child, Fred. "Steve Reich: Minimalism in the Mainstream." NPR Music. 20 April 2009. Updated 8 February 2012. Web. 13 March 2016.

Clements, Andrew. "Composer of the Week, Steve Reich (b. 1936)," *The Guardian*. BBC Radio 3 Programmes. Episode 1. 25 October 2010. Web. 13 March 2016.

Cole, Ross Graham. *Illusion / Anti-Illusion: the Music of Steve Reich in Context, 1965–1968*. University of York, 2010. 40. Web. M.M. Thesis. This source cites an interview between Reich and Jonathan Cott from which this quote was taken.

Corner, Philip. "How Minimal is Minimal?" *Perfect Sound Forever*. April 2012. Web. 12 March 2016. CT: Greenwood, 2002. 361. Print.

Dayal, Geeta. "Steve Reich: 'Radiohead is my kind of music.'" *The Guardian*. 11 Sept. 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.

Gann, Kyle. "Forest from the Seeds of Minimalism: An Essay on Postminimal and Totalist Music." Music After Minimalism. 1998. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Written for the program of a 1998 Minimalism Festival of the Berliner Gesellschaft fur Neue Musik.

Glass, Philip. Emory University Schwartz Center for Performing Arts, Atlanta. 27 September 2013. Performance. See concert program for historical information about Glass and Tim Fain (violinist), the pieces they performed, etc.

Gorecki's *Symphony no.3* ("Symphony of Sorrowful Songs"). Cond. Richard Prior. Emory University Schwartz Center for Performing Arts, Atlanta. 6 Mar. 2014. Performance. See concert program for historical information about Górecki, the movements, etc.

Gresham, Mark. "Review: Emory Gamelan Ensemble Treats a Full House to Javanese Shadow Puppets Concert." *Arts ATL.* 8 April 2015. Web. 13 March 2016.

Grimshaw, Jeremy. "Gamelan and minimalism." Message to the author. 25 Jan. 2016. E-mail.

Guttmann, Peter. "Steve Reich: Reinventing American Classical Music." *Goldmine Magazine.* Classical Notes. 2004. Web. 13 March 2016.

Headlam, David. “Re-drawing boundaries: The Kronos Quartet.” *Contemporary Music Review*, 19:1, 2000. 113. Web. 13 March 2016.

Huizenga, Tom. “Steve Reich Wins Music Pulitzer.” *National Public Radio: Music*. 20 Apr. 2009. Web. 13 March 2016.

Johnson, Timothy A. “Minimalism: Aesthetic, Style, or Technique?” The Musical Quarterly 78.4 (1994): 742–773. Web.

Johnson, Tom. *The Voice of New Music: New York City, 1972-1982: A Collection of Articles Originally Published in the Village Voice*. Eindhoven: Apollohuis, 1989. 742-44. Print.

Lebrecht, Norman. “Noisy Dissent Disrupts a Harpsichord Recital.” *Slipped Disc*. 29 Feb. 2016. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Margulis, Elizabeth Hellmuth. *On Repeat: How Music Plays the Mind*. Oxford and New York: Oxford UP, 2013. 80. Print.

Mason, Amelia. “What Is Gained, and Lost, When Indonesian Gamelan Music Is Americanized.” *Artery*. 19 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Publication of 90.9 WBUR, Boston's NPR News Station.

Mertens, Wim. *American Minimal Music: La Monte Young, Terry Riley, Steve Reich, Philip Glass*. London: Kahn & Averill, 1983. 11. Print.

Morris, Patrick. “Steve Reich and Debussy: Some Connections”. *Tempo* 160 (1987): 8. Web. 13 March 2016.

“Minimalism: Minimalism in the Visual Arts.” 2015. Web. 12 March 2016. Online encyclopedia; accessed from the Columbia Electronic Encyclopedia, 6th ed. Columbia University Press, 2012.

Orledge, Robert. *Debussy and the Theatre*. Cambridge, Cambridge U.P., 1982. 281. Print.

Oteri, Frank J. “Jocelyn Morlock.” *Music on Main.* July 2013. Web. 13 March 2016.

Prior, Richard and Yulia Van Doren. “Creativity Conversation” at Emory University’s Schwartz Center for Performing Arts. 5 March 2014. Discussing Górecki’s *Symphony no. 3* and its relation to political violence in Ukraine.

Prior, Richard, and Philip Glass. “Creativity Conversation” at Emory University’s Schwartz Center for Performing Arts. 25 September 2013. Discussing Glass’ inspiration and compositions.

Prior, Richard. “A Vigil of Compassion and Recollection” at Emory University’s Schwartz Center for Performing Arts. 6 March 2014. Discussing Górecki’s *Symphony no. 3* and its relation to political violence in Ukraine.

Reich, Steve. *Writings on Music: 1965 – 2000.* Oxford UP: Oxford, 2002. Print.

Reich, Steve. “The Steve Reich Website.” Web. 03 May 2015.

Reich, Steve. *Writings about Music*. Halifax: The Press of Nova Scotia College of Arts and Design; New York: New York University, 1974. Print.

Rodda, Richard E. (1999). Liner notes, Violin Concertos of John Adams & Philip Glass, Robert McDuffie (violin). Telarc, CD-80494.

Ross, Alex. The Rest Is Noise: Listening to the Twentieth Century. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux,

2007. Print.

Salzman, Eric. *Twentieth-Century Music: An Introduction*. 2nd ed. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1974. 186. Print.

Sande, Kiran. "A Brief History of Minimalism." *FACT Magazine: Music News, New Music*. 1 Feb. 2015. Web. 03 May 2015. This article originally appeared in *The Daily Note*, the official newspaper of the Red Bull Music Academy.

Scheffer, Frank. "In The Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Documentary on modern composers in New York: Julia Wolfe, Michael Gordon and David Lang who founded 'Bang on a Can,' Steve Reich, Philip Glass, Louis Andriessen, Elliott Carter, John Cage, Frank Zappa and Brian Eno.

Schwartz, Steve. "Schoenberg - Piano Concerto, Chamber Symphonies." *Arnold Schoenberg*. Classical Net, 2009. Web. 03 May 2015. Summary for the "Busy Executive."

Schwarz, K. Robert. *Minimalists*. London: Phaidon, 1996. 73. Print.

Service, Tom. "Minimalism at 50: How Less Became More." Review. The Guardian: Classical Music. 24 Nov. 2011. Web. 3 May 2015.

Sim, Stuart. *The Routledge Companion to Postmodernism*. London: Routledge, 2005. 273. Print.

Sitsky, Larry. *Music of the Twentieth-century Avant-garde: A Biocritical Sourcebook*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2002. 361. Print.

"Steve Reich: Contemporary Music Edition (2013)." BBVA Foundation Frontiers of Knowledge Awards. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Sumarsam. "Inner Melody in Javanese Gamelan Music." *Asian Music* 7.1 (1975): 7. Web. 13 March 2016.

Tamm, Eric. *Brian Eno: His Music and the Vertical Color of Sound*. Boston: Faber and Faber, 1989. 24. Print.

Teachout, Terry. "Holy Minimalism." *Commentary*. 1 April 1995. Web. 13 March 2016.

Tenzer, Michael. Gamelan Gong Kebyar: The Art of Twentieth-Century Balinese Music. University of Chicago Press: Chicago, 2000. Print. Forward by Steve Reich.

Terranova, David. "Influences: Steve Reich." Bloc. 2012. Web. 12 Mar. 2016. Bloc "Influences series." Reich discusses Ghanian drumming and a project with Radiohead.

Warburton, Dan. "A Working Terminology for Minimal Music." Paris Transatlantic Archives, 1988. Web. 03 May 2015. Originally written for and published in the magazine *Intégral* (Vol. 2, 1988).

"What is the most inaccessible music that you know of?" Reddit Music. Discussion post. 20 April 2015. Web. 13 March 2015.

Conclusions:

"15 Great Albums You Didn't Hear in 2014." *Rolling Stone*. 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.

Cooke, Mervyn. "'The East in the West': Evocations of the Gamelan in Western Music." *The Exotic in Western Music. Ed.* Bellman, Jonathan. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998. 259. Print.

Curran, Caitlyn. "Gamelan, Electronic Music's Unexpected Indonesian Influence." *The Pitch*. 15 April 2014. Web. 13 March 2016.

Demers, Joanna. *Steal This Music: How Intellectual Property Law Affects Musical Creativity*. Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 2006. 11. Print.

Gamelan Semara Ratih of Bali. *Returning Minimalism: In Nem*. Anak Agung Gede Anom Putra, 2012. CD. Liner notes.

Hayward, Philip. *Music at the Borders: Not Drowning, Waving and their Engagement with Papua New Guinean Culture (1986 – 1996).* John Libbey Publishers: Sydney, 2000. 41. Print.

Lechner, Ethan. *Composers as Ethnographers: Differences in the Imaginations of Colin McPhee, Henry Cowell, and Lou Harrison*. PhD Dissertation, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 2008. 96. Print.

McGraw, Andrew. "The Gamelan and Indonesian Music in America." *OUP Blog*. Oxford University Press, 27 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2016.

Noble, Jeremy. "Portrait of Debussy. Debussy and Stravinsky". *The Musical Times.* 108.1487 (1967): 22. Web.

Ralph P. Locke, "Cutthroats and Casbah Dancers, Muezzins and Timeless Sands: Musical Images of the Middle East," in The Exotic in Western Music, ed. Jonathan Bellman (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1998)

Reich, Steve. *Writings about Music*. Halifax: The Press of Nova Scotia College of Arts and Design; New York: New York University, 1974. 40. Print.

Scheffer, Frank. "In The Ocean - A Film About the Classical Avant Garde." Allegri Films and NPS, 2002. Web. 13 Mar. 2016. Documentary on modern composers in New York: Julia Wolfe, Michael Gordon and David Lang who founded 'Bang on a Can,' Steve Reich, Philip Glass, Louis Andriessen, Elliott Carter, John Cage, Frank Zappa and Brian Eno.

Steinberg, Leo L. "The Glorious Company." *Art About Art.* Ed. John Lipman and Rchard Marshall. E.P Dutton, New York. 1978. 25. Print.