

Distribution Agreement

In presenting this thesis as a partial fulfillment of the requirements for a degree from Emory University, I hereby grant to Emory University and its agents the non-exclusive license to archive, make accessible, and display my thesis in whole or in part in all forms of media, now or hereafter now, including display on the World Wide Web. I understand that I may select some access restrictions as part of the online submission of this thesis. I retain all ownership rights to the copyright of the thesis. I also retain the right to use in future works (such as articles or books) all or part of this thesis.

Michael J. Luzinski

April 17, 2012

Hymnody: A Critical but often overlooked aspect of
Methodist Revivalistic Expansion

by

Michael J. Luzinski

Dr. Barbara Patterson
Adviser

Department of Religion

Dr. Barbara Patterson
Adviser

Dr. William Gilders
Committee Member

Dr. Stephen Henderson
Committee Member

Hymnody: A Critical but often overlooked aspect of
Methodist Revivalistic Expansion

By

Michael J. Luzinski

Dr. Barbara

Adviser

An abstract of
a thesis submitted to the Faculty of Emory College of Arts and Sciences
of Emory University in partial fulfillment
of the requirements of the degree of
Bachelor of Arts with Honors

Department of Religion

2012

Abstract

Hymnody: A Critical but often overlooked aspect of Methodist Revivalistic Expansion

By Michael J. Luzinski

In 1735, John Wesley came to America, bringing Methodism along with him. Wesley's trip lasted only two brief years, but by 1850, Methodism dominated the "American Religious Economy."¹ This explosive growth presents an obvious question, how did it occur? Scholarship on this topic has shed light on a wide variety of political, social, theological, geographical, and musical factors influencing the growth of the Methodist Movement. Proselytizing proved to be the foundation of the Methodist Movement. This thesis: *Hymnody: A Critical and often overlooked aspect of Methodist revivalistic expansion* will focus on a specific aspect of the Methodist movement, as an exploration of all reasons proves beyond the scope of this study. The Revolutionary War and the Second Great Awakening, 1776-1835, historically frame this study. Hymns are by no means the sole reason for the expansion of Methodism, but they played an important supporting role. Chapter 1 outlines the premises of the main argument by presenting information on hymnody, John Wesley, and revivals, laying the foundation for a chronological study. Chapter 2 begins the chronological study by examining the Great Awakening and Francis Asbury, the most influential American bishop in the denomination's history. From Asbury the narrative leads to the Second Great Awakening examining Peter Cartwright who was a convert and circuit rider in the movement. The lessons learned about the tangible displays of faith, what scholars label, the emotionalism of revivals, can be applied to the present. The United Methodist Church has been in decline since the 1960s, and is now attempting to return to its roots as a means of fostering growth. The church has turned to revival in its time of need and this method of outreach might contribute to a possible re-emergence of Methodism.

¹ Finke, Roger, and Rodney Starke. "How the Upstart Sects Won America: 1776-1850." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 28.1 (1989): 27-44. 28

Hymnody: A Critical but often overlooked aspect of
Methodist Revivalistic Expansion

By

Michael J. Luzinski

Dr. Barbara Patterson

Adviser

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Emory College of Arts and Sciences
of Emory University in partial fulfillment
of the requirements of the degree of
Bachelor of Arts with Honors

Department of Religion

2012

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank all of the people who have supported me through the process of writing this honors thesis. I must first thank my parents, Joseph and Martha Luzinski for providing me the opportunity to study at Emory University. Next, I need to thank my adviser Dr. Bobbi Patterson for her abundant patience and profound knowledge. I also should thank Margaret J. Ewen for her help with editing this project. Lastly, I want to thank Alex Shanks for the role he played in inspiring my interest in Methodism. This honors thesis would not have been possible without the loving support I received.

Table of Contents

1. Methodologies	1
A. History-Methodism and Moravians	2
B. Musicology-Lyrics and Music Theory	5
C. Comparative-Watts and Dorsey	6
D. Personal Disclosure	8
2. Foundations of Hymnody, Wesley, and Revivals in America	11
A. Hymnody	11
B. John Wesley-the Legendary Preacher	15
C. Revivals-the American Context	19
3. The Great Awakening	22
A. The Great Awakening	22
B. Francis Asbury	26
C. The Methodist Episcopal Church's theology	29
4. The Second Great Awakening	40
A. The Second Great Awakening	40
B. Harmonia Coelestis	42
C. Peter Cartwright	46
5. Conclusion: the Decline and Re-Emergent Modern Revival	52
A. The Methodist Movement and Revivals	52
B. Social Formation	54
C. Modern Revivals-Exploration 2011	58
D. Modern Revivals-Camps	60
E. Conclusion	63
Bibliography	64

Methodologies

As a boy, I sat in the pews of my family's Methodist congregation and fidgeted while the organist played traditional hymns. This practice was typical for many young Christians. The poetic beauty of hymns proved beyond my comprehension at that time. A few years later, I visited the house of John Wesley in England. My interest was sparked, as I stood in the same places as the founder of the Methodist Movement. Wesley used hymns, sermons, pamphlets, books, and anything else at his disposal to spread his version of the gospel, espousing a balance of internal faith and external deeds.¹ He was an expert evangelist because he started a bi-continental movement of over 100,000 followers during his lifetime. Hymnody was an important part of Wesley's evangelism technique, serving as a musical pulpit for the transmission of faith-derived ideas.

This chapter briefly outlines the methodologies used in this study to examine the historical, evangelical, and theological impacts of Wesley's hymns in the context of the American Methodist Movement. A simple research statement, my thesis, will guide this study: *hymnody was a very important aspect of the American Methodist Movement from 1776 to 1835. It has often been overlooked because it was camouflaged within the extreme emotionalism of revivals, the central convention of Methodist expansion.* Hymnody proved important for three main reasons; hymns dictated belief, unified the movement, and disseminated Methodist ideology. This ideology was derived from Wesley's practical theology, which described the ways in which faith played a role in real life situations. Couched within the lyrics of hymns,

¹ Heitzenrater, Richard P., and John Wesley. *The Elusive Mr. Wesley*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1984. Print. 92

these ideas became a central part of the Methodist Movement in both America and England.

If revivals were the flint sparking Methodist growth, then hymns were part of the kindling that led to the fire. Hymns were a part of the catalyst for growth and served as a vehicle to instill the principles of the expanding Methodist Movement. The narrative of the Methodist Movement in America will be told chronologically. The earliest parts of the movement will be addressed by examining hymnody, Wesley, and revivals in chapter one. This will provide a platform for a chronological inspection of the Great Awakening and Second Great Awakening in chapters two and three. The latter period was positively correlated with the dramatic rise of Methodism in America. In the conclusion of the work, the correlation of music and revival will be discussed as it relates to the contemporary United Methodist Church, the descendent of the Methodist Episcopal Church.

The success of the Methodist movement can be examined in various ways. The methodologies used to support my argument fall into three main categories: the *historical*, the *musical*, and the *comparative*. These three methodologies will be explained in this chapter and applied to the study of Wesleyan hymns.

HISTORY-Methodism and Moravians

A historical methodology is useful for placing events within the larger context of time. This thesis will be framed within the lives and the following 50 years after the Wesley brothers. The element of time will also be applied to evolving beliefs throughout John Wesley's life such as his assurance of faith. Assurance of faith is the knowledge of a believer's divine destiny. Wesley believed he had

salvation in England. Yet, upon his crossing to America Wesley realized he did not know with certainty he was saved from hell. On this trip, in the winter of 1735 a great storm came upon the ship. Wesley and the other passengers were overtaken by fear as the waves crashed onto the deck. All of the English passengers were gripped with terror while the German Moravians calmly sang Psalms. The peace the Moravians possessed forced Wesley to ask himself questions about his assurance of salvation. When Wesley was confronted with a life or death situation, he was terrified. This stood in contrast to the assurance the Moravians possessed. He sought to have salvific assurance to the same degree.² Wesley read and translated Moravian hymns from German into English as a means of pursuing his assurance of salvation. This shows how Wesley's spiritual fascination with the Moravians would influence the Methodist Movement. This story from Wesley's journal puts his faith into context.

The rise of Methodism is a historical event and our methodologies for studying this movement will use this lens. The historical nature of this project suggests primary textual research is the most desirable avenue of study. Three primary documents will be used to aid this study: *The Principles of a Methodist: Occasion'd by a Late Pamphlet [by Josiah Tucker], Intituled, A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism(1742)*, *A Pocket Hymn-book: Designed as a Constant Companion for the Pious(1790)*, and *Harmonia Coelestis(1799)*. These three works provide insight into the development of the Methodist Movement. Wesley wrote the 1742 document, which demonstrates the theology that attracted so many to his

² Heitzenrater, Richard P. *Wesley and the People Called Methodists*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1995. Print. 59-60

movement. Francis Asbury and Thomas Coke, the two bishops of America, composed the hymnbook, which further provides insight into how the Methodist version of the gospel spread in America. The third text provides an example of hymns used in the revival setting of the American context. The historical methodology may be limited in nature but it also functions as the best available tool for research. Revivals provide a good example of the limits of a historical paradigm. The only information available to scholars is what was preserved. Much of the tangible history of revivals has been lost over time. This leaves blind spots in the scholar's historical lenses. This concession does not in any way invalidate a historical approach. In fact, primary and secondary texts enlarge our understanding as much as any other methodology.

The texts written by the John and Charles Wesley provide insight into their beliefs and convictions. Secondary research can provide good information for our study. In this context primary research would involve the writings of the Wesley brothers and secondary research entails the writings of others about the Wesley brothers.

It is important to be cognizant of the assumptions of the historical method because these assumptions define the perspective through which history is viewed. In relation to this thesis, history takes the shape of place, time, and movement. The importance lies in the interaction between these parts within chronological context. The assumptions of this methodology begin with history's relevance. A historical analysis assumes history matters. It assumes, what happened in the past has influence on the present. Acknowledging these assumptions and augmenting this

research with other methods is the way to paint a more precise picture. As a means of ensuring the quality of this thesis other methodologies will be used in conjunction with history.

Musicology-Lyrics and Music Theory

Musical analysis is an effective methodology for answering the presented research question. Studying the origin of hymnody provides a foundation for understanding Wesley's use of this particular musical form. Isaac Watts pioneered the use of hymns in England a generation before the Wesley brothers. He established hymns as a legitimate musical form appropriate for a Church setting, like the Anglican Church through which Wesley was ordained. Prior to Watts, vocalized music in the Church setting consisted of Psalms, which were put to music. Sung Psalms limited musical creativity and the message the songs could convey because the lyrics were set.³ The lyrical poetry of the Bible had a predetermined message and the words were not always conducive to song, especially after translation. The hymnody of Watts featured theology different than that of Wesley's. The lyrics of Charles Wesley were more invitational than the lyrics of Watts. The uses of different types of theology made the composers and thus their hymns distinct. Watts' hymnody tended to focus on the death of Christ through hymns like "When I Survey the Wondrous Cross." Wesley wrote hymns often espousing Arminian theology like "Come, Let us Use the Grace Divine" which advocated the availability of salvation to all humanity.

³ Reynolds, William Jensen., Milburn Price, and .. *A Survey of Christian Hymnody*. Carol Stream, IL: Hope Pub., 1999. Print. 56

Lyrics are the essential part of hymnody because they convey a message within the emotional parameters of song. Hymnody as a musical form was important but it does not tell the complete story. Certain aspects of Western musical theory serve to thicken the meaning of these hymns. This will be discussed in further detail when *Harmonia Coelestis* is further examined.

Musicology, like history, has a set of assumptions. My training in music undoubtedly influences the way I interpret hymns. This knowledge of music theory, tonality, chord structure, notation, and performance from Western musical pedagogy serves to influence my thinking. This is the inherent bias I possess; I hear music from a Western perspective. This is manifested by familiarity and unfamiliarity with aspects of music theory discussed in the first eight pages of *Harmonia Coelestis*. A Demisemiquaver is likely not well known among modern Western musicians but the equivalent 32nd note is. Awareness of evolution in Western musical theory in conjunctions with my modern training will allow for a deeper exploration of hymnody.

COMPARATIVE- Watts and Dorsey

The comparative method is the final method of my study. Comparison can be applied to Methodism and the other Protestant denominations of 18th and 19th century America such as the Episcopalians, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, and Baptists. The growth of these denominations occurred in a context of unprecedented national population growth. In the 1770s three sects dominated American religious life: Congregationalists, Anglicans, and the Presbyterians

composed 55% of American religious affiliation.⁴ By 1850, The Methodists and Baptists composed the majority of religious affiliation. This comparison shows a stark contrast to be examined over the course of this study. The Congregational, Episcopal, and Presbyterian denominations of the mid to late 18th century were outcompeted by the Methodists and Baptists. The advantage of the latter groups derived from their mutual use of revival.

Jonathan Z. Smith defines comparison as “the bringing together of two or more objects for the purpose of noting either similarity or dissimilarity, (this) is the omnipresent substructure of human thought.”⁵ The comparative methodology can also be applied to noncontiguous historical events. For instance, the musical innovation of Isaac Watts (1674-1748) can be compared to the musical innovation of Tommy Dorsey (1899-1993). Both changed the standard of acceptable Church musical forms; Isaac Watts pioneered hymnody and Tommy Dorsey pioneered gospel music. Each set the stage for others after them to effectively use these musical genres.

Comparison can facilitate connections and provide insight. However, like any methodology, it has shortcomings. It assumes there are not extreme variables that could distort the comparison, and that events have contexts similar enough to merit a relational study. A comparison of the way Methodist ministers were treated during the 1770s and the 1790s illuminates this point. The location is the same, so comparison seems legitimate. However, within the context of the Revolutionary

⁴ Finke, Roger, and Rodney Starke. "How the Upstart Sects Won America: 1776-1850." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 28.1 (1989): 27-44. Print. 30

⁵ Smith, Jonathan Z. *Map Is Not Territory: Studies in the History of Religions*. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1993. Print. 240

War, the comparison is no longer useful. Patriotic colonists considered any association with England treason; therefore, it is logical to conclude they would treat missionaries from England very differently during that time period. Despite this fallibility the comparative method is a very effective tool of study because it provides a tangible quantitative method of measurement.

Personal Disclosure

As a scholar of religion I acknowledge the perspective I bring in studying Wesley's hymns and revivals. I intend to disclose information about myself to give the reader a better knowledge of my perspective. As a white, male, upper class, and musical Methodist I carry a specific viewpoint. I am an insider in the Methodist tradition as well as an insider in the tradition of Western music because I have grown up in the Church and learned music at a young age with Western pedagogy. My pursuit of a career as an ordained Methodist minister is an undoubted influence. I believe with conviction the theology I write about. I have a set of Methodist assumptions that I bring when I use historical, musical and comparative perspectives. When I do scholarly work, I attempt to restrain bias; but I know my perspective creates an inherent bias. My disclosure of my own perspective serves to educate the reader of my bias, thus creating awareness in the mind of the critical reader. Clifford Geertz's famous metaphor of the swimmer comes to mind.

Geertz's brilliant metaphor describes the insider outsider dilemma in the study of religion. He juxtaposes a swimmer's knowledge of a river with the knowledge of a hydrologist. I hope to enlighten the reader with my knowledge of

the river based on my immersion in it. I also intend to inform the reader with the empirical tools of the hydrologist.⁶

Research on the topic of Wesleyan hymnody and revivals can be approached in various ways. The methodologies of history, musicology, and comparative research focus on the growth and expansion in the movement due to revivals and hymns. Synthesizing these perspectives is of the utmost importance. Each methodology and set of methods brings a unique set of assumptions, benefits, and potential negatives. In order to compensate, scholars must analyze research questions from multiple perspectives. This creates a multi-dimensional picture of Wesleyan hymns and their niche within revivals.

A final example demonstrates a specific case where the methodologies are synthesized. George Whitefield was a friend and colleague of Wesley. The pair studied together at Oxford University and were once partners but over time theological disputes surfaced. Comparison can be used to focus on the Arminian views of Wesley in contrast with the Calvinist views of Whitefield. These are two theological schools of thought, Arminians espouse free will and Calvinists support predestination. This theology will be elaborated in chapters to come. These ideas are evidenced in lyrical differences in the hymnody performed at events led by Whitefield.⁷ The historical methodology is evoked because Wesley and Whitefield are acting within a time and place. This was reflected by the use of different lyrics in hymns when used in revival contexts, thus evoking a musical methodology. These

⁶ Geertz, Clifford. *Available Light: Anthropological Reflections on Philosophical Topics*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton UP, 2000. Print. 140

⁷ Heitzenrater, Richard P. *Wesley and the People Called Methodists*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1995. Print. 98

differences are examined through the comparative method. All three of these methodologies provide overlapping paradigms to create a more accurate picture of the Wesleyan hymnody.

Chapter 1: Foundations of Hymnody, Wesley, and Revivals in America

This chapter focuses on hymnody, the life of John Wesley, and the American context for the rapid growth of the Methodist Church. These terms will be defined in a manner that provides a background and a foundational structure for arguments to be made in later pages. Hymnody is a central concept and merits precise definition.

Hymnody

What is a hymn? In order to thoroughly examine and define this term three definitions will be given. First a broad definition contrasted by a narrow definition with an alternative definition (the definition of hymn applied to this thesis) situated between the two poles. A rudimentary Greek definition asserts, a hymn is simply “a song of praise.”⁸ Under this definition, the National Anthem can be considered a hymn. This definition is broad for three reasons. First, the expected religious element is absent because “a song of praise”⁹ could be sung to a political figure, like a monarch or war hero instead of a deity. Second, the definition lacks any reference to performance. Hymns today are almost always sung in a communal setting. Hymns are communal in nature; they are intended to create an effect on the group singing them. Something happens when people lock arms and share ideas. A sense of community can be instilled through hymn singing. Lyrics like, “let his assembled saints unite, their harmony of tongues”¹⁰ brings this idea to life. Third, this

⁸ Routley, Erik. *Christian Hymns Observed: When in Our Music God Is Glorified*. Princeton, NJ: Prestige Publications, 1982. Print. 5

⁹ Ibid. 5

¹⁰ Benjamin, Jonathan, comp. *Harmonia Coelestis a Collection of Church Music, in Two, Three, and Four Parts. With Words Adapted to Each, Comprehending Not Only the*

definition does not delineate any particular types or specific forms. Greek hymnody was fluid in this way, it required no specific forms or literary types. In contrast, modern hymns are written within a specific structure, verses alternating with a refrain or chorus. During the 18th century this format became a default format of Western religious music. Since this time, artists in the American context have adopted this structure, including The Beatles and Coldplay. The famous Beatles song “Let it Be”, features a similar pattern of verse, chorus, verse, chorus, bridge, chorus.

This ancient definition stands in contrast to a much narrower modern definition, which states; “A strophic song on a Christian subject capable of being sung by a congregation which was not in any sense made up of trained singers.”¹¹ This definition differs because it specifies structure, topic, and participants. The structure of a modern hymn is very specific. The individual lines of hymns used in the 21st century often rhyme and form verses. This is contrasted with a refrain that is sometimes a different melodic line. The strophic structure refers to the correlation between melody and lyrics. The melodic pattern is set and different lyrics are substituted to create new verses. The subject of a hymn is often very specific. If conversion were the topic of a hymn, the modern composer wrote to capture or translate the emotion of the conversion experience into the music.

Charles Wesley did so in “O For a Thousand Tongues to Sing”. He wrote, “Jesus! The

Metres in Common Use, but the Particular Metres, in the Hartford Collection of Hymns;- the Tunes Correctly Figured for the Organ and Harpsichord.--with an Inttroduction [sic], to Music. Northampton [Mass.: Printed, Typographically, by Andrew Wright, for Oliver D. & I. Cooke, Booksellers, Hartford. September, 1799. Print. 19

¹¹ Routley, Erik. *Christian Hymns Observed: When in Our Music God Is Glorified.* Princeton, NJ: Prestige Publications, 1982. Print. 4

name that charms our fears, that bids our sorrows cease.” The verbs used by Wesley create a positive feeling and associates this emotion with conversion. Lyrics like these convey the emotional aspects of Christianity that are difficult to express. This makes the subject matter of the songs pertinent in a worship setting; which leads to the final aspect of hymns, the way they are performed. This definition asserts, that hymns be sung communally. This is in contrast to the Greek definition, which suggests hymns were often sung as a solo by a trained singer. This shows a distinction between individual performance and communal engagement.

The definition of hymnody used for this thesis falls in between the Greek and modern definitions. This is a logical conclusion, because the time period being studied falls between the two, specifically, the mid 1700s to mid 1800s. The definition of hymnody applied to this thesis will be constructed by expounding upon the Greek definition of hymnody. Hymns of the 18th and 19th century communally express faith. The music forms verses often accompanied by a refrain. This structure is used to encapsulate the idea of communal participation. Hymns are more than serious songs aimed at praise; they have specificity of topic. Hymns are a translation of the emotions and doctrines of a particular belief system in musical form. Charles Wesley emphasizes the emotional aspects of praising God in his hymn. “Let Earth and Heav’n Agree”. He wrote, “Let earth and heav’n agree, Angels and men be join’d To celebrate with me the savior of mankind;”¹² The musical element aids congregants in seeking the joy found in Jesus Christ, as suggested by

¹² Wesley, John, Charles Wesley, Robert Spence, Thomas Coke, and Francis Asbury. *A Pocket Hymn-book: Designed as a Constant Companion for the Pious*. Philadelphia: Printed by Prichard and Hall, in Market Street, and Sold by John Dickins, in Fourth Street, near Race Street, 1790. Print. 123

the lyrics. Each hymn is organized in structure following a simple or complex pattern making use of verses alternating with a refrain. The congregation, or whoever is present, participates in the communal expression. However, this participation in communal expression is not limited to vocalization. An engaged listener can participate equally with a trained singer. For this thesis, a definition between the broad and narrow descriptive poles, defines hymns as songs communally sung or performed with lyrics conveying an emotional expression of religious ideas.

The word religion is a part of my definition of hymnody. This term has a very convoluted definition and genealogy. Therefore, it is important to elucidate the meaning of this term. W. C. Smith's definition of religion as "faith plus cumulative tradition"¹³ is applicable. His idea of dialectic between faith (the transcendent relationship with God) and tradition (the human derived tangible aspects of religion) is very pertinent. This dialectic of "faith and cumulative tradition"¹⁴ is evidenced in hymnody. The writings and hymns of the Wesley brothers fall under the cumulative tradition category and these works are extremely influential in development of the faith of those listening to or singing the hymns.¹⁵

John Wesley's hymnody is a huge element of "cumulative tradition." So understanding Wesley is as important as understanding hymnody. John Wesley built upon the musical foundations of others. Isaac Watts (1674-1748) was extremely influential in English hymnody. Watts wrote many hymns, which became

¹³ Smith, Wilfred Cantwell. *The Meaning and End of Religion*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Print. 156

¹⁴ Ibid. 156

¹⁵ Ibid. 156

popular in England in the early 1700s. This served as a foundation upon which John and Charles Wesley could build the Methodist movement.¹⁶ Watts transformed what people defined as church music. Isaac Watts believed church music should reflect the message of the Christian church, the message of the Gospel. Watts lived this out as a pastor in England singing hymns at his Congregational church (a non-Anglican dissenting Christian sect). Through hymnody, Watts tried to encapsulate the essence of the gospel. Up to this point, the religious music sung in the 18th century England was derived directly from the Psalms.

Congregants experience a gap from the faith of the Psalmist in the Hebrew Bible and the faith of those in the pews. Watts bridged this gap through songs expressing the emotional aspects of Christianity. He wrote music that conveyed “the thoughts and feelings of those who sang, rather than merely relate(ing) the experiences of and circumstances of Psalm writers.”¹⁷ People were able to relate to hymns because the lyrics spoke to emotions in a relevant way the Psalmist could not. Furthermore, Watts employed the use of devices such as rhyme to make the songs easier to sing and memorize. Watts wrote many hymns, which became popular in England in the early 1700s. His forms, lyrical styles, and theological devices inspired John and Charles Wesley, who built upon Watt’s foundation to create their own hymns, which were an important part of the Methodist Movement.

John Wesley-the Legendary Preacher

Christianity came across the water out of continental Europe to England in

¹⁶ Reynolds, William Jensen. *A Survey of Christian Hymnody*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963. Print. 54-57

¹⁷ Ibid. 54

the 500s through Saint Augustine of Canterbury when he successfully converted Queen Bertha. This Queen and the subsequent monarchs remained within the Catholic faith for centuries. Catholicism's stronghold in the crown of England trickled down from the Monarchy to the peasants. The monarchs did so by mingling nationalism with religion. This format remained stable until Henry the VIII upset the balance of religious power with his well-known divorce. The schism between Henry VII and the Roman Catholic Church laid the foundation for the Anglican Church. This new church was different because it no longer had any association with Catholicism from Europe. This opened the Church up to potential reforms that would otherwise have no avenue of reception.¹⁸ This separation from the Catholic Church allowed English nationalistic religion to function more freely. John Wesley capitalized on this freedom when he attempted to invert the old monarchical order of religion by building a populist movement from the ground up.

In this thesis, the rest of the Wesley brothers' story will be told as relevant to hymnody, content, use, and influence. Wesley claimed he was chosen by God to serve at a very young age. Wesley was saved from a burning house at the age of five. When he retold the story, he evoked the biblical image of "a brand plucked out of the burning" (a reference to the texts of Amos 4:11 and Zechariah 3:2).¹⁹ Wesley and others interpreted this event as divine intervention. God saved John Wesley for a purpose that is well known now, but little known in 1709. Stories like this have

¹⁸ Heitzenrater, Richard P. *Wesley and the People Called Methodists*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1995. Print. 2-3

¹⁹ Heitzenrater, Richard P., and John Wesley. *The Elusive Mr. Wesley*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1984. Print. 40

enabled John Wesley's life to take on a legendary status and provide legitimacy to his movement.

Wesley felt a divine calling; so he focused his attention towards learning, a discipline associated with clergy and teaching. By 1720 Wesley had finished his schooling and was ready to attend college. He studied at Christ Church in Oxford, England for four years and graduated with a Bachelor of Arts. Wesley continued to study, earning a Masters degree. He entered the Anglican priesthood because it was a prerequisite for a teaching position. He was challenged by his parents to "seriously examine" his life, and he did so during the Lenten season of 1725.²⁰

Living a lifestyle of extreme piety led Wesley to gain the attention of others. Wesley's resolve to spread his holy living was strong. When given the opportunity to be a missionary, he accepted the offer. Both Wesley brothers ventured to America in the 1735. Their trip did not go as planned but they planted Methodist congregations in Georgia. Upon their return to England, the ideas of their movement began to spread, and John Wesley's ministry began to flourish. The larger than life image of Wesley was in full development during his lifetime. This can be attributed to a lifestyle of outrageous piety. "The traditional rehearsal of statistics of his life speaks for itself: 250,000 miles traveled on horseback, over 40,000 sermons preached during the span of sixty years, more than 400 publications on nearly every conceivable topic, all of this activity continuing almost

²⁰ Heitzenrater, Richard P., and John Wesley. *The Elusive Mr. Wesley*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1984. Print. 50-51

to his dying day in his eighty-eighth year.”²¹ His corpus of religious work in England was enormous. This was ironically juxtaposed with his stature, 5 feet 3 inches 126 pounds, small stature for even his day. Despite his petite frame, Wesley was truly larger than life.

How does the history of John Wesley influence the study of hymnody? This background information allows us to contextualize John Wesley, the hymn-writer, and begin to understand where ideas for his hymns and their use originated. When studying Wesley it is important to state what he was not. John Wesley was not a theologian who sat at a university and devised systematized theology. Wesley was an itinerant preacher and minister. “His theology was hammered out on the anvil of controversy.”²² John Wesley dealt with theological issues as they presented themselves during his ministerial work. This differentiates him greatly from a detached theologian like Jacobus Arminius.

Wesley was indeed not a theologian in the formal sense but he did espouse certain theologies, which can be found in his sermons, including his sermon at Bristol in 1740; his writings like his pamphlet, *A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism*; and his brother’s hymns, such as, “O for a Thousand Tongues to Sing.” Wesley’s theology was developing during these years of his life and these specific theologies will be discussed later in relation to analysis of revival hymnody. Revivals are important to study because they provide space for the

²¹ Heitzenrater, Richard P., and John Wesley. *The Elusive Mr. Wesley*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1984. Print. 21

²² Ibid. 28

theology of Wesley to spread and take root. A brief historical overview of revival will help illuminate the manner revival fits into Methodist expansion.

Revivals-the American Context

Religion has been central to America since Europeans first discovered the continent. Christopher Columbus, the alleged discoverer of America, had a Catholic religious agenda when he proselytized to natives. Other settlers of religious background fled persecution in Europe and found sanctuary in the American context. Settlers like the Puritans came to America with intentions of founding the new Zion, a City on a Hill. They wanted to be a beacon shining light back to Europe, but felt a heavy burden of responsibility from God to fulfill their goal. A somewhat successful version of this idea lasted for a generation but over generations this dream of a utopian religious community began to fade. The religion of the fathers, the passionate relationship with God they possessed, became the obligatory church attendance of the sons. Over time, the Puritans realized, those in America seemed to possess the same sinful inclinations as those in Europe.²³ This waning religious interest set in motion a trend of spiritual oscillation, periods of communal commitment to religion and periods of communal preoccupation with non-religious matters. This oscillation was compounded due to new and diverse religious beliefs like those possessed by Anne Hutchinson who will be discussed in later pages. Revivals entered the American scene within this context.

²³ Cooper, William H. *The Great Revivalists in American Religion, 1740-1944: The Careers and Theology of Jonathan Edwards, Charles Finney, Dwight Moody, Billy Sunday and Aimee Semple McPherson*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland &, 2010. Print. 11-13

A revival is a religious gathering in which those in attendance experience tangible energy and transmit it amongst themselves, focusing it towards a newly found spiritual awareness that is deeply personal as well as communal. The awareness is a result of a connection with the emotional and usually salvific message of revivals. This awareness is manifested in different forms. It can be a realization of the sinful life one is leading or it can be the adoption of a new set of theological ideas. The personal and communal aspects of the revival created a dynamic of shared experience. Each attendee had a deeply personal experience but it was shared and a part of everyone else's personal experience. This dynamic served as glue facilitating the post revival changes.²⁴

In order for an event to be labeled a revival, it must have certain characteristics. These three characteristics all must be present for an event to be labeled a revival: community, inspiration, and change. Revivals must include many people. One person having a transcendent experience does not constitute a revival. Thousands gathering on a Sunday morning at a mega church is also not a revival. Revivals need to inspire those in attendance. The event must provoke communal or self-reflection, a realization that the previous method of living is inadequate. This allows a place for the new ideas of the revival to grow, leading to change. There should be a definitive change post revival manifested in the form of piety or a new systematized theology.

²⁴ McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. xvii-xxiv

The three ideas of hymnody, Wesley, and the American context provide a backdrop for this study. Much like the methodologies, these three ideas each bring a unique perspective for understanding hymnody. These lenses used in combination will allow for a more complete understanding of how hymns influenced the rapid growth of the Methodist movement.

Chapter 2: The Great Awakening

The Great Awakening created religious renewal in America. The culturally formalized and ritually structured religion imported from Europe was exchanged for personal divine experience. Obligatory church attendance was exchanged for emotional revival and psalms were exchanged for hymns. The First Great Awakening provided a solid baseline to juxtapose with the Methodist revivals of later eras. The Great Awakening occurred in a time period Methodism's fetal stages, 1739-1745.

Many Americans migrated to America for religious purposes. For these people, religion was a defining aspect of existence. The Puritans came to America with a vision to show Europeans an example of correct religious and social living.²⁵ For the Puritans conversion was a process of formulaic public testimony as opposed to a heartfelt experience. The Quakers shared a similar vision when many moved to Pennsylvania, which was founded by a Quaker, William Penn.²⁶ The Puritan and Quaker vision of religious idealism became clouded over only a few generations.

The Great Awakening reflected a larger trend in American religious history of oscillation toward and away from religious fervor. These changes were both welcomed and shunned both by ministers and common Americans. This awakening upset the balance of religious power, altering the locus of power and identity. The established powers, such as the Anglican Church, did not appreciate this shift but rising powers, like the Baptists welcomed this change with open arms.

²⁵ Lippy, Charles H. *Introducing American Religion*. London: Routledge, 2009. Print. 23-24

²⁶ Ibid. 32

Controversial is not a term that comes to mind when discussing the Great Awakening but evidence of controversy can be observed frequently throughout the movement. One might even say that the movement exceeding controversy, bordering on revolution. Scholars have argued the Great Awakening laid the groundwork for the American Revolution.²⁷ During the 1700s, much of organized religion in the American colonies was heavily influenced by European religious traditions. This distance from ecclesial authority made the stability of denominations, such as Anglicans, tenuous.²⁸ The revivals and the preaching of the Great Awakening threatened to upset what existed as an institutional balance in American organized religion even further. George Whitefield was welcomed into Anglican Churches when he first came to America, but was later shunned because of his message of rebirth in Christ. Anglican clergy were dismayed at his message; he called into question the salvation of everyone in the Church. Whitefield's "radical theology" carried potentially disastrous implications.

The Great Awakening polarized communities, events, and even individual relationships in American religious history. Some embraced the emotion and the chaos of the revival scene. Dancing, shouting, jumping, singing, falling, and laughing were all interpreted manifestations of the Holy Spirit by those who supported revivals and manifestations of insanity by those who did not. Stephen Bordley was of the latter category, rejecting revivals as religious fanaticism. Bordley wrote a letter shortly after hearing George Whitefield.

²⁷ McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. 91-96

²⁸ Ibid. 91-96

“If he is sincere, he certainly is a violent enthusiast. If not, he is a most vain and arrogant hypocrite, and I own I should rather support the latter. He falls infinitely short of our favorite pastor’s divinity, tho’ he very much exceeds him in action (sic.) (preaching style) and delivery. In short, he has the best delivery with the worst divinity that I ever met with.”²⁹

Bordley disagreed with the theology espoused by Whitfield and felt strongly that this preacher was a fraud. Others, like Josiah Smith, viewed George Whitefield very positively, labeling him a “Son of Thunder” (reference to Mark 3:17 a name Jesus calls James and John). Smith praises Whitefield for escaping “the modalities and lesser rites and forms of religion” and focusing on salvation. He goes on to elaborate on Whitefield’s “love to good men of every denomination.”³⁰ In this sense, it seems Whitefield was ahead of his time; positive ecumenical dialogue was not common in the 18th century.

The Great Awakening caused outrage, confusion, and minor schisms in Churches all over America. Many people were convinced leaders like George Whitefield and James Davenport were leading American colonists in the wrong direction. Two perspectives can be taken on the issue. The first perspective of the revival attendee asserts that the experiences of revival are genuine religious experiences producing positive change. This was logical, because many people in attendance were able to tangibly see faith through the laughing, screaming, dancing, fainting, and other emotional displays of the revivals. Espousers of traditional religious establishments held a very different perspective. They viewed revivals as

²⁹ Kidd, Thomas S. *The Great Awakening: A Brief History with Documents*. Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2008. Print. 52

³⁰ Ibid. 53-54

lunatic preachers riling poorly educated people into a falsely spiritualized frenzy. These tensions existed for the Great Awakening and the Second Great Awakening.

George Whitefield figured centrally into this controversy. He was also arguably the most famous preacher of the Great Awakening. He had a lot in common with the Wesley brothers. They influenced Whitefield, leading to his conversion at Oxford University in 1735. In 1738, Whitefield traveled to America to proselytize and was wildly successful. For the remainder of his life he would frequently travel between England and America, preaching to large crowds on both continents. This practice helped him hone his skills, employing tactics that facilitated large attendance at his gatherings. He strategically met outdoors, advertised, and traveled frequently. Meeting outdoors was advantageous for two reasons. It freed him from the restraints of seating people within a church allowing for an unlimited number of people to gather. Secondly, it stripped away denominational barriers; all were welcome to attend regardless of denominational affiliation.

Whitefield utilized advertising techniques that generated anticipation and excitement, which led to larger crowds. The itinerant or traveling aspect of his ministry allowed him to reach thousands of people. A mobile preacher brought notoriety unknown to many local preachers who did not stray far from their congregations. The techniques of Whitefield yielded great results; many were converted by his preaching. These techniques were later replicated by Methodist

itinerate preachers in the later part of the 18th century.³¹ The Great Awakening was a spike in an oscillating trend of religious preaching and conversion. The next spike would come at the Second Great Awakening, which neared the pinnacle of Methodism's explosive growth in the American context.

Francis Asbury

The Methodist Church was able to grow exponentially during the late 18th and early 19th century because of the structure of the church. This structure can largely be attributed to one man, Francis Asbury. Asbury was the mastermind behind the itinerant preaching system. The system provided both an organized hierarchy and autonomy at the local level. Francis Asbury was commissioned by Wesley to help lead the American branches of his movement. Thus, he also served as the liaison between John Wesley and the Methodist Episcopal Church (American Methodism).

Francis Asbury served America in the same manner that John Wesley served England. These two were similar in respect to their larger-than-life images. The history of Asbury's childhood is similar to Wesley's in this legendary sense. His mother claimed to see a vision from God before her son was born. This prompted her to begin the religious training of Francis at a very young age. Her training consisted of Bible reading and hymn singing. As an infant Asbury was exposed to the hymns of Isaac Watts and Charles Wesley.³²

³¹ Kidd, Thomas S. *The Great Awakening: A Brief History with Documents*. Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2008. Print. 9-11

³² Asbury, Herbert. *A Methodist Saint; the Life of Bishop Asbury*. New York: Knopf, 1927. Print. 1-2

Asbury successfully preached in England as a teenager. In his early 20s he had the opportunity to serve in America. Funded by Methodists from Bristol, Asbury set off for America with Richard Wright. The pair landed in Philadelphia on October 27, 1771. American Methodists greeted Asbury and Wright when their ship came into port. Asbury wrote in his journal, “ they bid us welcome with great affection, receiving us as angels of God.”³³ Wesley personally gave Asbury substantial leadership. Asbury held the title of John Wesley’s “assistant in America,” and reported back to Wesley frequently.³⁴

Asbury was not the first or last Methodist minister to come from England to America. In fact, he was the eighth to do so. He came to a country in its political and religious seminal stages. Settlers of European descent like the Puritans, Quakers, and German Pietists escaped the persecution of religious majorities in Europe to live in America.³⁵ Yet, religious migration created religious instability because many of these were groups in conflict, such as, the Anglicans and the Protestant denominations of Baptists and Congregationalists. Methodism entered this religious fray, around the time it was disturbed in the 1770s by the Revolutionary War.

The American Revolution created great political and religious unrest. All of the itinerant preachers sent by Wesley returned to England, except for one, Francis Asbury. He decided to stay as a means of ensuring the survival of American Methodism. Asbury led by example, preaching tirelessly from town to town while

³³ Hughes, Jessie H. *Sons of Thunder*. 1975. MS. 4

³⁴ McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. 91-96

³⁵ Lippy, Charles H. *Introducing American Religion*. London: Routledge, 2009. Print. 32-33

leading the church as bishop. If he took the path of least resistance and returned to England, the movement could have failed.³⁶

During the Revolutionary War the Methodist Movement suffered duress because of its association with England. In the eyes of Americans, Methodism like Anglicanism bordered on treason. The itinerants found themselves caught in a struggle between country and congregation. They had no desire to fight against either but nonetheless became unintended casualties of the war. Americans who interpreted their dilemma as loyalty to the crown mistreated them. Wesley's political writings did nothing to ease these tensions. To the contrary, his writings leaked from England and were interpreted as English loyalism. In the mind of the nervous colonist, Methodists were a part of an English conspiracy to recapture America.³⁷ During the American Revolution, Methodist churches were ravaged by huge declines in membership. One of Francis Asbury's churches in New York lost over half of its congregation.³⁸ The end of the war was a welcomed relief, now the Methodists could be active without fear of being labeled conspirators of the English cause. The damage done during the war healed over the following years with the credit largely due to Asbury.

Under Asbury's control the Church quickly attempted to restore its public image. The leaders did so by congratulating George Washington in writing soon after he was elected as president of the United States.³⁹ Methodists were also the

³⁶ Asbury, Herbert. *A Methodist Saint; the Life of Bishop Asbury*,. New York: Knopf, 1927. Print. 95

³⁷ Ibid. 96

³⁸ Hughes, Jessie H. *Sons of Thunder*. 1975. MS. 14

³⁹ Ibid. 13

first denomination to formally acknowledge the new country. Methodists proved themselves pragmatic by quickly accepting the outcome of the Revolutionary War.

Just as the American Revolution severed political ties, it also severed religious ties with England. The link between English Methodism and American Methodism was irreparably damaged during the war. The American Methodist Movement began to operate with much more autonomy as exemplified by its recognition of Francis Asbury as the leader of the Methodist Episcopal Church in America. Wesley recognized this and was compelled to officially recognize the American offshoot of his movement as independent in 1784. This was a loss for Wesley because it marked the moment when his Anglican reform movement failed. He originally intended to reform the Anglican Church from within but realized American Methodists had no chance of rejoining the Anglican Church rendering the separation of these two bodies permanent.⁴⁰ However, this can be viewed as a victory for the newly formed Methodist Episcopal Church because it granted full autonomy and the blessing of the founder of Methodism.

The Methodist Episcopal Church and theology

The Methodist Episcopal Church was now under the leadership of Francis Asbury, who had the vision to see Methodism as the religion of the masses. He saw the potential for growth because of the way common folk easily related to the religion. His statement in 1774 affirms this. "Oh, rare steeple houses, bells, organs – these things are against me and contrary to the simplicity of Christ."⁴¹ Asbury

⁴⁰ Hughes, Jessie H. *Sons of Thunder*. 1975. MS. 14

⁴¹ Ibid. 6

wanted to keep the movement simple and gain more traction with simple colonists by doing so.

With his new authority Asbury began to organize the Methodist Episcopal Church. The “Book of Discipline,” written in 1787, evidenced this because it featured a concise mission statement: the purpose of the Methodist Church in 1787 was “to reform the continent, and spread scripture Holiness over these lands. As proof hereof, we have seen in the course of fifteen years a great and glorious work of God from New York... even to Georgia.”⁴² The purpose of proselytizing was achieved through revival. These meetings were the structure of Methodist growth. Revivals were based on the idea of saving souls. In the “Book of Discipline,” the Methodist Episcopal Church stressed to its preachers, “you have nothing to do but save souls.”⁴³

Saving souls was of the utmost importance to John Wesley as well. He wrote and preached on the topic. A sermon he preached in 1740 at Bristol and an essay he wrote in 1742 elaborate on these ideas. Wesley espoused an Arminian theology, which developed as a response to Calvinist theologies. Wesley was not the first to espouse this theology. He followed Jacobus Arminius after whom the theology was named. Arminius was a Dutch theologian born in the later half of the 16th century. Thus, his theology existed for over century before the birth of Wesley.

Jacobus Arminius developed his theology in response to that of John Calvin. Arminius was concerned Calvinistic theology distorted the concept of God’s

⁴² McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. 272

⁴³ Ibid. 272

sovereignty and used it to devalue the responsibility of humans. In response, Arminius emphasized the responsibility of man to accept the grace offered by God. This idea stood in conflict to the Calvinist idea of “unconditional election” which asserted God’s power to chose a person to go to heaven even against his or her will. Wesley’s ideas summarize the concepts of Arminius:

“In order to reassert human free will without negating divine sovereignty, Arminius suggested that persons do make real, free choices and that God, while not causing such decisions, does know ahead of time what is going to happen. Thus, divine foreknowledge supplants divine determination as the basis of God’s sovereign relationship to creation and humanity.”⁴⁴

The theology Wesley preached was well received. According to Wesley the eternal fate of an individual was in his or her own hands. They could control their own faith destiny. Wesley like Arminius, believed Christ’s atonement was extended universally. This idea conflicted with John Calvin’s ideas of limited atonement resulting in a theological stalemate. So the two sides attempted to demonize the other by questioning the piety of the other. The Arminians accused the Calvinists of moral laxity and the Calvinists responded with accusations of Arminian questioning of God’s sovereignty. These accusations stuck in the form of the names, Calvinist and Arminian. These types of disputes are relevant to the naming of John Wesley’s movement, as Methodist was originally a derogatory term.

Wesleyan theology was foundational to the Methodist Episcopal Church. John Wesley published “The Principles of a Methodist” in 1742 followed by subsequent editions. This work was Wesley’s own elucidation of his theology. He

⁴⁴Heitzenrater, Richard P. *Wesley and the People Called Methodists*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1995. Print. 11

writes in response to what he labels as “attacks”⁴⁵ on his views. Those critiquing him argued his views were complex and contradictory using perfectionism as an example. Wesley countered with a written sequential description of salvation, the most central tenant of the Methodist faith. Salvation is critical because “saving souls” was the crux of the Methodist Movement because the movement grew primarily through conversion. The theology Wesley espoused proved to be extremely attractive, as evidenced by the incredible rise of Methodism in America in the 18th and 19th centuries.

Wesley wrote, “I believe that conversion is an instantaneous work. And that the moment a man is converted, or has living Faith in Christ he is justified.”⁴⁶ This suddenness of the conversion experience illuminates a possible reason why Methodists were such zealous evangelists. When people converted they changed instantaneously. Therefore, the exhorters received instant faith derived gratification in the form of converts encouraging them to save more souls. Many Methodist leaders like John Wesley told personal conversion stories.

Wesley’s famous story of salvation occurred at Aldersgate. He believed his experience marked a fundamental change. He wrote, “I felt my heart strangely

⁴⁵ Wesley, John, and Thomas Phillips. *The Principles of a Methodist: Occasion'd by a Late Pamphlet [by Josiah Tucker], Intitled, A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism*. Bristol: Printed by Felix Farley. And Sold at His Shop, and by John Wilson: in London, by Thomas Trye, and Thomas Harris; and at the Foundry in Upper-Moor-Fields, 1742. Print. Preface 1

⁴⁶ Wesley, John. *The Principles of a Methodist: Occasioned by a Pamphlet Intitled A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism*. London: Printed by R. Hawes, and Sold at the Foundry in Moorfields; and at the Rev. Mr. Wesley's Preaching-House, in Town and Country, 1777. Print. 15

warmed."⁴⁷ From that instantaneous moment onward, Wesley was different because of his personal relationship with Jesus Christ. The lens through which converts viewed the world was markedly different than the lens they previously held. The sinful fallibility of humanity was the fundamental premise that changed the convert's perspective. Wesley's theology of salvation can be subdivided into four sequential beliefs: prevenient grace, justification, sanctification, and perfection. These four beliefs are still foundational to the doctrine of the United Methodist Church, the modern manifestation of Wesley's movement.

Prevenient grace or preventing grace is the vehicle that allows humanity to be in relationship with God. "For the preventing grace of God, which is common to all, is sufficient to bring us to Christ, though it is not sufficient to carry us any further till we are justified."⁴⁸

The next step in the process is Justification. "The moment a man comes to Christ (by faith) he is justified, and born again."⁴⁹ This is the step when man chooses to believe in God and have a relationship with Him. This correlates with the Arminian belief that God provides every human being the option of relationship through prevenient grace. Now, the responsibility rests on the part of the individual to accept the relationship God offers. The acceptance of this relationship is justification.

⁴⁷ Heitzenrater, Richard P., and John Wesley. *The Elusive Mr. Wesley*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1984. Print. 31

⁴⁸ Wesley, John. *The Principles of a Methodist: Occasioned by a Pamphlet Intituled A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism*. London: Printed by R. Hawes, and Sold at the Foundry in Moorfields; and at the Rev. Mr. Wesley's Preaching-House, in Town and Country, 1777. Print. 21

⁴⁹ Ibid. 21

Sanctification and Perfection will be discussed together because of their correlation. Wesley believed, "Sanctification (is) the last and highest state of perfection in this life."⁵⁰ The moment when Christ has become an integral part of who the convert is. Wesley calls this the "indwelling of the spirit,"⁵¹ when a convert is more able to live a Holy life because of her "clean heart,"⁵² that is sanctification. Wesley goes on to define "a perfect man [as] one in whom God hath fulfilled his faithful word."⁵³ These are the fruits of salvation, the manifestations of a heart with the "indwelling of the spirit"⁵⁴. Wesley also tempers this claim with an acknowledgement that no man will be perfect this side of heaven. Wesley's ideas are encapsulated in a sermon preached in England in 1740:

"First. It is free in all to whom it is given. It does not depend on any power or merit in man; no, not in any degree, neither in whole, nor in part. It does not in anywise depend either on the good works or righteousness of the receiver; not on anything he has done, or anything he is. It does not depend on his endeavors. It does not depend on his good tempers, or good desires, or good purposes and intentions; for all these flow from the free grace of God; they are the streams only, not the fountain. They are the fruits of free grace, and not the root. They are not the cause, but the effects of it. Whatsoever good is in man, or is done by man, God is the author and doer of it. Thus is his grace free in all; that is, no way depending on any power or merit in man, but on God alone, who freely gave us his own Son, and "with him freely giveth us all things." (John Wesley, sermon preached in Bristol, 1740)

⁵⁰ Wesley, John. *The Principles of a Methodist: Occasioned by a Pamphlet Intituled A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism*. London: Printed by R. Hawes, and Sold at the Foundry in Moorfields; and at the Rev. Mr. Wesley's Preaching-House, in Town and Country, 1777. Print. 21

⁵¹ Ibid. 21

⁵² Ibid. 21

⁵³ Ibid. 10

⁵⁴ Ibid. 21

This sermon illustrates the democratization of grace and sequentially salvation: both are free to all. No matter who you are, where you live, and what you have done with your life, Christ extends grace toward you. This was exactly what the people on the American frontier wanted to hear. Mountaineers, farmers, pioneers, slaves, and urban folk felt disenfranchised with Calvinist theology. The new doctrines preached by Wesley and subsequent Methodist preachers provided the perfect resolution. Arminian theology placed the power of salvation in the hands of common folk. This resolution allowed for those once disenfranchised to be awakened.

The process of salvation was described in detail through Wesleyan hymn lyrics. The goal of the Methodist movement was to “save souls.” Therefore, they wanted to take people along this path to conversion. This opening hymn of *A Pocket Hymn-book: Designed as a Constant Companion for the Pious* provides a synopsis of Wesleyan salvation. Francis Asbury and Thomas Coke published this salvific hymnbook in 1790. The hymnal features a topical organization. The table of contents has been transcribed:

“Awakening and Inviting	5
Penitential	22
Petition	43
Rejoicing	123
Praise	143
Trusting in Providence	158
Suffering	170
Funeral	174
Fellowship	180
Backsliding	202
Nativity	208
New-Year	211
Good-Friday	213

Praise	215
Morning and Evening	217
Sacramental	219
Parting	257
Christmas Hymns	275” ⁵⁵

The organization of this hymnbook walks through the steps of salvation. “Awakening and Inviting” presents the open invitational offer of salvation as described through “O For a Thousand Tongues to Sing”. “Penitential” describes the feeling of remorse accompanying the new believer’s realization of sin. This turns into “Petition”; begging for God’s forgiveness. When this forgiveness is granted “Rejoicing” occurs. The new believer is overjoyed to be forgiven and be in relationship with God. When the believer comes to understand the might of God she cannot refrain from “Praise.” These first five sections constitute the majority of the hymnbook, illustrating the value Francis Asbury and Thomas Coke placed on these concepts of salvation. The first hymn in the hymnbook emphasizes this idea. It is a famous piece by Charles Wesley entitled “O for a Thousand Tongues to Sing.”

**O for a thousand tongues to sing
My great Redeemer’s praise,
The glories of my God and King,
The triumphs of His grace!**

**My gracious Master and my God,
Assist me to proclaim,
To spread through all the earth abroad
The honors of Thy name.**

⁵⁵ Wesley, John, Charles Wesley, Robert Spence, Thomas Coke, and Francis Asbury. *A Pocket Hymn-book: Designed as a Constant Companion for the Pious*. Philadelphia: Printed by Prichard and Hall, in Market Street, and Sold by John Dickins, in Fourth Street, near Race Street, 1790. Print. 277

**Jesus! the name that charms our fears,
That bids our sorrows cease;
'Tis music in the sinner's ears,
'Tis life, and health, and peace.**

**He breaks the power of canceled sin,
He sets the prisoner free;
His blood can make the foulest clean,
His blood availed for me.**

**Look unto Him, ye nations, own
Your God, ye fallen race;
Look, and be saved through faith alone,
Be justified by grace.**

**See all your sins on Jesus laid:
The Lamb of God was slain,
His soul was once an offering made
For every soul of man.**

**With me, your chief, ye then shall know,
Shall feel your sins forgiven;
Anticipate your heaven below,
And own that love is heaven.⁵⁶**

This hymn is a microcosm of the Methodist Movement. Charles Wesley's lyrics express the same message as John Wesley's *The Principles of a Methodist*, first published in 1742. The hymn begins with a doxology praising God for His greatness and encouraging others to join. The last line of the first stanza concludes "triumphs of His grace." This alludes to the prevenient grace discussed by Wesley in his pamphlet. The idea that Christ died for everyone ensured the ability of all humanity to be in relationship with God, a fundamental idea that facilitated the spread of the Methodist Movement.

⁵⁶ Wesley, John, Charles Wesley, Robert Spence, Thomas Coke, and Francis Asbury. *A Pocket Hymn-book: Designed as a Constant Companion for the Pious*. Philadelphia: Printed by Prichard and Hall, in Market Street, and Sold by John Dickins, in Fourth Street, near Race Street, 1790. Print. 5

The conversion narrative continues in the next stanza. Now the gospel cultivates the heart of the convert. Her reaction is to spread the joyous news, to tell everyone of her experience. The new convert prays to God, asking for help to spread this story. The text speaks plainly, “assist me to proclaim, to spread through all the earth abroad, the honors of Thy name.” The experience is so powerful the convert must share it, and encourage others to follow in her footsteps.

The following two stanzas address the sacrifice of Jesus. The closing two lines of the fourth stanza capture this message. “His blood can make the foulest clean, His blood availed for me.” The message concerns the sacrificial death of Jesus Christ. The suffering of Jesus Christ thousands of years ago allows for liberty today. This idea of penal substitutionary atonement balances the scales of eternal justice. The perfection of Jesus makes up for the sin of man. This justice provides the avenue of divine relationship accepted by the individual through Arminian theology. The transition Charles Wesley makes between lines three and four of the fourth stanza brings this point home. He changes from third person theology to a first person assertive statement. “His blood availed for me.” (Keep in mind, these words were intended to be sung by believers and potential converts.) The rhetorical devices used by Charles Wesley create a change from a detached theology to an intimate first person claim. By singing, the hymn participants are agreeing with the theology and claiming it as their own.

Justification by faith is the topic of the next stanza. This is the conception that sinners need to accept God’s offer of salvation. People must accept God’s love by believing, to be in relationship with Him. Charles Wesley made an important

clarification, when he wrote, “be saved through faith alone.” John Wesley also wrote against the possibility of works or good deeds allowing salvation in his work, “The Principles of a Methodist”. However, he does stress that good works are manifestations of God’s spiritual indwelling.

The final stanza discusses both assurance of salvation and perfection, two important principles in the Wesleyan concept of salvation. Assurance of salvation is the point at which a believer knows she is going to heaven. Evidenced in the lines, “With me, your chief, ye then shall know, Shall feel your sins forgiven, Anticipate your Heaven below.” These lines also exalt the emotionalism of Methodism and the movement’s focus on individual experience. Charles Wesley implores the hymn singer to use her senses to grasp transcendent concepts.

Once a believer has an assurance of faith, the fulfillment of that faith can take place. This idea correlates with Perfection. This does not mean a believer becomes sinless. It simply means he or she is living a life reflecting the values of Christianity. Believers attempt and partially succeed as they try to emulate Jesus Christ, as described in the New Testament. This is the final step of the process of salvation as described by “O for a Thousand Tongues to Sing”.

Chapter 3: The Second Great Awakening

The Great Awakening and the American Revolution altered the religious landscape of America. A new scale measured religion, predominantly judging authenticity through personal experience. The post-revolutionary American idea of culturally acceptable divine and personal experience evolved from the intolerant Puritan understanding. Anne Hutchinson was an example of this intolerance because she was banished from the Massachusetts Bay Colony in 1637 for her continual claims of personal revelation from God. By 1739, evangelicals such as Gilbert Tennent in his sermon the “Danger of An Unconverted Ministry” claimed personal experience with the divine. Furthermore, he claimed that personal experience with God was the only way to confirm faith; something the Puritans deemed heretical, Gilbert Tennent espoused as the normative standard just over 100 years later. This reflected a new standard for religious experience set in place by the Great Awakening and applying to the Second Great Awakening.

The Second Great Awakening occurred roughly a generation after the Great Awakening, circa 1795-1835.⁵⁷ This movement, like the one before it, featured both social and religious changes. Conversion remained the central goal of the movement similar to the Great Awakening. The Itinerant preachers of this movement converted previously unchurched people and spiritually reenergized those who had experience with the church.

⁵⁷ McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. 384

For several reasons, the Second Great Awakening superseded the previous Great Awakening. Many attendees knew about the meeting's revivalistic potential. They prayed for God to stir hearts, thus changing their large gathering into a revival. Not every meeting turned into a revival, but the right blend of people, preaching, and emotion could stir many souls into revival. Attendees possessed a familiarity with these conventional aspects augmented by advertisements and widespread transmission of ideas through word of mouth. Similar events had been occurring since the 1730s further contributing to this familiarity. The infrastructure in America had improved facilitating the spread of ideas through roads and canals. Eventually, the excitement from individual revivals unified to form the Second Great Awakening.

The climate of post-revolution America created religious needs different than those met by the Great Awakening. Rationalist and Deist ideas circulated, stressing the goodness of human beings. This stood in contrast with revivalists preaching that espoused the fallibility of humanity and its need for a Savior. When colonists migrated out of the original 13 colonies, many became less religious. This was often due to the inaccessibility of religion. People could not attend church because the buildings did not exist on the frontier. Furthermore, the difficulty of travel made reaching a church or belonging to a congregation more difficult. Due to this, geography was a crucial part of the Second Great Awakening. People moved west outside of the established religious structure. The census of 1790 reported 94% of

Americans lived within the boundaries of the 13 original colonies.⁵⁸ This was contrasted with census of 1820, which reported, a fourth of all Americans lived outside of the 13 original colonies.⁵⁹ The population growth demonstrated a trend of Western migration. The growing frontier population of America significantly contributed to religious growth correlated with revivals. For example, Kentucky in 1790 claimed 73,000 residents in the state. Only a decade later, the population had swelled to 220,000.

This immense growth was too quick for any religious groups to keep pace. People moved to Kentucky faster than Methodists could establish itinerant preaching networks and congregations. After the migratory populations became stable and these itinerant networks were established, many people joined the Methodist Movement. This explains why so many people converted simultaneously, as evidenced by the Cane Ridge Revival of 1801. Thousands gathered for emotional preaching, singing, and dancing. The emotional appeal of revival often instigated conversion. Music conveyed these emotions extremely well.

Harmonia Coelestis

Two years prior to the Cane Ridge Revival at the turn of the 18th century, a hymnbook called *Harmonia Coelestis a Collection of Church Music, in Two, Three, and Four Parts. With Words Adapted to Each, Comprehending Not Only the Metres in Common Use, but the Particular Metres, in the Hartford Collection of Hymns; the Tunes Correctly Figured for the Organ and Harpsichord* was published as a hymnbook to be

⁵⁸ Hankins, Barry. *The Second Great Awakening and the Transcendentalists*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2004. Print. 2

⁵⁹ Ibid. 3

used at revivals. This text, compiled by Jonathan Benjamin, provides insight into the relationship of hymnody and revivals.⁶⁰ The text shows this relationship through music theory instruction in the introduction, theology in the lyrics, and its commitment to the American context. In many aspects, it is similar to the hymnbook published by Francis Asbury and Thomas Coke nine years prior.

The introduction of *Harmonia Coelestis* reveals its intended use in the American context because the first eight pages teach basic music theory. Musical literacy was rare in America unlike in the European context. To further support this claim, the title page reads, "Never before printed in America."⁶¹ On page two, the text identifies some basic musical concepts. Pitch is among the first described and elaborated through pictures as well as definitions of flats, sharps, and naturals. The introduction also depicts the values of rests labeling them by archaic names such as, Semibreve (whole rest), Minim (half rest), Crochet (quarter rest), Quavers (8th rest), Semiquavers (16th rest), and Demisemiquavers (32nd rest).⁶² In addition, the book teaches some stylistic elements of music like slurs and triplets. It concludes with a discussion of bar lines, repeats, and double bar lines. These serve to divide the music into sections and inform singers when a song repeats or ends.⁶³

⁶⁰ McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. 213

⁶¹ Benjamin, Jonathan, comp. *Harmonia Coelestis a Collection of Church Music, in Two, Three, and Four Parts. With Words Adapted to Each, Comprehending Not Only the Metres in Common Use, but the Particular Metres, in the Hartford Collection of Hymns; - the Tunes Correctly Figured for the Organ and Harpsichord.--with an Inttroduction [sic], to Music*. Northampton Mass.: Printed, Typographically, by Andrew Wright, for Oliver D. & I. Cooke, Booksellers, Hartford. September, 1799. Print. 1

⁶² Ibid. 3

⁶³ Ibid. 3

The discussion of metre reminds the hymn singer why hymnody was superior to singing the Psalms. Benjamin cites three categories of metre or time signature, common time, treble time, and compound time.⁶⁴ These three metres made the beat of the music easier to follow. Common time includes what modern musicians would view as standard time signatures like $\frac{4}{4}$, $\frac{4}{2}$, or $\frac{2}{4}$. The upper number in the sequence symbolizes how many beats are in the measure and the bottom number symbolizes what note is the beat. In $\frac{4}{4}$ time the quarter note is the beat and there are four beats per measure. Benjamin describes variations of $\frac{3}{4}$ time (when there are three beats per measure) as treble time. The beat indicated by this time signature has a waltz-like feel. These time signatures or “moods of time”⁶⁵ provided a framework for the hymnody of this period. This framework facilitated the emotional singing of hymns. Once people could navigate the music with ease, then they could emotionally invest in its lyrics.

Jonathan Benjamin provides more instruction on intervals, major keys, minor keys, solfege, transposition, and singing. His instruction on singing the hymns is particularly applicable. “Pay particular attention to your subject. A man (sic.) who does not feel, or at least seem to feel what he is performing, has no reason to expect

⁶⁴ Benjamin, Jonathan, comp. *Harmonia Coelestis a Collection of Church Music, in Two, Three, and Four Parts. With Words Adapted to Each, Comprehending Not Only the Metres in Common Use, but the Particular Metres, in the Hartford Collection of Hymns;- - the Tunes Correctly Figured for the Organ and Harpsichord.--with an Inttroduction [sic], to Music.* Northampton Mass.: Printed, Typographically, by Andrew Wright, for Oliver D. & I. Cooke, Booksellers, Hartford. September, 1799. Print. 5

⁶⁵ Ibid. 5

a bystander will.”⁶⁶ Here, Benjamin advocates emotional singing as a crucial aspect of frontier and revival hymnody.

The lyrics of these songs influenced revival conversions with emotional and musical roots. These lyrics encouraged people to take action. “All hail the pow’r of Jesus’ name, let angels prostrate fall.”⁶⁷ Frontier farmers singing these hymns at revivals, could have easily experienced and enacted these emotional lyrics. Falling prostrate fits into the revivalist idea of tangible manifestations of spiritual power. Some of the lyrics in this hymnal espouse a strong Arminian message and some lyrics espouse a Calvinistic theology. This hymnal possesses internal theological tension. The original Charles Wesley and Isaac Watts held different theological beliefs. Watts believed in the theology of John Calvin as demonstrated by lyrics, “Who shall the Lord’s elect condemn, ‘Tis God that justifies their souls.”⁶⁸ This strong endorsement of Calvinistic theology supports itself by condemning the contradicting theological stance. The “elect” undoubtedly refers to those chosen by God to go to heaven according to John Calvin’s theology. This idea contradicted Wesley’s idea that all men had the opportunity to be saved and go to heaven. The choice to follow God was a human responsibility rather than a divine responsibility.

⁶⁶ Benjamin, Jonathan, comp. *Harmonia Coelestis a Collection of Church Music, in Two, Three, and Four Parts. With Words Adapted to Each, Comprehending Not Only the Metres in Common Use, but the Particular Metres, in the Hartford Collection of Hymns;- - the Tunes Correctly Figured for the Organ and Harpsichord.--with an Inttroduction [sic], to Music.* Northampton Mass.: Printed, Typographically, by Andrew Wright, for Oliver D. & I. Cooke, Booksellers, Hartford. September, 1799. Print. 8

⁶⁷ Ibid. 13

⁶⁸ Ibid. 17

Other lyrics in the hymnal evoked a communal message, effectively creating a shared experience. "Let his assembled saints unite, their harmony of tongues."⁶⁹ Expounding on this communal idea, the following quote clearly proclaims a similar communal and salvific message, "Come to the living water come, Sinners obey your maker's call, Return ye weary wand'ers home, and find my grace, and find my grace reach'd out to all."⁷⁰ Another essential aspect of the communal experience was the democratization of grace. God died for everyone present at the revival. Therefore, many societal class distinctions were temporarily washed away. Sometimes even slaves were a part of these events. The inviting message embodied by these lyrics propelled individual revivals and sequentially the Second Great Awakening.

Peter Cartwright

Peter Cartwright embodied the narrative of the Second Great Awakening. He serves as an example of a product and a proponent of the movement. He was influenced by the emotionalism of the movement. Cartwright serves as a window through which to view the Second Great Awakening so hymnody's niche can be fully understood.

After his conversion during the early years of the Second Great Awakening Peter Cartwright became a significant and almost archetypal leader of Methodism. Cartwright was of frontier stock, much different than the English heritage of Francis

⁶⁹ Benjamin, Jonathan, comp. *Harmonia Coelestis a Collection of Church Music, in Two, Three, and Four Parts. With Words Adapted to Each, Comprehending Not Only the Metres in Common Use, but the Particular Metres, in the Hartford Collection of Hymns;- - the Tunes Correctly Figured for the Organ and Harpsichord.--with an Inttroduction [sic], to Music.* Northampton Mass.: Printed, Typographically, by Andrew Wright, for Oliver D. & I. Cooke, Booksellers, Hartford. September, 1799. Print. 19

⁷⁰ Ibid. 44

Asbury. Cartwright was born in Amherst Virginia in 1785. Five years after his birth his family moved to the frontier of Kentucky. Cartwright was an American born Methodist raised in the religiously, socially, and politically decentralized frontier.⁷¹ The rise of Peter Cartwright exemplifies the growth of the Methodist Movement because its leadership was found within the American context instead of England

The decentralization of the frontier allowed Cartwright to engage in practices he may have avoided elsewhere. As a youth, Cartwright gambled, raced horses, and partied. This lifestyle was pleasing to him until he had an epiphany in his late teens. One night, the way home from a dance, the weight of his sins came crashing down on him. Cartwright realized his life to that point had been a meaningless existence.⁷²

He grappled with these emotions, which came to a point in 1801. Cartwright wrote in his journal:

“In the midst of a solemn struggle of soul, ... an impression was made on m mind, as though a voice said to me, ‘Thy sins are all forgiven thee.’ Divine light flashed all around me, unspeakable joy sprung up in my soul. I rose to my feet, opened my eyes, and it really seemed as if I was in heaven. The trees, the leaves on them, and everything seemed, and I really thought were, praising God.”⁷³

His life-changing experience with the divine left a life-long impression on Peter Cartwright. He was far from alone in having tangible divine experiences. Cartwright was among the thousands of people overwhelmed by the emotional appeal of the Cane Ridge Revival in 1801.

⁷¹ Bray, Robert C. *Peter Cartwright, Legendary Frontier Preacher*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 2005. Print. 1

⁷² Hughes, Jessie H. *Sons of Thunder*. 1975. MS. 57

⁷³ Bray, Robert C. *Peter Cartwright, Legendary Frontier Preacher*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 2005. Print. 30

After this pivotal moment in his life, Cartwright began to spread his new faith. He successfully converted many of his friends and as his popularity grew, other Methodist itinerants noticed him. He then joined their number when he eventually accepted an assignment to form a circuit. This assignment was daunting for the young man. At first Cartwright felt unqualified arguing he did not have the correct education to be a circuit rider. He talked with minister John Page about his problem. Cartwright wrote, "He (Page) then told me that this(circuit riding) was the very best school or college that I could find between Heaven and Earth."⁷⁴ The response of Page shows the Methodist prioritization of itinerant, revival preaching over education. Knowledge from the seminary was definitely education but this paled in comparison to the learning derived from preaching and "saving souls." The lessons learned through circuit riding created an education more desirable than the seminary education. This emphasizes the point, "saving souls" was the most important aspect of Methodism. The saving of souls was accomplished through the emotional revivals of which hymnody was a central part.

Once Cartwright entered the organization of the Methodist Church he began to climb his way up the ranks. He was successful within his circuit and next elevated to the post of junior preacher. Before his 20th birthday Cartwright was working fulltime as a circuit rider. This was quite difficult for the young man because it forced him to bid goodbye to his family and life in Kentucky. He wrote, "I literally gave up the world"⁷⁵ He was now fully committed to the work of The Methodist

⁷⁴ Hughes, Jessie H. *Sons of Thunder*. 1975. MS. 58

⁷⁵ Ibid. 59

Episcopal Church. Cartwright gave up his world to save others from their sinful worlds.

In April of 1820 Cartwright experienced the power of music used in a religious setting. This probably evoked memories of the way music contributed to the Cane Ridge Revival 19 years prior. Peter Cartwright was traveling with a companion on the way to annual conference when he stopped in the Alleghany Mountains. The pair stayed an additional day to rest on the Sabbath. They were hosted by a local preacher and were asked to preach to his congregation. Cartwright's companion preached to a full church of disengaged mountaineers. Cartwright had an opportunity to speak and wrote in his journal:

“I had profound attention from a cabin full of these mountaineers, yet the preaching did not seem to have any effect whatever. When I closed, I called on our kind local preacher to conclude. He rose and began to sing a mountain song, and pat his foot, and clap his hands, and ever and anon would shout at the top of his speech, ‘Pray Brethren.’ In a few minutes the whole house was in an uproarious shout. When Brother Walker and I got a chance to talk, I said: ‘Well, sir, I tell you this local preacher can do more in singing, clapping, and stamping, than all our preaching put together.’”⁷⁶

The preaching of the pastors by itself was not enough to visibly stir the hearts of the congregation. Music evoked an emotional response when preaching could not. The pairing of preaching and music produced the emotionalism driving the Second Great Awakening.

Peter Cartwright continued his successful itinerant preaching career and expanded his circuit to the point that he could not visit every stop annually. After a

⁷⁶ Cartwright, Peter, and Charles Langworthy Wallis. *Autobiography of Peter Cartwright: With an Introduction, Bibliography, and Index*. New York, NY: Abingdon, 1956. Print. 138

few years of service including a very difficult appointment in the Marietta district, Francis Asbury ordained Peter Cartwright a deacon in 1806. Soon after Cartwright became an elder. In only eight years, from age 16 to 23 Cartwright departed his life of sin to become an ordained elder of the Methodist Episcopal Church. From this point onward to 1824 Cartwright's life remained mostly stable. He maintained his position as a circuit rider in the Kentucky and Tennessee area. The rising tensions of the abolitionist movement and his support for the abolitionist cause compelled Cartwright to move to the northern state of Illinois.

Peter Cartwright possessed many traits similar to John Wesley. Cartwright like Wesley engaged in politics. Cartwright famously lost to future President Abraham Lincoln in a senatorial election.⁷⁷ Both Cartwright and Wesley evoked the legendary archetype of the circuit rider. The statistics of Cartwright's life demonstrate, he preached over 14,000 times, led 10,000 people into the Methodist Episcopal Church, and baptized around 12,000. These statistics shed light on the broad scope of his ministry. Cartwright personified the larger-than-life ethos of itinerant preachers like Wesley and Asbury. Cartwright paved the way for Methodism in the Western states of Kentucky, Tennessee, and Illinois. Cartwright's work in the frontier was crucial because he helped organized the networks used for revivals ensuring emotional message of Methodism found a home these frontier states.

The Methodist conference of his time lauded him for his immense service. Cartwright, like Asbury, was honored for 50 years of service. Peter Cartwright was

⁷⁷ Bray, Robert C. *Peter Cartwright, Legendary Frontier Preacher*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 2005. Print. 136

born while John Wesley was alive; he served on America's greatest Methodist Bishop (Francis Asbury), and was the most tenured Methodist at the time of his death.⁷⁸ The Methodist Movement became self-perpetuating during the Second Great Awakening. The movement drew on its own converts to expand the message through the emotionalism of revivals. Peter Cartwright was both a product and a proponent of the Second Great Awakening. Peter Cartwright carried the torch passed down from Wesley through Asbury to himself. He used this torch to show thousands of people the divine light he saw so clearly in 1801 at the Cane Ridge Revival over the course of his 50 years of ministry.

⁷⁸ Hughes, Jessie H. *Sons of Thunder*. 1975. MS. 70

Conclusion: the Decline and Re-Emergent Modern Revival

Revivals were the central reason Methodism succeeded. Hymns, served as an important component of this larger narrative. Hymns extended influence beyond quarterly meetings and revivals. As Francis Asbury and Thomas Coke wrote in their 1790 Hymnbook, hymns were intended for “personal devotion.”⁷⁹ In the preface to the hymnal, they listed personal devotion before communal worship and the other uses of hymnody. The vision of a Christian life championed by these two Bishops featured hymnody as a central element of the Methodist Episcopal Church. The Methodist Movement reached out to Americans through the head and the heart. Wesleyan hymnody cultivated the hearts of Methodists as their minds wrestled through the steps of salvation. Hymnody helped people realize their sin, repent, and embrace the salvific relationship offered through Jesus Christ’s sacrifice. And yet, hymns were even more than that. They also served the to deepen the devotion of those who already believed. They were, in fact, *A Constant Companion for the Pious*.

Revivals and hymnody can be related an intense storm and the calm that follows. Revivals were intense, faith-based emotional storms, which produced change. Hymns equate to the calm periods after the storm when people assess what happened and absorb the change. The ideas in the pages of hymnbooks provided consistent teaching for congregation members. The hymnal stood next to the Bible

⁷⁹ Wesley, John, Charles Wesley, Robert Spence, Thomas Coke, and Francis Asbury. *A Pocket Hymn-book: Designed as a Constant Companion for the Pious*. Philadelphia: Printed by Prichard and Hall, in Market Street, and Sold by John Dickins, in Fourth Street, near Race Street, 1790. Print. A 2

as the most used text of Methodism, often found in the hands of circuit riders and congregation members alike.

The defining of Greek and modern hymnody provided insight into our definition of 18th and 19th century hymnody. The large historical lens used in this study of hymnody currently shows the decline of both hymnody and the Methodist church. The Methodist Church has seen recent decline in membership, peaking at 10,789,624 in the 1960s and declining since.⁸⁰ The communal element of hymn singing seems to point to a correlated decline. Less people in the pews on a Sunday translates to less exposure and thus less popularity of Methodist hymns. This lack of popularity can be tied back to revivals because the 21st century United Methodist Church does not utilize revivals like its historical counterpart. A tracing of the history of the movement can help to find the locus of this decline in its context, showing how the United Methodist Church arrived in its current location.

The Methodist Movement began in England with John Wesley. Students at Oxford University mocked Wesley's group by making derogatory remarks on their "methods" of piety. Despite this, the movement grew, expanding into the American context. In 1770, there were 1,000 Methodists in America.⁸¹ This number grew dramatically through the itinerant preaching system organized by Francis Asbury. By 1820, there were 250,000 Methodists in America.⁸² This number continued to

⁸⁰ Gilbert, Kathy L. "Giving, Membership Decline in Recession." *UMC.org*. United Methodist Church, 8 Mar. 2010. Web. March Mar. 20. <<http://www.umc.org/site/apps/nlnet/content3.aspx?c=IwL4KnN1LtH&b=2789393&ct=8065437>>.

⁸¹ McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. 387

⁸² *Ibid.* 387

grow, and by 1850, over a third of all American church memberships were Methodist (more than 2.5 million),⁸³ making it the most dominant denomination in America. The Methodist Movement experienced exponential growth in the 80 years that it went from a tiny minority to claiming the largest affiliation of any denomination in America.

This growth can be attributed to the use of revivals, Wesleyan theology, hymnody, the organizational structure of the Methodist Episcopal Church, and the political culture of the post Revolutionary War United States of America.⁸⁴ The story of the growth of the Methodist Church has been told through the narratives of John Wesley, Francis Asbury, and Peter Cartwright. Each individual voice overlaps with the other. Wesley commissioned Asbury to be his assistant in America and traveled to America in 1771. In 1806, Asbury ordained Cartwright a deacon. The overlapping narratives of these three Methodist “saints” provide insight into the reasons why the movement was able to grow through revival.

Social Formation

The success of their movement was documented in *The Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Methodist Episcopal Church*. Hymnody was a part of this growth and can be categorized under Russell McCutcheon’s phases of “social formation.”⁸⁵ McCutcheon’s phases of social formation provide a descriptive perspective analyzing the communal aspects of hymns. This served as the capstone of the bridge

⁸³ McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print. 387

⁸⁴ Finke, Roger, and Rodney Starke. "How the Upstart Sects Won America: 1776-1850." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 28.1 (1989): 27-44. Print. 27-43

⁸⁵ McCutcheon, Russell T. *Critics Not Caretakers: Redescribing the Public Study of Religion*. Albany: State University of New York, 2001. Print. 29

connecting the individual experience of the hymn singer to the Methodist Movement. McCutcheon breaks up this concept into three distinct stages. He states that there are:

“Three phases in the life of any social formation: *dominant* (when a social system reproduces its authority effectively in the midst of ongoing natural disruptions), *residual* (when, due to changing natural conditions, a social system formed in the past is no longer able to reproduce its authority and legitimacy yet remains effective in the present), and *emergent* (when, in the wake of natural disruptions, novel or experimental forms of authority and attendant social organization are developing).”⁸⁶

These three phases are evident in Methodism. The first *emergent* stage had a dual locus. The first originated in England during the 1730s while John and Charles Wesley studied at Oxford. They founded their “Holy Club” and the movement began to gain traction. The second locus grew in the American context where Bishop Asbury began the process of reorganizing the Methodist Church after the Revolutionary War. During this period, Methodism internally organized in order to enable future expansion accomplished through the use of internal hierarchical structure and the circuit rider or itinerant preaching system. Methodism was *emergent* in this stage (1776) because their membership numbered 4,921 led by 24 itinerant preachers.⁸⁷

The *dominant* stage of Methodism became apparent in certain areas in the early 1800s. By 1820 the number of affiliated Methodists had increased to

⁸⁶ McCutcheon, Russell T. *Critics Not Caretakers: Redefining the Public Study of Religion*. Albany: State University of New York, 2001. Print. 29

⁸⁷ *Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Methodist Episcopal Church, for the Years 1773-1828*. New York: T. Mason and G. Lane, 1840. Print. 7

256,881.⁸⁸ This number increased by 15,957 from the previous year.⁸⁹ The numbers kept growing and by 1839, Methodists numbered at 650,357.⁹⁰ The movement was *dominant* in frontier states like Kentucky, Ohio, and Illinois. The Ohio conference boasted 51,945 members and the largest membership of any Methodist conference at the time.⁹¹

The *residual* stage of Methodism can be seen today. It is difficult to locate the precise time when Methodism began to decline. Some scholars have suggested it began at the same time the Methodist Church moved away from the itinerant preaching system and organized pastors into specific local congregations.⁹² Yet contemporary Methodism is still hanging on to its once culturally dominant message in a time when it does not seem as relevant. This message of the democratization of grace is no longer novel and the appeal of hymnody as a new musical form has long since faded. The movement has lost a huge amount of its market share in the “American religious economy.”⁹³

The macro historical lens of *emergent*, *dominant*, and *residual* also provides insight into hymnody as a musical form. This can be properly described through Isaac Watts (the emergent phase), John and Charles Wesley (the dominant phase),

⁸⁸ *Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Methodist Episcopal Church, for the Years 1773-1828*. New York: T. Mason and G. Lane, 1840. Print. 346

⁸⁹ *Ibid.* 346

⁹⁰ *Ibid.* 679

⁹¹ *Ibid.* 679

⁹² Finke, Roger, and Rodney Starke. "How the Upstart Sects Won America: 1776-1850." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 28.1 (1989): 27-44. Print. 41

⁹³ Finkie, Roger, and Rodney Stark. "How the Upstart Sects Won America: 1776-1850." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 28 (1989): 27-44. Print. 28

and modernity (the residual stage). The genealogy of hymnody traces its initial history from and then through a Christological reinterpretation of the Psalmist.

“Isaac Watts’s innovative restoration of the Christological interpretation of the Psalms in the early eighteenth century led eventually to an acceptance of non-biblical hymns in most reformed rites; this practice is ironically more in line with the New Testament than the use of psalms alone.”⁹⁴

This new *emergent* interpretation of worship adapted a change in musical style. The Psalms were no longer sung line by line in irregular patterns. Patterns and styles of lyrics created songs with standard rhythms and singable tunes, which reinforced the emergence of a new genre. This new framework provided flexibility and creativity for the composer, allowing for a product much more appealing to the congregation member singing the hymn. Subsequently, the idea of composing hymns with specific theological ideas eventually became the standard genre of religious music in Christian traditions.⁹⁵

Wesleyan hymnody of the mid 18th century and onward seemed to be the *dominant* stage of hymns as a musical form in the Methodist Episcopal Church and other Protestant denominations. The hymns of this era long outlasted their composers. The timeless element of these hymns is encapsulated in their emotional translation of salvation into music. The beauty of the musical form and theology couched within it appealed to 18th and 19th century Americans.

Contemporary society views hymnody as an archaic form of music, more related to Gregorian chant than rock music heard on the radio. Most ‘millennials’

⁹⁴ Wainwright, Geoffrey, and Tucker Karen B. Westerfield. *The Oxford History of Christian Worship*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2006. Print. 784

⁹⁵ Ibid. 785

interpret the musical form as dated and irrelevant. The message of the lyrics fits into a similar vein, a message clothed in archaic language repeating something already known. Hymnody is still present but it is much less effective than it has been in the past. Many Churches, such as my own, Christ Church United Methodist in Fort Lauderdale, Florida have services that feature electric guitars, drum sets, microphones rather than traditional hymnody accompanied by an organ.

Today the Methodist Church, along with many other protestant denominations finds itself in the state of decline. The Methodist Church that once numbered over 10.7 million members now has 7,774,420 members nationwide. The past decade saw a precipitous drop of 589,164 members.⁹⁶ The United Methodist Church reached out to combat this decline with attempts to create growth. The church fights decline through two avenues: national conferences encouraging youth to join the church as clergy and summer camps intended to draw youth into the church.

Modern Revival-Exploration 2011

Tri-annually, the United Methodist Church has a conference with a focus on encouraging young people to explore full-time ordained ministry. I attended one of these conferences in November 2011 in Saint Louis, Missouri. My experience at this “modern revival” revealed the re-*emergent* intentions of the United Methodist Church to address decline in membership. The themes were very similar evoking historical revivals that focused on generating excitement and commitment to the

⁹⁶ "2010 State of the Church: Membership." *UMC.org*. United Methodist Church, Jan. 2010. Web. 30 Mar. 2012.
<<http://www.umc.org/site/c.lwL4KnN1LtH/b.6072819/k.2327/Membership.htm>>

Methodist Church. The smaller aspects of the revival proved insignificant. The setting differed from a historical revival; the open air of the frontier was replaced by the air conditioning of the Millennium Hotel. The level of education was drastically different as well with seminaries were present recruiting the best and brightest Methodist youth. Unlike the frontier, a degree, not solely a call from God, is now required for ordination.

Despite these differences, the main ideas struck a revivalist tone. There was tangible excitement about Methodism. The emotional appeal of the movement was still leveraged and present. Adam Hamilton, the pastor of a 10,000-member mega church, The United Methodist Church of the Resurrection in Kansas City, spoke. He preached his testimony of conversion. In it he discussed how he dealt with the death of two close friends in their late teens and early 20s. He preached about a God who does not take life. Instead, he believed in and witnessed to a God that set up the world to function within certain boundaries, when humans press up against those laws, like gravity. Sometimes they get hurt. In his mind, the tragic deaths of his friends had more to do with the laws of nature than an act of God: their deaths were an accident. This God stood in contrast to a purposeful God who predetermined the outcome of all events, "electing" some for heaven and others for damnation.

Reverend Hamilton subtly evoked Arminian theology to paint a picture of a loving, forgiving, and relational God. His message resonated with the hundreds gathered, myself included. Emotional singing and dancing bracketed his sermon providing a complete emotional connection to the type of faith and God he preached about.

Adam Hamilton's skillful use of rhetoric in combination with emotional music evoked the positive response of those in attendance.

The fundamental emotional appeal and leverage of it still functions in modern Methodism. The model of Methodist revival still works even with a substituted musical form. The strategy of Methodists proves to be a large part of the appeal. The creation of "collective effervescence"⁹⁷ through music provides solid ground for the ideas of skilled preachers to take root. This is evidenced in a similar case study of "modern revival."

Modern Revivals-Camps

The Warren W. Willis United Methodist Youth Camp serves as a locus for "modern revival." This camp, established in 1948 by the Florida Conference of the United Methodist Church serves United Methodist Churches all over the state of Florida. During the year it caters to both adults and youth but over the summer it specifically serves youth. Like many of the gatherings held in Kentucky and the South, revivals are annual summer time events. The camp's objective is precisely to create a revival. A quote from the camp's website proclaims its purpose: "to help campers know Christ as friend and Savior."⁹⁸ The fundamental evangelistic objective remained the same after over 200 years.

The youth camp possesses more structure than the revival meeting, but in many ways it features similar characteristics. The first aspect is the gathering of large groups of people. The buildings at the camp have large rooms, the largest of

⁹⁷ Durkheim, Émile, and Karen E. Fields. *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*. New York: Free, 1995. Print.

⁹⁸ Standifer, Mike. "Warren Willis Camp." *Warren Willis Camp*. Web. 28 Mar. 2012. <<http://www.warrenwilliscamp.org/page.asp?PKValue=48>>.

which can accommodate up to 600 people. These rooms are used for gatherings at the very beginning and very end of a camper's six-day stay as well as every day throughout. "Praise Time" draws campers of all ages together. Originally this activity featured older songs that were similar to hymns, but now the musical forms have modernized into the rock genre, featuring electric guitars, drums, microphones, brass instruments, colorful lights, and amplifiers. The campers' experience at these daily performances is uniquely conveyed through emotional, physical, and transcendent expressions.

The interactions campers have with "Praise Time" changes over the course of the week. In this context, dancing, shouting, laughing, crying, and falling become expressions of praising God. For many youth this "collective effervescence"⁹⁹ creates an emotional experience. The emotional experiences birthed at camp create feelings of community and shared ideas campers can take home with them and remember. Preaching in the evenings augments this experience. Near the end of the week, preachers hold "commitment night," this evening features salvific preaching inviting the campers to accept Jesus Christ. The camp documents these decisions of accepting Christ or recommitting to Christ on "commitment cards" which are given to church leaders as a means of ensuring continued growth when the camper returns to her home church.

The themes evoked by this contemporary practice tap into a deep vein of revival. The emotional appeal of the music, the salvific message of the preachers, and the communal aspects of the experience echo themes of revival. In a sense, the

⁹⁹ Durkheim, Émile, and Karen E. Fields. *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*. New York: Free, 1995. Print.

Florida Conference of the United Methodist Church is going back to the roots of Methodism. They are attempting to initiate a “Third Great Awakening.” The theme for the summer of 2012 “Awakening” confirms this claim. The Warren W. Willis United Methodist Youth Camp has adapted some new techniques, but it still uses the same format and affect-driven approach as the great revivalists of the 18th and 19th century.

Conclusion

In contemporary Methodism, hymnody lacks the presence it once possessed during the revival period. Hymns are slowly disappearing from congregations. If this trend is extrapolated out, there will eventually be no hymns within Methodist sanctuaries. Hymns seem to be fading without a clear successor. This leads to the question of modern music in Methodist Church. How can the substantive message of hymnody be transmitted in contemporary musical worship? Many modern praise songs repeat simple phrases over 10 times during the course of a song. Some bands like “The David Crowder Band” are using the lyrics of hymns and playing them with modern instrumentation. The band released the song “O, For A Thousand Tongues To Sing” on its album Remedy released in 2007. Songs like this provide a possible solution bridging the gap between the lyrical substance of hymnody and the relevance of modern music. Whether this song is a renaissance of hymnody or just a retread of a fading musical form remains to be seen. The contemporary church is still answering this question.

The answer to the use of modern hymnody is enveloped in history. This leads us to the question; what if hymns had never played a role in the Methodist

Movement? It is difficult to completely answer such a question, but worth an examination to further illuminate the reasons why hymnody became so important. I have demonstrated that the Methodist Movement would not have grown as successfully as it did without hymnody. The question, now posed more specifically becomes, to what degree did hymns affect a wildly growing Methodist Movement? The poorly educated people of the frontier were overwhelmed by emotion at revivals such as the Cane Ridge Revival of 1801. Hymnody was a method through which people could respond to the emotion generated through revivals. The music of hymnody helped embody the lyrics to communicate an emotional and religious response. Hymns became a point of psychological contact, something people could hold on to when they left the gathering. Taking hymns home and singing them repeatedly became an element of cementing the conversion process. Hymnody bridged the gap between the emotion of the conversion experience at the revival and the monotony of everyday life while simultaneously providing an outlet of the sensory aspects of religion. The themes of revival, conversion, and emotion are the foundation of the Methodist Church. The decline of the Church provoked reflexivity, leading it to return to the very principles it used to generate explosive growth in the early 1800s.

This explosive growth of Methodism in the American context is a story of the extraordinary fervor of men like John Wesley, Charles Wesley, Francis Asbury, and Peter Cartwright who devoted their lives to spreading Methodist ideas. The organizational structure of the Methodist Episcopal Church through the circuit rider system and the revivals like the one held at Cane Ridge Kentucky in 1801 propelled

the Methodist Movement forward. Hymnody fits into this context and has been often overlooked but is nonetheless an important aspect of the success of the Methodist Movement in America from the Revolutionary War to the mid 19th century.

Works Cited

- "2010 State of the Church: Membership." *UMC.org*. United Methodist Church, Jan. 2010. Web. 30 Mar. 2012.
<<http://www.umc.org/site/c.lwL4KnN1LtH/b.6072819/k.2327/Membership.htm>>.
- Asbury, Herbert. *A Methodist Saint; the Life of Bishop Asbury*. New York: Knopf, 1927. Print.
- Benjamin, Jonathan, comp. *Harmonia Coelestis a Collection of Church Music, in Two, Three, and Four Parts. With Words Adapted to Each, Comprehending Not Only the Metres in Common Use, but the Particular Metres, in the Hartford Collection of Hymns;-- the Tunes Correctly Figured for the Organ and Harpsichord.--with an Inttroduction [sic], to Music*. Northampton [Mass.: Printed, Typographically, by Andrew Wright, for Oliver D. & I. Cooke, ellers, Hartford.--, 1799. Print.
- Bray, Robert C. *Peter Cartwright, Legendary Frontier Preacher*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois, 2005. Print.
- Cartwright, Peter, and Charles Langworthy Wallis. *Autobiography of Peter Cartwright: With an Introduction, Bibliography, and Index*. New York, NY: Abingdon, 1956. Print.
- Cooper, William H. *The Great Revivalists in American Religion, 1740-1944: The Careers and Theology of Jonathan Edwards, Charles Finney, Dwight Moody, Billy Sunday and Aimee Semple McPherson*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland &, 2010. Print.
- Durkheim, Émile, and Karen E. Fields. *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*. New York: Free, 1995. Print.

Finke, Roger, and Rodney Starke. "How the Upstart Sects Won America:1776-1850."

Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion 28.1 (1989): 27-44. Print.

Geertz, Clifford. *Available Light: Anthropological Reflections on Philosophical Topics*.

Princeton, NJ: Princeton UP, 2000. Print.

Gilbert, Kathy L. "Giving, Membership Decline in Recession." *UMC.org*. United

Methodist Church, 8 Mar. 2010. Web. March Mar. 20.

<<http://www.umc.org/site/apps/nlnet/content3.aspx?c=lwL4KnN1LtH&b=2789393&ct=8065437>>.

Hankins, Barry. *The Second Great Awakening and the Transcendentalists*. Westport, CT:

Greenwood, 2004. Print.

Heitzenrater, Richard P., and John Wesley. *The Elusive Mr. Wesley*. Nashville:

Abingdon, 1984. Print.

Heitzenrater, Richard P. *Wesley and the People Called Methodists*. Nashville: Abingdon,

1995. Print.

Hughes, Jessie H. *Sons of Thunder*. 1975. MS. Emory University.

Kidd, Thomas S. *The Great Awakening: A Brief History with Documents*. Boston:

Bedford/St. Martin's, 2008. Print.

Lippy, Charles H. *Introducing American Religion*. London: Routledge, 2009. Print.

McClymond, Michael James. *Encyclopedia of Religious Revivals in America*. Westport,

CT: Greenwood, 2007. Print.

McCutcheon, Russell T. *Critics Not Caretakers: Redescribing the Public Study of*

Religion. Albany: State University of New York, 2001. Print.

Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Methodist Episcopal Church, for the Years

- 1773-1828. New York: T. Mason and G. Lane, 1840. Print.
- Reynolds, William Jensen., Milburn Price, and .. *A Survey of Christian Hymnody*. Carol Stream, IL: Hope Pub., 1999. Print.
- Routley, Erik. *Christian Hymns Observed: When in Our Music God Is Glorified*. Princeton, NJ: Prestige Publications, 1982. Print.
- Smith, Jonathan Z. *Map Is Not Territory: Studies in the History of Religions*. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1993. Print.
- Smith, Wilfred Cantwell. *The Meaning and End of Religion*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991. Print.
- Standifer, Mike. "Warren Willis Camp." *Warren Willis Camp*. United Methodist Church. Web. 28 Mar. 2012. <<http://www.warrenwilliscamp.org/page.asp?PKValue=48>>.
- Wainwright, Geoffrey, and Tucker Karen B. Westerfield. *The Oxford History of Christian Worship*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2006. Print.
- Wesley, John, and Thomas Phillips. *The Principles of a Methodist: Occasion'd by a Late Pamphlet [by Josiah Tucker], Intitled, A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism*. Bristol: Printed by Felix Farley. And Sold at His Shop, and by John Wilson: in London, by Thomas Trye, and Thomas Harris; and at the Foundery in Upper-Moor-Fields, 1742. Print.
- Wesley, John, Charles Wesley, Robert Spence, Thomas Coke, and Francis Asbury. *A Pocket Hymn-book: Designed as a Constant Companion for the Pious*. Philadelphia: Printed by Prichard and Hall, in Market Street, and Sold by John Dickins, in Fourth Street, near Race Street, 1790. Print.
- Wesley, John. *The Principles of a Methodist: Occasioned by a Pamphlet Intitled A Brief History of the Principles of Methodism*. London: Printed by R. Hawes, and Sold at the

Foundry in Moorfields; and at the Rev. Mr. Wesley's Preaching-House, in Town and Country, 1777. Print.