Distribution Agreement

In presenting this thesis as a partial fulfillment of the requirements for a degree from Emory University, I hereby grant to Emory University and its agents the non-exclusive license to archive, make accessible, and display my thesis in whole or in part in all forms of media, now or hereafter now, including display on the World Wide Web. I understand that I may select some access restrictions as part of the online submission of this thesis. I retain all ownership rights to the copyright of the thesis. I also retain the right to use in future works (such as articles or books) all or part of this thesis.

Amanda Hutson April 1, 2013

Becoming British:

The Transformation of Scottish National Identity in the Long Eighteenth Century

by

Amanda Hutson

Dr. James Melton
Adviser

Department of History

Dr. James Melton

Adviser

Dr. Judith Miller

Committee Member

Dr. Geraldine Higgins

Committee Member

2013

Becoming British:

The Transformation of Scottish National Identity in the Long Eighteenth Century

By

Amanda Hutson

Dr. James Melton

Adviser

An abstract of
a thesis submitted to the Faculty of Emory College of Arts and Sciences
of Emory University in partial fulfillment
of the requirements of the degree of
Bachelor of Arts with Honors

Department of History

2013

Abstract

Becoming British:

The Transformation of Scottish National Identity in the Long Eighteenth Century

By Amanda Hutson

This paper explores the nature of Scottish national identity during the period scholars have termed the "long eighteenth century" (1688-1830), a period that witnessed both the rise and fall of Jacobitism and the emergence of the British state. Within this analysis, it also seeks to explain the Scottish presence in the paradox of British national identity. By utilizing Anthony Smith's theory of ethno-symbolism, a socio-cultural approach to the study of nations and nationalism, this paper aims to illustrate the conceptualization of the Scottish and British nations based on a selection of key symbolic ideas and traditions. Throughout the paper, contemporary Scottish folksongs are used to reveal the symbolic manipulation of Scottish myths, memories, traditions, and values that were adapted to strengthen the cultural appeal of each nation. The first half of the paper explores symbols and traditions cultivated by the Stuart dynasty in order to unify the Scottish people under one articulation of national identity. The second half traces those same symbols through their use in a British framework and demonstrates their re-imagination as essential factors of British national identity. An analysis of these songs and the broader cultural, social, political, and economic trends they reflect suggest that the tension between Scottish and British identities was not as powerful as previously supposed and did not inhibit a compatible sense of dual identity.

Becoming British:

The Transformation of Scottish National Identity in the Long Eighteenth Century

By

Amanda Hutson

Dr. James Melton

Adviser

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Emory College of Arts and Sciences
of Emory University in partial fulfillment
of the requirements of the degree of
Bachelor of Arts with Honors

Department of History

2013

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank everyone who helped me throughout this entire process. I offer particular and heart-felt thanks to my mother for patiently guiding me through moments of panic and stress, and for always encouraging me to reach for the stars. To my friend and fellow thesis-writer, Steffi Delcourt, thank you for tirelessly listening to my ideas, ruthlessly editing my sentences, and craftily challenging all of my assumptions. I am immensely grateful to Dr. James Melton for being the best advisor at Emory University, both for this thesis and for your excellent guidance and encouragement for the past four years. Thank you to Dr. Judith Miller and Dr. Geraldine Higgins for offering your support for this massive project; I could not have asked for two better teachers who enrich not only my education but my life as well. I would also like to acknowledge all of the other brave souls who wrote a thesis in the History Department: Sarah Clayton, Emily Clark, and Nicholas Going. We did it!

Table of Contents

Introduction

"What is Scotland? A nation, a province, a lost kingdom; a culture, a history, a body of tradition; a bundle of sentiments, a state of mind; North Britain or Caledonia?"[1] This series of evocative questions opens an article entitled "Some Eighteenth-Century Ideas of Scotland" (1970) written by Janet Adam Smith. Smith explores the conceptions of national identity felt by some of Scotland's leading intellectuals during the Scottish Enlightenment. The poets, scholars, and authors she examines articulated differing interpretations of what it meant to be Scottish in a time when the Scottish state no longer existed. Smith finds that the construction of Britain, of which Scotland was a member nation, complicated the issue of identity for each of these writers and for Scots in general. Drawing on the contributions of Smith and other historians eager to unravel the paradox of British identity, this paper will explore the complexity of Scottish and British national identity during the long eighteenth century.

During the period from roughly 1689 to 1830, Britain emerged as one of the greatest European and world powers, a feat largely dependent on the contributions of the man-power, commerce, knowledge, and skills of the Scottish people. Powerful Scots held positions of influence within the British state, acting as prime ministers, imperial governors, and captains of industry. However, this level of Scottish equality in the British state was not always the norm. Until 1746, a large portion of the Scottish population actively took part in a traitorous allegiance to the exiled Scottish royal family, the Stuarts. It was only after the Stuart "Pretenders" were conclusively defeated, both politically and militarily, that the Scottish people began to look beyond their borders for sources of national identity that were available to them in the wider

[1] Janet Adam Smith, "Some Eighteenth-Century Ideas of Scotland," in *Scotland in the Age of Improvement: Essays in Scottish History in the Eighteenth Century*, ed. N.T. Phillipson and Rosalind Mitchinson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1970), 107.

British framework. This paper will attempt to answer two comprehensive questions: what was the nature of the Scottish nation during the era of Jacobitism, and how did the leaders of the British nation successfully integrate the Scots after 1750 when they had never been able to before?

A brief history of the Scottish experience is helpful for understanding the context Scotland's integration into Britain. Until the period being explored in this paper, Scotland and England were well-known competitors and distinctly hostile neighbors. Centuries of conflict continued even after the two states became intimately connected through the Union of the Crowns in 1603, when King James VI of Scotland assumed the throne of England after the death of his cousin, Queen Elizabeth I. Tensions rose again in the mid-seventeenth century with the War of the Three Kingdoms, an interconnected series of conflicts among Scotland, England, and Ireland. The most well-known side of this conflict was the English Civil War, when Oliver Cromwell and his New Model Army executed King Charles I and exiled his son, Charles II. Charles II was later invited back to England, and the Stuart Restoration continued with James II, who reigned until 1688. James II was a devout Catholic, but his two daughters were Protestant, and so the dominant Anglican faction within English society was willing to tolerate James' policy of religious freedom for Catholics. However, when James' wife had a son, the Protestant succession was no longer guaranteed. A group of Parliamentarians invited the Protestant Dutch stadtholder William of Orange, the husband of James' daughter Mary, to assume the English throne in a war that has come to be known as the Glorious Revolution.

James II was deposed and sent into exile with his young son James Francis Edward Stuart, but he and his followers quickly retaliated with the first Jacobite rebellion. The Jacobites, who take their name from the Latin word for James (*Jacobus*), were defeated at the Battle of the

Boyne in Ireland and the Battle of Killiecrankie in Scotland, but their pursuit of a Stuart restoration did not end there. Queen Anne, James' second daughter who had assumed the throne after the deaths of William and Mary, convinced the Scottish Parliament to pass the Act of Union in 1707. Until this point, Scotland had remained as a separate country from England and was only joined to England by a common sovereign. With the Act of Union, the Scottish Parliament voted itself out of existence, and Scotland ceased to be an independent state. This prompted a second Jacobite invasion in 1708, which was once again repelled despite significant assistance from France. When Queen Anne died in 1714, the throne of Great Britain passed to her Hanoverian Protestant cousin, George I. Once again, the Jacobites attempted a restoration during the Rising of 1715. Despite a strong start, this rebellion led by James Edward Stuart, the Old Pretender, suffered from bad leadership, insufficient support, and ended in defeat.

After a small invasion force was defeated in 1719, the Jacobites began their most successful full-scale rebellion. The 1745 Rising (also known simply as the Rising or the '45) was led by Prince Charles Edward Stuart, the son of James Edward Stuart, who was called the Young Pretender and later Bonnie Prince Charlie. Charles landed in Scotland in 1745 and assembled the loyal Jacobite clans at Glenfinnan. After a series of impressive victories at Preston, Edinburgh, Carlisle, and Falkirk, internal disputes began to take their toll on Jacobite morale. Charles failed to rally the support he needed from English Jacobites and was eventually forced to retreat from England. The demoralized Jacobite forces made their last stand at the Battle of Culloden, an engagement that proved to be the end of the Jacobite restoration attempts. Charles and several of his generals escaped from Scotland, but the majority of lower level Jacobites were executed or transported to the colonies. The government policy of "Pacification" devastated the Highlands and sent thousands of Scots into exile on the Continent and the Empire.

The Jacobite movement had ended, but the story of Scotland and Britain had just begun: during the course of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, Scots would enlist in the British army, staff the imperial bureaucracy, and take seats in the national Parliament, becoming equal partners with the English in the British state. It has been said that the English went to British North America and became Americans, while the Scottish went to America and became Britons.[2] How did this happen? Why did a people who openly opposed the English and the political union that combined their two kingdoms at the beginning of this period, fight loyally in wars conducted to further the interests of that very union? The answer to these questions is found in the development of national identity, both in the Scottish and British nations. I use Anthony Smith's theory of ethno-symbolism, a socio-cultural approach to the study of nations and nationalism, to examine both nations and their respective conceptions of national identity. Through this model of symbolic regeneration and manipulation, I explore the subjective elements of the Scottish and British identities and find that sentiments of national identity enabled dramatic changes at all levels of British society.

Moving beyond a simple application of Smith's model, this paper introduces a dual level of analysis to the study of Scottish and British national identities. Rather than describing or comparing the two nations, this paper conducts a simultaneous analysis of the two nations to reveal the coincident nature of the Scottish and British nations. This paper also attempts to extend ethno-symbolism beyond the socio-cultural realms it usually focuses on by exploring the symbolic transformations taking place at the political, economic, and institutional levels. It is important to note that this paper is not an analysis of Scottish or British nationalism, a political movement that advocates the creation of an independent state. The British state had already attained autonomy and relative unity by 1707 and did not experience a nationalist movement like

[2] Neil Davidson, *The Origins of Scottish Nationhood* (London: Pluto Press, 2000), 123.

other nations of Europe. This paper is also solely confined to the relationship between Scotland and Britain and does not address any of the associations of Britain with England, Wales, or Ireland. While these nations certainly did interact with and contribute to a modern understanding of the British nation, the scope of this paper does not allow a comprehensive examination of all of the component parts of Britain.

In the past, scholars have relied on the writings of individual Scots, such as the novels of Sir Walter Scott or the works of Adam Smith, but I sought evidence that reaches into the symbolic and emotional dimensions of national identity. To this end, my primary sources consist mainly of a collection of Scottish folksongs written by a broad range of poets and songwriters. The songs that I use are divided into two broad categories, active and romantic songs, and correspond to the Scottish and British nations, respectively. The first group of songs consists of those written by Jacobite poets, like Alexander MacDonald and John MacLachlan who supported the Stuarts' cause through their compositions. The majority of these songs, however, were anonymously composed in the folk tradition and were later passed down through generations of loyal Jacobites. These "active" songs were used to create and promote an interpretation of the Scottish nation that served to unite the various factions within Scottish society around a common sense of Scottish identity. These songs employed powerful symbols that the Stuart family and its supporters used to motivate the Scottish people for their cause.

The second set of Scottish folksongs I analyze are those written by poets who were not political Jacobites but still continued to write in the Jacobite genre, producing "romantic" songs that reflected Scotland's position within the British nation. Romantic songs simultaneously advocated the continuing distinctiveness of the Scottish nation and the patriotic duty Scots felt toward the British nation. The poets and songwriters who crafted these songs helped to set the

course for Scottish participation in the British nation and contributed to the strength of Scottish identification with the institutions and organization of British society. This paper traces the inception of the Scottish and British nations through these songs and identifies the symbolic processes that are revealed in the simple lyrics. By examining the subjective aspects of national identity, this paper seeks to explain the appeal of the British nation for the people of Scotland.

Section 1

Historiography and Methodology

Historiography

Scholarly research on nations and nationalism has received much attention in the last fifty years. The works of Eric Hobsbawm, Ernest Gellner, Benedict Anderson, Miroslav Hroch, and countless others have produced a seemingly endless number of books covering every angle of the topic.[3] With theories ranging from Perennialism to Modernism and Neo-Pereniallism to Post-Modernism, every so-called nation on earth has received a specialized interpretation and analysis through at least one of these models. A country that has received particular interest in the scholarly world is the United Kingdom. The United Kingdom is one of the few, if not the only, modern state that is equally defined by a broad and overarching national identity as well as four individual and distinctive local conceptions of national identity. One can speak about British national identity just as legitimately and profoundly as English, Scottish, Welsh, and Irish identity.

Much of the scholarly work on national identity in the UK has been sparked by the recent debates over devolution. This experiment in power-sharing has been most successful in Scotland, which of the three nations of Great Britain is the most historically distinct and most likely to advocate for greater political and economic independence within the Union. [4] Scottish sentiments of national distinction are reflected in the historiography of the complex relationship between

---

[3] Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, ed., *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992); Ernest Gellner, *Nations and Nationalism* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1983); Miroslav Hroch, *Social Preconditions of National Revival in Europe: A Comparative Analysis of the Social Composition of Patriotic Groups Among the Smaller European Nations* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985).

[4] For more information on modern devolution in the UK as well as a discussion of its historical context see Vernon Bogdanor, *Devolution in the United Kingdom* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001).

Scotland and Britain. Scotland is a component part of Britain and therefore has influenced the nature of "Britishness," but the comprehensive presence of Britain has similarly developed the modern understanding of "Scottishness." Scholars in history, political science, and literature have attempted to unravel this intricate relationship, and the following paragraphs present a few of the most significant models of British and Scottish national identity.

The most well-known interpretation on the origins of British national identity is Linda Colley's *Britons: Forging the Nation, 1707-1837* (1992).[5] Colley claims that Great Britain was an "invented nation" that was superimposed on older nations and loyalties. These identities were not lost, but merely set aside for the more practical application of Britishness.[6] This invented nation was successful because different classes and interests recognized the economic, political, and social benefits of adopting British patriotism. Scots in particular responded to the incentives of Empire and became the soldiers, merchants, and bureaucrats of imperial Britain. According to Colley, the key to inspiring loyalty in the British nation was exploiting the unifying influence of the "Other." In opposition to the free and civilized Protestants of Great Britain, the Continental Catholics, especially the republican French, and the native populations of the Empire forced the inhabitants of Great Britain to embrace the characteristics they had in common in order to overcome the threat of the Other. War was the means of fostering this allegiance and encouraged a sense of unity and collective self-definition: "They came to define themselves as a single people not because of any political or cultural consensus at home, but rather in reaction to the Other beyond their shores."[7] A British identity allowed its adherents to maintain their original cultural identities and provided them with additional physical and "psychic" profits.[8]

---

[5] Linda Colley, *Britons: Forging the Nation, 1707-1837* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009).
[6] Ibid., 5.
[7] Ibid., 6.
[8] Linda Colley, "Britishness and Otherness: An Argument," *Journal of British Studies* 31 (1992): 316.

Colley's thesis of the Other was one of the first models of British nationalism and provoked many attempts to comprehend the nuances of the British case, most of which sought to refute the Colley argument in one way or another. Neil Davidson, author of *The Origins of Scottish Nationhood* (2000), responded to Colley's socio-economic model with a Marxist interpretation of the rise of the Scottish and British nations. According to Davidson, a nation is "a human community that has acquired national consciousness," a concept which he further defines as "a process of *constructing* imaginary common interests."[9] The core of Davidson's argument asserts that there was no conception of a Scottish nation until the Union of the Parliaments in 1707 and similarly that there was no notion of the British nation until the Scots acquiesced to integration after 1746:

> The British nation state was as much responsible for shaping the nations of which it consists as it was shaped by them. The Scottish nation was only formed in the late eighteenth century, so too was the British nation, and these two processes were not simply chronologically coincident, but structurally intertwined. What we are concerned with is not simply the origins of Scottish national consciousness, but the origins of national consciousness in Scotland, since it had two aspects, both Scottish and British…it is not simply that Scottishness is part of Britishness – a point most people would concede – it is also that Britishness is part of Scottishness and the latter would not exist, at least in the same form, without the former.[10]

Davidson emphasizes the unifying influence of war, stating that it was not until the Scots participated in the campaign to control North America that a sense of Britishness was actually felt, a concept which until then had been a descriptive term for the inhabitants of the island.[11] Despite frequent tangents into the structures of Scottish capitalism and its interaction with nationalism, Davidson's model strongly articulates one of the major complexities of the Scottish/British relationship that other scholars tend to overlook.

Another interpretation of the association between Scotland and Britain is Colin Kidd's concept of North Britain, a political and social construct that he has analyzed in several books

[9] Davidson, *Scottish Nationhood,* 11, 13.
[10] Ibid., 4.
[11] Ibid., 115.

and articles.[12] Kidd asserts that, rather than being an established form of national identity, North Britishness was the "by-product of the particular circumstances of Union and of the eighteenth-century Scottish renaissance."[13] As a political ideology, North Britishness sought to transform Scotland by embracing the ideals of English institutions and civil liberties while maintaining an emotional identification with Scotland. This process of Anglicization was the "glue of integration" and acted to liberalize Scottish civil society.[14] It was most prominent among the Lowland Whigs of the Scottish Enlightenment who identified more with the English-oriented institutions of North Britain than with the rest of Scotland. As a result, an effective Scottish national consciousness was thwarted by this emulation of England and was only manifested when "erupting into full-blown chauvinistic expression at moments of Anglo-Scottish tension."[15] The dominance of an Anglo-centric conception of the nation relegated any Gaelic-inspired nationalism to the cultural fringe and prevented its political ideology from taking a more central role in Scottish life.

Literary scholar William Donaldson also focuses on the Lowland experience of Scottish national identity, but he does not limit its existence to an imitation of the English. In his book *The Jacobite Song: Political Myth and National Identity* (1988), Donaldson connected the advent of the Jacobite song to the creation of a Celtic-based conception of Scottish national consciousness.[16] Criticizing the historiographical emphasis on the Whig intelligentsia, Donaldson reveals a new view of Scottish national identity, one based on the "forces which

---

[12] For Kidd's most comprehensive discussion of this topic, see *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity, 1689-c.1830* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993).
[13] Colin Kidd, "North Britishness and the Nature of Eighteenth-Century British Patriotisms," *The Historical Journal* 39 (1996): 362.
[14] Colin Kidd, "Integration: Patriotism and Nationalism," in *A Companion to Eighteenth-Century Britain,* ed. H.T. Dickinson (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), 376.
[15] Kidd, "North Britishness," 377.
[16] William Donaldson, *The Jacobite Song: Political Myth and National Identity* (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1988), ix.

resisted English cultural hegemony."[17] Donaldson presents the idea of the "Guid Auld Lang Syne" as a version of Scottish history and identity replete with heroic examples of independence and integrity, encompassing everything from their ancient origins to the sacrifice of the Covenanting tradition. This heroic legendary history was used in "maintaining and defining a distinctly Scottish world-picture in the century after the Union" and provided the means for overcoming the traditional divide between the Highlands and the Lowlands.[18] The Jacobite movement represented the epitome of this unification through heroic self-expression, but the concept of the "Guid Auld Lang Syne" was used by all Scottish groups and interests and represented a truly Scottish national identity of both the past and the present.

Building on the contributions of Donaldson, Murray Pittock's *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present* (1991) links the exiled Stuart dynasty to ideologies of Scottish independence and identity. Stuart mythology became "a kind of protest history, a self-expression of identity on behalf of those whose identity was under threat."[19] Rather than entirely subsuming Scottish identity into a British context, Stuart imagery and ideology allowed the Scots to maintain a sense of themselves in a purely Scottish context, characterized by sentiments of anti-Unionism and nostalgia. However, the influence of Britain could not be ignored, and consequently the symbols of Scottish identity and culture were exploited by the patriotism of imperial Britain:

> The Jacobite reading of the Scottish experiences was retained, but it was increasingly subsumed under a British context. During the 1760s and 1770s, the Jacobite note of loss became institutionalized by the imperial note of gain, which adapted some of its stronger images in the quest for an imperial identity into which Scotland would fit… and such Jacobitism, castrated by sentiment, became politically mute and socially fashionable.[20]

---

[17] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 88.
[18] Ibid., ix.
[19] Murray G.H. Pittock, *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present* (London: Routledge, 1991), 5.
[20] Ibid., 72.

Both Scottish nationalists and British patriots adopted and adapted Stuart imagery to suit their own purposes, with the result that Stuart mythology has survived into modern times and remains as a potent force for both sides of the debate on devolution.

This essentially negative interpretation of the use of Scottish images for the benefit of the British nation is the most common element of contention among scholars. Colley and Pittock represent the extremes on this issue: while Pittock's interpretation is of Scottish cultural exploitation and disparagement, Colley's Whig-like view of British progress and unity would likely embrace the integration as further proof of Scottish pragmatism and profit maximization. With the possible exception of Davidson, each of these five models of British and Scottish national identity proposes a value judgment on the desirability or validity of one expression of identity over the other, whether it is British, North British, or Scottish. Colley favors the British side of Scottish identity and fails to acknowledge that the Scots were not integrated into Britain simply through the temptations of economic profit. The cultural complexity of this exchange cannot be confined to a common profession of Protestantism, especially when the different denominations of Protestantism were more divided than united. Pittock, on the other hand, refuses to see any aspects of Scottish identity in the "imperial identity into which Scotland would fit." Yet the use of Scottish symbols in a British context does not necessarily imply that all of Scottish identity is leached from the final product of British identity.

Kidd's concept of North Britishness, for its part, is as one-sided as the Colley and Pittock theses. Anglicization in the Lowlands did not prevent a strong Celtic presence from enduring in other parts of Scotland, particularly in the Gaelic Highlands. Even within the Lowlands, a sense of definite Scottishness could be found alongside this pro-English attitude. Donaldson's theory of Lowland authors resisting English influence stands in contrast to Kidd's Anglicization, but

Donaldson makes no further attempt to explore Scotland's position within Britain. He clearly articulates the constructive integration of the Highlands and the Lowlands but does not extend that analysis to the successful integration of Scotland into the rest of Britain. Why should one identity be inherently unifying and positive while the other is a demeaning capitulation to the exploitative powers of a hegemonic state? While he is not biased toward any form of national consciousness in Scotland, Davidson's dependence on the interaction between capitalism and nationalism restricts his analysis to the Lowlands as much as Kidd and Donaldson. Davidson claims that national consciousness was specific to those areas in the Lowlands that had developed a functioning bourgeoisie, with the Highlands only attaining a sense of national consciousness when their culture was destroyed in the late eighteenth century. Overall, these models are too restrictive to fully capture the complexity of the relationship between Scottish and British national identity.

Methodology

In his introduction, Davidson states that "Nationhood is never asserted for its own sake, but always in order to achieve some economic, social or political goal."[21] This assertion is echoed in the judgments of the other authors who state that the British and Scottish nations were in some way imaginary, invented, or artificial. The contrived nature of a modernist understanding of nations and nationalism has been successfully countered by Anthony Smith's theory of ethno-symbolism.[22] According to Smith, ethno-symbolism was established in reaction to an overtly structural interpretation of nationalism that failed to significantly consider the cultural and symbolic elements of nations. While both modernism and ethno-symbolism consider

[21] Davidson, *Scottish Nationhood,* 1.
[22] Anthony Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism: A Cultural Approach* (London: Routledge, 2009).

nations as "real" sociological and historical communities, the ethno-symbolist focuses more on the subjective and symbolic resources of the nation rather than the material and political realms.

Smith and his fellow ethno-symbolists believe that nations "cannot be simply wished into existence," thereby refuting the modernist assertion that nations can be invented by enterprising nationalists or literate populations desiring a sense of community.[23] Instead, the creation of a nation is a long and historical process where the idea of the nation must be fully internalized by the population it seeks to represent. Ethno-symbolists analyze "communities, ideologies and sense[s] of identity in terms of their constituent symbolic resources, that is, the traditions, memories, values, myths and symbols that compose the accumulated heritage of cultural units of [a] population."[24] This "accumulated heritage" is the key to understanding the origins and persistence of a nation as well as the way its members view themselves and those around them. Smith's theory of ethno-symbolism is particularly potent for understanding the Scottish nation and can equally be applied to the Scottish nation by itself and the Scottish transition into the British nation. The remainder of this section will be an overview of Smith's theory, covering the topics of nation formation and reinterpretation, followed by my account of how ethno-symbolism can be applied to the case of Scotland in order to overcome the insufficiencies of the models presented by the authors above.

The foundation of every ethno-symbolist approach is the *ethnie*, "a named and self-defined human community whose members possess a myth of common ancestry, shared memories, one or more element of common culture, including a link with a territory, and a measure of solidarity, at least among the upper strata."[25] This network of ethnic ties is the most essential element for the development of a nation, regardless of whether that ethnic group

[23]Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism*, 59.
[24] Ibid., 15-16.
[25] Ibid., 27.

becomes a nation in itself or feeds into another nation. Once the dominant "ethnic core" is established, a nation may form around it or attract other *ethnies* to it in the case of an ethnically heterogeneous population. The nation is more sophisticated and complex than the original *ethnie*, encompassing a "named and self-defining human community whose members cultivate shared memories, symbols, myths, traditions, and values, inhabit and are attached to historic territories or 'homelands,' create and disseminate a distinctive public culture, and observe shared customs and standardized laws."[26] Not all *ethnies* become nations, but many are later adopted by various nationalisms as a link to the ethnic past.

Ethnies become nations through a selective process of symbolic cultivation and differentiation. These symbolic resources are the memories, values, myths, traditions, and symbols that nations use to create a sense of common consciousness and cultural heritage. The symbolic repertoire is reflected in the language, religion, customs, and institutions of the community, features which also work to provide a sense of continuity with previous generations: "memories of heroes and battles, traditions of marriage and burial, symbols of dress, emblems and language, myths of migration and liberation, and values of holiness and heroism may all find a place in the common symbolic fund as preserved by communicators and augmented by them down the generations for the community."[27] These cultural elements shape the social structure and culture, define and legitimize the relationships between different groups and interests, and endow the community with a distinctive identity in relation to outsiders.

The second crucial element for the creation of the nation is the establishment of a unique public culture, those political symbols and ideals, public rituals, ceremonies, and codes that allow for interaction between the different classes and interests within the nation. A community's

[26]Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism*, 29.
[27] Ibid., 48.

public culture is significant because it enables the exchange between elites and non-elites in the forging of the nation. More often than not, a nation is composed of one or more ethnic groups with their own unique collections of symbolic resources. The role of the nationalist elite,[28] either cultural or political, is to "rediscover, select and reinterpret" the ethnic pasts of a community in order to attract the various ethnic strands to a comprehensive idea of the nation:

> Typically, the designated population is subdivided into strata and regions, as well as dialect and often religious categories and communities, and this makes it necessary to base the proposed category of the nation on a carefully selected range of symbols, traditions, memories, myths and values that will strike a chord, or rather a series of chords, in an often fairly heterogeneous population.[29]

Rather than resulting from an elite-driven invention, nations are established through a process where elite proposals of the nation are presented to non-elite populations which can accept, reject, or reshape a particular conception of the nation. This produces a reciprocal relationship in which the nationalist version of the nation cannot be achieved, let alone survive, without the willing consent of the population it seeks to motivate. It is the cultivation of the particular symbolic resources of an *ethnie* that enables cultural and political nationalists to "build" a nation.

A dominant *ethnie* progresses into a nation through the manipulation of particular symbols that represent a given population. Nationalist elites cultivate those symbols in order to project a certain interpretation of the nation which the community under consideration must identify with on several different levels. This process of nation formation is not necessarily a conscious attempt to create a nation, but may occur through centuries of trial and error with multiple versions of the nation being introduced with little to no success. It is the "rediscovery" of myths and symbols that have survived in the symbolic repertoire for generations that initiates the development of a nation. One of the most basic resources that may be drawn on is the myth

[28] "Nationalist" in the sense of a "nation-builder," not in the commonly used articulation of "nationalism." A nationalist in Smith's theory is any individual or group who encourages or facilitates the creation of a nation derived from one or more *ethnie* or ethnic past.
[29] Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism,* 65, 31.

of common ancestry, "a shared belief in common origins and descent, at least on the part of elites." Genealogical ties connect the generations in a "common worship of eponymous ancestors" and trace the lineages of families, clans, tribes, and *ethnies*.[30] In addition to the ethnic myth of ancestry, the civic myth is often as powerful and unifying. In these, the origin of the polity or momentous events in its past foster a sense of community. Myths of election also serve this purpose for nations without the tradition of common ancestry. These myths can be either covenantal or missionary and refer to the religious justification of the nation and the covenant between the nation and its deity.

Closely related to the myths of ancestry and election is the idea of the golden age: "Those periods remembered by later generations as moments of heroism and glory, the 'golden ages' of the community, recorded in epic and chronicle, art and song, are not only a source of collective pride and confidence, they also inspire action and emulation."[31] These past examples of victory and prosperity are presented as the "one true path" of the nation, a period when the nation was at its greatest but which has now past. Conceptions of national destiny seek to restore the nation to what it was during the golden age, often inspiring sacrifices on behalf of that particular image of the past. Different groups and interests in the nation will select their own distinct golden age, which usually competes with other versions of national destiny, so that "we usually find two or more visions of national destiny competing for political influence at any one point in time, with members of the community harking back to different golden ages and types of public culture… proposing different and even opposed projects of national revitalization."[32] Conflicts over interpretations of the national past lead to further divergences concerning the character of the nation as a whole. The national symbols associated with the dominant version of national destiny

[30] Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism,* 47.
[31] Ibid., 95.
[32] Ibid., 39.

and its related golden age serve to unite more members of the community than they divide, but instances of civil war reflect the conflict that potential differences in national destiny can inspire.

Conflict and war are typically modes of cohesion and solidarity in a nation rather than indications of its decline. Wars between nations mobilize a population in defense of the nation and provide new myths and traditions of heroism and collective sacrifice. Examples of heroic deeds bring the nation together and attach its population to a specific homeland: "Places of battle and treaty, assembly, celebration and remembrance, like the buildings, shrines and monuments that commemorate them, can also be invested with deep significance and awe."[33] The tombs of ancient heroes and heroines are venerated as communal ancestors, and through their deeds, the land is sanctified. The people are symbiotically joined to the land through the process of territorialization, where "historical memories of personages, battles, assemblies and the like are closely linked to the intimate landscape of the homeland, which in turn become intrinsic to those shared memories."[34] When the nation contains competing myths of heroism and sacrifice, such as the image of the golden age, the conflict between them eventually becomes constructive. Even if the weaker definition of the nation is integrated by the dominant faction, the resulting opposition serves to reinforce the sense of self felt by each group. Rival mythologies are retained as a potent view of the nation that may be drawn on in future reinterpretations of the nation.

The survival of a nation is dependent on its constant reinterpretation. In times of change and conflict, its members must identify with the current version of the nation in order for it to be relevant; the only means to ensure that connection is through adaptation and reconstruction. In addition to encompassing alteration and rejection, reinterpretation signifies revival and renewal. Smith's definition of national identity reflects the importance of change and is stated as "the

[33]Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism,* 95.
[34] Ibid., 50.

continuous reproduction and reinterpretation of the pattern of values, symbols, memories, myths and traditions that compose the distinctive heritage of nations, and the identification of individuals with that heritage and its cultural elements."[35] One group of key players in this revitalization of the nation is the artist: the poets, authors, and musicians who infuse the nation with "imaginative content and g[i]ve it tangible, and often memorable, form."[36] Artists provide a palpable "substance" or "body" to the nation and are the individuals who project the particular vision of the nation to the wider population. By drawing on the myths, traditions, values, memories, and symbols of the nation, artists act as the cultural nationalists described above. Nations are constantly changing form, attracting populations that may have constituted an independent nation in the past and adding new resources to their symbolic repertoire.

Every aspect of the ethno-symbolist process presented by Smith can be found in the nations of Scotland and Britain. This paper uses ethno-symbolism to trace the development of the Scottish nation as an independent entity as well as its later transference to the British nation. An ethno-symbolist approach views the cohesion of Scotland and the integration of Britain not in positive or negative terms, but as the result of the process of nation-formation through the successful manipulation of symbolic resources. Following Smith's emphasis on various artists in creating the nation, I will use Scottish song to demonstrate the origins and persistence of these two nations. Unlike earlier historiography, which used song as supplemental evidence or cultural validation, I treat Scottish song as the primary lens for understanding the Scottish nation and its presence within the British nation. These songs were written by Scottish poets living in a fully

[35] Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism,* 109.
[36] Ibid., 90.

activated British state, if not nation, and therefore provide a unique glimpse into the conceptualization of each nation and their respective national identities.

Section two will begin with an identification of the symbols of Scotland present in Scottish Jacobite folksongs. By placing them in their proper historical context, I will show how the symbols, myths, memories, and traditions invoked in these songs were used to solidify and motivate the Scottish nation. Section three identifies those same Scottish symbols within the British context. The Scottish authors who wrote these songs were simultaneously members of the Scottish and British nations and used the symbols of Scotland for the benefit of both national identities. Here, I will be identifying the symbols of Scotland in the songs of these Scoto-British poets as well as analyzing the broader historical trends they reflect. By using this approach, I will reveal the processes of ethno-symbolism at work in the social, political, and cultural transformations taking place across Great Britain and demonstrate how those changes affected contemporary Scottish conceptions of national identity.

Section 2

Active Song and the Scottish Nation

Introduction

The period of active Jacobitism occurred during the one hundred years between the Glorious Revolution in 1688 and the death of Prince Charles Edward Stuart in 1788. A typical Whig history may present Jacobitism as a brief challenge to British progress and a relatively unimportant movement, but during the eighteenth century, the Jacobites were far from marginal. During this relatively short period of time, an attractive and successful interpretation of the Scottish nation was offered by the exiled Stuart dynasty. The Stuart-sponsored view of the Scottish nation succeeded in manipulating the symbols, myths, memories, traditions, and values associated with the Scottish people and re-imagined them into a source of Scottish identity. After a brief discussion of the Scottish song culture and the history of the Jacobite song, this section will trace the ethno-symbolist elements of the Scottish nation articulated in popular songs. Although I focus on Jacobite songs and the Stuart nation, I offer an analysis of Whig songs as well to ensure that both interpretations of the Scottish nation are accounted for.

Scottish song in the eighteenth century was a popular medium of oral transmission accessible to all social classes and political ideologies. An important characteristic of the Scottish song culture was the close link that developed between song and the language and traditions of the common people. Composers in both the high and low cultural traditions used the Scots vernacular as a means of "cultural defense" and embraced the distinctively Scottish folk

traditions.[37] During this period, broadsides and chapbooks were the main method of dispersion of popular song. Distributed by urban street-singers or country peddlers, they were crudely printed sheets of columned text displaying songs acquired from the oral tradition. A circular process of theft and re-adaptation was essential to the circulation of these songs, and allowed new material to be distributed rapidly.[38] A printer would obtain a song from the oral tradition and include it in his broadside. Townsfolk and country dwellers would then learn the song and pass it along, initiating the "folk process" where verses and tunes were modified or removed and eventually made indistinguishable from the original song. These songs in turn became attractive to the broadside printers and made their way into new collections. This process occurred throughout the British Isles with songs from Ireland and England included in song books and broadsides published in Scotland, making the folk process a pan-British phenomenon.[39]

One genre of Scottish song that grew out of the folk tradition was the "national song." These politically oriented songs were a "kind of pseudo-folk-song, designed for a genteel class of people who regard real folk-songs as crude and beneath their attention, and to which they can attach the feelings of tradition and national identity that other people express through the oral tradition." Authors of national songs took an original composition and rewrote it to suit their needs, "bringing it into line with the latest fashion, until nothing is left of the original but the use to which it is put."[40] However, the divisions between the two genres became blurred when newly created national songs entered into oral circulation and were re-adapted at the popular level.

---

[37] Murray G.H. Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth-Century Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 148.
[38] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song*, 25.
[39] Thomas Crawford, *Society and the Lyric: A Study of the Song Culture of Eighteenth-Century Scotland* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1979), 7, 6.
[40] David Johnson, *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century* (London: Oxford University Press, 1972), 130.

National songs, like folk songs, joined the common pool of Scottish song culture to be used, transformed, and built upon by succeeding generations of song-crafters. [41]

Arguably, the most successful category of national song to come out of Scotland was the Jacobite song. The nineteenth century Scottish scholar John Stuart Blackie wrote that "the Jacobite songs of Scotland are the finest combination of poetry, patriotism, and war that the history of literature knows" and that no "national songs ever were so pervasive, so dramatic, so pathetic, at once and so humourous, as the Jacobite ballads; none ever so rich and so exuberant."[42] Regardless of this rapturous review, Jacobite songs represented a dominant genre within the Scottish folksong tradition, second in popularity only to love songs.[43] The primary purpose of Jacobite song was to act as a medium for the profession of loyalty to the exiled Stuart family. With that said, Jacobite songs were not only concerned with the political future of the dispossessed Stuart family, but with the economy, war, religion, culture, education, the law, language, and Scottish society in general. Blackie appropriately described them as a "ready-made national opera" due to their editorialization of every aspect of contemporary Scottish history, from the expulsion of the Stuart dynasty in the Glorious Revolution to the eventual destruction of the Highlands during the nineteenth century Clearances.[44]

The Jacobite canon originated through the fusion of politics and conventional love songs to create a body of satirical parody. These songs matured and became propaganda in their own right through their use in disseminating the diverse range of codes, secret languages, and symbols that developed around the Jacobite movement. As the Jacobite cause became more distant from the heart of political life, the Jacobite song proceeded to develop into a deeply

[41] Crawford, *Society and the Lyric,* 179.
[42] John Stuart Blackie, *Scottish Song: Its Wealth, Wisdom, and Social Significance* (New York: AMS Press, 1976), 144, 190.
[43] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 109.
[44] Blackie, *Scottish Song,* 160-161.

emotive genre. Conveying humor and sentiment, the songs emphasize the themes of exile and restoration, focusing on individual emotion rather than on public affairs.[45] Broken down into broad categories, Jacobite songs are classified as erotic, sacred, or militant.[46] They can be further divided into songs of expectation, invitation, and preparation; songs of welcome and gathering of the clans; songs of the different points of the military progress; songs of lamentation; and songs of the aftereffects of the political Jacobite movement.[47] Jacobite song was a diverse and adaptable genre which was successfully used by "the king across the water" and his supporters to keep the cause alive in the hearts and minds of loyal Scots.

The Scottish Nation

Because of their covert nature, Jacobite songs contain extensive examples of symbolism, making them ideal for an ethno-symbolist analysis. Through the use of the symbols of Scotland, Jacobite songs (and their counterpart Whig songs) reveal the myths, traditions, memories, and values of the Scottish nation, including the various golden ages and national destinies promoted by different factions of Scottish society. During their reign as monarchs of Great Britain and in exile, the Stuarts produced a vision of the Scottish nation built around their political and social agenda. This Stuart-proposed version of the Scottish nation advocated anti-Unionism and was focused on the key concepts of tradition, independence, and renewal.[48] The remainder of this section will serve to highlight those ethno-symbolist characteristics found in Jacobite songs to reveal the presence of a vital and active Scottish nation built around Stuart symbolism and ideology. Stuart propaganda was successful because it made excellent use of the symbols and

[45] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 35.
[46] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 45.
[47] Blackie, *Scottish Song,* 199.
[48] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 24, 60.

traditions of Scotland and presented a viable representation of the nation with which Scots of all classes and backgrounds could identify.

Symbols

Jacobite symbolism covered a wide range of topics but generally revolved around the Stuart dynasty and its cause. Allusions to the Stuart family are the most common symbols in the Jacobite canon. The white rose, the lion, the oak tree, and many others were often invoked to represent the Stuarts and various aspects of their propaganda campaign. For example, the Stuarts adopted the oak tree from the mystical Druidical tradition in Scotland, and the sacred oak became a potent symbol for the divine nature of the Stuarts: "Give mirth its full scope, that the nations may see, we honour our standard, the royal oak tree."[49] Rallying symbols like the white cockade and certain momentous dates are also repeated throughout Jacobite songs. More popular in Irish Jacobite song, the white cockade was a material symbol of Jacobite support and was typically included with other visual representations of Jacobite culture:

> I'll sell my rock, I'll sell my reel,
> My rippling-kame, and spinning-wheel,
> To buy my lad a tartan plaid,
> A braid sword, durk, and white cockade.[50]

Songs like "The Tenth of June" celebrate key dates in the Jacobite calendar, in this case the birthday of James Edward Stuart, the Old Pretender: "Fill a bumper every one to the glorious tenth of June, and a speedy restoration."[51] James Stuart was also related to many species of birds,

[49] James Hogg, *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland: Being the Songs, Airs, and Legends of the Adherents of the House of Stuart, Vol. I,* ed. Murray G.H. Pittock (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003), 10. Written by members of the Royal Oak Society in Edinburgh, published in *The Nightingale* (1776). Considered pre-Romantic but not contemporary.
[50] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 41. "Retouched" by Burns, but based on several earlier versions, published in *The Nightingale* (1776).
[51] Ibid., 38. Reputed to have been written by David Morgan, a barrister who joined the '45 Rising and was later executed. Published in *Loyal Songs* (1750).

including the moor hen, the lark, and the blackbird. In one version of the classic song, Scotland is personified as a woman who affectionately announces:

> "Good luck to my Blackbird, wherever he be!
> "In Scotland he's loved and dearly approved,
> "In England a stranger he seemeth to be;
> "But his name I'll advance in Britain or France.
> "Good luck to my Blackbird, wherever he be![52]

The use of the blackbird is one of the oldest Stuart symbols and is purportedly a reference to the family's dark hair. With James, the blackbird symbol became even more appropriate, as it signifies a bird in exile from its home.

Scotland and the Stuarts are united in many Jacobite songs to represent the altered fate of both entities: the Stuarts without their home and Scotland without its king. In "The Thistle and Rose," Scotland is presented as a fierce and independent thistle wooed by a cunning rose (England) into becoming a weak flower. After the first storm, the thistle bitterly regrets this decision and mourns its old life: "For then I did stand on yon heath-cover'd land, admir'd by each nymph and each swain…O were I a Thistle again!"[53] Through this metaphor, the author addresses the common belief that the Union with England was a mistake, especially because the Scots found themselves on the losing side of the bargain. Another way Scottish Jacobite songwriters conveyed their disappointment with the Union was to criticize the new Hanoverian monarchs, George I in particular, as in "The wee wee German Lairdie":

> Wha the deil hae we gotten for a king,
> But a wee wee German lairdie?
> And when we gade to bring him hame,
> He was delving in his kail-yardie;
> Sheughing kail, and laying leeks,
> Without the hose, and but the breeks[54]

---

[52] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 68. Potentially Irish in origin, several versions published (1640s, 1651, 1710, 1715, 1746, 1766, 1783).
[53] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. I,* 67. Hogg claims that it was written c.1710 but offers no citations, while Walter Scott offered the composition date of 1707.
[54] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 83. Found in various contemporary manuscripts and also in the folk tradition.

George is portrayed as working in a stolen kailyard (Scotland), useless for everything except taking the rightful property and place of others, namely the Stuarts. George I is often compared to vegetables, including turnips (which were imported from Germany) and cabbage (the kailyard), nothing comparable to the noble bird or the fierce lion of the Stuarts.

The best-known symbol of both Scotland and the Stuarts was the Highland soldier. Easily recognized by their colorful tartans and unique traditions, the image of the Highland soldier is still renowned as a symbol of national valor and military prowess. The first scholar to critically study the image of the Highland soldier was William Donaldson, who traced the increasingly appealing image of the "Bonnie Highland Laddie." Originally conceived of as a barbarous alien or a satirical buffoon, the Bonnie Highland Laddie was eventually transformed into a skillful and attractive Highland warrior with Lowland patriotic values. Lowlanders and Highlanders alike could identify with the handsome and civilized Bonnie Laddie, allowing for one of the first instances of a shared Scottish culture. Jacobites on both sides of the Highland line adopted the heroic image of the Highland soldier and elevated Prince Charles Edward Stuart as the ultimate Bonnie Highland Laddie:[55]

> Our gallant prince is now come hame
> To Scotland, to proclaim his daddie:
> May Heav'n protect the royal name
> Of Stuart, and the tartan plaidie!
> O my bonny Highland laddie,
> My handsome charming Highland laddie!
> May Heav'n still guard, and him reward,
> Wi's bonnet blue, and tartan plaidie![56]

The Highland soldier represented military skill, sexual virility, honorable poverty, and spiritual renewal, characteristics that Prince Charles united in one person: he was a handsome royal, deprived of his rightful inheritance, and coming to free Scotland by leading its troops into

[55] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 53-54, 60.
[56] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 115. Several published versions, particularly those in *Scots Songs* (1721) and *Loyal Songs* (1750).

battle.[57] Similarly, the symbol of the Scottish clans was a major component of Jacobite propaganda. These groups of rugged Highlanders were the "true patriots," uncorrupted by the Union and unfailingly loyal to their king and nation[58]:

> These lions, for their country's cause,
> And natural prince, were never slow:
> So now they come with their brave prince;
> The clans advance, oho! oho![59]

Myths

According to Murray Pittock, the Highland clan is not only a useful symbol in the Jacobite canon, but also a powerful myth propagated by the Stuarts to add legitimacy to their cause. Like the symbols of the nation, the myths associated with the Stuarts were potent forces of unity and identity.[60] Charter myths were used to establish original title to land and "invest the contemporary state with an aura of imperial grandeur."[61] The Scottish myth of ancestry was a well-documented and strategic alliance of Biblical and historical figures. To counter the English myth of ancestry via the Trojans, the Scots traced their lineage back to other Greeks and the Egyptians, and even further back to Noah and Adam. Most versions of Scottish ancestry begin with Gathelus Glas, a Prince of Athens who served the Pharaoh in Egypt. Gathelus quickly gained the Pharaoh's favor and was married to his daughter Scota. With his close friend Moses, Gathelus left Egypt during the Exodus, taking his followers with him and establishing a kingdom in Spain. His descendants settled permanently in Ireland in 1300 BC and subsequently colonized Scotland and the Isles. The modern monarchy was founded by Fergus I in 330 BC, who was

---

[57] Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics,* 57.
[58] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 43.
[59] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 72. Written in the later 1740s and published in *Loyal Songs* (1750) and *The True Loyalist* (1779).
[60] See Murray G.H. Pittock, *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995).
[61] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 6.

followed by forty-five other kings until Fergus II in 403 AD.[62] The Jacobite song "Charles Son of James" by Alexander MacDonald illustrates the fact that these relatively far-fetched myths of ancestry remained relevant to the Scottish nation through the next 1,400 years:

> And likewise the Gaels, Scota's proud race,
> Handsome race of Gathelus, race ever victorious,
> Who could withstand them in the sword-play of battle,
> When their anger was kindled to smite down the boar?[63]

Through these family connections and many others, the Stuart dynasty held claims to all of the royal lines of Great Britain. They claimed sovereignty through Fergusiana, sister of King Hungus of the Picts, and Mordred of Lothian, heir to Uther Pendragon; Canute and the Danish kings; the Saxon royal family through Queen Margaret, daughter of Edward the Confessor; the Norman kings, and the royal line of Wales, through Banquo, thane of Lochaber, whose son Fleance married the princess Nesta, daughter of Griffith ap Llewelin.[64] Regardless of the veracity of these connections, the dispossession of the Stuarts meant a complete overthrow of royal lineage and presented an opportunity for the Stuarts to emphasize their traditional right to the throne.

The tangential connections with religion found in the myths of ancestry are addressed more directly through myths of election. The Scottish myth of election promoted the conviction that God favored the Scots and participated in a sacred covenant with the Scottish nation. The Jacobite song entitled "A Balland [*sic*] for those whose Honour is sound, Who cannot be named, and must not be found. Written by a Sculper in the Year 1746" references some of the most popular metaphors and beliefs associated with Scotland's divine relationship:

---

[62] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 6-7.
[63] John Lorne Campbell, *Highland Songs of the Forty-Five* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press for the Scottish Gaelic Texts Society, 1984), 53-61. Written by Alexander Macdonald, also known as Alasdair Mac Mhaighstir Alasdair (c.1700-1770). He fought in the Rising and survived, and later lived in Europe.
[64] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 14.

Though our dear native prince be toss'd
From this oppressive land,
And foreign tyrants rule the roast,
With high and barbarous hand;
Yet he who did proud Pharaoh crush,
To save old Jacob's line,
Our Charles will visit in the bush,
Like Moses langsyne.

Though God spares long the raging set
Which on rebellion doat,
Yet his perfection ne'er will let
His justice be forgot.[65]

God takes an interest in his chosen people, as he did with Moses in Egypt, and will ensure that his representative on earth will prevail. Biblical images of exile and return resonated with the Scots and provided some of their most significant symbols. Artists linked Christ's Second Coming with the restoration of the Stuarts and recalled David's troubles and Israel's misery in Egypt to represent their exile and oppression.[66] The suffering of the faithful prophets was reflected in the modern experiences of the Scots. Myths of election brought the sacred realm into the secular world and provided a layer of common culture that all Scots could identify with, regardless of whether they were Presbyterian, Episcopal, or Catholic.

Scottish conceptions of the sacred homeland take on a more mystical or pagan atmosphere than the devoutly Christian myths of election. Stuart imagery of fertility and renewal are realized in Jacobite songs which depict the return of the Stuarts to Scotland, such as "A Song upon the Birth of Prince Charles":

[65] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 168. Found in various manuscripts, the oldest of which dates from 1711.
[66] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 3. Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics,* 68.

A change will come o'er barren lands,
No thorn on the ground but will fade,
Every hill will be laid on smooth rigs,
And wheat will grow on the hillsides;
Contention no more shall we own
Since the root that won't grow is consumed,
There's the corn-field now cleansed of its weeds
Which did hinder the growth of our crop[67]

The once barren lands will become fertile again, and all barriers to prosperity will be cleared away; even the divisions among people will be cleansed when the Stuarts remove the need for contention. Through this interpretation of the sacred homeland, a thriving and independent Scotland is dependent on the Stuart family whose divine nature will allow for a complete messianic renewal of the nation. The Stuarts were also linked to the legends of Fionn and Arthur, defenders of the nation who would one day awake and restore the fortunes of Scotland.[68] Images of rural renewal became potent in Scotland with the advent of industry and "improvement." The mythical lost paradise of rural Scotland was compared to contemporary political issues during times of famine and the Clearances, and the Stuarts were quick to take advantage of the propaganda opportunities.[69] The fortune of the Stuarts and the fortune of Scotland were inextricably linked in conceptions of the sacred homeland where neither could prosper alone.

Traditions

Some of the oldest traditions of the Scottish nation were attached to its institutions and provided another effective topic to invoke in support of the Stuarts. After the Union, Scotland lost its parliament and most of its public institutions, not to mention its independent monarchy. Jacobitism became the only effective medium for anti-Unionism, and Scots who did not necessarily support the Stuart restoration found themselves aligned with the Jacobites merely for

[67] Campbell, *Highland Songs,* 3-7. Prince Charles was born on December 20th, 1720. The song was written by John MacLachlan, who came from a family of Gaelic scholars.
[68] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 4.
[69] Ibid., 48-49.

their ideological support of Scottish independence.[70] The song "Britons who dare to claim" is a good example of the Jacobite stance on Scottish public culture under the Union:

> Church, king, and liberty,
> Honour and property,
> All are betray'd:
> Foreigners rule the land,
> Our blood and wealth command,
> Obstruct, with lawless hand,
> Justice and trade.[71]

The three Scottish institutions preserved in the Treaty of Union, the so-called "holy trinity," were the Kirk (the Scottish word for church), the educational system, and the law.[72] These public institutions allowed for some autonomy in Scotland but, as the poet expresses, were not much consolation when those institutions were corrupted by foreign interests. The betrayal of "Justice and trade" is a reference to the Darien scheme of the 1690s, where the Scots attempted to establish their own overseas colony in Panama. The Scots claimed that the venture failed due to the malicious influence of the English, and invocations of Darien appear in several Jacobite songs that advocated anti-Unionism and the return to a more traditional public culture in Scotland.[73]

After the execution of Charles I and the overthrow of James II, the public culture of Scotland was severely diminished and experiences of exile (and the songs they inspired) worked to fill the void. Royal examples of exile were supplemented by subsequent uprisings when defeated Jacobites, especially the nobility, were forced to leave Scotland to avoid imprisonment or death. For many, Scotland became a lost land, the home of nostalgia and vanished honor.[74] In

---

[70] Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics,* 134.
[71] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 52. No known author, appears in *Loyal Songs* (1750).
[72] Davidson, *Scottish Nationhood,* 51.
[73] Colin Kidd, "North Britishness and the Nature of Eighteenth-Century British Patriotisms," *The Historical Journal* 39 (1996): 367.
[74] Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics,* 175.

"Hame, Hame, Hame," a typical song of exile, the singer longs for his home and laments the fate of his comrades:

> O hame, hame, hame, fain wad I be,
> O hame, hame, hame, to my ain countrie.
> When the flow'r is in the bud, and the leaf is on the tree,
> The lark shall sing me hame in my ain countrie…
>
> The great are now gane, a' wha ventur'd to save;
> The new grass is springing on the tap o' their graves:
> But the sun, through the mirk, blinks blythe in my e'e,
> "I'll shine on ye yet in your ain countrie."[75]

Songs of exile are often the antithesis of songs of the sacred homeland and contain corrupted versions of those shattered expectations. The singer wishes to be home "when the flow'r is in the bud, and the leaf is on the tree," but will never be able to while he is gone. Jacobite songs of exile are often narrated by a woman who simultaneously represents the abandoned lover and the personified Scotland mourning for her lost heroes. What differentiates early songs of exile from those produced after the final Rising in 1745 is the fact that the absent lord, the dispossessed king, and the abandoned lassie are not past hope. The singer in "Hame, Hame, Hame" laments his exile but is comforted by the sun (Stuart imagery) who promises an eventual restoration of both him and his king. Later songs of exile, which are addressed in the next section, tend to focus on grief and permanent loss. Jacobite songwriters in the eighteenth century still clung to the hope that their cause would be revived again, this time with success.

Memories

Memories of heroes, battle, and conflict are one of the strongest factors of the ethno-symbolist nation, and over the centuries the Scots acquired a fierce collection of heroic examples. The battles of Stirling Bridge (1297), Bannockburn (1314), Preston (1648), Killiecrankie (1689), Sheriffmuir (1715), and Culloden (1746) top the list of unforgettable

[75] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. I,* 134. Similar versions are published in various articles. It is likely that this is in essence a song from the Jacobite period that has been editorialized by Hogg or the person he acquired it from.

Scottish conflicts. Heroes such as William Wallace, Robert the Bruce, John Graham (Bonnie Dundee), and Bonnie Prince Charlie complement these battles and provide a focus of veneration and imitation. In "Wha wadna fight for Charlie," the author directly invokes the example of Scotland's heroes and uses them to rally troops for the next engagement:

> Think on Scotia's ancient heroes,
> Think on foreign foes repell'd,
> Think on glorious Bruce and Wallace,
> Wha the proud usurpers quell'd.
>
> Rouse, rouse, ye kilted warriors!
> Rouse, ye heroes of the north!
> Rouse, and join your chieftain's banners,
> 'Tis your prince that leads you forth![76]

The heroic past, represented by Bruce and Wallace, and the gallant present-day heroes of Prince Charles and his kilted warriors are united in the common fight for Scottish independence. Bruce and Wallace epitomize the folk hero and their ambitions are finally realized in Prince Charles.[77] These ancient warriors laid the foundation for the Highlander to become the image of the true and noble patriot and served to unite the different factions in a common veneration of heroism in service of the nation. All Scots could identify with their honorable deeds and were proud to claim a relationship with this epic past.

Images of heroes and battle also compose a major element of the Jacobite conception of the golden age. In most interpretations, pre-Union Scotland was seen as a nation of political independence, social autonomy, and admirable heroism. This unspecified time of prosperity and honor is identified only by the fact that it is lost. Songs of the golden age are not purely nostalgic, but contain sentiments of both sorrow and hope. Although lost, the golden age presents

[76] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II*, 100. Hogg states that it is a Buchan song supplied by John Wallace, however it does not appear in print until the close of the eighteenth century.
[77] Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics*, 153.

a path for the future. "The Act of Succession," a song which rejects the 1714 Hanoverian Succession, harkens back to a time when England had no claim on Scotland:

> Consider, the power is our own:
> Let Scotland no more be oppress'd,
> Nor England lay claim to our crown:
> Let us think with what blood and what care
> Our ancestors kept themselves free;
> What Bruce and what Wallace could dare:
> If they did so much, why not we?
>
> Let Montrose and Dundee be brought in,
> As later examples before you;
> And hold out but as you begin,
> Like them, the next age will adore you.[78]

In this golden age, the bravery of the Scots was fully active and its heroes did not surrender their freedom, a sin reserved for contemporary Scots. During the Jacobite period, Scotland was a nation without a state, and songs of the golden age reflected a fierce desire among sections of the Scottish nation to regain political independence. "The Act of Succession" is concerned with the general influence of England on Scotland, but "When the King comes o'er the Water" is more specifically concerned with dynastic and party politics:

> I hae seen the gude auld day,
> The day o' pride and chieftain glory,
> When royal Stuarts bare the sway,
> And ne'er heard tell o' Whig nor Tory.
> Though lyart be my locks and gray,
> And eild has crook'd me down – what matter?
> I'll dance and sing aeither day,
> That day our king comes o'er the water.[79]

The subject of this song is Lady Keith, a Jacobite supporter who was ruined during the failed 1745 Rising. She is an old woman but remembers "the gude auld day" of her youth when Scotland had its traditional leader and she still prays for the day when that golden age will come

[78] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. I,* 42. The song as a whole is classified as high church Episcopalian attack on Presbyterianism and Lutheranism. It is a contemporary song, published by Ritson in 1794.
[79] Ibid., 45. This song is also known as "Lady Keith's Lament" and was published in various manuscripts with no identified author.

again. These two songs and many others like them demonstrate the presence of different interpretations of the golden age in Scottish society, whether it was martial glory or peaceful prosperity.

Values

Closely tied to the golden age is the articulation of national destiny. If the golden age is the template, then national destiny is the means of recreating that image of the past. Just as there were multiple versions of the golden age in Scottish society, there were many corresponding conceptions of Scotland's destiny as a nation and a polity. The golden age offered in "The Tenth of June" is the period when the Stuarts ruled over all of Britain. The singer calls on all Britons, both Scottish and presumably English, to lead the country back to this famed era:

> Britons, be loyal once again,
> Ye've a precedent before ye;
> This day, crown'd with a Stuart's reign,
> Shall blaze in future story.
> Be resolute and brave,
> Your country ye may save,
> If once ye dare to be loyal:
> Then at honesty's call
> Let us conquer or fall
> In the cause of our old line royal.[80]

The Stuart restoration is still in the undefined future, but if Britons "dare to be loyal" they will find the path to victory. In this song, national destiny is dependent on the unity of all of the nations of Great Britain, but in "Come, let us drink a Health, Boys" the dynamic is less conciliatory. This song places the burden of national destiny on the Stuart family specifically, and sees the English as a barrier to the Stuart's (and Scotland's) rightful place:

> For England must surrender
> To him they call Pretender:
> God save our faith's defender,
> And our true lawful king…
> The royal youth deserveth

[80] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 38.

To fill the sacred place;
'Tis he alone preserveth
The Stuarts' ancient race.
Since 'tis our inclination
To call him to the nation,
Let each man, in his station,
Receive his king in peace.[81]

The law of man and the law of God both declare the Stuarts' legitimacy, and it is just and lawful for them to regain their position. It is the "inclination" of the Scottish nation to welcome the Stuarts back home, regardless of what the English may claim. Although each Jacobite attempt to reinstate the Stuarts was a military campaign, neither of these songs advocates violence directly. Jacobite songs of national destiny assume that a civil war will occur between the Jacobites and the Government, but take great efforts to prove the legality and, more importantly, the desirability of such an event.

Alongside the hopeful and positive visions of the Scottish golden age and national destiny, there were as many Jacobite songs which found those ideals thoroughly corrupted. "Such a Parcel of Rogues in a Nation," popularized by Robert Burns but originally dating as far back as 1689, is a Jacobite song which recognizes a former golden age but cannot envisage any optimistic future for Scotland:

Fareweel to a' our Scottish fame,
Fareweel our ancient glory,
Fareweel ev'n to the Scottish name,
Sae fam'd in martial story…

O would, or I had seen the day
That treason could thus sell us,
My auld gray head had lain in clay,
Wi' Bruce and loyal Wallace!
But pith and power, till my last hour
I'll make this declaration,
We're bought and sold for English gold:
Such a parcel of rogues in a nation![82]

[81] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. I*, 98. Found in various manuscript collections, notably published in *True Loyalist* (1779).

The Union was largely achieved through the maneuverings of a select group of Scottish lords and merchants, those who were "bought and sold for English gold" as the author puts it.[83] This English gold and the political transformations it entailed has wiped away all traces of the glorious Scottish past, and its shameful influence has ensured that no Scot can claim such praise again. The Scots have lost their pride, their country, and even their name through this traitorous act. Bruce and Wallace, who were famous for their resistance to the English, are invoked in this song to highlight the scarcity of true and loyal Scots. It is the destiny of Scotland to pay for this treason and to live with the rogues who brought it about.

Alternative History

The Stuart version of the Scottish nation was the dominant view of Scotland during the first half of the eighteenth century, but there were other viable options. Tobias Smollett (1716-1771), a popular Scottish author who was never associated with Jacobitism, wrote a song called "The Tears of Scotland" that mourns the fate of Scotland after the slaughter at Culloden 1746. He presents his own vision of the Scottish golden age which is now ruined beyond repair:

> Mourn, hapless Caledonia, mourn
> Thy banish'd peace, thy laurels torn!
> Thy sons, for valour long renown'd,
> Lie slaughter'd on their native ground.
> Thy hospitable roofs no more
> Invite the stranger to the door;
> In smoky ruins sunk they lie,
> The monuments of cruelty…
> Whilst the warm blood bedews my veins,
> And unimpair'd remembrance reigns,
> Resentment of my country's fate
> Within my filial breast shall beat;
> And, spite of her insulting foe,
> My sympathizing verse shall flow.[84]

---

[82] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. I* 56. This song is probably older than the Union, a similar copy was presented to James VII in 1700. It refers to the acts of the 1689 Convention rather than to the 1706 Estates that led to the Union.
[83] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 33.
[84] Douglas Gifford and Alan Riach, eds., *Scotlands: Poets and the Nation* (Manchester: Carcanet; Edinburgh: Scottish Poetry Library, 2004), 86.

The peaceful past of valor, hospitality, and piety are now gone, and all the poet can do is remember how Scotland once was. Although Smollett was not a Jacobite, he could still resent the brutal reprisals that befell Scotland. His "sympathizing verse" is the only way the golden age of Scotland can be preserved despite a national destiny of perpetual grief for what has been lost.

In contrast to the Jacobites and sympathetic Scots like Smollett, the Whig interpretation of Scottish history and the Scottish nation had an entirely different set of symbols, myths, traditions, memories, and values. The Whig song "King William's Birth-day" contains examples of many of these ethno-symbolist elements:

> Let's sing the brave hero whom Heaven did ordain
> To quell wicked tyrants, and nations set free…
> The hero who sav'd us when James had enslav'd us,
> The hero who sav'd our religion and law…
>
> Thus Orange, like Caesar, came, saw, and did conquer:
> His foes were dispers'd like a mist by the wind,
> As James went to France with his warming-pan younker.
> Oh! that he had ne'er left a Tory behind!...
>
> May Hanover prosper, whom great William chose
> To finish what he and brave Anne had begun:
> As we drove out King James…
> Let's keep the true daughter and hang the false son.[85]

The Stuarts are not the liberty-loving heroes presented in Jacobite verse, but "wicked tyrants" who enslaved Britain and threatened both religion and law. The heroic past is seen through both Caesar and William, while the national destiny of this version of Scotland is the peaceful reign of George I. The "warming-pan younker" is a reference to James Edward Stuart who was supposedly smuggled into Queen Mary's bed and passed off as the Catholic heir to the throne. His birth was one of the precipitants of the Glorious Revolution, the story the author of the song is relating. Interestingly, classic Whig constitutional theory affirmed that James left his throne

[85] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. I*, 367. Written during Queen Anne's reign between 1702 and 1714, appears in collections in 1715.

vacant during the Glorious Revolution and that William and Mary were offered the monarchy. In this song, however, William "came, saw, and did conquer" the throne, an interpretation that has become anathema to the official series of events.

Another tendency of the Whig version of the Scottish nation was to mock the symbols of the Jacobites and their Highland supporters. Whig songs like "Over the Hills and far away" and "Bonnie Laddie, Highland Laddie" take their titles from original Jacobite songs and twist their content into a parody of Jacobite ideology. This theme was the continuation of a long history of anti-Highland satire dating back to the Middle Ages, especially in the Lowlands, which remained popular despite the positive images offered in Jacobite song.[86] "O Brother Sandie, hear ye the News" is an example of the Whig view of the Jacobites and their cause:

> O Brother Sandie, hear ye the news?
> Lillibulero, bullen a la,
> An army's just coming without any shoes,
> Lillibulero, bullen a la.
> To arms, to arms, brave boys, to arms;
> A true British cause for your courage doth ca';
> Court, country, and city, against banditti,
> Lillibulero, bullen a la.
>
> The Pope sends us over a bonnie young lad, &c.
> Who, to court British favour, wears a Highland plaid…[87]

The chorus of "Lillibulero, bullen a la" is a reference to an older Jacobite song about the Glorious Revolution and is used to ridicule Sandie, the stereotypical Scot. The bonnie young lad in the counterfeit plaid is Prince Charles, who is accused of being sent by the Pope. In reality, the Pope only offered local support to the Stuarts and relied on other European powers to provide the means of a Catholic restoration. Despite their different methods and symbols, both Whig and Jacobite representations of the Scottish nation attempted to unite the Highlands and the Lowlands into a common conception of Scottish identity. While this was not achieved during the

[86] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 49.
[87] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 457. Published in *A Collection of Loyal Songs* (1748).

Jacobite period, both versions of the Scottish nation survived to pass on their symbols, myths, memories, traditions, and values to new interpretations of the Scottish nation. This transition of Scottish symbols into a British context and a British nation is the subject of the next section.

Conclusion

Even with the presence and popularity of the Whig interpretation, the Jacobite version of the Scottish nation was the only articulation that focused exclusively on Scotland. The Whigs relied too heavily on a pan-British identity that belittled large sections of the Scottish population and was not truly inclusive. The Stuart-sponsored version of the Scottish nation utilized the symbols of Scottish history in order to incorporate all classes, regions, and religions into a united body of people. By advertising the need for tradition, independence, and renewal, the Stuarts were able to project a vision of the nation which resonated with all Scots, from the noble lairds to the common crofters. After the Rising failed in 1746, Stuart images and ideology survived but acquired a different form. When they no longer represented a viable political movement, the Jacobites quickly became one of the symbols of Scotland and joined the ranks of other heroes of the past. Jacobite symbols continued to motivate new generations of Scots long after the last Stuart was gone.

One final Jacobite song can be used to illustrate the potency of the Stuart vision of the Scottish nation. "The Clans are all away" was published in the *True Loyalist* in 1779, over thirty years after the final Rising, but contains every aspect of an ethno-symbolist nation:

> Let mournful Britons now deplore
> The horrors of Drummossie's day;
> Our hopes of freedom all are o'er,
> The clans are all away, away.
> The clemency of late enjoy'd
> Is changed to tyrannic sway;
> Our laws and friends at once destroy'd:
> The clans are all away, away.

Has fate thus doom'd the Scottish race
To tyrants' lasting power a prey?
Shall all those troubles never cease?
Why went the clans away, away?
Brave sons of Mars, no longer mourn;
Your prince abroad will make no stay:
You'll bless the hour of his return,
And soon revenge Drummossie's day.[88]

The golden age of clemency is cruelly interrupted by exile, and a thriving public culture is uprooted with "laws and friends at once destroy'd." Drummossie Moor, the site of the final battle of the '45, is remembered as part of the heroic past and sacred homeland – sacred because of the sacrifice offered for Scotland and the Stuarts. Unpredictable fate becomes the new articulation of the myth of election, while the Scots claim ancestry to the "brave sons of Mars." Despite their losses, the mournful Britons still have a national destiny through Prince Charles, who will ensure that they are avenged. Finally, the subject of the song, the Highland clan, is the most recognizable symbol of the Scottish nation and they are said to be gone. But gone where? As the following section will demonstrate, the Stuart vision of the Scottish nation provided a unifying force for all Scots and continued to serve the interest of the nation in the years to come.

[88] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II,* 75.

Section 3

Romantic Song and the British Nation

Introduction

With the failure of the 1745 Jacobite Rising, the potency of the Stuart vision of the Scottish nation collapsed. The Stuarts could not guarantee a viable interpretation of the future of Scotland and subsequently lost their appeal for the majority of the Scottish population. The Jacobite version of the Scottish nation no longer inspired sacrifice and loyalty to the nation, but the symbols, myths, memories, traditions, and values that the Stuarts cultivated endured as powerful unifiers of the Scottish people. This section will explore how traditional Scottish symbols were redefined within a broader British framework. This incorporation and manipulation of Scottish symbols into a British context was devised in order to bind the Scots to a new interpretation of Britain, one that was only possible after the collapse of the politically ambitious Jacobites. Until around 1750, the concept of "Britishness" was exclusively territorial: a person was British if one was born on the island of Great Britain. This sense of identity was merely descriptive and held no deep emotional attachment. By incorporating Scottish symbols into the vision of the British nation, cultural nationalists of Britain worked to generate the feelings of passion and commitment for that broader conception of national identity.

The ethno-symbolist model of the Scottish nation presented in the last section can also be traced in the formation of the British nation. Contemporary songs written by Scottish authors contain various symbols of Scotland adapted for a British audience, symbols that were used to enable the Scots to identify with the British nation on an emotional level. As in the Scottish nation, the invocation of symbols, public culture, heroes and war, and national destiny were

particularly useful for inspiring this attachment. These songs also document many of the broader social, political, and economic transformations taking place in the British nation as a whole. By examining these wider trends, a second level of ethno-symbolist incorporation is revealed. Not only did the fusion of the British and Scottish nations occur at the cultural and symbolic level, but in other areas of British society as well. The symbols of Scotland contributed to the projected image of the British nation but, more importantly, they profoundly influenced its fundamental institutions and identity. Any understanding of the British nation is incomplete without considering the impact of the Scots, a people whose participation was dependent on the efforts of the British nation to appeal to their symbolic interests.

One of the unique features of the British nation was an ability to establish itself as a viable nation built on the contributions of smaller nations without requiring the elimination of those older communities. Thus, the Scottish nation was effectively adopted by the British while continuing to exist as an independent entity in its own right. This survival of the Scottish nation is apparent in the compositions of the Scottish songwriters who followed the active Jacobite poets. These songwriters, who were not politically connected to the Jacobite movement, continued to compose in the Jacobite *genre*, producing songs purely of the Scottish nation. At the same time, they created patriotic songs of the British nation that used those same symbols, myths, and traditions to inspire and support British causes. These seemingly divergent interests were possible only because of the interconnectivity of the Scottish and British national identities; a songwriter's Scottishness and Britishness were not mutually exclusive because both were built on a common body of symbolic resources.

This section will begin with a brief biographical sketch of three of the major romantic songwriters who composed both Jacobite and British songs during this period. Their Jacobite

songs, as well as a few written by lesser-known songwriters, demonstrate the persistence of the Scottish nation and some of its key symbols and traditions noted in the previous chapter. From there, the remainder of section three will be an analysis of the Scottish contributions to the British nation and the broader historical trends they influenced. Particular attention will be paid to the ethno-symbolist fields of public culture, symbolism, heroes and war, and national destiny to demonstrate both the cultural and social dimensions of the Scottish impact on the British nation.

The Scottish Nation

Robert Burns (1759-1796) was born in Alloway, Ayrshire, a county in the Lowlands of Scotland. He was the eldest of seven children and received a limited education through his father, local tutors, and parish schools. Despite this lack of a formal education, Burns was an avid poet and songwriter who achieved recognition during his lifetime and is still regarded as one of Scotland's greatest poets. While his artistic genius is uncontested, Burns's political views continue to be a topic of debate among scholars. When discussing British politics, Burns presented himself as a loyal Foxite Whig.[89] However, he was also committed to Scottish independence and the cause of liberty, a subject he addresses in his poems and songs supporting the French Revolution. Burns admitted to feelings of sympathy for the Jacobites and their campaign, and even confessed some Jacobite relations in his family history, while patriotically supporting British endeavors throughout the empire.[90] The complexity of his political views have led some scholars to conclude that he had no conviction at all and merely changed his party

[89]Donaldson, *Jacobite Song*, 69. Foxite Whigs followed the political ideology of Charles James Fox, a British politician who led a faction of the Whig party from 1794 to his death in 1806. Fox and his supporters were notable for their campaigns for anti-slavery, support of the French Revolution, and religious tolerance.
[90] David Daiches, "Robert Burns and the Jacobite Song," in *Critical Essays on Robert Burns,* ed. Donald A. Low (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1975), 138, 141.

loyalties to best suit his needs.[91] Regardless, Burns was one of the earliest songwriters to reinvigorate the Jacobite song as an independent genre. Burns worked as a "packager, an image-maker, [and] a presenter" of Jacobite songs and revived their popularity.[92] He made the Jacobite song respectable in a period when the Jacobites continued to be censured and considered a political threat.

Sir Walter Scott (1771-1832) the well-known poet and novelist, is credited with rehabilitating much of the Scottish image in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. He was educated at the University of Edinburgh before receiving wide-spread fame for his historical novels, beginning with *Waverley* in 1814.[93] Building on the contributions of Burns, Scott helped make Jacobitism fashionable and was a major advocate of the reconciliation of Whig and Jacobite politics.[94] Scott was a firm believer in the 1707 Union and was responsible for its glamorous celebration through the Highland extravaganza that welcomed King George IV to Edinburgh in 1822. Modern historiography has accused Scott of romanticizing and depoliticizing Scottish culture, making it the romantic fantasy of British tourists. But Scott was in fact a Scottish patriot who was anxiously aware of the effects of Union on the distinctive culture of Scotland.[95] In 1826, Scott wrote to the conservative journalist John Wilson Croker that "Scotland completely liberalised, as she is in a fair way of being, will be the most dangerous neighbour to England that she has had since 1639...if you unScotch us, you will find us damned mischievous Englishmen."[96] While acknowledging that the future of Scotland lay in a political

[91] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 86.
[92] Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics,* 6.
[93] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 94.
[94] Colin Kidd, "The Rehabilitation of Jacobitism," *The Scottish Historical Review* 77 (1998): 73-74.
[95] Murray G.H. Pittock, "The Jacobite Cult," in *Scottish History: The Power of the Past,* eds. Edward J. Cowan and Richard J. Finlay (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002), 192-193.
[96] Kidd, "Rehabilitation," 76.

and economic union with England, he remained wary of completely surrendering the Scottish nation.

One of Scott's contemporaries and protégés was James Hogg (1770-1835), better known in his time as the Ettrick Shepherd. Hogg was a largely self-taught poet, songwriter, and novelist who began his literary career as a ballad collector for Scott's *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border* (1803). Hogg published several pro-Hanoverian and British songs and continued in the tradition of Burns and Scott in romanticizing the image of Scotland as "the land of the mountain and the flood."[97] In 1817 he was asked by the Highland Society of London to collect and publish a book of Jacobite folksongs. The first volume of *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland,* published in 1822, received mixed reviews. Contrary to the expectations of the collection's commissioners, the book was not another compilation of romantic and "tasteful" Jacobite songs, but an honest representation of the condition of Scotland as seen by Stuart loyalists. The songs that Hogg featured were not valedictions of a bygone era, but a contemporary articulation of the political threat of Jacobitism.[98] Hogg, like Burns and Scott, produced uncompromisingly positive interpretations of British patriotism, but more than either Burns or Scott, he demonstrated the survival of the Jacobite version of Scotland: "Hogg's own songs, as well as those he collected, demonstrate that Jacobite literature and ideology had outlived Jacobitism itself. They were tied to a positive, unified, and patriotic view of Scotland."[99]

In what way did Jacobite ideology and literature outlive its origins? One of the songs that Hogg collected for his *Jacobite Relics*, "The Broad Swords of Scotland," is an example of the perseverance of Stuart symbolism in songs written for the post-political Jacobite genre. The song begins and ends by invoking some of the most potent Jacobite symbols:

---

[97] Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics,* 224.
[98] Donaldson, *Jacobite Song,* 107.
[99] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 98.

When our valiant ancestors did land in this isle,
Brave Fergus commanded, and vict'ry did smile;
With their broad swords in hand they soon clear'd the soil.
O, the broad swords of old Scotland
And O, the old Scottish broad swords.

Our Scottish ancestors were valiant and bold,
In learning ne'er beat, nor in battle control'd;
But now – shall I name it? – alas! we're all sold.[100]

Here, Scottish myths of ancestry and ancient heroes are still called upon to provide heroic examples of past glory. Fergus and other "valiant and bold" ancestors provide the model on which contemporary Scots were to base their actions and ambitions. The sword itself is a symbol of the military might of Scotland and invokes a golden age of independent martial victory matched by academic achievement when their learning was "ne'er beat." Alongside praise of the Scottish past is a critique of modern Scotland "all sold" for the same English gold that condemned the contrivers of the Union. Not all Scots were convinced of the benefits of Union, and Stuart propaganda continued to hold a position of power in terms of anti-Union sentiment.

Other Jacobite symbols, figures, and momentous events were passed down to a new generation of songwriters. Scott, known for his novels that sentimentalized the Jacobites and their cause, could not avoid using Jacobitical subjects for his writing. One example is his song "On the Massacre of Glencoe," written in 1814. This episode of betrayal and revenge in Scotland's past became an important Jacobite symbol, and even Scott could not entirely remove the power of that image in conjuring feelings of Scottish independence and pride: "Each chord should imprecations fling, till startled Scotland loud shall ring, 'Revenge for blood and treachery!'"[101] In addition to anti-Unionism, Jacobite ideology endured in popular song via its

[100] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. I,* 78. Hogg states that this song might have been written by "an English gentleman who was sojourning here after the time of the Union." If so, he had a great understanding of the symbolism of the Scottish nation.
[101] Scudder, Horace E., ed. *The Complete Poetical Works of Sir Walter Scott* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1906), 409.

condition as new exemplars of the heroic past. While the Jacobites were no longer politically or militarily active, their cause could be added to other instances of heroism and honor, joining King Fergus and the victims of Glencoe. Charles Stuart in particular was commemorated as a hero and was given the title of "Bonnie Prince Charlie" in this period:

> Come thro' the heather, around him gather,
> Come Ronald, come Donald, come a' thegither,
> And crown your rightfu', lawful' king!
> For wha'll be king but Charlie?[102]

The author of this song, "Wha'll be King but Charlie," was Carolina Oliphant, Lady Nairne (1766-1845). Lady Nairne was raised in a staunchly Jacobite family who lost its title after the Rising. Nairne's songs of Jacobite sentiment and heroism were wildly popular and reflected the general trend of romanticizing the Jacobites away from their political background.[103] However, unlike the songs I will be examining later in the section that also romanticized the Jacobites, Nairne's songs like "Wha'll be King but Charlie" did not seek to idolize them for the benefit of the British nation. Nairne wanted to revive the Jacobites as a representation of the Scottish nation and articulated none of the dualism present in the artistic contributions of Burns, Scott, or Hogg.

Images of Scottish heroes, war, and sacrifice were supplemented in these post-Jacobite songs by representations of the social, political, and cultural institutions that were dismantled after the Rising. Depictions of these public institutions (or more specifically the loss of them) in the romantic phase of Jacobite song were more explicit than the songs of the active period. As in earlier songs, Scottish public life is seen through the law, the educational system, and the Church – the "holy trinity" of Scottish institutions. In contrast to early songs that expressed hope for reinstatement, contemporary songs could not convey even the slightest prospect of recovering

---

[102] Sarah Tytler and J.L. Watson, *The Songstresses of Scotland Vol. II* (London: Strahan & Co., 1871), 171.
[103] Margery Palmer McCulloch, "The lasses reply to Mr. Burns: women poets and songwriters in the Lowlands," in *Crossing the Highland Line: Cross-Currents in Eighteenth-Century Scottish Writing: Select Papers from the 2005 ASLS Annual Conference*, ed. Christopher MacLachlan (Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2009), 151.

the integrity of these institutions. Burns's song "There'll Never be Peace till Jamie Comes Hame" is a moving example of this transition from optimism to despair:

> The church is in ruins, the state is in jars,
> Delusions, oppressions, and murderous wars;
> We dare na weel say't, but we ken wha's to blame –
> There'll never be peace till Jamie comes hame.[104]

As the narrator sees it, the foundations of Scottish society have fallen apart: the Church is divided and ineffectual, the state no longer exists, and wars are waged with impunity. The singer is unable to speak his opinions freely even though he knows who is responsible for the state of affairs. By Burns's time, it was assumed that the Stuart family was practically finished, so the singer's avowal that "there'll never be peace till Jamie comes hame" is a telling statement. Jamie (or James Edward Stuart, the Old Pretender) will never come home: he died in 1766, ten years after Burns was born, and Charles Edward Stuart, the Young Pretender, died in 1788 – eight years before Burns himself died. In this song, Burns acknowledges that Scotland will never see the return of its traditional institutions and the public culture they represent. But he is also declaring that its poets can still remember it and mourn its loss as a symbol of their distinctiveness and cultural past.

Along the same lines, images of Scottish national destiny in terms of the Jacobite vision of the Scottish nation were equally bleak. Once the Stuarts were finally eliminated as political players, the Jacobite version of Scottish national destiny could no longer be maintained. The destiny of those Scots who remained loyal to the cause took on two eventualities: exile or revenge. Songs of exile, as discussed later in the section, were not produced exclusively by the Jacobite authors and could not be separated from contemporary social and economic conditions

[104] Alexander Smith, ed., *Poems, Songs, and Letters: Being the Complete Works of Robert Burns* (London: Macmillan, 1906), 236.

in Scotland. Songs of revenge, however, were purely Jacobite. Hogg's song "Farewell to Glen-Shalloch" is a stirring example of this style:

> "I'll tell thee, my son,
> How our laurels are withering;
> I'll bind on thy sword
> When the clansmen are gathering;
> I'll bid thee go forth
> In the cause of true honour,
> And never return
> Till thy country hath won her!"[105]

Here, Scotland is once again personified as a woman, this time not as an abandoned lover but as a vengeful mother. The woman Scotland prepares her sons for battle in order to reclaim her lost honor. Compared to past expressions of Scottish national destiny, this conception is not based on the return to a particular golden age or even the lawful right of the Stuart family. Scotland is concerned only with revenge, not for the Stuarts' sake but for her own.

More generally, how did the Stuart version of the Scottish nation survive? While the scope of this paper cannot fully address this issue, two theories on the topics of defeat and nostalgia provide a partial response. Wolfgang Shivelbusch's *The Culture of Defeat: On National Trauma, Mourning, and Recovery* (2003) examines the deep psychological impact of military defeat on a nation.[106] Although he uses the examples of the American Confederacy, the French after the Franco-Prussian War, and post-World War I Germany as his case studies, many of his conclusions can be applied to post-Jacobite Scotland. Schivelbusch remarks on the degrees of defeat and capitulation: "As long as losing nations have an intact national identity at their command, they will stubbornly refuse to comply with the victor's demands for moral and spiritual surrender through demonstrations of regret, conversion, and willingness to be

[105] James Hogg, *The Works of the Ettrick Shepherd* (London: Blackie and Son, 1865), 411.
[106] Wolfgang Schivelbusch, *The Culture of Defeat: On National Trauma, Mourning, and Recovery* (New York: Metropolitan Books, 2003).

reeducated."[107] The Jacobites qualified their defeat by emphasizing their honor and sacrifice, a connection, as will later be seen, that was actually encouraged by the British nation. The Stuart interpretation of the Scottish nation provided a strong sense of national identity that survived well into the nineteenth century.[108]

In addition to qualifying its losses, the Stuart version of the Scottish nation used the medium of nostalgia to survive despite political and military defeat. Peter Fritzsche's work on the aristocratic exiles of the French Revolution in "Specters of History: On Nostalgia, Exile, and Modernity" (2001) highlights the role of nostalgia in maintaining links with the past in times of great crisis and change.[109] In the course of the nineteenth century, argues Fritzsche, nostalgia was "made tenable by the massive displacing operations of industrialization and urbanization, which also standardized its meaning as a vague, collective longing for a bygone time rather than an individual desire to return to a particular place."[110] The Jacobite defeat at Culloden caused as much displacement and stress as the French Revolution, and Jacobite songs reveal an equal concern with exile and melancholy as the aristocratic memoires that Fritzsche analyzes. The Stuart vision of the nation capitalized on a new interpretation of the golden age: Jacobitism, a past that was free of English intervention and destabilizing economic change. This time, bound to the past by the dominance of the British state, could never be attained again and Jacobitism was elevated as the "dispirit of the age." These two models of defeat and nostalgia provide merely a starting point for the discussion of the endurance of the Scottish nation as an independent entity, a topic that deserves further exploration.

---

[107] Schivelbusch, *Culture of Defeat, 29.*

[108] Many of the Jacobite symbols first presented in the seventeenth century can still be seen in the political campaigns of modern Scottish nationalist parties. The Jacobite white rose is used as a symbol of Scotland and Culloden is often invoked in defense of Scottish independence.

[109] Peter Fritzsche, "Specters of History: On Nostalgia, Exile, and Modernity," in *American Historical Review* 106 (2001).

[110] Ibid., 1519.

The British Nation

The establishment of the British nation, then, appears to be a paradox. It was created and perpetuated by a generation of individuals and institutions who had risen in open rebellion against their state. Soldiers, merchants, intellectuals, and nobles of Scotland participated in the final Jacobite Rising in 1745, but as soon as ten years later, many of them were loyal Britons fighting in the Seven Years War. Culturally, the British nation was brought to life by songwriters whose compositions also kept an autonomous Scotland alive through appeals to Scottish distinctiveness and independence. How did this happen? How is it that two Scotsmen, James Thomson and David Mallet, wrote one of the greatest patriotic hymns in the British repertoire?

> The nations, not so blest as thee,
> Must in their turns to tyrants fall;
> While thou shalt flourish great and free,
> The dread and envy of them all.
> 'Rule, Britannia, rule the waves;
> Britons never will be slaves.'[111]

For people all over the world, "Rule Britannia" signifies the might of the British state and the endurance of the British nation. However, this song and the meaning behind it would not have been possible without the contributions of the Scottish nation, and particularly without the creative powers of its songwriters.

The integration of the Scottish nation into Britain was achieved through a process of political, social, cultural, and economic shifts that allowed the symbols of Scotland to be transferred into a British context. The rehabilitation of the Scottish Jacobites, Highlandism, war and empire, and the "improvement" of Scotland all combined to produce a Britain that Scots could identify with on several levels. Culturally, the symbols of Scotland continued to appear in British songs, but the traditions, institutions, and values of Scotland also cropped up throughout

[111] Gifford and Riach, *Scotlands,* 81.

the British nation. Beyond recognizing Scottish styles of dress or Stuart symbolism in British propaganda, the Scots could find pieces of themselves in the very fabric of the British state, from the bureaucratic operation of the empire to the conceptualization of the monarchy. The remainder of this section will demonstrate how the symbols of Scotland, both cultural and otherwise, were transferred to the British nation to create a strong sense of national identity.

Rehabilitation

The rehabilitation of the Scottish image after Culloden was a long and brutal process that began with repression and retaliation against the rebellious Scots. In 1746, the Duke of Cumberland, the younger son of King George II known as "the Butcher," pillaged and burned his way through the Highlands in an attempt to pacify the region once and for all. In London, punitive legislation curtailed traditional Scottish rights and liberties, instituted the abolition of ward tenures and heritable jurisdiction, and enforced a policy of disarmament.[112] Most bitterly resented by the Scots was the Dress Act, a provision of the Act of Proscription in 1746. The act forbade the wearing of Highland dress in Scotland, and only soldiers in specifically designated regiments were permitted to wear the traditional plaid.[113] While the act was in force, Scottish songwriters poured out condemnations on this prohibition, including Alexander MacDonald in his song "The Proud Plaid":

> More I loved the proud plaid
> Beneath my arms and round my shoulders,
> Than any coat I could get,
> Though of the finest cloth from England.[114]

Similar pieces included "A Song to the Breeches," "The Song of the Black Coats," "A Song Against the Lowland Garb," and "A Song to the Marquis of Graham and to the Highland

[112] Kidd, "Integration," 377.
[113] Edward J. Cowan, "Contacts and tensions in Highland and Lowland culture," in *Crossing the Highland Line: Cross-Currents in Eighteenth-Century Scottish Writing: Select Papers from the 2005 ASLS Annual Conference,* ed. Christopher MacLachlan (Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2009), 13.
[114] Campbell, *Highland Songs,* 155. Written by Alexander MacDonald, see note 61 on page 28 for more information.

Dress."[115] The Dress Act and the various forms of punishment enacted against the Scots were used to repress Scottish culture as much as to prevent future rebellions. Judicial repression, as T.M. Devine writes, was used to "transform Highland society and culture through legislation designed to encourage economic improvement, the expansion of Presbyterianism and the removal of cultural difference with the rest of Britain."[116]

After the initial brutality of Pacification, a series of political relaxations allowed the Scots to regain their valued position in the Union. The necessities of war and empire created a demand for Scottish soldiers and wealthy nobles, despite their possible taint of Jacobitism. Waning anti-Catholicism, a revival of Tory control in Parliament, and the efforts of the Highland Society of London to lift the ban on tartan and to return the forfeited Jacobite estates, all contributed to the acceptance of Scots as respectable members of the British nation.[117] Eventually the Scots willingly committed themselves to the British nation, and the coercive measures of the Act of Proscription were removed. Beginning in 1784, Jacobite estates and titles that had been attained after the Rising were restored, an act that became the subject of a song by Reverend William Cameron. In the opening stanzas of "On the Restoration of the Forfeited Estates, 1784," the Jacobite clans are lovingly welcomed back to Scotland from exile in the manner of a traditional Jacobite song: "As o'er the Highland hills I hied, the Camerons in array I spied, Lochiel's proud standard waving wide in all its ancient glory." But by the end of the song, it is apparent that the clans have been recalled for a different purpose:

[115] Campbell, *Highland Songs,* 219, 237, 249, 281. Written by Duncan Ban McIntyre, Rob Donn Mackay, John MacCodrum, and William Ross, respectively.
[116] T.M. Devine, *The Scottish Nation: A History, 1700-2000* (New York: Viking, 1999), 233.
[117] Kidd, "Rehabilitation," 60.

> Ye northern chiefs, whose rage, unbroken,
> Has still repell'd the tyrant's shock;
> Who ne'er have bow'd beneath her yoke
> With servile base prostration;
> Let each now train his trusty band
> 'Gainst foreign foes alone to stand
> With undivided heart and hand,
> For freedom, king, and nation.[118]

Cameron uses Stuart symbols of Scotland such as the martial heritage and an emphasis on independence, but the purpose of this song is not to rally support for the Jacobites. In 1784, the "foreign foes" are the French, not the English, and Cameron is calling on the restored Jacobite lords to defend Britain's "freedom, king, and nation." Here the Jacobites, and the Scottish people in general, are being politically rehabilitated and thus reintegrated into the British nation. The song sends a message to those who will freely take their reward for loyalty to the Britain.

Throughout Britain and abroad, Scots were eager to demonstrate their newly transferred loyalty, primarily through service in the imperial army or in the political realm. Several theories have been posited as to why the Scots were so quick to take up British patriotism. Colley states that patriotism acted as a "bandwagon on which different groups and interests leaped so as to steer it in a direction that would benefit them."[119] For the Scots, patriotism was a means of political involvement and a path to citizenship rights. Similarly, Matthew Dziennik offers the explanation that patriotism "offered a secure means of exploiting the fiscal-military state and protecting the continued legitimacy of local rule."[120] Both of these theories highlight incentives for patriotism, but an ethno-symbolist understanding looks for the deeper motivations. These are suggested by James Hogg's "The Jubilee," a loyal eulogy for the reigning Hanoverian monarch:

---

[118] Hogg, *Jacobite Relics Vol. II*, 207. Reverend William Cameron (1752-1811), published in the *Scots Musical Museum.*
[119] Colley, *Britons*, 5.
[120] Matthew P. Dziennik, "Whig Tartan: Material Culture and its Uses in the Scottish Highlands, 1746-1815," *Past and Present* 217 (2012): 121-122.

> Who will not join the lay,
> And hail the auspicious day
> That first gave great George the sway
> Over our island?...
>
> In mercy first sent to us;
> In love so long lent to us;
> Grateful, let's vent our vows
> For Heaven's kindness.[121]

This song is noticeably similar to ones produced in the Jacobite era to praise the Stuart family, so much so that if James replaced George, it would be virtually indistinguishable from the Jacobite canon. Hogg commends the divine providence of George's arrival in Britain and invites the audience to proudly proclaim its loyalty to the House of Hanover, much in the same way as Jacobite songs of invitation did in the past. Given his knowledge of the Jacobite repertoire, Hogg must have known that the structure of this song would immediately resonate with generations of Scots who were familiar with such messages. While the Scots certainly responded to the incentives for patriotism, they were already familiar with this kind of demonstrative devotion and needed very little encouragement to transfer their loyalty to a regime that appealed to this tradition.

Another interesting quality of Hogg's "The Jubilee," is its explicit identification with the monarchy as an institution sympathetic to the Scots. This connection was solidified after the downfall of the Stuarts when Hanoverian monarchs adopted specific Jacobite symbols in order to clothe themselves in the "mystical robes of sacred kingship."[122] By adopting a modified doctrine of the divine right of kings, the Hanoverians were able to steer the Scottish commitment to the Stuarts into an abstract loyalty to the monarchy in general. Hanoverian monarchs wore the tartan plaid and visited Scotland, and they were rewarded when the Scots began to identify with kings and queens who actively cultivated their support. The monarch who took the most advantage of

[121] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd*, 281.
[122] Kidd, "Rehabilitation," 58.

this reciprocal relationship was Queen Victoria, who practically turned the institution of the monarchy into a cult in Scotland.[123] Another of Hogg's songs, "Donald M'Donald" reveals the passionate sense of loyalty that common Scots felt for the monarch in one generation after the Jacobites:

> Whenever a clan is disloyal.
> Wherever our king has a foe.
> He'll quickly see DONALD M'DONALD,
> Wi'shighlandmen a' in a row.[124]

Written in 1803, this song was composed when Britain was under the real threat of invasion from France.[125] The eponymous soldier proudly professes his loyalty to King George, claiming that he will valiantly fight for "our" king, a man from a family who most Scots openly reviled as the Kings of Turnips less than sixty years earlier.

The humble and happy Donald M'Donald confesses his opinions on the Stuarts as well as the Hanoverians – Prince Charles Edward Stuart in particular:

> What tho' we befriendit young CHARLEY,
> To tell it I dinna think shame.
> Poor lad he came to us but barely.
> And reckon'd our mountains his hame;
> 'Tis true that our reason forbade us.
> But tenderness carry'd the day,
> Had GEORDY come friendless amang us,
> Wi' him wi' had a' gane away.[126]

This song offers an interpretation of the Jacobite movement that became popular during the period of Scottish social rehabilitation. It was determined that the Scots were led into the wrong cause out of a sense of loyalty to their clan chiefs, a dedication that was perverted and abused; they had acted with honor and heroism by bravely following their leaders, but it was obviously a

---

[123] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 103.
[124] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd*, 283.
[125] Peter Garside, "The Origins and History of James Hogg's 'Donald MacDonald,'" *Scottish studies Review* 7 (2006): 25.
[126] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd*, 283.

case of misguided allegiance.[127] "Donald M'Donald" makes this statement very clearly: he admits that he and his fellow Highlandmen joined the Jacobite cause, but only because Bonnie Prince Charlie was nice to them. As he says, if King George had been more agreeable or sympathetic, things might have been different.

This recasting of Scottish participation in the Jacobite Uprisings reveals the extent to which the British nation went to incorporate this formerly marginal population into its jurisdiction. The former Jacobites were welcomed back into the good graces of the British nation, and they consented to be there because a British identity looked more like themselves than it had before the Rising. British cultural and social elites, those individuals writing songs of the British nation using Scottish symbols and intimately connecting Scotland to the monarchy and other institutions, ensured that the Scots would be more open to responding to the incentives of Union than they had in the past. The incentives that Colley and Dziennik propose as the fundamental motivations for Scottish integration, access to the political bandwagon and the fiscal-military complex, were available to Scots from the Union in 1707, albeit to a relatively small extent compared to the post-Jacobite period. Regardless, the Scots failed to respond to these enticements because there was not enough "Scottishness" in the comparatively shallow conception of Britain and its institutions. It was only when the Stuart version of the Scottish nation collapsed that the British nation was able to effectively readapt Scottish symbolism and traditions to suit their own needs. It was also precisely at this time that the Scots were willing to look elsewhere for an emotional connection to a nation.

Highlandism

Also contributing to the rehabilitation of the Scottish reputation within the post-Jacobite Union was the influence of Highlandism, the cultural identification of all of Scotland with a

[127] T.M. Devine, *Scotland's Empire, 1600-1815* (London : Allen Lane, 2003), 312.

romantic image of the Highlands. Highlandism, while not an identity in itself, was "adopted, vulgarised and reinvented by Lowlanders as a distinctive badge of Scottishness" and, beginning in the late eighteenth century, became the face of Scotland in Britain.[128] The emerging ideas of Romanticism greatly contributed to this elision of Highland and Lowland, emphasizing the "discovery" of the Highlands as a scenic and ruggedly beautiful region, with its picturesque glens and romantic mountains.[129] Once again, a song by Hogg captures the sentiment of this phenomenon, one that is appropriately named "Caledonia," the Roman name for Scotland that became one of the major buzzwords for Highlandism:

> Caledonia! thou land of the mountain and rock,
> Of the ocean, the mist, and the wind –
> Thou land of the torrent, the pine, and the oak,
> Of the roebuck, the hart, and the hind:
> Though bare are thy cliffs, and though barren thy glens,
> Though bleak thy dun islands appear,
> Yet kind are the hearts, and undaunted the clans,
> That roam on these mountains so drear![130]

Contrary to what this song suggests, all of Scotland is not composed of mountains and forests, nor was it barren of all but the undaunted clans. This interpretation of Scotland as a natural and wild land does not mention the thriving industrial and intellectual centers in Scotland, notably Glasgow and Edinburgh. It does, however, refer to the mythical clans that the Jacobites also venerated. In Highlandism, the fascination of the inspiring scenery was only matched by its inhabitants, those noble savages who represented Scotland's virtuous citizenry.[131] This image of Scotland permeated the minds of all Britons – English, Lowlander, and Highlander – and continues to this day as the representation of Scotland found in kitschy tourist shops.

---

[128] Kidd, "Rehabilitation," 60.
[129] Devine, *Scottish Nation*, 242.
[130] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd*, 286.
[131] Charles Withers, "The Historical Creation of the Scottish Highlands," in *The Manufacture of Scottish History*, ed. Ian L. Donnachie and Christopher A. Whatley (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992), 145.

A major component of Highlandism was its emphasis on Highland dress, an ironic quality considering that wearing plaid and tartan was prohibited in Scotland during much of the period when Highlandism was developed. Although the Jacobites were most well-known for wearing tartan, the exiled Stuarts were not the only faction to use it as a symbol of Scotland. Contrary to what Hugh Trevor-Roper suggests, the kilt was not invented in the eighteenth century, and its formal use can be traced back at least to the sixteenth century when Anne of Denmark was married to James VI in 1589.[132] After the defeat at Culloden and the subsequent Dress Act, British cultural elites worked to uncouple the links between Jacobitism and tartanry. This was largely achieved through its use in the British military realms, but it was also aided by the advent of the fashionable tartan. Both women's and men's fashion adopted the plaid and provided it with an aesthetic as well as a martial quality.[133] The most famous wearer of the renovated tartan plaid was King George IV on his visit to Scotland in 1822, whose outfit was complete with philabeg, trews, and hose.[134]

Adding to the irony of a British king of German descent wearing the traditional dress of the Scottish nation was the equally ironic habit of Lowlanders of adopting the kilt as well. The animosity between Highlanders and Lowlanders was well-known throughout the British Isles. Historically, the Lowlanders had far more in common with the English than their fellow Scots to the north and subsequently cultivated an image of refined and commercial politeness in contrast to the militant image of the Highlands.[135] Of course, the Highlanders reciprocated this hostility; the Scots word "Sassenach" was used as an abusive term mainly for the English, but its roots (from the Gaelic "*Sasunnach*") actually refer to any Saxon, Lowlanders as much as the

[132] Pittock, "Jacobite Cult," 193.
[133] Dziennik, "Whig Tartan," 128-129, 137-138.
[134] Devine, *Scottish Nation,* 235.
[135] Colley, *Britons,* 14; Dziennik, "Whig Tartan," 118.

English.[136] With these traditions of animosity, if not outright hatred, in mind, it is surprising that the Lowlanders accepted the diminishment of their contribution to Scottish national identity. Burns, a Lowlander, was also susceptible to this phenomenon, as seen in his song "My Heart's in the Highlands":

> My heart's in the Highlands, my heart is not here;
> My heart's in the Highlands a-chasing the deer;
> Chasing the wild deer, and following the roe,
> My heart's in the Highlands wherever I go.
>
> Farewell to the mountains high cover'd with snow;
> Farewell to the straths and green valleys below;
> Farewell to the forests and wild-hanging woods;
> Farewell to the torrents and loud-pouring floods.[137]

Apart from occasional visits as a tourist and for research, Burns never lived in the Highlands, and he is not reported to have had a particularly strong attachment to the region. Even so, he wrote this song and others like it that suggest that the Highlands represented his true home. Although the Jacobite movement played its part in reconciling the Highlands and the Lowlands into a common Scots identity, Highlandism represented its final realization.

For Lowland Scots like Burns and Scott, who were concerned that the identity of Scotland would be subsumed under the weight of English identity in Britain, Highlandism provided a means to safeguard the distinctiveness of Scotland within the Union. Highlandism enabled the emotional link with Scotland to continue even while Scots of all kind embraced the English-inspired institutions of North Briton.[138] Highlanders also benefitted from the effects of Highlandism by no longer being reviled as the home of barbarism and crime. Instead, they were welcomed into the cultural core of Britain and praised as the bearers of national virtue and martial prowess, with their traditional dress becoming the emblem of Scottish identity. The

---

[136] Davidson, *Scottish Nationhood,* 72.
[137] Smith, *Robert Burns,* 212.
[138] Dziennik, "Whig Tartan," 118; Devine, *Scotland's Empire,* 354.

"Scottishness" of the Highlands became a fundamental part of "Britishness" and all parties were included in the image of Highlandism: the Lowlanders protected their emotional link with Scotland, the Highlanders established their position as Britons, and all Scots found pieces of their identity celebrated throughout Britain and abroad. It should be noted that Highlandism, although a powerful unifier within British identity, was not a conception of national identity in itself. Highlandism, as a cultural and social movement, emphasized and exaggerated facets of the Scottish identity and made it accessible to the British nation as a whole.

War and Empire

In many ways, Highlandism attained such high levels of popularity due to the efforts of Scots participating in war and empire abroad. The image of the Highland soldier captured the imagination of the British public and became an icon of national valor. Fashionable interest in the kilt and tartan found its origins in the popularity of the Scottish soldier, who was emulated by all levels of society. As noted earlier, Scotland possessed a famed tradition for soldiering and martial prowess. Generations of Scottish noble families and common men acted as officers and soldiers for foreign armies, especially in Holland and France.[139] While the rest of Britain contained strong prejudices against soldiering, in Scotland it was seen as a viable option and a welcome opportunity for the economically poor and demographically large Scottish male population.[140] At the end of the eighteenth century, soldiering became more respectable throughout Britain, largely due to the demands of war with France that mobilized a greater portion of the British populace. Similarly, more inclusive interpretations of citizenship enabled the common soldier to become an increasingly sympathetic representative of the "every-man."[141]

---

[139] James Hayes, "Scottish Officers in the British Army 1714-63," *Scottish Historical Review* 37 (1958): 23.
[140] Devine, *Scotland's Empire,"* 316.
[141] Fritzsche, "Specters of History," 1614.

The Scottish soldier in particular benefited from this positive view of the military man because a large portion of Scottish identity in Britain was based on their supposed military skill. Burns's "The Sodger's Return" is a stunning example of how far soldiers, and especially the Highland soldier, progressed in the eyes of the public. It tells the story of a "poor and honest sodger" who returns to Scotland to find that his sweetheart has remained true to him. After their reunion, the soldier makes this appeal for all of his kind:

> For gold the merchant ploughs the main,
> The farmer ploughs the manor;
> But glory is the sodger's prize,
> The sodger's wealth is honor:
> The brave poor sodger ne'er despise,
> Nor count him as a stranger;
> Remember he's his country's stay,
> In day and hour of danger.[142]

The soldier depicted here is not a bloodthirsty or undisciplined ruffian who revels in violence, but an honest and honorable citizen who has his place in society like any other. The newfound respectability of the Highland soldier played nicely into the conceptualizations of Highlandism. Images of the Highland warrior and the rugged landscape that produced him made the Scots into "natural warriors" who were innately fearless, hardy, and loyal.[143] By claiming that a fundamental part of Scottish heritage was its enduring loyalty, proponents of Highlandism also became the enablers of the rehabilitation of Jacobitism in British society; if Scots were inherently loyal and the British cultural and military elites wanted that image to endure, then they could not fault the Scots for that virtue in its past guises.

Scottish participation in the British army reached staggering levels in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. By the 1750s, the Scots began to dominate military life, with Scottish officers staffing a quarter of the British army and a little over thirty percent of the

---

[142] Smith, *Robert Burns,* 237.
[143] Kenneth McNeil, *Scotland, Britain, Empire: Writing the Highlands, 1760-1860* (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2007), 83-84.

British East India Company.[144] Between 1777 and 1800 alone, twenty regiments were formed out of the Highlands, with thousands more committing themselves to the fencible corps and the volunteer movement.[145] From the Scottish point of view, war provided the first real opportunity for them to prove their rehabilitation as loyal Britons; on the British side, war revealed the extent to which political and military elites had become dependent on Scottish contributions. War became the test of Scottish integration and satisfactorily demonstrated the Scottish commitment to Britain. Although Scots served in five major wars before 1790s,[146] the French Revolutionary and Napoleonic Wars represented the pinnacle of Scottish military participation.

It was also during these wars that the image of the Highland soldier became popular as the epitome of national valor and sacrifice. The first Highland regiment to catch the public's attention was the Forty-Second, known as the Black Watch and the "Gallant Forty-Twa," that helped to overthrow the kingdom of Mysore, India in 1799 and triumphed at the Battle of Alexandria in 1801.[147] When the Black Watch returned to Edinburgh, they were welcomed back with wild celebration, as the regiment's quartermaster later recalled: "we entered the city amidst the loud cheering and congratulations of friends; while over our heads, from a thousand windows, waved as many banners, plaided scarfs or other symbols of courtly greetings."[148]

Serving in the British army allowed the Scots to perpetuate their rehabilitated image of patriotism and loyalty to the crown while also providing them with social and economic opportunities they could not receive in Scotland. Because the Highland regiments were the only

---

[144] Kidd, "Integration," 371-372; John M. MacKenzie, "Essay and Reflection: On Scotland and the Empire," *The International History Review* 15 (1993): 716.
[145] Devine, *Scotland's Empire,* 294.
[146] King William's War, or the War of English Succession (1688-1697), the War of Spanish Succession (1702-1713), The War of Jenkin's Ear and Austrian Succession (1739-1748), the Seven Years War (1756-1763), and the American War of Independence (1775-1783)
[147] J.E. Cookson, "The Napoleonic Wars, Military Scotland and Tory Highlandism in the Early Nineteenth Century," *The Scottish Historical Review* 78 (1999): 63.
[148] Devine, *Scottish Nation,* 240.

space where the traditional dress of Scotland was allowed, enlisting in the army provided cultural links with Scotland as well. Another popular alternative to service with the army was to join the volunteer movement. By the end of the Revolutionary War with France, Scotland had contributed 25,000 volunteers that made up 100 corps throughout the country. This number increased to 50,000 during the Napoleonic War and prompted government officials to establish county quotas in Scotland much earlier than they did in any other part of the country.[149] A song by Burns, "The Dumfries Volunteers" reflects this enthusiasm for volunteerism:

> Does haughty Gaul invasion threat?
> Then let the loons beware, Sir,
> There's wooden walls upon our seas,
> And volunteers on shore, Sir.
> The Nith shall run to Corsincon,
> And Criffel sink to Solway,
> Ere we permit a foreign foe
> On British ground to rally![150]

The members of the Dumfries volunteers dare the French to land on British ground, especially their homeland near Galloway and the Solway Firth. The "wooden walls" are a reference to Britain's famed naval forces, a division of the British armed forces where the Scots were conspicuously absent. However, they more than made up for scant naval participation through infantry enlistment and the volunteer movement. This song also brings to light that during the Napoleonic Wars, the Scots were granted home defense for the first time since the Union.[151] Enlistment, volunteerism, and home defense became popular in Scotland because the British army was becoming a Scottish institution, dominated by Scots officers who propagated their celebrated image.

In addition to illustrating the Scottish volunteer movement and home defense, "The Dumfries Volunteers" is especially significant because the song's subject is a Lowland regiment.

[149] Cookson, "Napoleonic Wars," 62.
[150] Smith, *Robert Burns*, 231.
[151] J.E. Cookson, *The British Armed Nation, 1793-1815* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), 142.

Although the prevailing image of the Scottish soldier was dominated by the Highlanders dressed in their tartan kilts and plaids, the majority of Scottish regiments in the British army were from the Lowlands. If the Highlands represented the spirit and traditions of the Scottish armed nation, then the Lowlands provided the substance.[152] One estimate states that by the 1790s, the manpower of the Highlands had been virtually exhausted through battle, disease, and natural attrition.[153] The transition from Highland to Lowland can be seen in the "War Song: Of the Royal Edinburgh Light Dragoons," a song written by Scott in 1798 after he formed the Royal Edinburgh Light Dragoons. Scott served as the regiment's quartermaster and wrote their song:

> From high Dunedin's towers we come,
> A band of brothers true;
> Our casques the leopard's spoils surround,
> With Scotland's hardy thistle crowned;
> We boast the red and blue.[154]

Although Edinburgh is the capital of all Scotland, it is definitely a Lowland city and the majority of its regiments were made up exclusively of Lowlanders. Regardless, Scott uses a mixture of Scottish symbols in this song to appeal to Scots of every region: Dunedin, an anglicized version of the Gaelic word for Edinburgh (Dùn Éideann), appeals to the proud Lowlanders while the hardy thistle stands for the Jacobite representation of the Highlands. He ends the stanza with the image of the "red and blue," a possible reference to their regimental uniform as part of the British army. This song, written for a Lowland regiment, is a masterpiece of Scottish symbols deployed in the service of the British nation. It invokes its Gaelic heritage and connections to Jacobitism but is ultimately used to rally troops engaged to fight for the British nation.

In ethno-symbolist theory, war plays a vital role in bringing the nation together, an experience that was particularly potent for the incorporation of Scotland into Britain. The

---

[152] Cookson, *British Armed Nation,* 129.
[153] Devine, *Scotland's Empire,* 308.
[154] Scudder, *Sir Walter Scott,* 9.

pressure of war was a significant factor that pushed the British state to actively appeal to the Scottish nation. The drive to integrate the Scots in the British war effort and, ultimately, the British nation, was based on a need for troops, monetary and political support, and a morale boost that Scottish regiments could provide. War allowed the Scots to prove their patriotism but it also provided a concrete reason for the British state to positively incorporate the Scottish nation. Conflict with France and other states provided the Scots with a niche in which to prove their loyalty to the nation and to become more essential in the running of the state. By the end of the Napoleonic Wars, Scottish integration in the British war engine was symbolically complete: the poster child of the British war effort had become the Scottish soldier. The Jacobites may have begun the cultivation of the Scottish martial tradition, but the political and cultural nationalists of the British nation most successfully harnessed it for the benefit of the state. Scots of all backgrounds could look at the British army, with its kilted regiments and Scottish officers, and see something of their heritage in its organization. This identification drew them closer to the more Scottish-friendly version of the British nation.

Another key area of Scottish integration was the Empire, whose colonial markets provided access to economic prosperity and whose administrative needs allowed Scots to introduce aspects of their public culture. The British Empire was opened to the Scots in 1707, but like the army and the political realm, the Scots largely ignored its opportunities until after the Jacobites were defeated in 1746. Within ten years, the impecunious Scots took full advantage of the prospects of empire and worked to make it their own. Acting as warriors and colonists, the Scots in the Empire filled the bureaucratic posts and colonial administration, exploited new markets, and provided the bulk of skilled professionals like doctors, artisans, and tradesmen.[155] Emma Rothschild's investigation into the lives of the far-reaching Johnstone family provides an

[155] Colley, *Britons,* 129.

excellent glimpse into the fates and fortunes of Scots in the Empire. The four sisters and seven brothers reached every corner of the globe, establishing businesses and families in Persia, India, Virginia, Grenada, Jamaica, and Scotland.[156] The Johnstones' accomplishments are partially attributable to their successful manipulation of the institutions of Empire. While the legal and administrative systems were predominantly English, aspects of Scottish civil society were more common throughout the Empire and reflected the Scottish traditions of clanship.[157] The use of Scottish public culture in the Empire acted as another means of drawing the Scots closer to the British nation and its imperial extensions. Scottish participation in the Empire was similar to the Scottish reaction to British patriotism: by appealing to their traditions and values, the Scots were more willing to take advantage of the opportunities of empire because they found its structure and content more culturally familiar.

Improvement

The economic benefits of Empire and the commercial drive behind it provided the stimulus for the fourth area of Scottish integration, the process known as "improvement." Up to this point, this paper has examined the integration of the Scottish nation into Britain through cultural and social expressions of Highlandism, the rehabilitation of Jacobitism, and warfare. This final section moves into a more economic and intellectual analysis of the Scottish position within the British nation. Unlike the first three generally inclusive causes of integration, improvement did not positively incorporate the Scottish population into the British nation. Improvement and its accompanying trends were essential to the inclusion of Scotland, but unlike the previous features, it worked to negate portions of the Scottish past and distance it from the

[156] Emma Rothschild, *The Inner Life of Empires: An Eighteenth-Century History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2011).
[157] John M. MacKenzie, "Empire and National Identities: The Case of Scotland," *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* 8 (1998): 222.

new British nation. Improvement targeted those aspects of the Scottish nation that could not be successfully modified and reused by the British nation, and removed certain Scottish symbols, traditions, and values from the symbolic repertoire of the British nation. Improvement had the opposite effect of Highlandism, rehabilitation, and warfare because it sought to break the links of Scottish identification in both the British and Scottish context.

Improvement initially began as an agricultural program used to modernize Scotland through the commercialization of farming and was the Scottish equivalent of enclosure.[158] Facing accusations of mismanagement and illiberal feudal law, Scottish landholders pushed out small crofters and replaced them with wage laborers, a transition that prompted T. M. Devine to state that in "less than two generations Scottish Gaeldom had moved from tribalism to capitalism."[159] During a period of extreme demographic change, a large portion of the Highland population moved to the industrial Lowlands, English cities, or the Empire, to be replaced by vast herds of sheep. Robert Burn's "The Highland Widow's Lament" is the tragic account of one woman who is forced to leave her home in the Highlands to relocate in the distant Lowlands:

> Oh! I am come to the low countrie,
> Och-on, och-on, och-rie!
> Without a penny in my purse,
> To buy a meal to me…
>
> And there I had threescore o' yowes
> Och-on, och-on, och-rie!
> Skipping on yon bonnie knowes
> And casting woo' to me.[160]

The Highland widow who lost her husband during the Rising is further punished by the economic forces that drive her from her home. Rather than owning her own ewes, she has been replaced by them. During the period known as the Clearances, which occurred between 1815 and

[158] Cookson, *British Armed Nation,* 128-129.
[159] Devine, *Scotland's Empire,* 325.
[160] Smith, *Robert Burns,* 260.

1821, roughly 794,000 acres of land were emptied of 15,000 people for the cultivation of sheep and other livestock.[161] Ironically, commercial landlordism and the shift to a market economy that emptied much of the Highlands of its population took place at the same time that Highlandism was projecting its image of pastoral Scotland. Industry and booming manufacturing towns like Glasgow stood in stark contrast to the falsely idyllic picture of Scotland.

In addition to sending Scots to populate the industrial towns of Britain, the Clearances also sent thousands of Scottish people into the Empire. The high levels of military recruitment, partially attributable to rehabilitation and other incentives of patriotism, were also a result of the economic changes forcing the Scots out of their homes.[162] "The Emigrant," written by Hogg, reflects the sense of betrayal and loss that many of these exiled Scots felt because of the improvement of Scotland:

> My country, they said – but they told me a lie –
> Her valleys were barren, inclement her sky;
> Even now in the glens, 'mong her mountains so blue
> The primrose and daisy are blooming in dew.
> How could she expel from those mountains of heath
> The clans who maintain'd them in danger and death!
> Who ever were ready the broad-sword to draw
> In defense of her honour, her freedom, her law.
>
> Our chief, whom we trusted, and liv'd but to please,
> Then turn's us adrift to the storms and the seas.[163]

In this song, the emigrant looks back on his home from the shores of Canada, a common destination for those forced to leave. "The Emigrant" reveals another harsh fact of the Clearances: it was not conducted by interfering English grandees, but by Scottish lords seeking to modernize their lands at the expense of their traditional tenants. The narrator of the song

[161] Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics,* 225.
[162] Cookson, *British Armed Nation,* 128-129.
[163] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd,* 285.

blames his chief, who like many of his peers, has moved from a feudal lord to a capitalist landlord.

As well as sending away his loyal followers, the modernizing chief rudely distorts the traditional institutions of Scotland by disregarding "her honour, her freedom, her law." The implicit meaning behind this accusation is that the emigrant's clan fought for the Jacobites in the past. A common trend in Scottish songs written about the Clearances was to associate it with Jacobitism. Songs of exile were traditionally a part of the Jacobite cannon and became naturally linked to new causes of exile, especially the Clearances. Older Stuart anti-Union propaganda predicted a situation like the Clearances, which led many to interpret it as the fulfillment of Jacobite prophecy.[164] The connection between Jacobitism and the Clearances is demonstrated in Hogg's "The Highlander's Farewell":

> The glen that was my father's own,
> Maun be by his forsaken;
> The house that was my father's home
> Is levell'd with the braken…
>
> And thou, my prince, my injured prince,
> Thy people have disown'd thee –
> Have hunted and have driven thee hence,
> With ruined chiefs around thee.[165]

The Highlander laments that his home has been destroyed, presumably to make room for sheep, but instead of rooting the song in the nineteenth century Clearances, he harkens back to the exile of Prince Charles Edward Stuart after Culloden. The exile of the Prince and the exile of the Highland people are inextricably linked as the "common denominator of anti-Scottish oppression."[166] Economic improvement worked to distance the Scottish experience from its past feudal associations and made aspects of the Scottish nation irrelevant, such as the relationship

[164] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 62.
[165] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd,* 422.
[166] Pittock, *Invention of Scotland,* 62.

between a chief and his clansman. Ironically, it also served to revive certain areas of the Stuart version of the Scottish nation: with the return of the experience of exile and the disorientation of economic change, the Jacobite platform of anti-Unionism gained new ground.

Beyond addressing economic concerns, improvement sought to modernize Scottish intellectual life. The best-known expression of this side of improvement was the Scottish Enlightenment, whose thinkers produced innovations in moral philosophy, the social sciences, history, rhetoric, poetry, periodical journalism, the novel, the theater of the passions, and anti-novelistic fiction. This intellectual movement guided by figures like David Hume, Adam Smith, and Adam Ferguson worked to develop a "new, synthetic account of human nature, historical process, and the dynamics of social formation, in a cosmopolitan or universal order of modernity."[167] Most relevant to the process of Scottish integration was the Enlightenment's study of history and its focus on renovating the Scottish past. Enlightenment writers like William Robertson dismissed everything before the 1688 Revolution as "feudal darkness, fanaticism and anarchy," which was only alleviated by the Union of the Crowns in 1603 and finally cast aside with the Union of the Parliaments in 1707.[168]

Enlightenment Whig thinkers built on the early eighteenth century critique of Scottishness and actively worked to demythologize Scotland by increasingly drawing on English models. The concept of North Britain was structured around the ideas and practices emerging from the Scottish Enlightenment, especially in the fields of economic growth, modernity, and constitutionalism.[169] Enlightenment writers were anxious to remove all traces of Scottishness

---

[167] Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen, eds., *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 2-3.
[168] Devine, *Scotland's Empire,* 347.
[169] Richard J. Finlay, "Caledonia or North Britain? Scottish Identity in the Eighteenth Century," in *Image and Identity: The Making and Re-making of Scotland Through the Ages,* ed. Dauvit Broun, R.J. Finlay, and Michael Lynch (Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd., 1998), 147.

from their intellectual lives. Elites sent their children to schools and universities in England to learn polite manners and refined speech, while authors attempted to eliminate all Scottish idioms from their writing.[170] During the heyday of the Scottish Enlightenment, North Britain experienced a craze for elocution lessons and produced handbooks on how to avoid using unfashionable "Scottisicims."[171] Still, the majority of Scottish people continued to speak Scots or Gaelic and avoided the Anglicization occurring in the urban Lowlands. There was also growing concern about assimilation, with fears that anglicizing influences were eroding too much of Scotland. Even for Walter Scott, who proudly celebrated the benefits of Union in Scotland, said that "Little by little, whatever your wishes may be, you will destroy and undermine, until nothing of what makes Scotland, Scotland will remain."[172]

The incorporation of the Scottish people into the British nation was not a seamless process. It was initiated by the brutal physical and legislative repression of the Highlands through the process known as Pacification, driven by an assimilationist motive that sought to inhibit the Scots from ever daring to attempt rebellion again. This was followed by the economic and intellectual platforms of improvement, which aimed to eliminate all historical barriers to integration. Enlightenment Whig intellectuals, who had historically been more open to English institutions, aided the British state in weakening many of the ideas and traditions that had allowed the Stuart version of the Scottish nation to have popular influence over the people. By effacing the traditional bond between landlord and tenant and by discrediting the Scottish past, the British nation was able to take control of the symbols of the Scottish nation, some Whig and some Jacobite, and to use them to their benefit. The successful assimilation of the Scottish nation

---

[170] T.C. Smout, "Problems of Nationalism, Identity and Improvement in Later Eighteenth-Century Scotland," in *Improvement and Enlightenment: Proceedings of the Scottish Historical Studies Seminar, University of Strathclyde, 1987-88,* ed. T.M. Devine (Edinburgh: J. Donald, 1989), 7.
[171] Finlay, "Caledonia or North Britain," 149.
[172] Devine, *Scotland's Empire,* 351, 346.

into Britain did not depend entirely on British concessions to Scottish interests, nor was it a compromise that satisfied everyone, but it was effective in binding the two nations together for the next 250 years.

Conclusion

The generation of Scottish nationalist elites who followed the Jacobites was charged with conceptualizing a different Scotland from the one their predecessors had visualized. Once the Jacobites proved incapable of realizing their interpretation of Scotland's national destiny, one that was predicated on an independent Scotland, they could no longer inspire the same kind of loyalty and confidence that they had in the past. When this deficiency was compounded by the repressive measures of the British state and the intellectual movements of the Jacobites' ideological competitors, the Whigs, the symbols of Scotland were set free to be used by new groups and new interests. Aspects of the Stuart version of the Scottish nation did remain potent in certain areas, especially in relation to anti-Unionism and the experience of exile, but the overwhelming trend of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries was the adoption of Scottish symbols by the British nation. The British nation, which had previously been defined merely by territorial boundaries, was able to acquire a deeper layer of emotional identification for the Scots because the British cultural and political elites successfully manipulated those symbols, myths, traditions, and values of Scotland that would resonate most strongly within the population. By the 1830s, the Scottish people were able to consider Britain's institutions and popular culture and see something of themselves in it.

James Hogg's song "Scotia's Glens" testifies to this transition and demonstrates that it was through the medium of song that much of the symbolic manipulation was taking place:

‘Mang Scotia’s glens and mountains blue,
Where Gallia’s lilies never grew,
Where Roman eagle never flew…
Where roves the swift an’ stately deer,
There live the lads to freedom dear,
By foreign yoke ne’er galled…
And Scotland will be Scotland still,
While hearts so brave defend her:
“Fear not, our sovereign Liege,” they cry,
“We’ve flourished fair beneath thine eye;
For thee we’ll fight, for thee we’ll die”[173]

In these brief lines, every aspect of the integration of Scotland into the British nation is apparent. Hogg uses the Jacobite memory of independence from Rome and juxtaposes it with Scotland’s continuing freedom from France as part of Britain. The influence of Highlandism is seen in the picturesque descriptions of the landscape and the praise of the brave Highland warriors who proudly pledge their honor to their sovereign liege, King George IV. “Scotia’s Glens” highlights Scottish patriotism, Highlandism, and the role of military valor. However, it does not have Scotland’s exiled populations, industrial boomtowns, or improved economy. The incorporation of the Scottish nation was a highly selective process that made a British identity accessible to the Scots who no longer had a self-sustaining concept of their own nationhood.

[173] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd*, 281.

Conclusion

This purpose of this paper has been twofold: to describe the solidification of the Scottish nation around Stuart symbolism and ideology, and to demonstrate the successful transition of those Stuart images and ideas into the symbolic repertoire of the British nation. From the Scottish point of view, the Stuart version of the nation was effective because it appealed to the myths, memories, traditions, and values that were held to embody those distinctly Scottish qualities passed down through the generations. Even with the Stuarts in exile, this produced a powerful sense of unity that brought together Lowlanders and Highlanders alike in a common sense of Scottishness. With the political failure of the Jacobite cause, the building blocks of the Scottish nation became available for a new generation of nationalist elites to reuse and manipulate in order to tie the Scottish people to a new vision of the nation. That new nation was Britain, and it was fashioned, as it never was before 1746, because cultural and political elites were able to redeploy the symbols of Scotland for Britain and ensure that the Scots felt an emotional and symbolic attachment to the nation.

As Smith has stated, a nation "cannot be simply wished into existence by intellectuals or any other elite, without support from other sectors of the population, and without the development of key social and symbolic processes."[174] British political and cultural elites, songwriters among them, harnessed this support and completed the symbolic processes by making Britain look more like Scotland. Before the collapse of the Jacobite threat, Britain did not possess a comprehensive national identity, but was rather defined by a group of older identities resident within the state and collectively identified by a geographical boundary. When Scottish symbols arrived on the market, so to speak, the British nation was able to incorporate

[174] Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism,* 59.

the Scottish population by using aspects of their unique symbolic repertoire. British nationalists used the appeal of Scottish culture to integrate the Scots into Britain and intentionally selected the symbols of Scotland that would resonate with the population. The careful juxtaposition of Scottish symbols with British causes and institutions allowed the Scots to look at the images and ambitions of Britain and recognize something of their own culture: Scottish memories of independence from Rome alongside the current fight with France, the image of the Highland soldier as the icon of national valor, the monarchy dressed in tartan and plaid, and traditional Scottish institutions adopted throughout the empire provide just a few examples.

To return to Smith's definition, a nation is a "named and self-defining human community whose members cultivate shared memories, symbols, myths, traditions, and values, inhabit and are attached to historic territories or 'homelands,' create and disseminate a distinctive public culture, and observe shared customs and standardized laws."[175] The British nation meets all of these criteria, but this fact would not be possible without the contributions of the Scottish nation. The British nation drew on the memories of Scotland, like its heritage of independence, and added them to new memories that were experienced by the whole British nation, such as the victory at Trafalgar and the abolition of slavery. Symbols of Britain were drawn from the older nations of England, Scotland, Wales, and to some extent Ireland, and were then re-crafted to represent the new unified image of Britain. The British flag is an excellent example of this phenomenon. Adopted in 1801, the Union Flag is composed of the Cross of St. Andrew (Scotland), the Cross of St. Patrick (Ireland), and the Cross of St. George (England); a union of symbols as well as a union of nations.

In terms of national mythology, the older nations retained their respective myths of ancestry as symbols of their distinctiveness. However, these differences of the past did not harm

[175] Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism,* 29.

the British nation because Britain came to represent the future of each individual nation. Myths of election also remained separate, but the overarching message of each myth was of celebratory Protestantism, which was fully embraced by Episcopalians, Presbyterians, Anglicans, and other dissenting denominations. The image of the sacred homeland in Britain encompassed past experiences and joined with new landmarks of purely British heroics; rather than being emotionally tied to just Edinburgh or London, Britons felt shared pride in the whole island, the source of empire and the home of innovation. In Britain, the public culture may have been predominantly English, with its Anglicized institutions and values, but the public culture of the Empire had more of a Scottish character. The Empire was dominated by Scottish administrators, missionaries, intellectuals, and soldiers who influenced the operation of territories around the world. Individual Scots, as well as various Scottish regiments, provided the manpower of this vast empire and, in the process, also contributed to the collection of estimable heroes of the British nation. Heroes and warfare comprise a key aspect of nation-building, and the Scottish reputation for military might remains as one of their most significant contributions to the image of the British nation.

The Union of 1707 became the prevailing golden age for the newly crafted British nation, the moment when forward-looking leaders in both England and Scotland put aside their differences and joined in prosperous harmony. The Whig model of British progress claimed the dominant interpretation of British national destiny, and revolved around the Empire, victory against France, and the continuous advancement of British interests as a whole. For the Scots who had previously supported the Jacobite policy of anti-Unionism, this must have been a dramatic change. But, as this paper has shown, there were enough incentives to adopt this new point of view. While the golden age and national destiny of Britain had fewer Scottish influences

than other symbolic features of the British nation, the Scots continued to have a strong presence in the articulation of an alternative history. The Stuart version of the nation may have lost its influence on the majority of the Scottish population, but its program was never entirely eliminated. Instead, it endured as a platform of anti-Unionism and Scottish independence. After 1750, Stuart symbolism continued to be used by various political groups such as the National Association for the Vindication of Scottish Rights (NAVSR), the Neo-Jacobite and Home Rule movements, Theodore Napier's newspaper *The Fiery Cross*, and the modern Scottish Nationalist Party (SNP).[176] Other conceptions of alternative national destiny found in Britain include the images and ideology of the English nation, temporarily revived by John Wilkes, and the Irish nation, which had an entirely different experience with the British nation than the Scots.

Walter Scott once wrote that his sense of identity was split between his British "head" and his Scottish "heart," with the British head representing the future of Scotland and the heart signifying its past. This division between the romantic and the rational is a common characterization of Scotland, and has been most clearly articulated by Tom Nairn as the "Caledonian Antisyzygy" in his book *The Break-Up of Britain* (1977). [177] However, this strict dualism is not supported by an ethno-symbolist approach to the study of Scottish and British national identity. As the songs discussed in this paper have revealed, elements of the Scottish heart were present in the British nation and were used to intentionally attach the Scottish experience to British culture. If British identity had been purely defined by the "head" of Scottish practicality, very few Scots would have felt any passionate attachment to Britain – that sense of intense devotion to "their" nation that leads to sacrifice on behalf of the nation. According to the

[176] See Murray Pittock, *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present* (London: Routledge, 1991), chs. 4 and 5.
[177] David McCrone, *Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a Stateless Nation* (London: Routledge, 1992), 175-176.

ethno-symbolist model, "people do not lay down their lives for a discursive formation" and similarly, they will not consent to a nation that does not appeal to their sense of self.[178] The Scots proved this assertion through the course of the long eighteenth century: although they had access to the incentives of a British identity with the Union of the Parliaments in 1707, the Scottish population as a whole did not truly embrace a British national identity until being "British" looked more like being "Scottish."

Far from being the sole concern of elite intellectuals, the issue of Scottish and British national identity permeated all levels of Scottish society. It is one of the tenets of ethno-symbolism that the nationalist elites propose the idea of the nation, whether through song or other venues, which must then be accepted, rejected, or reshaped by the population it is seeking to represent. The Scottish people accepted the proposed interpretation of the nation, especially with its utilization of the symbols of the previous versions of the Scottish nation. Of course, there were conditions to this consent, the greatest of which was that the Scottish people not be culturally subsumed under the English. The preface to "The Harp of Ossian," written by James Hogg, eloquently states this concern: "I have been sorely blamed by some friends for a sentiment expressed in this song; but I have always felt it painfully that the name of SCOTLAND, the superior nation in everything but wealth, should be lost, not in Britain, for that is proper, but in England. In all dispatches we are denominated *the English*, forsooth! We know ourselves, however, that we are not English, nor never intended to be."[179] Hogg and others like him knew that the future of Scotland lay in the union with the rest of Britain, but he was not willing to consent this arrangement without the protection of his culture. The transition of the Scottish nation into Britain was only allowed to occur because it acquired the people's tacit consent.

[178] Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism,* 14.
[179] Hogg, *Ettrick Shepherd,* 417.

The paradox of the British nation is that it was successfully created as a viable and unifying conception of national identity but was not dependent on the elimination of the older nations on which it was built. By the beginning of the nineteenth century, if not earlier, a person born in the Highlands of Scotland was simultaneously Scottish and British, and he or she would have found no sense of contradiction in this dual identity. The Scots integrated themselves within the British state through the processes of rehabilitation, Highlandism, war and empire, and improvement, transitions that appealed to the symbolic nature of the Scottish identity. The effect of these processes did not make the Scots any less Scottish than they were under the Stuart version of the Scottish nation. Those qualities that made them distinctly Scottish did not disappear when they became British, but were in fact encouraged and strengthened by the British nation. Both nations were composed of the symbolic resources of the Scottish people, and therefore, the Scots were able to emotionally identify with both identities as legitimate representations of their culture.

Ultimately, the survival of a nation is dependent on its constant reimagining. It must adapt to the political, economic, and social changes that influence a society and its conception of national identity, the "continuous reproduction and reinterpretation of the pattern of values, symbols, memories, myths and traditions that compose the distinctive heritage of nations, and the identification of individuals with that heritage and its cultural elements."[180] The Scottish nation proposed by the Stuarts, and later the British nation introduced by a group of Scottish songwriters working to tie the Scots to Britain, succeeded in producing inclusive and affirming identities that Scots of all backgrounds and situations could embrace.

Although this paper has relied heavily on the model of ethno-symbolism presented by Anthony Smith, it has also attempted to extend the analysis of Scotland and Britain beyond the

[180] Smith, *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism*, 109.

usual limits of this theory of nations and nationalism. Most applications of ethno-symbolism highlight the relevant features of the nation, those qualities that make it unique or classify it along with similar nations. If there is a comparison of two or more nations, the nations under consideration are generally culturally and geographically distinct. This kind of analysis is impossible with the Scottish and British nations; these two entities were concurrent conceptions of national identity and could not be separated because of their shared symbolic repertoire and territorial overlap. Rather than simply identifying the symbols, myths, memories, traditions, and values of the Scottish and British nations to reveal the ethno-symbolic characteristics of both nations, this paper has argued that the case of Scotland and Britain cannot be reduced to such a one-dimensional analysis. While I have focused on the socio-cultural aspects of the Scottish and British nations, I have attempted to broaden the ethno-symbolist parameters into the political, economic, and institutional realms to demonstrate the pervasion of Scottish symbols in British society as a whole.

Another major deviation from the ethno-symbolist model that I pursued was an examination of those institutions of the British nation that sought to remove symbols from the cultural repertoire. Most ethno-symbolist studies do not draw attention to the forces that work to eliminate symbols that cannot be converted and redeployed. In this case, improvement and its associated phenomena acted as symbolic cultivation in reverse, a negative selection of symbols rather than a positive one. In addition to contributing to the scholarly discussion on ethno-symbolism, this paper has sought to counter the prevailing trend toward value judgment when considering the relationship between Scotland and Britain and their associated national identities. Historiography on this subject has relied too heavily on identifying which conception of identity was better or worse for the Scots, which was truer or purer. As this paper has shown, Scottish

and British identities are not mutually exclusive, an actuality that everyday Scots, both in the long eighteenth century and now, have proved through their daily lives. The model presented in this paper has worked to articulate how this sense of dual identity occurred and why it was accepted by the general population as a legitimate vision of their community.

Bibliography

Primary Sources:

Campbell, John Lorne. *Highland Songs of the Forty-Five.* Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press for the Scottish Gaelic Texts Society, 1984.

Gifford, Douglas and Alan Riach, eds., *Scotlands: Poets and the Nation*. Manchester: Carcanet; Edinburgh: Scottish Poetry Library, 2004.

Hogg, James. *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland: Being the Songs, Airs, and Legends of the Adherents of the House of Stuart*. Edited by Murray G.H. Pittock. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003.

Hogg, James. *The Works of the Ettrick Shepherd*. London: Blackie and Son, 1865.

Scudder, Horace E., ed., *The Complete Poetical Works of Sir Walter Scott.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1900.

Smith, Alexander, ed., *Poems, Songs, and Letters: Being the Complete Works of Robert Burns*. London: Macmillan, 1906.

Tytler, Sarah and J.L. Watson. *The Songstresses of Scotland Vol. II*. London: Strahan & Co., 1871.

Secondary Sources:

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso, 1991.

Blackie, John Stuart. *Scottish Song: Its Wealth, Wisdom, and Social Significance*. New York: AMS Press, 1976.

Bogdanor, Vernon. *Devolution in the United Kingdom.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Colley, Linda. *Britons: Forging the Nation, 1707-1837*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009.

Colley, Linda. "Britishness and Otherness: An Argument." *Journal of British Studies* 31, no. 4 (Oct. 1992): 309-329.

Cookson, J. E. *The British Armed Nation, 1793-1815*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.

Cookson, J.E. "The Napoleonic Wars, Military Scotland and Tory Highlandism in the Early Nineteenth Century." *The Scottish Historical Review* 78, no. 205, part 1 (Apr. 1999): 60-75.

Cowan, Edward J. "Contacts and tensions in Highland and Lowland culture." In *Crossing the Highland Line: Cross-Currents in Eighteenth-Century Scottish Writing: Select Papers from the 2005 ASLS Annual Conference*, edited by Christopher MacLachlan, 1-19. Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2009.

Crawford, Thomas. *Society and the Lyric: A Study of the Song Culture of Eighteenth-Century Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1979.

Daiches, David. "Robert Burns and the Jacobite Song." In *Critical Essays on Robert Burns*, edited by Donald A. Low, 137-156. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1975.

Davidson, Neil. *The Origins of Scottish Nationhood*. London: Pluto Press, 2000.

Davis, Leith, Ian Duncan and Janet Sorensen, eds., *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Devine, T. M. *Scotland's Empire, 1600-1815*. London: Allen Lane, 2003.

Devine, T. M. *The Scottish Nation: A History, 1700-2000*. New York: Viking, 1999.

Donaldson, William. *The Jacobite Song: Political Myth and National Identity*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1988.

Dziennik, Matthew P. "Whig Tartan: Material Culture and its Uses in the Scottish Highlands, 1746-1815." *Past and Present* 217 (Nov. 2012): 117-147.

Finlay, Richard J. "Caledonia or North Britain? Scottish Identity in the Eighteenth Century." In *Image and Identity: The Making and Re-making of Scotland Through the Ages*, edited by Dauvit Broun, R.J. Finlay, and Michael Lynch, 157-176. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd., 1998.

Finlay, Richard J. "Queen Victoria and the Cult of Scottish Monarchy." In *Scottish History: The Power of the Past*, edited by Edward J. Cowan and Richard J. Finlay, 209-224. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002.

Fritzsche, Peter. "Specters of History: On Nostalgia, Exile, and Modernity." *American Historical Review* 106, no. 5 (Dec. 2001): 1587-1618.

Garside, Peter. "The Origins and History of James Hogg's 'Donald MacDonald.'" *Scottish Studies Review* 7, no. 2 (Autumn 2006): 24-39.

Gellner, Ernest. *Nations and Nationalism.* Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1983.

Hayes, James. "Scottish Officers in the British Army 1714-63." *Scottish Historical Review* 37, no. 123, part 1 (Apr. 1958): 23-33.

Hobsbawm, Eric and Terence Ranger, eds., *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Hroch, Miroslav. *Social Preconditions of National Revival in Europe: A Comparative Analysis of the Social Composition of Patriotic Groups Among the Smaller European Nations*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.

Johnson, David. *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*. London: Oxford University Press, 1972.

Kidd, Colin. "Integration: Patriotism and Nationalism." In *A Companion to Eighteenth-Century Britain*, edited by H.T. Dickinson, 369-380. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2002.

Kidd, Colin. "North Britishness and the Nature of Eighteenth-Century British Patriotisms." *The Historical Journal* 39, no. 2 (June 1996): 361-382.

Kidd, Colin. *Subverting Scotland's Past: Scottish Whig Historians and the Creation of an Anglo-British Identity, 1689-c. 1830*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Kidd, Colin. "The Rehabilitation of Jacobitism." *The Scottish Historical Review* 77, no. 203, part 1 (April 1998): 58-76.

Kidd, Colin. "Teutonist Ethnology and Scottish Nationalist Inhibition, 1780-1880." *Scottish Historical Review* 74, no. 197, part 1 (Apr. 1995): 45-68.

Leoussi, Athena S. and Steven Grosby, eds., *Nationalism and Ethnosymbolism: History, Culture and Ethnicity in the Formation of Nations*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007.

MacKenzie, John M. "Empire and National Identities: The Case of Scotland." *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* (Sixth Series) 8, (Dec. 1998): 215-231.

MacKenzie, John M. "Essay and Reflection: On Scotland and the Empire." *The International History Review* 15, no. 4 (Nov. 1993): 714-739.

Martin, Maureen. *The Mighty Scot: Nation, Gender, and the Nineteenth-Century Mystique of Scottish Masculinity*. Albany: SUNY Press, 2009.

McCrone, David. *Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a Stateless Nation*. London: Routledge, 1992.

McCulloch, Margery Palmer. "The lasses reply to Mr. Burns: women poets and songwriters in the Lowlands." In *Crossing the Highland Line: Cross-Currents in Eighteenth-Century Scottish Writing: Select Papers from the 2005 ASLS Annual Conference*, edited by Christopher MacLachlan, 137-152. Glasgow: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2009.

McLynn, Frank. *The Jacobites*. London: Routlegde & Kegan Paul, 1985.

McNeil, Kenneth. *Scotland, Britain, Empire: Writing the Highlands, 1760-1860*. Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2007.

Morton, Graeme. "What if?: The Significance of Scotland's Missing Nationalism in the Nineteenth Century." In *Image and Identity: The Making and Re-making of Scotland Through the Ages*, edited by Dauvit Broun, R.J. Finlay, and Michael Lynch, 157-176. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd., 1998.

Pittock, Murray G.H. *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth-Century Britain and Ireland*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Pittock, Murray G.H. *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and the Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present*. London: Routledge, 1991.

Pittock, Murray G.H. "The Jacobite Cult." In *Scottish History: The Power of the Past,* edited by Edward J. Cowan and Richard J. Finlay, 191-208. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002.

Pittock, Murray G.H. *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995.

Rothschild, Emma. *The Inner Life of Empires: An Eighteenth-Century History.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2011.

Schivelbusch, Wolfgang. *The Culture of Defeat: On National Trauma, Mourning, and Recovery*. New York: Metropolitan Books, 2003.

Smith, Anthony. *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism: A Cultural Approach*. London: Routledge, 2009.

Smith, Janet Adam. "Some Eighteenth-Century Ideas of Scotland." In *Scotland in the Age of Improvement: Essays in Scottish History in the Eighteenth Century*, edited by N.T. Phillipson and Rosalind Mitchinson, 107-124. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1970.

Smout, T.C. "Problems of Nationalism, Identity and Improvement in Later Eighteenth-Century Scotland." In *Improvement and Enlightenment: Proceedings of the Scottish Historical Studies Seminar, University of Strathclyde, 1987-88*, edited by T.M. Devine, 1-21. Edinburgh: J. Donald, 1989.

Szechi, Daniel. "The Jacobite Movement." In *A Companion to Eighteenth-Century Britain*, edited by H.T. Dickinson, 81-96. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2002.

Watt, Lauchlan MacLean. *Scottish Life and Poetry*. London: James Nisbet & Co., Limited, 1912.

Winstock, Lewis S. *Songs and Music of the Redcoats: A History of the War Music of the British Army 1642-1902*. Harrisburg: Stackpole Books, 1970.

Withers, Charles. "The Historical Creation of the Scottish Highlands." In *The Manufacture of Scottish History*, edited by Ian L. Donnachie and Christopher A. Whatley. Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992.

Zimmermann, Doron. *The Jacobite Movement in Scotland and in Exile, 1746-1759*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003.